

1964, agreed without any amendment to the Kerala State Legislature (Delegation of Powers) Bill, 1964, which was passed by the Lok Sabha at its sitting held on the 24th September, 1964."

PRESIDENT'S ASSENT TO BILLS

Secretary: Sir, I lay on the Table the following two Bills passed by the Houses of Parliament during the current Session and assented to by the President since a report was last made to the House on the 1st October, 1964:—

- (1) The High Court Judges (Conditions of Service) Amendment Bill, 1964; and
- (2) The Legal Tender (Inscribed Notes) Bill, 1964.

13.17 hrs.

LEAVE OF ABSENCE FROM SITTINGS OF THE HOUSE

Mr. Speaker: The Committee on Absence of Members from the Sittings of the House in their Tenth Report have recommended that leave of absence be granted to the following six Members for the periods indicated in the Report:—

1. Shri Motilal Kundanmal Firodia
2. Shri R. Kanakasabai
3. Shri Muzaffar Husain
4. Chaudhury Brahm Prakash
5. Shri Priya Gupta, and
6. Shri Maheswar Naik.

The Committee have also recommended that the absence of Shri B. P. Maurya for the period indicated in the Report may be condoned.

I take it that the House agrees with the recommendations of the Committee.

1324 (A) LSD—6.

Some Hon. Members: Yes.

Mr. Speaker: The Members will be informed accordingly.

The Minister of Defence Production in the Ministry of Defence (Shri A. M. Thomas): With your permission, I would like to make a short statement. It is in connection with an assurance given.

Mr. Speaker: Shri Bhakt Darshan may first make his statement.

CORRECTION OF ANSWER TO STARRED QUESTION NO. 1328, DATED 6-5-1964

The Deputy Minister in the Ministry of Education (Shri Bhakt Darshan): While replying to a supplementary question asked by Shri Indrajit Gupta, the Deputy Minister of Education stated as below:—

"The hon'ble Member may be correct in his estimate; but, as far as I know, these camps are restricted only to foreign students. That is a fact."

The correct position is that Indian Council for Cultural Relations takes care to see that some Indian students are also admitted to our Summer Camp; so that there is no segregation of foreign students and the Indian and foreign students come to know each other better.

STATEMENT RE DEATH OF SCHOOL CHILDREN IN ANDHRA PRADESH

The Deputy Minister in the Ministry of Education (Shri Bhakt Darshan): On behalf of Shri M. C. Chagla, I make the following statement:

After the Education Minister made his last statement on this tragic incident before this House, Government have received from the Andhra Pra-

[Shri Bhakt Darshan]

desh Government a report of a Committee consisting of Collector of Kurnool and the Director of Public Health, Andhra Pradesh. This Committee finalised its report on 25.9.1964 after making thorough investigations and on-the-spot inspections for locating the cause of tragedy. The three main possibilities which the Committee looked into were:

- (1) an outbreak of cholera
- (2) chemical poisoning of the ingredients of the food,
- (3) bacteriological contamination of the cooked meal.

The Committee was of the opinion that "the present outbreak of the epidemic might be probably due to local bacterial contamination of the mid-day meals in the course of its preparation or cooking or distribution." The Committee did not give a final verdict however because they were awaiting the result of the various chemical and bacteriological analysis.

A senior officer of the health Ministry was also sent to Hyderabad to

report on the incident. In his report received by the Education Ministry on the 1st of October, 1964 this officer has made the following significant observations:—

(i) Pathikenda Taluk in which the village Maddikera is situated had cholera from 9.7.64 to 21.9.64 in 8 villages but Maddikera itself was free from cholera and Gastro-Enteritis until the 19th of September, 1964.

(ii) The mid-day meal had been suspended for some time in this village due to cholera infection in the surrounding villages. It was resumed on the 15th of September. The meal was not served on the 16th due to rains and the sickness of the cook. The meal was prepared and served on the 17th and 18th September. On 19th and on subsequent days it was suspended.

(iii) The report of the incident was received by the local dispensary doctor on the 19th at 6 A.M.

(iv) The up-to-date figures of attacks and deaths are as under

Date	Attacks	Deaths	
19-9-64	63	(one adult and 62 children)	17
20-9-64	66	(all children)	12
21-9-64	30	(4 adults and 26 children)	3
22-9-64	15	(all children)	6
23-9-64	25	(3 adults and 22 children)	—
24-9-64	11	(6 adults and 5 children)	—
25-9-64	—		—
26-9-64	—		—
27-9-64	5	(3 adults and 2 children)	—
28-9-64	1	(one adult)	—
	216		38

The water used for cooking was from two step wells, which was also used by the people located round about the wells. The bacteriological and chemical examination of 23 samples taken on 22.9.64 by the District Health Officer has given the following results:—

"One rectal swab of girl Hanumakka, aged 8 has proved positive on the 26th. The well water from Nallanabhavi from where the cook has taken water for cooking and for other uses has proved positive on the 28th. Subsequently the lecturer in Microbiology of Andhra Medical

College Kurnool took rectal swabs from 27 cases out of the 34 cases under treatment on 24th evening. Out of these 5 have proved positive including one specimen of vomit. Specimens were also taken from the cook and the attendants. These were all negative for cholera till the 28th. Further examinations are going on. The bacteriological examination for Salmoulla, Shigalla, Typhimmurium, Closteridium, etc. have all proved negative.

The post-mortem specimens of one child on 21.9.64 and another child on 22.9.64 have all been negative for different insecticides—for routine poisonous metals, alcalides, etc."

The tentative conclusion arrived at by the officer of the Health Ministry is that the highly insanitary conditions of the cooking place of the mid-day meal and the use of contaminated water from Nallanabhavi may be the cause for this outbreak of Gastro-Enteritis.

On the basis of the two reports received by the Education Ministry, Andhra Pradesh Government have been requested to improve the conditions in Maddikera village and to ensure rigid observance of necessary standards of sanitation in the preparation and distribution of mid-day meals.

Shri Hem Barua (Gauhati): On a point of clarification. The other day when the Education Minister made a statement to this effect, the House was interested in knowing why it was, when the attack took place on the 15th September and some children died, that this food was continued to be served upto the 27th September? Why was it that it was not stopped as soon as it was found that there was an attack due to the food and all that? We told him that he should collect information on this point, but in this statement there is no mention of it.

Shri Bhakt Darshan: I have already said in the statement that the meal was prepared and served on the 17th

and 18th, but on the 19th and subsequent days, it was suspended.

Shri Hem Barua: After that, again it was started and continued upto the 27th.

Shri Bhakt Darshan: It was suspended as soon as the information was received.

Shri Ranga (Chittoor): I made a suggestion the other day that the representative of the United Nations Children's Committee, who is stationed at Hyderabad, should also be asked to go there and submit his report. How is it that Government has not thought it fit to do so? Maybe, the report that they have received is a good enough one and correct one, but we would like to have the assurance that the experts of the Government of India as well as the United Nations' own representative who is there in Hyderabad, had also been given an opportunity of going there and confirming the report that they have made to us.

The Minister of Health (Dr. Sushila Nayar): The United Nations expert would have come into the picture if we had found any indication that the food materials supplied were at fault. The results of the enquiry made by our medical experts from the Central Government as well as from the State Government,—the Central Government sent a top officer for the enquiry—the reports of these expert enquiries up till now are indicative of the fact that it was bacterial contamination due to the use of water from a nearby well which was contaminated.

Shri Ranga (Chittoor): That was already there.

Dr. Sushila Nayar: The United Nations or the CARE supply is not at fault. Surely, we do not need to wait for experts from other countries when we have competent experts of our own.

Shri Ranga: It is not a matter of other countries. The United Nations' own expert is there, stationed at Hyderabad, for this specific purpose.

Dr. Sushila Nayar: Our experts are as good. Should we go on asking for foreign experts to help us when we have competent experts?

Shri Ranga: The hon. Minister does not even know who that expert is. He happens to be an Indian, and not a foreigner, and has been appointed by the United Nations on the recommendation of the Government of India. All that I suggested is that he should also have been taken over, and I made that suggestion much earlier. Anyhow, I am not prepared to blame the Government for their failure on this.

Shri Bhakt Darshan: In the statement I have clearly stated that the Director of Public Health, Andhra Pradesh, visited the place immediately after the incident.

Shrimati Yashoda Reddy (Kurnool): When there was cholera contamination in the places round about Maddikera, I want to know whether the Education Ministry, the local Government or the Health Ministry, had given specific instructions to see that the contaminated water was not used, and if they have now taken the precaution that the water being used especially in schools is pure. Have they made any such provision?

Dr. Sushila Nayar: The facts of the case are that while there was cholera in some of the villages in that taluk, this village had been free from cholera completely up till the 19th. It was under those circumstances that the school authorities allowed the meals to be served. It was not known at that time that the well was infected. It was after the tragedy that the well water was tested, and it was found to be infected.

Shrimati Yashoda Reddy: So, we do not believe in prevention.

Dr. Sushila Nayar: We do.

श्री श्रीकार लाल बेरवा (कोटा): उस कुएं से सारे गांव वाले पानी पीते थे तो गांव के आदमियों के मरने की भी घटना हुई है या यह केवल बच्चे ही बच्चे मरे हैं ?

डा० सुशीला नायर: ऐडल्ट्स भी मरे हैं। उन के भी केसेज हुए हैं। प्रोबैटिव ऐक्शन के लिए जो मेरो बहन ने पूछा तो यह काम तो होता रहा है। वहां की लोकल पंचायत का काम कुंभों को सफाई करने आदि का है, भारत सरकार की हेल्थ मिनिस्टरी या एजुकेशन मिनिस्टरी उस की जिम्मेदार नहीं हो सकती।

श्री बागड़ि (हजियार): अध्यक्ष महोदय, यह बच्चों के मरने की ऐसी दुर्घटना है जिससे कि सब के दिल दहक जाते हैं। मैंने मंत्री महोदय का बयान सुना है जिसमें बतलाया गया है कि एक दिन कुछ बच्चे मरे, दूसरे दिन कुछ बच्चे मरे और तीसरे दिन और बच्चे मरे। बाद में उसकी जांच पड़ताल हुई तो मैं मंत्री महोदय से पूछना चाहता हूँ कि इस तरह से जो बच्चे मरे और गवर्नमेंट ने यह जांच करके पाया कि कुएं में कंटैमिनेशन था जिससे कि यह मौतें हुईं तो यह मालूम होने के बाद फौरी तौर पर सब बच्चों को टीका लगाने, इस छूत की बीमारी को आगे न फैलने देने के लिए और सारे गांव की देखभाल करने का इस तरह का कोई एक व्यापक कार्यक्रम क्यों नहीं तत्काल चालू किया गया? दूसरे सरकार क्या ऐहति-याती कार्यवाही कर रही है ताकि आगे इसी किस्म की दुर्घटनाएं न हों, उनको आगे के लिए रोकने के वास्ते क्या कदम उठा रही है ?

डा० सुशीला नायर: जैसे ही पहला केस 19 तारीख को हुमा खाना औरन बन्द कर दिया गया और उसी वक्त वहाँ पर स्टेट गवर्नमेंट के ऐक्सपर्ट्स पहुंच गये और उन बच्चों को जो भी डाक्टरी इमदाद दी जा सकती थी वह दी गई और उनको अस्पताल भी पहुंचाया गया। बच्चों का इस तरह से मरना वाकई यह बड़े दुःख की बात है और हमें बच्चों की इन मृत्युओं से बड़ा सदमा पहुंचा है लेकिन जैसा कि श्री भक्त

दर्शन ने बतलाया उसका कारण है कौलरा जंतु जिसकी वजह से यह इनफेक्शन हो गया। प्रीवेंटिव ऐक्शन के लिए एजुकेशन मिनिस्ट्री ने आंध्र प्रदेश सरकार को लिखा है कि जब तक पूरी तरह से सैनेटरी कंडीशंस कुकिंग की न हो जायं बच्चों को खाना पका कर न दिया जाय।

श्री बागड़ी : मेरा प्रश्न यह था . . .

अध्यक्ष महोदय : बागड़ी जी, हेम बरुआ साहब ने भी यही पूछा था कि जब एक दिन बच्चे मरे और बराबर अटक होता रहा तो दूसरे दिन फिर क्यों खाना दिया गया ?

श्री बागड़ी : खाने की बात नहीं है, अध्यक्ष महोदय, मंत्री महोदय ने बतलाया कि वे कौलरा की बिना पर मरे हैं तो मेरा कहना है कि पहले दिन जब एक गांव में 20-30 आदमी मर जायं तो उसके कितने दिन के बाद यह पता लगा कि यह इस बीमारी से मरे हैं और कौलरा के टीके तमाम बच्चों को फौरन क्यों नहीं लगाये गये ?

डा० सुशीला नायर : मैं निवेदन करूँ कि टीके वगैरह का जो प्रसर होना होता है उसको डेवलप होने में कुछ समय लगता है, एकदम टीका लगते ही यह नहीं हो जाता है कि शरीर में उस रोग से लड़ने की शक्ति आ जाय।

श्री बागड़ी : मंत्री महोदय बतलायें कि क्या टीके उनको लगाये गये थे ?

डा० सुशीला नायर : जी, हाँ।

श्री रामसेवक यादव : सवाल यह नहीं है कि इन्फेक्शन का फौरी प्रसर होता है या नहीं होता है सवाल तो यह है कि उनको टीके लगाये गये या नहीं ?

डा० सुशीला नायर : यह बता तो दिया गया है कि उनको टीके दिये गये और हर तरह

का जो भी उपचार हो सकता है वह उनको पहुंचाया गया।

श्री बड़ें (खारगोन) : यह प्रक्सर देखा गया है कि जहाँ जहाँ कौलरा होता है, जिस ताल्लुके में वह फैलता है उस के आस-पास के इलाके के तमाम स्कूलों के बच्चों को प्रीवेंटिव ऐक्शन की तौर पर कौलरा के टीके लगा दिये जाते हैं तो मैं जानना चाहता हूँ कि यह जो लड़के मरे हैं उन के भी इसी प्रकार से टीके लगाये गये थे ?

डा० सुशीला नायर : उन में से ज्यादातर को टीके नहीं लगे हुए थे, कुछ को लगे हुए थे। हजार एक बच्चे जो थे उन में से कोई तीन सौ बच्चों को टीके लगाये गये थे बाकी के माता, पिताओं ने टीके नहीं लगवाये थे।

Shri P. Venkatasubbaiah (Adoni): This is a very tragic incident, and in one family all the children died. May I know whether there has been some delay in rushing medical help to these people? Is it a fact that they failed to take the assistance of the medical staff from Guntakkal, which has a big railway hospital, and they waited for the medical help to come from Kurnool, which is more than 80 miles away, and that this also resulted in the tragedy? May I know whether that aspect has been enquired into?

Dr. Sushila Nayar: Immediate medical aid was rushed. The railway hospital is not a hospital that generally comes to the aid of the civilian and general population. That is well known. Whichever was the quickest means of getting assistance to them was adopted. The doctor there was also available along with certain staff, and further assistance was immediately rushed.

Dr. Melkote (Hyderabad): The Minister has stated that cholera was prevalent in that area. If there was cholera infection, the children should have been inoculated. In view of the fact that inoculation has not taken

[Dr. Melkote]

place and a number of children have died, people feel that it is not due to cholera, but something else. Is the Minister aware of this? If it was due to cholera, why were they not inoculated earlier?

Dr. Sushila Nayar: I have already submitted, and my colleague has also submitted, that seven cases have been found positive on culture for cholera bacilli. So far has inoculations are concerned, I have submitted that about one-third of the children had been inoculated. It is well known that there is resistance amongst our people against inoculations.

Shri Ranga: Not now.

Dr. Sushila Nayar: There is no compulsory inoculation, and parents get their children inoculated if they want to, and refuse if they want to.

Shri Heda (Nizamabad): Has it come to the notice of Government that those children who did not attend the school, or partake in the mid-day meals on those days, were the victims, and some of them have died; if so, what is their number?

Shri Bhakat Darshan: It is a fact. As I read out in the statement, out of 216 cases, 10 were adults. . . (Interruptions).

Mr. Speaker: Shri Vishram Prasad.

श्री विश्राम प्रसाद (लालगंज): श्री मंत्री जी या मंत्रिणी जी ने कहा है कि प्रास-पास के आठ गांवों में कालेरा फैला हुआ था और इस गांव में इन्फेक्शन नहीं था। मैं यह जानना चाहता हूँ कि जब उन आठ गांवों में कालेरा फैला हुआ था, तो सरकार ने क्या कार्यवाही की। मंत्रिणी जी ने कहा है कि कुएँ की सफ़ाई करना पंचायत का काम था, भारत सरकार, एडुकेशन मिनिस्ट्री या हेल्थ मिनिस्ट्री का काम नहीं था। जब यह भारत सरकार की इयूटी नहीं थी, तो फिर इस

हाउस में इस सवाल का जवाब क्यों दिया जाता है ?

अध्यक्ष महोदय: माननीय सदस्य यह तो मेरी कसूर बता रहे हैं। अगर मैं जवाब देने की इजाजत न दूँ, तो मैं जिम्मेदार और बुरा और अगर मैं जवाब देने की इजाजत देता हूँ, तो माननीय सदस्य कहते हैं कि क्यों जवाब दिया जाता है।

श्री विश्राम प्रसाद: मंत्रिणी जी ने कहा है कि यह भारत सरकार या एडुकेशन मिनिस्ट्री या हेल्थ मिनिस्ट्री की जिम्मेवारी नहीं थी, इसलिए मैंने यह बात कही है। मैं यह जानना चाहता हूँ कि जब उन आठ गांवों में कालेरा फैला हुआ था, तो वहाँ पर क्या कार्यवाही की गई? क्या वहाँ पर पोर्टेबल परमेगनेट वगैरह का प्रयोग किया गया?

डा० सुशीला नायर: जो भी कार्यवाही स्टेट गवर्नमेंट ने मुनासिब समझी होगी, वह उसने की होगी। अगर माननीय सदस्य चाहते हैं, तो स्टेट गवर्नमेंट से वह इन्फेक्शन मंगा कर दे दी जायेगी।

Shri S. M. Banerjee (Kanpur): On the first day, the hon. Minister of Education made a statement from which it was evident that it was due to some defective cooking. But later on, now, we are told that because there was cholera there, these small boys were victims. The doubt persists in the minds of the general public in the country. I would like to know whether a judicial enquiry or a high-powered enquiry into this incident will be held to elicit the truth?

Dr. Sushila Nayar: No, Sir. we have made the enquiry that was necessary. We are quite satisfied with it. We were in the first instance worried whether there were insecticides or something like that mixed with the foodstuffs. But that is not

the case. As has been explained, it was due to the insanitary conditions of cooking and there is no need for any further enquiry.

श्री हुकम चन्द कछराय (देवास) : क्या माननीय मंत्रिणी का ध्यान समाचार पत्रों में प्रकाशित इन समाचारों की भोर गया है कि इस दुर्घटना के बाद, जिसमें 38 बच्चे मरे, इन्दीर, राजकोट और नागपुर में भी विद्यार्थियों के भोजन में विषैले पदार्थ पाए गए ?

श्री भक्त दर्शन : इस सम्बन्ध में सरकार के पास कोई सूचना नहीं है।

श्री तुलशीदास जाधव (नांदेड़) : माननीय मंत्री को मालूम है कि जेल में भी खाना देने से पहले डाक्टर उसकी इन्स्पेक्शन करते हैं। मैं यह जानना चाहता हूँ कि जब पहले दिन कुछ बच्चे मरे, तो क्या दूसरे दिन डाक्टरों ने बच्चों को दिये जाने वाले खाने को टेस्ट किया था।

डा० सुशीला नायर : जिस दिन—19 तारीख को—बच्चा बीमार हुआ, उस दिन से यह खाना बन्द कर दिया गया। हर एक स्कूल में बच्चों को खाना बंटने से पहले डाक्टर जा कर देखे, यह तो सम्भव नजर नहीं आता।

13.33 hrs.

STATEMENT RE. DISCOVERY OF
DEFENCE MAP

The Minister of Defence Production in the Ministry of Defence (Shri A. M. Thomas): Mr. Speaker, during the discussion on Defence Minister's statement in Lok Sabha on 28th November, 1964 on the reported discovery of the defence map in a fruit parcel at Pipariya railway station, Madhya Pradesh, the Defence Minister agreed to furnish the name of the person who sent the fruit parcel and the name of the person to whom the parcel was sent.

The position is that a Havildar S. D. Kimothi, of Army Educational Corps sent a parcel of apples from Chaubatyia, Ranikhet to a junior commissioned officer, Jamadar Gunanand Shastri, of Army Education Centre and School, Pachmarhi, Railway station Pipariya.

Shri S. M. Banerjee (Kanpur): I would like to know this. Our question was twofold. One was about the name of those and other was whether the person who had sent the parcel and the person to whom the parcel was sent were apprehended and interrogated and if so what was the result of interrogation?

Shri A. M. Thomas: One person had been interrogated. The other person to whom the parcel was despatched—it has not been possible to get him—will be interrogated when he is apprehended.

Shri Hem Barua (Gauhati): What steps have the Government taken or contemplate taking against these persons who have made our defence maps or defence papers a marketable commodity like that?

Shri A. M. Thomas: As indicated by the Defence Minister, this case was enquired into. The Chief or Army Staff is of opinion that the information is already generally known to the public.

Mr. Speaker: Even if it be known to the public then too?

Shri A. M. Thomas: It is true that there has been some carelessness on the part of the officers.

Mr. Speaker: Is the Government going to do something?

Shri A. M. Thomas: Adequate action is being taken.

श्री प्रकाशवीर शास्त्री (बिजनौर) : संरक्षण मंत्री ने इस सम्बन्ध में अपने वक्तव्य में कहा था कि नेफ़ा और सहाय के ये नक्शे