

Shri U. M. Trivedi (Mandsaur): Would it not be better if you could kindly suspend the rule so that some more persons could put questions?

Mr. Speaker: We have already spent half an hour on this.

Shri U. M. Trivedi: It is a very important question.

Mr. Speaker: There are different methods in which a subject can be raised in this House to elicit information.

Shri U. M. Trivedi: It is going on for the last three days.

Mr. Speaker: They have received some information and they are expecting to get more information.

Shri U. M. Trivedi: By that time this session would be over.

Shrimati Renu Chakravartty: We want to make one point clear. We did not discuss it here so that there may be repercussions among the Hindus and Muslims. That is not what we ever wanted. We do not want, like Pakistan, there should be repercussions on the minorities.

Mr. Speaker: Order, order. The hon. Member should resume her seat.

श्री बड़े : माननीय अध्यक्ष, यह गलत बात है। मैंने इस प्रकार नहीं कहा है।
(Interruptions).

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आर्डर, आर्डर।

श्री बड़े : मैंने यह कहा है कि यदि हाउस में इस विषय को डिस्कस करने के लिए टाइम नहीं दिया जायेगा, तो देश में अशांति बढ़ेगी और हिन्दू मुस्लिम टेन्शन बढ़ेगा। मैंने यह नहीं कहा कि वह होना चाहिए। ऑनरेबिल मेम्बर हिन्दी नहीं समझती हैं।

Mr. Speaker: Order, order. Would he kindly resume his seat or not? He

now says that he never intended to say that. We should accept that. Shrimati Renu Chakravartty has made it clear as to what their intention was. Shri U. M. Trivedi has also made it clear that it was not their intention that it should have repercussions on the minorities or create some difficulties for them. So, this is over. We will now take up the next item. Is Shri P. R. Chakraverti present in the House? No. Shri Vasudevan Nair.

Shri Vasudevan Nair (Ambalapuruzha): Under Rule 197,

श्री रामेश्वरानन्द (करनाल) : अध्यक्ष महोदय,

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आर्डर आर्डर।

श्री रामेश्वरानन्द : मैं आपसे निवेदन करना चाहता हूँ कि यह जो महत्वपूर्ण विषय चल रहा है, उसको इस तरह से गुस्से में दबाने का यत्न किया जा रहा है। यह कहा जा रहा है कि पाकिस्तान में गड़बड़ होती है, हिन्दुस्तान में गड़बड़ होती है। क्या सरकार इसका कोई उपाय नहीं सोच सकती? आप भी बोलने न देकर "आर्डर, आर्डर" कह कर बिठा देते हैं।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : अब मुझे आपको बिठाना ही होगा, क्योंकि इसका यहां पर कोई ताल्लुक नहीं है।

CALLING ATTENTION TO
MATTERS OF URGENT
PUBLIC IMPORTANCE

REPORTED DECISION OF PROF. J. B. S. HALDANE TO QUIT THE C.S. AND I.R.

Shri Vasudevan Nair: Sir, under rule 197. I call the attention of the Minister of Scientific Research and Cultural Affairs to the following matter of urgent public importance and I request that he may make a statement thereon:

"The reported decision of Prof. J. B. S. Haldane to quit the Council of Scientific and Industrial Research."

The Minister of Scientific Research and Cultural Affairs (Shri Humayun Kabir): Mr. Speaker, Sir, in reply to a Short Notice Question on 12th June 1962 I said in Parliament:—

- (1) Professor Haldane was appointed Head of the Genetics and Biometry Unit with a small supporting staff as from 1st November 1961 and he and his staff had drawn their salary in the first week of December 1961,
- (2) The house selected by Professor Haldane has been secured and is being repaired according to the wishes of Professor Haldane, and
- (3) Office accommodation for the Unit has been provided at the Indian Institute of Bio-Chemistry and Experimental medicine.

To my regret and surprise, Professor Haldane contradicted this in the press and alleged that officers of the C.S.I.R. had given me false information and as such my statement in Parliament was false. An analysis of Professor Haldane's own statement will show that his allegations are completely unjustified.

Professor Haldane has said nothing about my first observation that he knew that he was appointed Head of the Genetics and Biometry Unit as from 1st November 1961. He has, therefore, virtually admitted that his earlier remarks to the press that he did not know of the existence of the Unit nor when he was appointed were not based on facts.

Regarding my second observation, Professor Haldane has complained that the architects have not carried out his wishes in details. The work carried out so far has by and large been in accordance with his wishes, and where there have been differences between him and the architects,

we have instructed them to conform to his wishes.

Professor Haldane has also complained that only five rooms are being repaired and he has not obtained a plan for the repairs of the remaining part of the House. He has apparently forgotten that on January 10, 1962, he wrote to the architects that he wanted six rooms in the south wing with electric lighting and water and added "I am quite aware that the repair of the north wing will take some time, and that until this is done, I cannot have laboratory accommodation....."

Shri Frank Anthony (Nominated—Anglo-Indians): Sir, I am raising a point of order. You have repeatedly ruled that we cannot ask any questions about minor details whether the person concerned is distinguished or non-distinguished. Our time is being wasted on all manner of details about lack of water and electric amenity to some distinguished gentleman.

Shri U. M. Trivedi: Sir, I support the point of order raised by Shri Anthony.....(Interruption).

Shri Nath Pai (Rajapur): Sir, on the point of order raised by Shri Anthony, may I submit that the matter is not as insignificant as Shri Frank Anthony thinks. The matter relates to how we treat our scientists. This distinguished scientist adopted India as his motherland and an impression is likely to go round the world that we cannot provide accommodation for the world's most distinguished biologist. We want a full statement and want to be satisfied that the Government has done all that it can do.

Mr. Speaker: Shri Frank Anthony was not present the other day. The matter had assumed importance in view of the statement made by the hon. Minister here in response to what Professor Haldane had said. The press had also commented on that. There apparently were certain

[Mr. Speaker]

contradictions between the two statements and therefore it had assumed some importance.

Shri Humayun Kabir: I am in your hands, Sir.....(Interruption).

Mr. Speaker: Order, order.

Shri Humayun Kabir: As I have stated, the statements which have been made by Professor Haldane are not justified. I was quoting from what he wrote on the 10th January 1962, namely:—

"I am quite aware that the repair of the north wing will take some time and that until this is done, I cannot have laboratory accommodation. I wish however to emphasise that we can start work as soon as we have rooms available for offices and stores and a wall or fence round the garden. Laboratory facilities are not needed in the early stages of genetical research."

The architects have reported that half the building should be ready within three weeks and plans for re-conditioning the remaining rooms have been prepared.

As I told the Parliament on the 12th June, 1962, possession of this house was handed to CSIR only on the 16th March, 1962, and to renovate half of this dilapidated 150-year old house within three months cannot surely be regarded as a sign of lethargy or indifference on the part of the officers of CSIR.

Professor Haldane has objected to my third observation that office accommodation has been provided in the Indian Institute of Bio-Chemistry and Experimental Medicine and complained that only half a table has been provided there for his Administrative Officer and none for himself or his scientific colleagues. The House will remember that my statement was in reply to Professor Haldane's remark in the Press asking

CSIR to tell him the address of his Unit. I may add that the Indian Institute of Biochemistry and Experimental Medicine has not only provided accommodation to his Administrative Officer but is also offering the facilities of secretarial and accounts staff to the Unit.

I do not say that this is a completely satisfactory state of affairs but I would like to point out that this is Professor Haldane's own choice. He declined our offer to set up his laboratory in a rented flat in Calcutta and preferred to work in his own house pending the renovation of the house of the late Surendranath Banerjee. The Indian Institute of Bio-Chemistry and Experimental Medicine is itself short of accommodation and Professor Haldane has himself in a letter of the 24th March 1961 expressed his admiration for the work of this Institute and said:—

"I was very favourably impressed by the work of Dr. Ray and his colleagues....The success in coping with overcrowding reminded me of F.G. Hopkin's Laboratory about 1920. This is a very high compliment."

It is surprising that Professor Haldane should pay the Institute a compliment for improvising but at the same time be so impatient with the transitional arrangements which have been made at his own desire pending renovation of the house intended for his laboratory.

Professor Haldane has complained that officers of the CSIR have given me false information and have been thwarting and frustrating him. The facts are quite the contrary. Many rules and procedures have been dispensed with or modified to accommodate him. He has been allowed to draw salaries without signing a pre-receipted salary bill. He and his colleagues have been exempted from signing forms which all officers have to fill on appointment. The CSIR

also offered to place a block grant at his disposal so that he would have complete freedom to operate and administer the funds of his Unit. He was told that he could appoint his staff on contract and thus obviate the necessity of following the various procedures of a departmental set-up.

It will thus be seen that Professor Haldane chose the name and designation of the Unit which he was to direct, chose his staff to man the Unit, chose the building in which the Unit was to be housed, chose to work in his own house instead of moving into rented accommodation till the permanent building of the Unit was ready and announced its existence to the outside world even before the house which it was to inhabit was ready for occupation. Only one instance has been reported to me in which the CSIR stood in the way of Professor Haldane's inclination and this has nothing to do with scientific research. During the last General Elections Prof. Haldane wanted to campaign for certain candidates, and he was advised against it.

On the basis of these facts, I leave it to the House to judge whose statements are correct and whose otherwise. Since a certain amount of confusion has been created in the public mind because of Prof. Haldane's various statements I thought Sir, it would be fair to me and to the House to place before it these detailed facts. And, if you wish, a completely documented statement can be placed before the House at a future date.

Shri H. N. Mukerjee (Calcutta Central): Sir, here is a scientist of international reputation who has adopted Indian nationality, who might be a difficult person in a psychological sense, but who is having accusations hurled against him by the Minister. And he has no opportunity of defending himself. It is a very bad precedent, Sir. I wish you, Sir, as the custodian of the liberties of this House, and the privileges and

prerogatives of this House, to lay down some rules with regard to this matter. Here is a Minister who is answering the charges which in a very rational manner an internationally well-known scientist was making against the Government, and he is making counter-charges and laying down....

Mr. Speaker: Order, order.

Shri H. N. Mukerjee: And that man is not in a position to answer these things. This is extremely undesirable.

Mr. Speaker: I do not think we should pursue this controversy any further. (Interruptions). Order, order. I would request hon. Members to leave this matter just where it is now.

Shri Frank Anthony: It is too much.

Shri Vasudevan Nair: May I make a very sensible suggestion to the Minister which you should kindly allow. He could very well fly to Calcutta, which is not far off, and meet Prof. J. B. S. Haldane. Why did the Minister not do that? And may we know whether he is proposing to do that?

Mr. Speaker: Order, order. Already an objection has been taken here that an individual case should not have been discussed at all. That is the practice normally. It was only on account of the importance of that scientist that I allowed it and the Minister made a statement. As the Minister said, Mr. Haldane had rushed to the press and said that all that was said inside the Parliament was false, and therefore the necessity arose that it should be clarified. Now, if it had remained in the press that the Minister had made a false statement, was it justified? Hon. Members should not now appear as if they were advocating any case. We should leave it there. Both the statements are there and, as the Minister said, Members could now draw their own conclusions. I do not think there is any

[Mr. Speaker]

justification that we should now put any questions on it. Let these statements remain as they are, and hon. Members should draw their own conclusions. If they want to discuss it with the Minister or give him some advice, they might do it. But it would be in the interests of all that it should remain where it is.

Shri Hem Barua: Sir, I rise on a point of order.

Mr. Speaker: Yes, what is the point of order?

Shri Hem Barua: My information is this that Prof. Haldane....

Mr. Speaker: This is not a point of order.

Shri Hem Barua: I will come to the point of order.

Mr. Speaker: He should come to it straight.

Shri Hem Barua: The hon. Minister, Shri Humayun Kabir, made a statement through the Press Information Bureau saying that he had been misquoted by the press, and then that the office was handed over, not to Prof. Haldane but to....

Mr. Speaker: What is the point of order?

Shri Hem Barua: The point of order is this. When the House is in session, when there is an apprehension that the Minister has been misquoted, the Minister should bring the matter to the notice of the hon. Speaker, and then the hon. Speaker, after consulting the proceedings, the records of the House could allow him to make a statement. Here he does it over the head of the House through the P.I.B.

Mr. Speaker: Misquoting in the press is quite a different thing. The hon. Member is quoting the procedure where something happens between a Member and a Minister; if there is a contradiction and the Member brings it to my notice, then I send it on to

the Minister, and if the Member feels that he has not been rightly quoted or something, then I allow him to make a statement. That is quite different. There is no point of order.

Papers to be laid on the Table.

Shri U. M. Trivedi (Mandsaur): Sir, just one request.

Shri Nath Pai (Rajapur): I also want to make a submission.

Shri U. M. Trivedi: We have already discussed Prof. Haldane for some time. But there is a very big demonstration outside Parliament House which I want to bring to your notice. Their complaint is....

Mr. Speaker: Order, order. The hon. Member may kindly resume his seat. As to what is happening outside, I should not be concerned with it.

Shri U. M. Trivedi: I am not concerning myself with it, Sir. But I am making only one request to you, and that is that the hon. the Home Minister should be directed to go and listen to their representations.

Mr. Speaker: Order, order. I have no authority to direct any Minister to go and do a thing outside the House.

Mr. Speaker: Shri Datar. Papers to be laid on the Table.

Shri Bagri (Hissar): On a point of order,....

Mr. Speaker: There is no point of order. Order, order. He should sit down.

Shri Bagri: सारा गुस्सा मेरे ऊपर ही उतारेगा क्या? (Interruptions.) मेरी बात भी तो सुन लीजिये।

Mr. Speaker: Now, when one thing has been finished and the next is not taken up, there cannot be any point of order. That is what I am submitting to the hon. Member. He should