

Shri M. R. Krishna (Peddapalli): Why is there this announcement in Parliament about fasting?

संस्कृत-कार्य तथा संचार मंत्री (श्री सत्य नारायण सिंह) : माननीय सदस्य बड़े धर्मात्मा गिने जाते हैं। गीता और रामायण का पाठ भी वह बहुत करते हैं। उनको मैं एक बात याद दिलाना चाहता हूँ वादा भंग की। आपको याद होगा कि महाभारत में भगवान कृष्ण ने कहा था कि हम कभी धायुद्ध नहीं पकड़ेंगे। हुआ यह कि दस दिन बाद भीष्म ने धायुद्ध पकड़वा दिया। हाउस ने मुझ को वादे से टलवा दिया। मैं क्या करूँ ?

Shri A. P. Sharma (Buxar): Regarding the proposed statement by the hon. Commerce Minister at 2-30 P.M., I would submit that it is a very important subject, and, therefore, we should be allowed to ask questions after the statement is made.

Mr. Speaker: That would be seen at that time.

11.23 hrs.

**QUESTION OF PRIVILEGE AGAINST
SHRI MADHU LIMAYE**

Mr. Speaker: Now, Shri G. N. Dixit might only ask for leave to raise the question of privilege against Shri Madhu Limaye....

Shri G. N. Dixit (Etawah): Under rule 225....

Mr. Speaker: He might only ask for leave now.

Shri G. N. Dixit: Under rule 225, I had raised the question of privilege, and it was objected to. Under rule 225(2)....

श्री किशन पटनायक (सम्बलपुर) :
नए सिरे से क्या होगा ? कल उन्होंने मूव किया था क्या ?

Mr. Speaker: Now, he might ask for leave.

Shri G. N. Dixit: I ask for leave to raise the question of privilege, under rule 225(2).

Shri S. M. Banerjee (Kanpur): On a point of order. I raise on a point of order under rule 223. As I pointed out yesterday also, rule 223 reads thus:

"A member wishing to raise a question of privilege shall give notice in writing to the Secretary before the commencement of the sitting on the day the question is proposed to be raised. If the question raised is based on a document, the notice shall be accompanied by the document."

I hope that you, Sir, have satisfied yourself on these two counts.

Rule 224 reads thus:

"The right to raise a question of privilege shall be governed by the following conditions, namely:

- (i) not more than one question shall be raised at the same sitting;
- (ii) the question shall be restricted to a specific matter of recent occurrence;
- (iii) the matter requires the intervention of the House."

Mr. Speaker: He had made that point yesterday also.

Shri S. M. Banerjee: On the 17th August, 1966, just after the Question Hour, this was what you had stated. I am reading out from the proceedings of the House. It is as follows:

'RE: Question of Privilege against the Minister of Food and Agriculture.

Mr. Speaker: There was a breach of privilege notice given by Shri Madhu Limaye in the first instance, and then by three Members Shri Daji and Shri S. M. Banerjee

[Mr. Speaker]

and by Shri Madhu Limaye again after four days'.

Then, you argued and ultimately you said:

"So far as this privilege is concerned, it is of the utmost importance that the notice must be given immediately at the very first opportunity; a delay of one day or two days has been held to be fatal to the entertainment of any notice of breach of privilege...."

Then, Shri Kamath had interrupted and said:

"You were pleased to say that there should not be delay of even 24 hours, that a delay of even 24 hours may be fatal to the privilege motion."

Then, there were interruptions, and Shri Kamath said:

"Please keep quiet...."

Then, you had said:

"Order, order. Both sides will kindly listen to me."

And we listened as we are listening now. Then, you had said:

"There are decisions in which two days, three days have been held to be fatal."

Here, what is the specific subject? The specific subject is that Shri Madhu Limaye had sent a letter to you in the form of a privilege motion which read as follows:

"I hereby give notice of a privilege motion against one gentleman styling himself as Colonel Amrik Singh alias K. S. Sahi. . . . If the document exists, then Mr. Jit Paul, against whom a breach of privilege motion is already pending in the House, would be guilty of another grave breach of privilege...."

Shri G. N. Dixit: On a point of order. The hon. Member is going

back on the proceedings which had taken place yesterday and which you had closed yesterday when you were going to ask for voting. Therefore, rules 224 and 225 would not apply now and they are gone.

Mr. Speaker: Shri S. M. Banerjee, I think, had argued that point yesterday.

Shri S. M. Banerjee: I had not quoted at that time because I had not got the document then.

Then, Shri Madhu Limaye had said in his letter as follows:

"It is not for me to say whether this document exists or not. All I know is that this constitutes a scurrilous attack on the Hon. Speaker. It is for the House and the Privilege Committee to look into the existence or otherwise of this document and haul up Col. Amrik Singh or Mr. Jit Paul as the case may be for breach of privilege."

Then, he went a step further and said. . . .

Shri M. R. Krishna (Peddapalli): These are all details. Are you allowing him to go into all those things now?

Shri G. N. Dixit: On a point of order. . . .

Shri S. M. Banerjee: I am coming to another point now.

Mr. Speaker: He should say that straightway.

Shri S. M. Banerjee: I am not as capable as you, Sir, or the other Members. . . .

Mr. Speaker: What is the use of casting these reflections? I am asking him to give me the points or the facts straightway.

Shri S. M. Banerjee: I have my own limitations both in regard to language

and in regard to expression also. Kindly hear me. My hon. friend opposite had taken at least half an hour yesterday.

Mr. Speaker: That was because he was the Mover. But the hon. Member Shri S. M. Banerjee is only raising a point of order.

Shri S. M. Banerjee: I only want to quote your own rulings. The rule says that not more than one question shall be raised at the same sitting and that the question shall be restricted to a specific matter of recent occurrence. In other words, the thing should have happened recently. In this case, on what is this question of privilege based? It is based on the Eleventh Report of the Privileges Committee which was laid on the Table of the House and which was taken up yesterday for consideration. So, the hon. Member's motion for breach of privilege is not based suddenly on any document, but it is based on the report, on the findings of the Members of the Privileges Committee. More than three months or so have elapsed since Shri Madhu Limaye had written that letter. Shri G. N. Dixit had never the wisdom to raise it then. He is seeking to raise it only now. Therefore, my submission is that this motion does not fulfil the conditions laid down.

I, therefore, crave your indulgence and request you to kindly consider the point of order on this line and see whether this has been done on the basis of any incident of a recent occurrence or whether this is a deliberate attack with *mala fide* intention and because of the axis of Shri Atulya Ghosh and Shri S. K. Patil against Shri Madhu Limaye. (*Interruptions*)

श्री मधु लिमये (मुंगेर) : मेरे खिलाफ इतने आरोप लगाए गए हैं। अब श्री बनर्जी के एक वाक्य कहने पर क्यों एतराज किया जा रहा है ?

श्री बड़े (खारगोन) : अध्यक्ष महोदय, मेरा पायंट ऑफ ऑर्डर है।

पहली बात तो यह है कि यह कोई रिसट आकरेंस नहीं है। दूसरी बात यह है कि इस सदन के सदस्यगण अपने कर्तव्य का पालन करने के लिए यहां पर प्रस्ताव और मोशन आदि लाते हैं। जहां तक प्रिविलेज मोशन का सम्बन्ध है, आप चैम्बर में बैठ कर उन के बारे में फैसला करते हैं। तो आप ने इस प्रिविलेज मोशन के बारे में ऐसा क्यों नहीं किया ? आप किसी भी प्रिविलेज मोशन को एज स्पीकर एलाऊ या डिसएलाऊ करते हैं। एज श्री हुकम सिंह नहीं। कल आप ने कहा कि चूंकि आप इस में पर्सनली इन्वाल्ड है, इस लिए आप ने इस को एलाऊ किया। वास्तव में प्रिविलेज कमेटी की रिपोर्ट में जो एविडेंस दिया गया है, वह रट्टी की टोकरी में फेंकने लायक है। उस के आधार पर इस प्रिविलेज मोशन को लाने की इजाजत नहीं देनी चाहिए थी। आप को स्पीकर और श्री हुकम सिंह के बीच में फर्क करना चाहिए था और एज स्पीकर इस बारे में निर्णय करना चाहिए था। आप को अपने चैम्बर में ही इस प्रिविलेज मोशन को डिसएलाऊ कर देना चाहिए था। इस मामले में कोई ब्रीच ऑफ प्रिविलेज नहीं हुआ है। यह केवल इस लिए हाउस में आ रहा है, क्योंकि आप इस में पर्सनली इन्वाल्ड हैं। क्या इस का अर्थ यह है कि कोई मॅम्बर केवल इस लिए कोई प्रिविलेज मोशन नहीं ला सकता है, क्योंकि स्पीकर उस में पर्सनली इन्वाल्ड है ? अगर आप इस तरह प्रिविलेज मोशन को लाने की इजाजत देंगे, तो भविष्य में अपोजीशन के किसी सदस्य को कोई प्रिविलेज मोशन लाने की हिम्मत नहीं होगी। इसी तरह कई कॅसिज में मिनिस्टर्ज इन्वाल्ड होते हैं ; तो क्या इसी कारण हम किसी प्रिविलेज मोशन को हाउस में नहीं ला सकते हैं ? इस प्रकार इस प्रिविलेज मोशन को लाने देना बहुत अनुचित है।

Shri S. M. Banerjee: It has been done with a view to wreak vengeance. Shri Madhu Limaye has exposed them to the hilt.

डा० राम मनोहर लोहिया (ऊर्ध्वावाद) : अध्यक्ष महोदय, जहाँ तक प्रक्रिया का सम्बन्ध है, मैं आप से भ्रज करना चाहता हूँ कि विशेषाधिकार समिति को यह प्रस्ताव देने से पहले इस सदन में इस पर बहस होनी चाहिए। इस बहस का अवसर आप या तो अपनी अनुमति देने से पहले, सदस्यों के इस पर बोट देने से पहले दीजिए, या इस के बाद दीजिए, लेकिन बिना बहस के यह प्रस्ताव विशेषाधिकार समिति के पास नहीं जाना चाहिए। क्योंकि यह एक सदस्य, श्री मधु लिमये की मन की स्थिति के बारे में है। मन की स्थितियाँ कई हों सकती हैं। मैं विवाद के लिए यह मान सकता हूँ कि श्री मधु लिमये के मन में शायद यह बात रही हो कि वह आपका नीचा दिखाना चाहते हैं। श्री दीक्षित ने एक बात आप के सामने रखी जिस का आप पर असर पड़ा।

उन के मन की दूसरी स्थिति यह हो सकती है कि दिल्ली में जो बड़े बड़े लोगों के, या सरकार के, जो दस पंद्रह हजार प्रादमी घूमते फिरते रहते हैं, जो रिफ्त के प्रादमी हैं, जो सम्बन्ध कायम करते हैं, लेन देन चलाते हैं, किसी तरह से दिल्ली को उन से राहत दिलानी चाहिए। अगर इन दस पंद्रह हजार में से तीन, चार, पाँच, सात प्रादमी भी खतम हो जायें, कम हो जायें, तो एक बड़ा भारी काम हो जायेगा। हो सकता है कि श्री मधु लिमये के मन में यह बात रही हो।

हो सकता है कि उन के मन में यह रहा हो कि अगर कोई प्रादमी जान-बूझ कर लोगों को बदनाम करता है, अगर ऐसे प्रादमी को अच्छी तरह से कोई सजा मिल जाये, तो फिर बाकी लोगों के लिए आगे के लिए वह मिसाल बन जायेगी और बाकी लोग इस तरह से जल्दी में लोगों को बदनाम नहीं करेंगे। ये तीप मन की स्थितियाँ हो सकती हैं।

मैंने आप की मन की स्थिति के बारे में मैं भी कुछ भ्रज करता हूँ। आप के पास एक खत प्राप्त पहुँचा है। उस खत को से कर कुछ भ्रजवार वालों ने शायद नासमझी में शायद इस लिए कि यहाँ की कार्यवाही ठीक तरह से नहीं छपती है, हम लोगों पर यह आरोप लगाया—श्रीर कल भी कई दफ़ा यह कहा गया—कि शायद हम जाली दस्तावेज तैयार करते हैं या लोगों के चक्कर में फँस जाया करते हैं। आप का वह पत्र बिल्कुल साफ़ है। आप ने एक मंत्री को वह पत्र लिखा। उस पत्र में आप ने अपने जिले के एक प्रादमी के लिए, जो क्यू होती है, जो कायदा होता है, (Interruptions).

Mr. Speaker: Instead of discussing that, let him conclude.

डा० राम मनोहर लोहिया : उस कायदे के खिलाफ़ जा कर, क्योंकि सरकारी मकान एक कायदे से, एक नियम से, दिये जाते हैं और नियम से उस प्रादमी को मकान नहीं मिलना चाहिए था, लेकिन फिर भी आप ने मंत्री को खून लिखा, क्योंकि वह आप के जिले का है, "आउट ऑफ़ टर्न" यह शब्द . . . (Interruptions)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : अब आप मेरी स्थिति भी कह चुके हैं। अब आप बँट जाइये।

डा० राम मनोहर लोहिया : तो क्या . . . (Interruptions)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : मैं उस खत को पढ़ देता हूँ। यह हाउस और कंट्री जज करेगा। मैं लीडर आफ़ दि हाउस से कहूँगा कि वह उस खत को पढ़ दें।

They have taken advantage of that.

डा० राम मनोहर लोहिया : एडवांटेज क्या है? आप बाएँ तरफ़ से हम पर हमला करवा रहे हैं। कहा जाता है कि ये लोग गलत

खत रखा करते हैं। प्राक्सिर कोई हद हुआ करती है ?

प्रध्यक्ष महोदय : मदनस्य मदस्य बैठ जायें। मैं खत पढ़ देता हूँ।
(Interruptions)

Order, order. I will ask the Leader of the House to kindly read that letter which has been flourished twice here in this House.

डा० राम मनोहर लोहिया : पहले मैं अपनी बात खत्म करूंगा, उस के बाद।

The Leader of the House (Shri Satya Narayan Sinha) rose—

Shri Surendranath Dwivedy (Kendrapura): This is not the proper procedure. He was wanting to ask the leave of the House for a privilege motion. On that points of order have been raised. Before that is disposed of, you are asking somebody else to read something else.

Mr. Speaker: Because he has raised it.

Shri Surendranath Dwivedy: He raised another point. In the course of a particular discussion, can anyone raise any other matter which is not relevant to the matter under discussion? This is an extraneous matter.

Shri Ranga (Chittoor): We do not know about it.

Shri Surendranath Dwivedy: I do not think you should introduce it in the midst of this discussion.

Mr. Speaker: All right.

So far as these points of order are concerned, the main point made is that this is not a matter of recent occurrence, that that letter written by Shri Madhu Limaye was written to me about two months ago.

डा० राम मनोहर लोहिया : प्रध्यक्ष महोदय, तो मुझे खत्म नहीं करने देंगे ? प्राप मेरी बात तो पूरी होने दीजिए।

प्रध्यक्ष महोदय : मैं ने मून लिया है।

That letter was written to me about two months ago. That is correct. But that letter did not give any cause of action for any breach of privilege. It is only after the Privileges Committee's finding that there is no such letter that Amrik Singh had referred to that this cause has arisen. Therefore, that is not belated and that is of recent occurrence. I would now ask those Members who are in favour of leave being granted to rise in their places--As more than 25 Members have risen in their places, leave is granted.

डा० राम मनोहर लोहिया : प्रध्यक्ष महोदय : यह ठीक नहीं है। प्राप यह क्या कह रहे हैं? प्राप कैसे हम मदन को चला रहे हैं ? प्राप एक भाषण को बीच में ही खत्म कर देते हैं।

प्रध्यक्ष महोदय : मुझे कहा गया है कि इस मोशन को कमेटी को भेजने से पहले यहाँ पर बहस हो। प्रागर हाउस खुद इस बारे में फैसला करना चाहता है, तो मुझे बहस पर कोई एतराज नहीं है। (Interruptions) लेकिन प्रागर इस को कमेटी के पास भेजा जाना है, तो इस वक्त कोई बहस नहीं होगी। फिर कमेटी फैसला करेगा। (Interruptions)

श्री स० मो० बनर्जी : हम रात के नौ बजे तक बैठने के लिए तैयार हैं। यहाँ पर बहस होनी चाहिए।

प्रध्यक्ष महोदय : मेरा खयाल है कि हाउस को घोर काम करना है। इस लिए यह कमेटी देखे कि क्या बीच प्राफ़ प्रिविलेज हुआ है या नहीं। (Interruptions)

Is that the pleasure of the House?

Several hon. Members: Yes, yes.

श्री मधु लिमये : अध्यक्ष महोदय, ये लोग क्यों बहस से भाग रहे हैं ?

Shri G. N. Dixit: I move:

"That the matter be referred to the Committee of Privileges."

Mr. Speaker: Motion moved:

"That the matter be referred to the Committee of Privileges."

श्री किशन पटनायक (सम्बलपुर) : सदन में गलत कायदे से काम हो रहा है।

श्री रामसेवक यादव (बाराबंकी) : इस में मेरा एक शोधन है।

Shrimati Renu Chakravarty: (Barackpore): I wish to move an amendment that the matter should be discussed in the House.

Mr. Speaker: No, no.

Shri S. M. Banerjee: I move:

"That the question of breach of privilege for which leave has

been granted be discussed in the House."

Several Hon. Members: No, no.

Shrimati Renu Chakravarty: Why are you afraid?

Mr. Speaker: This is a substitute motion.

Shri Surendranath Dwivedy: I move:

"That the Report of the Committee be submitted to the House on Monday".

Mr. Speaker: I will put that. First I will put Shri Banerjee's motion.

The question is:

"That the question of breach of privilege for which leave has been granted be discussed in the House."

The Lok Sabha divided:

Division No. 24]

AYES

[11.47 hrs.

Banerjee, Shri S.M.
Bhattacharya, Shri Dinan
Bheel, Shri P.H.
Chatterjee, Shri H.P.
Deo, Shri P.K.
Dharmalingam, Shri
Gulshan, Shri

Gupta, Shri Kashi Ram
Kunhan, Shri P.
Lohia, Dr. Ram Manohar
Mukerjee, Shri H.N.
Nair, Shri Vasudevan
Pattayak, Shri Kishan
Roy, Dr. Saradish

Singh, Shri J.B.
Swamy, Shri Sivamurthi
Vishram Prasad, Shri
Warior, Shri
Yadav, Shri Ram Sewak
Yashpal Singh, Shri

NOES

Abdul Rashid Bakshi, Shri
Abdul Wahid, Shri T.
Achal Singh, Shri
Achuthan, Shri
Alva, Shri A.S.
Alva, Shri Joachim
Azad, Shri Bhagwat Jha
Bai Krishna Singh, Shri
Balmiki, Shri
Barman, Shri P. C.
Basappa, Shri
Bhakt Uarshan, Shri
Bist, Shri J.B.S.
Brij Basi Lal, Shri
Chakravarti, Shri P.R.
Chanda, Shrimati Jyotsna
Chandak, Shri
Chandrabhan Singh, Dr.

Chandriki, Shri
Chaturvedi, Shri S.N.
Chaudhuri, Shrimati Kamala
Chavan, Shri D.R.
Chavda, Shrimati Johrabai
Das, Shri B.K.
Das, Shri N.T.
Dass, Shri C.
Desai, Shri Morarji
Deshmukh, Shrimati Vimla
Deshmukh, Shri B.D.
Dhuleshwar Meena, Shri
Dighe, Shri
Dixit, Shri G. N.
Dubey, Shri R. G.
Dwivedi, Shri M.L.
Gahmari, Shri
Gujraj Singh Rao, Shri

Govind Das, Dr.
Gowdh, Shree Veerana
Guha, Shri A. C.
Gupta, Shri Shiv Charan
Hansda, Shri Subodh
Hanumanthaiya, Shri
Harvani, Shri Anwar
Hazrika, Shri J.N.
Heda, Shri
Jadhav, Shri Tulaidas
Jajivan Ram, Shri
Jayaraman, Shri
Jedhe, Shri
Joshi, Shri A.C.
Joshi, Shrimati Subhadra
Kamble, Shri
Kappen, Shri
Kodaria, Shri C.M.

Keishing, Shri Rishang	Panna Lal, Shri	Satyabhama Devi, Shrimati
Khan, Shri Shah Nawaz	Patel, Shri N.N.	Sen, Shri P.G.
Kindar Lal, Shri	Patil, Shri D.S.	Shah, Shri Manubhai
Kisan Veer, Shri	Patil, Shri M.B.	Shah, Shrimati Ja aben
Kotoki, Shri Liladhar	Patil, Shri S.B.	Shakuntala Devi, Shrimati
Koujalgi, Shri H.V.	Patil, Shri S.K.	Shankaraiya, Shri
Kripa Shankar, Shri	Patil, Shri T.A.	Sharma, Shri D.C.
Krishna, Shri M.R.	Patil, Shri V.T.	Sharma, Shri K.C.
Kureel, Shri B.N.	Pattabhi Ramen, Shri C.R.	Sheo Narain, Shri
Laskar, Shri N.R.	Prahhakar, Shri Naval	Shree Narayan Das, Shri
Linga Reddy, Shri H.C.	Pratap Singh, Shri	Siddananappa, Shri
Lonikar, Shri	Puri, Shri D.D.	Sid fiah, Shri
Mahadeo Prasad, Shri	Raja, Shri C.R.	Sidheshwar Prasad, Shri
Mahadeva Prasad, Dr.	Raju, Shri D.B.	Singh, Shri K.K.
Mahida, Shri Narendra Singh	Ram, Shri T.	Sinha, Shrimati Ramdulari
Mali Mariyappa, Shri	Ram Sewak, Shri	Sinha, Shri Satya Narayan
Maihotra, Shri Inder J.	Ram Swarup, Shri	Sinha, Shrimati Tarkeshwari
Mandal, Dr. P.	Ramdhani Das, Shri	Sivapraghassan, Shri Ku.
Mantri, Shri D.D.	Rameshekhar Prasad Singh, Shri	Snatak, Shri Nardeo
Masuriya Din, Shri	Rane, Shri	Soundaram Ramachandran,
Mathur, Shri Harish Chandra	Ranga Rao, Shri	Shrimati
Mathur, Shri Shiv Charan	Ranjit Singh, Shri	Subbaraman, Shri
Mehrotra, Shri Braj Bihari	Rao, Shri Hanmanth	Subramanyam, Shri T.
Mehta, Shri J.R.	Rao, Shri Jaganatha	Sumat Prasad, Shri
Melkote, Dr.	Rao, Shri Muthyal	Swaran Singh, Shri
Menon, Shri P.G.	Rao, Shri Rajagopala	Thengal, Shri Nallakoya
Mirza, Shri Bakar Ali	Rao, Shri Ramapathi	Thomas, Shri A.M.
Mishra, Shri Bibhuti	Rao, Shri Rameshwar	Tiwary, Shri D.N.
Mishra, Shri M.P.	Rattan Lal, Shri	Tiwary, Shri K.N.
Mohammad Yusuf, Shri	Raut, Shri Bhola	Tiwary, Shri R.S.
Mohanty, Shri Gokulananda	Ray, Shrimati Renuka	Tripathy, Shri Krishna Deo
Mohsin, Shri	Reddi, Dr. B. Gopala	Ulkey, Shri
Morarka, Shri	Reddier, Shri	Ulaka, Shri Ramachandra
More, Shri K.L.	Reddy, Shri Narayan	Upadhyaya, Shri Shiva Dutt
Muthiah, Shri	Reddy, Shri Ramkrishna	Vaishya, Shri M.B.
Naidu, Shri, V.G.	Reddy, Shri Surender	Valvi, Shri
Naik, Shri D.J.	Roy, Shri Bishwanath	Varma, Shri Ravindra
Naskar, Shri P.S.	Sahu, Shri Rameshwar	Veerappa, Shri
Neelamony, Shri	Saigal, Shri A.S.	Vyas, Shri Radhelal
Niranjan Lal, Shri	Samnani, Shri	Yadab, Shri, N.P.
Pandey, Shri R.S.	Sanji Rupji, Shri	Yadav, Shri Ram Harkh
Pandey, Shri Vishwa Nath	Saraf, Shri Sham Lal	Yadava, Shri B.P.

Mr. Speaker: The result of the division is:

Ayes 20; Noes 179.

The motion was negatived.

Mr. Speaker: Now, I put Mr. Dixit's motion. The question is:

"That the matter be referred to the Committee of Privileges."

Shri Surendranath Dwivedy: My motion should first be put.

2374 (A1) LSD—2.

अध्यक्ष महोदय : पहले यह कमेटी को जायगा तभी तो आप का मॉशन आयागा ।

Shri Vasudevan Nair (Ambalapuruzha): Will he explain how it can be done? There is one Sunday.

Mr. Speaker: The question is:

"That the matter be referred to the Committee of Privileges."

The Lok Sabha divided.

Division No. 25]

AYES

[11.49 hrs.

- Abdul Rashid Bakshi, Shri
 Abdul Wahid, Shri T.
 Achal Singh, Shri
 Achuthan, Shri
 Alva, Shri A.S.
 Alva, Shri Joachim
 zad, Shri Bhagwat Jha
 Bai Krishna Singh, Shri
 Balmiki, Shri
 Barman, Shri P.C.
 Bhakt Darshan, Shri
 Bist, Shri J.B.S.
 Brij Basi Lal, Shri
 Chakraverti, Shri P.R.
 Chanda, Shrimati Jyotsna
 Chandak, Shri
 Chandrabhan Singh, Dr.
 Chandriki, Shri
 Chaturvedi, Shri S.N.
 Chaudhry, Shri Chandramani Lal
 Chauhuri, Shrimati Kamala
 Chavan, Shri D.R.
 Chavda, Shrimati Johraben
 Das, Shri B.K.
 Das, Shri N.T.
 Dass, Shri C.
 Dasji, Shri Morari
 Deshmukh, Shrimati Vimla
 Deshmukh, Shri B.D.
 Duleshwar Meena, Shri
 Dighe, Shri
 Dixit, Shri G.N.
 Dubey, Shri R.G.
 Dwivedi, Shri M.L.
 Gahmari, Shri
 Gajraj Singh Rao, Shri
 Govind Das, Dr.
 Gowdh, Shri Veeranna
 Guha, Shri A.C.
 Gupta, Shri Shiv Charan
 Hansda, Shri Subodh
 Hanumanthaiya, Shri
 Harvani, Shri Anwar
 Hazrika, Shri J.N.
 Heda, Shri
 Jadhav, Shri Tulcidas
 Jagjivan Ram, Shri
 Jayaraman, Shri
 Jedhe, Shri
 Joshi, Shri A.C.
 Joshi, Shrimati Subhadra
 Kamble, Shri
 Kappen, Shri
 Kedaris, Shri C.M.
 Kelshing, Shri Rishang
 Khan, Shri Shah Nawaz
 Kinkar Lal, Shri
 Kisan Veer, Shri
 Koroki, Shri Lijadhar
 Koushali, Shri H.V.
 Kripa Shankar, Shri
 Krishna, Shri, M.R.
 Kureel, Shri B.N.
 Laskar, Shri N.R.
 Lina Reddy, Shri H.C.
 Lonkar, Shri
 Mahadeo Prasad, Shri
 Mahadeva Prasad, Dr.
 Mahida, Shri Narendra Singh
 Mali Mariyappa, Shri
 Malhotra, Shri Inder J.
 Mandal, Dr. P.
 Mantri, Shri D.D.
 Manuriya Din, Shri
 Mathur, Shri Harish Chandra
 Mathur, Shri Shiv Charan
 Mehrotra, Shri Braj Bihari
 Mehta, Shri J.R.
 Melkote, Dr.
 Menon, Shri P.G.
 Mirza, Shri Bakar Ali
 Mishra, Shri Bibhuti
 Mishra, Shri M.P.
 Mohammad Yusuf, Shri
 Mohanty, Shri Gokulananda
 Mohsin, Shri
 Morarka, Shri
 More, Shri K.L.
 Muthiah, Shri
 Naidu, Shri V.G.
 Naik, Shri D.J.
 Naikar, Shri P.S.
 Neasmony, Shri
 Niranjan Lal, Shri
 Pandey, Shri R.S.
 Pandey, Shri Vishwa Nath
 Panna Lal, Shri
 Patel, Shri Chhotubhai
 Patel, Shri N.N.
 Patil, Shri D.S.
 Patil, Shri M.B.
 Patil, Shri S.B.
 Patil, Shri S.K.
 Patil, Shri T.A.
 Pattabhi Raman, Shri C.R.
 Prabhakar, Shri Naval
 Pratap Singh,
 Puri, Shri D.D.
 Raju, Shri C.G.
 Raju, Shri D.B.
 Ram, Shri T.
 Ram Sewak, Shri
 Ram Swarup, Shri
 Ramdhani Das, Shri
 Ramchekhar Prasad Singh, Shri
 Rane, Shri
 Ranga Rao, Shri
 Ranjit Singh, Shri
 Rao, Shri Hanmant
 Rao, Shri Jagannath
 Rao, Shri Muthyal
 Rao, Shri Rajagopala
 Rao, Shri Ramapathi
 Rao, Shri Ramchawar
 Rattan Lal, Shri
 Raut, Shri Bhola
 Ray, Shrimati Rezuka
 Reddi, Dr. B. Gopala
 Reddiar, Shri
 Reddy, Shri Narayan
 Reddy, Shri Ramkrishna
 Reddy, Shri Suresnder
 Roy, Shri Bishwanath
 Sahu, Shri Ramchawar
 Saigal, Shri A.S.
 Samnani, Shri
 Sanji Rupji, Shri
 Satyabhama Devi, Shrimati
 Sen, Shri P.G.
 Shah, Shri Manubhai
 Shah, Shrimati Jayaben
 Shakuntala Devi, Shrimati
 Shankaraiya, Shri
 Sharma, Shri A.P.
 Sharma, Shri D.C.
 Sharma, Shri K.C.
 Sheo Narain, Shri
 Shree Narayan Das, Shri
 Siddananappa, Shri
 Siddhanti, Shri Jagdev Singh
 Siddiah, Shri
 Sidheshwar Prasad, Shri
 Singh, Shri K.K.
 Sinha, Shrimati Ramdulari
 Sinha, Shri Satiya Narayan
 Sinha, Shrimati Tarakeshwari
 Sivapraghassan, Shri Ku.
 Sniatak, Shri Nardeo
 Soundaram Ramchandran, Shrimati
 Subharaman, Shri
 Subramanyam, Shri T.
 Somar Prasad, Shri
 Swaran Singh, Shri
 Thengal, Shri Nallakoya
 Thomas, Shri A.M.
 Tiwary, Shri D.N.
 Tiwary, Shri K.N.
 Tripathi, Shri Krishna Deo
 Uikay, Shri
 Ulaka, Shri Ramachandra
 Upadhayaya, Shri Shiva Dutt
 Valahya, Shri, M.B.
 Valvi, Shri
 Varma, Shri Ravindra
 Veerappa, Shri
 Vyar, Shri Radhela
 Yadav, Shri N.P.
 Yadav, Shri Ram Harish.
 Yadava, Shri B.P.

NOES

Banerjee, Shri S.M.
Bhattacharya, Shri Dinen
Bheal, Shri P.H.
Chatterjee, Shri H.P.
Dharmalingam, Shri
Gulshan, Shri
Gupta, Shri Kashi Ram

Kunhan, Shri P.
Lohia, Dr. Ram Manohar
Mukerjee, Shri H.N.
Nair, Shri Vasudevan
Pattnayak, Shri Klahan
Roy, Dr. Sarad'lah
Singh, Shri J.B.

Swamy, Shri Sivamurtbi
Tiwary, Shri R.S.
Vishram Prasad, Shri
Wazior, Shri
Yadav, Shri Ram Sewak
Yeabpal Singh, Shri

Mr. Speaker: The result of the division is:

Ayes: 179; *Noes* 20

The motion was adopted.

श्री च० ला० चौबरी (मद्रुघा) : मेरा बोट ठीक नोट नहीं हुआ है। मशीन ने ठीक काम नहीं किया है।

श्री जगदेव सिंह राखिन्ती (झज्जर) : मेरी मशीन भी ठीक काम नहीं कर रही है।

Mr. Speaker: That would be taken into account. Mr. Dwivedy has said that the Committee be asked to report by Monday. That would be physically impossible.

Shri Surendranath Dwivedy: My amendment is that the Committee should sit tomorrow, although it is a Sunday because the last day available to us is Monday and there is the desire that this matter should be disposed of before we adjourned. If the Committee reports by Monday, the House will have the opportunity to discuss that matter also.

Shrimati Renu Chakravartty: What is the point in sending it to the Committee of Privileges? Let us understand it. We understand that they have a stick and they have got a big handle to beat. But whether they will beat at all, I do not know. The point now is this. What is going to happen to this Privilege Committee's report? In the lame duck session, you will come and we will have no time to take it up because we cannot take up any extraneous matters. Where do we stand?

श्री मधु लिमये : अब अध्यक्ष महोदय, इस के बारे में मुझे सुनिए।

डा० राम मनोहर लोहिया : अध्यक्ष महोदय, इस समिति में इस के ऊपर पूरी तरह से बहस होनी चाहिए। वह रपट कल प्राये या साल भर में प्राये, वर्षों में प्राये इससे मतलब नहीं है लेकिन इस के ऊपर पूरी तरह से जांच होनी चाहिए। कहीं ऐसा न हो जाय कि संक्षिप्त रूप से बिन्सी तरह से फैसला कर दिया जाय . . .

अध्यक्ष महोदय : यह मैं भी इस से इत्त हाक करता हूँ।

डा० राम मनोहर लोहिया : मधु लिमये को बुलाया जाना चाहिए। मधु लिमये को अपनी पूरी बात कहने का मौका दिया जाना चाहिए और अगर हमारे जैसे प्रादमी कुछ कहना चाहें तो मुझको भी मौका मिलना चाहिए।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : अब यह तो कमेटी की बात होगी। कमेटी के ऊपर में कोई पाबन्दी नहीं लगा सकता।

मगर यह मुनासिब नहीं होगा कि उन को परसों तक कहा जाय कि परसों रिपोर्ट प्रानी चाहिए। यह उनके ऊपर छोड़ दिया जाय।

Shri N. C. Chatterjee (Burdwan): I want to point out that it is a physically impossible burden on us, on the committee of privileges. We cannot possibly do justice to it because it has got to be thrashed out properly; it will take time. We will have to hear Mr. Limaye and Dr. Lohia and others also.

श्री अध्यक्ष महोदय : मिस्टर बहली राम भगत। . . .

अब वह चिट्ठी, कृक उसका जिक्र प्राया इसमिए सीडर आफ दि हाउस उस चिट्ठी

को हाउस को पढ़ दें ताकि हाउस को श्रीर कंट्री को पता चल जाय और वह उस के बारे में स्वयं जज कर लें। यह वह चिट्ठी है जिसके बारे में लोहिया साहब ने जिक्र किया था और जिसे उन्होंने दिखाया था कि यह डाक्यूमेंट है उनके हाथ में स्पीकर साहब के खिलाफ पटनायक जी ने इसे आपके पास भेजा था। मैं समझता हूँ कि हाउस को श्रीर कंट्री को यह मालूम होना चाहिए कि वह चिट्ठी क्या है। . . . (व्यवधान) . . . यह वह चिट्ठी है जिसको उन्होंने दिखाया था। यह है सरदार हुकम सिंह, The Speaker, Lok Sabha. की तरफ से This is marked personal and confidential.

An hon. Member: What is the date?

The Leader of the House (Shri Satya Narayan Sinha): It is, New Delhi, 19th February, 1964. It reads:

"Dear Shri Bhagavati,

One Mr. Sardul Singh of G. S. Cables was given temporary allotment of a quarter for three months only. He has migrated from my home district and, therefore, his mother came to me and explained the circumstances and that his family is in urgent necessity of a quarter out of turn.

I am just drawing your attention to this case to see whether anything can be done for this family . . .

Shri D. C. Sharma (Gurdaspur): This does not mean anything.

Shri Satya Narayan Sinha:

"I am sending herewith a copy of the original letter of temporary allotment."

Yours sincerely".

प्रध्यक्ष महोदय : अब मैंबर साहबान श्रीर कंट्री जज कर लेंगे कि मैं ने इस में क्या किया है (व्यवधान)

Shri B. S. Pandey (Guna): It is not only that Dr. Lohia has created a sensation by showing this letter. Here

is that letter. I would invite the Leader of the House to see the letter. By that letter, Dr. Lohia has in fact tried to show that there might be something very bad, something sensational, something unfortunate, in that letter that was written by you and that in the contents you wanted to support a movement and just request the Government that some concession has to be shown. Let the country know what kind of attitude is taken by Dr. Lohia towards the highest, august person who is presiding over the destiny of this country.

Some hon. Members: Shame, shame (Interruption).

डा० राम मनोहर लोहिया : अब यह झुंड चुप हो गया है। यह कायदे-कानून की बात नहीं रही, यह सिफारिश की बात हो गई है। यह खत करप्ट-प्रेक्टिसिज में आ सकता है।

श्री सत्य नारायण सिन्हा : मैं हाउस की इन्फार्मेशन के लिए श्रीर जो नहीं जानते हैं, उनके लिए साफ करना चाहता हूँ कि जिस बात पर बहुत स्ट्रेस दिया जाता है—ग्राउट-ग्राफ्टर्न एलाटमेंट, मिनिस्टर लोगों को भ्रष्टितयार है कि वह ग्राउट-ग्राफ्टर्न एलाटमेंट दे सकते हैं।

श्री राम सेवक यादव : जब कोई सिफारिश करेगा, तब होगा न ग्राउट-ग्राफ्टर्न एलाटमेंट।

Shrimati Renu Chakravartty: If it is a normal thing, why should it be marked confidential?

श्री मधु सिन्घे : इस का खुलासा दीजिये कि यह कान्फीडेन्शियल क्यों था ?

11.53 hrs.

PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE
NOTIFICATION UNDER CUSTOMS ACT

The Minister of State in the Ministry of Finance (Shri B. R. Bhagat): Sir, I beg to lay on the Table—

(1) A copy of Notification No. G.S.R. 1795 published in