

helpless what to do at that moment, because he worked himself up to such an extent that he would not listen at all. I knew he was excited on this particular subject, but everybody is. There ought to be some limit to which we can control ourselves. How many times did I ask him? It was not the first time. When he goes out, he challenges the Chair in such a manner that I feel that I have been insulted.

12.20 hrs.

SUSPENSION OF MEMBER
(Shri Hem Barua)

The Minister of Communications and Parliamentary Affairs (Shri Satya Narayan Sinha): In view of the fact that Shri Hem Barua, while going out, made certain remarks which were derogatory to the Chair, I propose that he should be suspended from the House for one week.

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath (Hoshangabad): Sir, I submit that the motion is not in order. He said: "In view of the fact that . . ." What did he say—"derogatory remarks"?

Shri Satya Narayan Sinha: I said: "derogatory to the Chair".

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: As far as I know, if I heard him aright, he only said—you may discount his voice and tone, but the words were perhaps these—"Why do you take the trouble of asking me to go out when I am going out myself".

श्री रामसेवक यादव (बाराबंकी) :
इस प्रस्ताव को सदन की राय के लिए रखने के पहले . . .

Mr. Speaker: Order, order. I shall place it before the House.

इस पर डिबेट तो नहीं हो सकती। जब मोशन प्राया है तो मुझे रखना पड़ेगा :

श्री रामसेवक यादव : इस में एक संशोधन तो स्वीकार किया जा सकता है।

श्री हुकम चन्द कछवाय (देवास) : यह सजा बहुत लम्बी है। तीन दिन से ज्यादा की सजा न दें।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : मेरे सामने जो मोशन प्राया है उस को मुझे रखना है।

श्री रामसेवक यादव : मोशन प्राया है तो उस में संशोधन तो हो सकता है।

Mr. Speaker: I have to put the motion as it comes before me.

संशोधन बाद में देखेंगे। पहले यह तो देखें कि यह पास होता है या नहीं होता या क्या होता है।

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: Sir, on a point of order. May I request you to guide us in this matter? You have just now ruled that the motion moved by the Minister of Parliamentary Affairs is not subject or liable to amendment. Under what rule is that motion not subject to amendment?

Mr. Speaker: A motion for suspension of a member from the service of the House has to be put by the Speaker forthwith and, as such, no amendment can be moved to that motion. Now the question is:

"That Shri Hem Barua, a Member of this House, and named by the Speaker, be suspended from the service of the House for one week."

The Lok Sabha divided.

*Shri Koya (Kozhikode): Sir, my vote has not been properly recorded.

Mr. Speaker: It will be noted.

**Shri C. K. Bhattacharyya (Raiganj): One should be added to 'Ayes' because my vote has not been correctly recorded.

*Shri Koya voted for "Noes."

**Shri C. K. Bhattacharyya voted for "Ayes."

Division 14]

AYES

[12.27 hrs

Achal Singh, Shri
 Alagesan, Shri
 Alva, Shri A. S.
 Anjanappa, Shri
 Arunachalam, Shri
 Azad, Shri Bhagwat Jha
 Bakliwal, Shri
 Basappa, Shri
 Basumatari, Shri
 Bhagat, Shri B. R.
 Bhagwati, Shri
 Bhakt Darshan, Shri
 Bist, Shri J. B. S.
 Borooah, Shri P. C.
 Brajeshwar Prasad, Shri
 Brij Basi Lal, Shri
 Brij Raj Singh, Shri
 Chakraverti, Shri P. R.
 Chandriki, Shri
 Chaturvedi, Shri S. N.
 Chaudhry, Shri Chandramani Lal
 Chavan, Shri D. R.
 Chavda, Shrimati Joraben
 Chuni Lal, Shri
 Dafle, Shri
 Dajjit Singh, Shri
 Das, Dr. M. M.
 Dass, Shri C.
 Desai, Shri Morarji
 Deshmukh, Shri Shivaji Rao S.]
 Dinesh Singh, Shri
 Dixit, Shri G. N.
 Dorai, Shri Kasinatha
 Dubey, Shri R. G.
 Ering, Shri D.
 Gaekwad, Shri Fatehsinhrao
 Gahmati, Shri
 Ganapati, Ram, Shri
 Gandhi, Shri V. B.
 Ganga Devi, Shrimati
 Ghosh, Shri Atulya
 Gowdh, Shri
 Guha Shri A. C.
 Gupta, Shri Shiv Charan
 Hansda Shri Subodh
 Harvani, Shri Ansar
 Hazarika, Shri J. N.
 Himatsingka, Shri
 Iqbal Singh, Shri
 Jadhav, Shri M. L.
 Jamunadevi, Shrimati
 Jedhe, Shri
 Joshi, Shrimati Subhdra
 Joytishi, Shri J. P.
 Kabir, Shri Humayun
 Kadadi, Shri
 Kajrolkar, Shri
 Kannamwar, Shrimati Tat
 Kanungo, Shri
 Kappen, Shri

Karuthiruman, Shri
 Keishing, Shri Rishang
 Khadilkar, Shri
 Khan, Shri Osman Ali
 Khanna, Shri Mehr Chand
 Kindar Lal, Shri
 Kotoki, Shri Liladhar
 Koujalgi, Shri H. V.
 Kripa Shankar, Shri I
 Krishnamachari, Shri T.T.
 Lahtan Chaudhri, Shri
 Lakhan Das, Shri
 Lakshmikanthamma, Shrimati
 Lalit Sen, Shri
 Laskar, Shri, N. R.
 Mahadeo Prasad, Shri
 Mahadeva Prasad, Dr.
 Mahishi, Dr. Sarojini
 Maimoona Sultan, Shrimati
 Malhotra, Shri Inder J.
 Maniyangadan, Shri
 Mantri, Shri D. D.
 Marandi, Shri
 Mathur, Shri Harish Chandra
 Mathur, Shri Shiv Charan
 Mehrotra, Shri Braj Bihari
 Mehta, Shri Jashvant
 Menon, Shri P. G.
 Mirza, Shri Bakar Ali
 Mishra, Shri M. P.
 Misra, Dr. U.
 Misra, Shri Shyam Dhar
 Morarka, Shri
 More, Shri K. I.
 More, Shri S. S.
 Mukerjee, Shrimati Sharda
 Murti, Shri M. S.
 Musafir Shri G. S.
 Muthiah, Shri
 Nanda, Shri
 Naskar, Shri P. S.
 Nayar, Dr. Sushila
 Nesamony, Shri
 Niranjana Lal, Shri
 Paliwal, Shri
 Pande, Shri K. N.
 Pandey, Shri R. S.
 Pandey, Shri Vishwa Nath
 Pandit, Shrimati Vijay Lakshmi
 Panna Lal, Shri
 Paranasivan, Shri
 Patel, Shri Chhotubhai
 Patel, Shri Man Sinh P.
 Patel, Shri P. R.
 Patel, Shri Rajeshwar
 Patil, Shri D. S.
 Patil, Shri S. K.
 Patil, Shri T. A.
 Patnaik, Shri B. C.
 Pattabhi Raman, Shri C. R.

Prabhakar, Shri Naval
 Pratap Singh, Shri
 Ragbunath Singh, Shri
 Raghuramsiah, Shri
 Rai, Shrimati Sahodra Bai
 Raja, Shri C. R.
 Rajdeo Singh, Shri
 Raju, Shri D. B.
 Raju, Dr. D. S.
 Ram Subhag Singh, Dr.
 Ramakrishnan, Shri P.R.
 Ramanathan Chettiar, Shri
 Ramdhani Das, Shri
 Ramshekhar Prasad Singh, Shri
 Rane, Shri
 Rao, Shri Jaganatha
 Rao, Shri Krishnamoorthy
 Rao, Shri Ramapathi
 Rao, Shri Thirumala
 Reddi, Dr. B. Gopala
 Reddiar, Shri
 Reddy, Shri Ramakrishna
 Reddy, Shrimati Yashoda
 Sahu, Shri Rameshwar
 Saigal, Shri A. S.
 Samanta, Shri S. C.
 Sanji Rupji, Shri
 Satyabhama Devi, Shrimati
 Sen, Shri A. K.
 Sen, Shri P. G.
 Shah, Shri Manabendra
 Shah, Shrimati Jayaben
 Sham Nath, Shri
 Shankaraiya, Shri
 Sharma, Shri D. C.
 Shastri, Shri Lal Bahadur
 Shastri, Shri Ramanand
 Shivananjappa, Shri
 Shree Narayan Das, Shri
 Shukla, Shri Vidya Charan
 Shyam Kumari Devi, Shrimati
 Siddananjappa, Shri
 Sidheshwar Prasad, Shri
 Singh, Shri D. N.
 Singh, Shri S. T.
 Sinha, Shrimati Ramdulari
 Sinha, Shri Satya Naryan
 Sinha, Shrimati Tarakeshwari
 Snatak, Shri Nardeo
 Soundaram Ramachandran,
 Shrimati
 Subbaraman, Shri
 Subramoniam, Shri C.
 Subramanyam, Shri T.
 Surendra Pal Singh, Shri
 Swaran Singh, Shri
 Swell, Shri
 Thimmaiah, Shri
 Thomas, Shri A. M.
 Tiwary, Shri D. N.

| | | |
|----------------------------|----------------------------|-----------------------------|
| Tiwary, Shri K. N. | Upadhyaya, Shri Shiva Dutt | Vidyalankar, Shri A. N. |
| Tiwary, Shri R. S. | Vaishya, Shri M. B. | Vijaya Ananda, Maharajkumar |
| Tripathi, Shri Krishna Deb | Varma, Shri Ravindra | Virbhadra Singh, Shri |
| Tula Ram, Shri | Veerappa, Shri | Wasnik, Shri Balkrishna |
| Tyagi, Shri | Venkatasubbaiah, Shri P. | Yadav, Shri Ram Harkh |
| Ukey, Shri | | |

NOES

| | | |
|-------------------------------|----------------------------|---------------------------|
| Alvares, Shri | Kakkar, Shri Gauri Shanker | Sharma, Shri A. P. |
| Aney, Dr. M. S. | Kamath, Shri Hari Vishnu | Shastri, Shri Prakash Vir |
| Bade, Shri | Kandappan, Shri S. | Shinkre, Shri |
| Bagri, Shri | Kapur Singh, Shri | Singh, Shri A. P. |
| Banerjee, Shri S. M. | Lohia, Dr. Ram Marohar | Singh, Shri J. B. |
| Basant Kunwari, Shrimati | Mate, Shri | Singh, Shri Y. D. |
| Berwa, Shri Onkar Lal | Maurya, Shri | Sivasankaran, Shri |
| Bhattacharya, Shri Dinen | Murmu, Shri Sarkar | Swamy, Shri Sivamurthi |
| Chakravartty, Shrimati Renu | Omkar Singh, Shri | Vishram Pr sad, Shri |
| Daji, Shri | Pandey, Shri Sarjoo | Warior, Shri |
| Dharmalingam, Shri | Pattanyak, Shri Kishan | Yadav, Shri Ram Sewak |
| Gupta, Shri Inderjit | Pottekkatt, Shri | Yajnik, Shri |
| Jha, Shri Yogendra | Sen, Dr. Ranen | Yudhvir Singh, Shri |
| Kachbavaiya, Shri Hukam Chand | Sezhian, Shri | |

Mr. Speaker: The result of the division, as indicated by the machine, is: Ayes 193; Noes 42.

The motion was adopted.

श्री रामसेवक यादव : अध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं प्रस्ताव करता हूँ कि श्री चपल कान्त भट्टाचार्य को एक सप्ताह के लिये सदन की सेवा से मुअत्तिल कर दिया जाए ।

Mr. Speaker: The difficulty is that a motion cannot come without the Speaker having named a Member. The wording of the motion is: such and such member of the House, named by the Speaker, be suspended from the service of the House for such and such period. So, how could this motion come?

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: Then, may I request you to name him?

डा० राम मनोहर लोहिया (फर्रुखाबाद): मेरा एक व्यवस्था का प्रश्न है ।

Mr. Speaker: I might be allowed to proceed further.

Shri Koya: I just want to know whether it is in order for Shri C. K.

Bhattacharyya to say that an hon. Member is playing to the gallery. I want your ruling on that.

Mr. Speaker: It has been done so many times in this House. I would certainly advise hon. Members not to impute motives to other hon. Members.

Shri Rangā (Chittoor): In regard to this specific incident, should you not say that it is unparliamentary and, therefore, it will be expunged?

Mr. Speaker: I have given the ruling that it is not desirable for any member to impute motives to others. In this case, it was not desirable for Shri Bhattacharyya to use such expression or impute motives.

Shrimati Renu Chakravartty (Barrackpore): May I point out to you another occasion when I was accused. At that time, Shri Jain was the Rehabilitation Minister and we had a sharp exchange of words. Then Shri Jain said that I was trying to make propaganda. At that time, Shri Ananthasayanam Ayyangar, who was in the Chair, told him that it was improper to make such references and that he should withdraw those words. Shri Jain was good enough to withdraw

[Shrimati Renu Chakravartty]

those words and apologise for using such an expression. It is all in the record. So, I think it is only right and proper that Shri Bhattacharyya should also regret for using such words and withdraw them.

Shri Shivaji Rao S. Deshmukh (Parbhani): Sir, I rise on a point of order. On an earlier occasion, referring to our late Prime Minister, Shri Ranga said that he is playing to the gallery. Naturally, those remarks were made with a view to impute motives to the late Prime Minister. That should also be looked into.

Mr. Speaker: I cannot rake up old records. Sometimes it is done. Though it might have been tolerated at that time, it is not desirable. I say it is improper. It should not be done. Mr. Bhattacharyya ought not to have done that. I say that. Mr. Banerjee.

Shri Alvares (Panjim): Mr. Bhattacharyya may be asked to withdraw his remarks. (*Interruption*).

Shri Ranga: How are we to proceed otherwise? This remains on record. Why did we abstain on the earlier voting? If you want us to co-operate, then the Treasury Benches, the ruling Party, should co-operate with the Opposition. Surely, I would like to appeal to them. Do they approve of that remark? If they do not approve of that remark, it should be withdrawn. My hon. friend is a learned gentleman and he should spontaneously get up and withdraw it. (*Interruption*).

Mr. Speaker: Order, order. I would advise Mr. Bhattacharyya that he should be sorry for that. He should withdraw it.

Shri C. K. Bhattacharyya: Sir, I certainly submit with the utmost respect to what you say. But references have been made . . .

Mr. Speaker: It would be better now to do it so that it might be a good precedent for the future.

Shri C. K. Bhattacharyya: That is what I submit. I respectfully submit to what you say and withdraw what what you suggest to me to withdraw . . . (*Interruptions*).

Mr. Speaker: Order, order.

Shri C. K. Bhattacharyya: But the references have been made by Shrimati Renu Chakravartty and Mr. Ranga . . .

Mr. Speaker: Let it be done in clear terms so that I can enforce it in future on every occasion.

Shri C. K. Bhattacharyya: I do it with the utmost respect and without any mental or verbal reservation. When Shrimati Renu Chakravartty referred to some precedent and Mr. S. S. Deshmukh also referred to some precedent, I would request you to consult the records and find out what had happened on these occasions.

Mr. Speaker: I have already . . .

An hon. Member: He should be named.

Mr. Speaker: There is no occasion for naming him.

I have already said that this phrase has been used earlier many a time and notice has not been taken. I had said that just a little while ago. (*Interruption*). Would he allow me to finish? But in order to lay down good tradition, I have advised Mr. Bhattacharyya to withdraw these words because it would be a good precedent which I can enforce in future also. So, I ask him to withdraw those words.

Some hon. Members: He has withdrawn them.

Mr. Speaker: Has he withdrawn them?

Shri C. K. Bhattacharyya: I have already done it unreservedly.

डा० राम मनोहर लोहिया : अध्यक्ष महोदय . . .

Shri Alvares: Sir, I rise on a point of order.

Mr. Speaker: He has withdrawn it unreservedly. Mr. Banerjee.

Shri S. M. Banerjee (Kanpur): From the various replies given by the hon. Minister for Defence Production and the Prime Minister, it appears . . .

Shri Alvares: I rise on a point of order.

डा० राम मनोहर लोहिया : अध्यक्ष महोदय, मेरा एक व्यवस्था का प्रश्न है। मैं कितनी ही बार खड़ा हुआ लेकिन खड़ा ही रह गया जबकि दूसरे लोग अपनी बात कहते रहे। अब क्या जो आप से दब कर रहे वह दब कर ही रह जायगा? यहाँ पर इस सारे सदन में स्पीकर से सब से ज्यादा दब कर मैं ही रहता हूँ अगर आप अब मुझे इजाजत दें तो मैं अपनी बात रखूँ वरना जैसी आप की इच्छा और मैं उस हालत में बैठे जाता हूँ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आप का प्वाएंट आफ़ आर्डर है क्या क्योंकि अभी तो हाउस का एक टिप्पिशन हुआ है ?

डा० राम मनोहर लोहिया : मुझे आप से निवेदन करना है कि यह रोज रोज की चखचख चल रही है और जब श्री च० का० भट्टाचार्य ने कहा कि वह मुझे और मेरे जैसे लोगों को हमेशा न सिर्फ कांग्रेस वाले बल्कि उधर वाले भी कहा करते हैं तो हमारा भी कुछ हक है कहने का कि यह बुरी चीज़ है और इस लोक सभा को अच्छे तरीके से चलना चाहिए (इंटरप्शंस) प्रश्नोत्तर काल, ध्यानाकर्षण काल और काम रोको काल, यह तीनों ऐसे ही चके हैं कि या तो उन के नियम ख़राब है या नियम अच्छ होते हुए उन का यहाँ पर पालन इस प्रकार से होता है कि लोकसभा में शमल नहीं होना दमन हो जाता है। लोकसभा में चीजों को अच्छे तरीके से लाकर शान्ति नहीं रहती बल्कि दबाये जाया करते हैं मामले और जहाँ पर दबेगा वहाँ पर जरूर कुछ-न-कुछ

ख़राब चीज़ होकर रहेगी इतना नहीं दबाया जाय। जैसा मैंने एक दफ़े कहा था आध घंटे के लिए, पौन घंटे के लिए एक छोटा काम रोको प्रस्ताव दे दिया करें जिसमें इस सवाल पर आदमी अपनी बात कह दे तो ऐसी कोई अनुचित चीज़ नहीं होगी और इसीलिए . . .

उपाध्यक्ष महोदय : आप ने अपनी बात आज फिर कह दी। पहले भी कई दफ़े आपने यही कहा है।

डा० राम मनोहर लोहिया: लेकिन आपने उस पर कोई एक्शन तो नहीं लिया।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : मैंने आप से हमेशा कहा है कि आप चाहते हैं कि जिन तरीकों के जरिए हम लोकसभा को चला रहे हैं वे दुरुस्त नहीं हैं और उन में संशोधन करने की जरूरत है। पार्लियामेंट के क्रायदे बदले जायें और उसको और तरीके से चलाया जाय।

डा० राम मनोहर लोहिया : नियमों को दूसरे तरीके से लागू करें। आप खुद भी नियमों को दूसरे तरीके से लागू करें।

अध्यक्ष महोदय मैंने आप की बात सुन ली। Mr. Banerjee.

Shri Alvares: I rise on a point of order.

Mr. Speaker: I might be allowed to proceed. There is no point of order. What is the point of order that Mr. Alvares wants to raise?

Shri Alvares: The remark of Mr. Bhattacharyya which triggered off this incident has resulted in the suspension of Mr. Hem Barua. That remark has now been withdrawn. If it had not been made, in all likelihood, that incident could not have occurred. Sir, I may quote something which, I remember, you said during the civic reception in Bombay where the Presiding Officers' Conference was held. You said that Lok Sabha will always reflect the state of conditions in the country outside. Mr. Hem Barua

[Shri Alvares]

raised the question of defence and of the necessity of being aware of it. I am sorry that Mr. Bhattacharyya could characterise that as playing to the gallery. Now that he has subsequently withdrawn that remark, I think, it will be proper for you to review the question of the suspension of Mr. Hem Barua.

Mr. Speaker: It cannot be done in this manner. Mr. Banerjee.

Shri S. M. Banerjee: It appears from the replies... .

Mr. Speaker: When a decision has been taken by the House, I might make it clear that unless the Member expresses regret, there is no question of my putting the same question to the House at any moment.

12.37 hrs.

CALLING ATTENTION TO MATTER
OF URGENT PUBLIC
IMPORTANCE—*contd.*

(i) FIRING BY PAKISTANI TROOPS ON
THE CHIEF MINISTER OF PUNJAB AND
PARTY FROM ACROSS THE CEASEFIRE
LINE—*contd.*

Shri S. M. Banerjee (Kanpur): Sir, I would like to know from the hon. Minister if no security could be given to the Chief Minister of Punjab though his programme was better known to the Punjab Armed Constabulary forces which were posted there. I would like to know what steps have been taken to safeguard the interests of those who are in the border area and whether they have been given adequate arms and ammunition.

Shri A. M. Thomas: The security was given to the Chief Minister. But, of course, this firing was quite unprovoked. There is no doubt about that. With regard to the arming of the people on the frontier, we have got the troops there and we have also got the Punjab Armed Police stationed there.

Mr. Speaker: That is all. We shall now take up the Privilege Motion tabled by Mr. Ram Sewak Yadav. Shri Ram Sewak Yadav.

Some hon. Members rose—

Mr. Speaker: Order, order. The Members shall resume their seats.

श्री श्रीकारलाल बेरवा (कोटा): सारे नाम नोटिस में दिये हुए हैं।

श्री गुलशन (भटिंडा): अध्यक्ष महोदय, यह पंजाब का मामला है सारे नाम उसमें दर्ज हैं और जिनके नाम दर्ज हैं उनको बुनाया जाना चाहिए।

अध्यक्ष महोदय: ठीक है पंजाब का मामला है। आप इसे और किसी शकल में फिर ले आइयेगा और मैं उस पर गौर कर लूंगा।

श्री युद्धवीर सिंह (महेन्द्रगढ़): इस पर पंजाब के मेम्बरों को बुलाया जाय। जिनके नाम दर्ज हैं उनको तो बुलाया ही जाय।

अध्यक्ष महोदय: जी नहीं, अब इस पर मैं और ज्यादा वक्त नहीं दे सकता।

श्री हुकम चन्द कछवाय: अध्यक्ष महोदय ने यह परम्परा चलाई है कि जिनके नाम में नोटिस आया है उन सब को सवाल पूछने का मौका दिया जायगा... .

अध्यक्ष महोदय: मैं कई दफे कह चुका हूँ कि जब नाम बहुत ज्यादा हों तो हर एक मेम्बर को बुलाना लाजिमी नहीं है। काफ़ी वक्त हम ने इस पर खर्च किया है। अब हम प्रीविलेज मोशन ले रहे हैं।

श्री हुकम चन्द कछवाय: कल राध ने एक कॉलिग अटेंशन नोटिस पर जिसमें 34 नाम दर्ज थे उन सभी 34 के चौतीसों को मौका दिया था तो फिर आज सब को मौका क्यों नहीं दिया जाता है ?