

[Shri S. K. Patil]

do proceed to elect, in such manner as the Speaker may direct, two members from among themselves to serve as members of the Indian Central Sugarcane Committee."

**Mr. Speaker:** The question is:

"That in pursuance of Rule 1 of the Rules and Regulations of the Indian Central Sugarcane Committee, the members of Lok Sabha do proceed to elect, in such manner as the Speaker may direct, two members from among themselves to serve as members of the Indian Central Sugarcane Committee."

*The motion was adopted.*

#### National Shipping Board

**The Minister of Shipping in the Ministry of Transport and Communications (Shri Raj Bahadur):** I beg to move:

"That in pursuance of sub-section (2)(a) of Section 4 of the Merchant Shipping Act, 1958, and the National Shipping Board Rules, 1960, framed under the said Act, the members of Lok Sabha do proceed to elect, in such manner as the Speaker may direct, four members from among themselves to serve as members of the National Shipping Board."

**Mr. Speaker:** The question is:

"That in pursuance of sub-section (2)(a) of Section 4 of the Merchant Shipping Act, 1958, and the National Shipping Board Rules, 1960, framed under the said Act, the members of Lok Sabha do proceed to elect, in such manner as the Speaker may direct, four members from among themselves to serve as members of the National Shipping Board."

*The motion was adopted.*

#### ALL INDIA INSTITUTE OF MEDICAL SCIENCES

**The Minister of Health (Dr. Sushila Nayar):** Sir, I beg to move:

"That in pursuance of Section 4(g) of the All India Institute of Medical Sciences Act, 1956, the members of Lok Sabha do proceed to elect, in such manner as the Speaker may direct, two members from among themselves to serve as members of the All India Institute of Medical Sciences for a term of five years, subject to the other provisions of the said Act."

**Mr. Speaker:** The question is:

"That in pursuance of Section 4(g) of the All India Institute of Medical Sciences Act, 1956, the members of Lok Sabha do proceed to elect, in such manner as the Speaker may direct, two members from among themselves to serve as members of the All India Institute of Medical Sciences for a term of five years, subject to the other provisions of the said Act."

*The motion was adopted.*

12.06 hrs.

#### RE. SIMULTANEOUS TRANSLATION OF PROCEEDINGS

**Mr. Speaker:** The House shall now take up further General Discussion of the Railway Budget.

**An Hon. Member:** Sir, how much time has been allotted for this?

श्री रामेश्वरानन्द (करनाल) : अध्यक्ष महोदय, आप ने अभी जो घोषणा की है कि कमेडियों में कौन कौन चुने गये हैं, उसको हिन्दी में भी बतत दीजिए, आप से यह प्रार्थना है ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : धनी तो माननीय मंत्रियों ने ये प्रस्ताव रखे हैं कि उन कमेटियों के लिए मेम्बर चुने जायें ।

श्री रामेश्वरानन्द : उसी को हिन्दी में भी बता दिया जाये ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : मैं बता देता हूँ ।

श्री पाटिल ने यह प्रस्ताव रखा है कि लोक सभा के मेम्बर इंडियन काँग्रेस प्राफ एशीकल्बरन रिसर्च—मुझे हिन्दी में इस का तर्जुमा करना नहीं आता है—के लिए चार मेम्बर चुने ।

श्री हाजी (इन्दौर) : भारतीय कृषि अनुसंधान केन्द्र ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : मेम्बर साहब के बताने के बावजूद मैं नहीं कह सकता । उस के बाद श्री पाटिल ने इंडियन सेंट्रल यूनिवर्सिटी के लिए दो मेम्बर चुने जाने का प्रस्ताव रखा है ।

श्री राज बहादुर ने नैशनल शिपिंग बोर्ड के लिए चार मेम्बर चुने जाने को प्रस्ताव रखा है ।

डा० सुशीला नायर ने झाल इंडिया इंस्टीट्यूट प्राफ मेडिकल साइंसिज के लिए दो मेम्बर चुने जाने का प्रस्ताव रखा है ।

Shri Nambiar (Tiruchirapalli): On a point of order, Sir. May I know whether this sort of translation will be possible?

Shri H. N. Mukerjee (Calcutta Central): Sir, I did not wish to interrupt you while you were translating the position for the benefit of the hon. Member, but if you are going to make a practice of it, I am afraid, you will have to consider so many other aspects of the situation. You have been insisting, very rightly, that we should economise as far as the time of the House is concerned. If

it is to be the convention or practice by whoever is in the Chair that anything said in English has to be translated in Hindi then surely those hon. Members who do not understand Hindi speeches can insist that any Hindi speech or statement made should at once be translated and the time of the House be consumed in the process. I have no animus against Hindi, but if in this kind of way conventions get going, I do not know where we shall end up.

Mr. Speaker: Our Rules are that any hon. Member can express himself in Hindi or in English. He can use either of the two languages unless there are special circumstances; for example, if an hon. Member does not know either of them we have special provision and the Speaker can allow him to speak in his mother tongue provided a copy of his speech has already been supplied to the Speaker. That rule will continue. I am not going to spend double the time. When an hon. Member speaks in one language I will request other hon. Members to try to understand that themselves or to get the help of their neighbours who are there to know what has been said. I agree with the hon. Member, Shri H. N. Mukerjee, that if everyone were to insist like that, it can only be conceived how much time would be spent in such unnecessary things. That is my submission and I hope I will get the cooperation of all the hon. Members. If it is insisted upon, I shall not be able to do that in future.

श्री विभूति मिश्र (मोतिहारी) : अध्यक्ष महोदय, जब कोई प्रश्न हिन्दी में पूछा जाता है, तो उस का जवाब हिन्दी के साथ साथ अंग्रेजी में भी दिया जाता है । इस स्थिति में यदि कोई सदस्य अंग्रेजी में कही जाने वाली किसी बात का हिन्दी में अनुवाद चाहे, तो उस का क्या कुसूर है ?

अध्यक्ष महोदय : हमें दो कम्पार्टमेंट्स बना कर इस तरह से आपस में झगडा शुरू

[ अध्यक्ष महोदय ]

करने की कोशिश नहीं करनी चाहिए कि उन्होंने इतना लिया है, हम भी उतना ही लेंगे। इस से तकलीफ होगी। हम सब चाहते हैं कि ज्यादा से ज्यादा भादमी हिन्दी बोलें और सीखें और उन को इस बात का धीक पैदा हो। हिन्दी वाले साहब दूसरों को समझा कर, तरगीब दे कर अपने साथ लायें। अगर इस बारे में झगड़ा होगा, तो हमारे लिए काम करना मुश्किल हो जायगा। हमारा मुद्दा यह है कि सब लोग हिन्दी समझने और बोलने लग जायें। तो इस बारे में झगड़े की जरूरत नहीं है।

श्री बागड़ी (हिसार) : मैम्बर साहिबान चाहे जिस भाषा में बोलें लेकिन स्पीकर साहब जब भी कोई रूलिंग दें या दूसरी बात कहें, तो उन्हें दोनों भाषाओं में कहना चाहिये। मैं चाहता हूँ कि आप दोनों भाषाओं में बोला करें।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : जब मैम्बर साहिबान को आज्ञा है, इजाजत है, फ्रीडम है कि वे दोनों में सी किसो भाषा में बोलें तो स्पीकर को भी यह फ्रीडम होनी चाहिये कि वह किसी भी भाषा में बोलें।

श्री रामेश्वरानन्द : जो आदेश आप इंग्लिश में सुना देते हैं, उस को अगर आप हिन्दी में भी सुना दिया करें तो बहुत अच्छा होगा। मैं यह नहीं कहता कि आप इंग्लिश में अपने आदेश न सुनायें लेकिन उस के साथ ही साथ मैं प्रार्थना करता हूँ कि आप हिन्दी में भी सुना दिया करें। यह कोई अनुचित मांग नहीं है जो मैं कर रहा हूँ क्योंकि संविधान में हिन्दी और अंग्रेजी दोनों का उल्लेख है। जब आप दोनों में बोलते हैं तो मैं कुछ नहीं कहता हूँ। मैं तभी बोलता हूँ जब आप अंग्रेजी में ही बोलते हैं।

Shri Nambiar: I have to make a submission.

Mr. Speaker: These submissions will go on endlessly.

Shri Nambiar: If they insist on speaking in Hindi and we insist on speaking in Tamil or other languages there will be only confusion here. There has been the practice all through that a Member may speak either in English or in Hindi. Those who do not know either of these two languages, may be allowed to speak in other languages. That healthy practice should be continued and no departure should be allowed to be made.

Mr. Speaker: Did I say something else?

Shri Nambiar: But he is insisting on that point.

Mr. Speaker: Perhaps I could not explain it in so beautiful language.

श्री रामेश्वरानन्द : जब इंग्लिश में कोई सज्जन बोलते हैं, तो हम कुछ नहीं कहते हैं लेकिन जब . . . .

अध्यक्ष महोदय : अब काम को आगे चलने दीजिये।

श्री रामेश्वरानन्द : बहुत अच्छा।

12.12 hrs.

#### RAILWAY BUDGET—GENERAL DISCUSSION—contd.

Mr. Speaker: The House will now resume discussion on the Railway Budget. Mr. Pattnayak who was on his legs yesterday will resume his speech.

An Hon. Member: On a point of order.