

supply of military aid to Pakistan during the last four months?

**Shrimati Indira Gandhi:** As regards the last part of the question, I have already answered it in my statement itself, that they have not given any arms and no such agreement was made.

With regard to Israel, it did not crop up at all in our conversation. I am not aware of any statement which the hon. Member has attributed to us.

**श्री ज० ब० सिंह (घोसी) :** आपने वहाँ डिवैल्युएशन के बारे में कोई बात नहीं की क्या उनकी तरफ से डिवैल्युएशन के बारे में आप से किसी लेवल पर कुछ बात हुई? आपके और लोग भी गए थे। क्या उन से या किसी और लेवल पर उन्होंने कुछ बात की?

**श्रीमती इन्दिरा गांधी :** जी, नहीं।

**Shri Umanath (Pudukkottai):** In the joint communique signed by our Government and the Soviet Government there is reference to threat to peace from imperialist forces. As soon as our Prime Minister came back to our country, she said that this particular word "imperialist" did not refer to the USA Government. If so, may I know which is the particular Government that is referred to, or which are the particular forces that are referred to? Forces or Governments cannot exist in the air. So, we want to know with what understanding the Prime Minister signed that communique stating that imperialist forces were threatening peace.

**Shrimati Indira Gandhi:** This expression has often been used in international parlance as well as in the United Nations. It is a general statement about certain forces. It did not specifically apply to any specific country as such.

**Shri Umanath:** Where do they exist?

**Shrimati Indira Gandhi:** They exist everywhere, in many countries; they exist in China, they exist in the old

colonial countries and many others.

**Shri Umanath:** Do they exist in the Soviet Union also?

**Shri U. M. Trivedi:** You are talking of South Vietnam. Twenty million people were killed by China, we never opened our eyes.

16.32 hrs.

MOTION RE. PRESENT ECONOMIC SITUATION IN THE COUNTRY

**Mr. Speaker:** Shri Sachindra Chaudhuri.

**Shri Nambiar (Tiruchirapalli):** I want to have a clarification.

**The Minister of Finance (Shri Sachindra Chaudhuri) rose—**

**श्री हुकम चन्द कछवाय (देवास) :** यह प्रस्ताव नहीं रखा जा सकता है। अविश्वास के प्रस्ताव पर पहले बहस होनी चाहिये। यह नहीं लिया जाना चाहिये (इंटरप्शन)।

**अध्यक्ष महोदय :** एक आदमी कोई बात कहे तो मैं सुन भी सकता हूँ। इस तरह से मैं कैसे सुन सकता हूँ।

**Shrimati Renu Chakravartty (Barackpore):** We will not allow Mr. Sachindra Chaudhuri to get away with it.

**Dr. Ranen Sen (Calcutta East):** Why is he standing? You are not allowing him.

**Shrimati Renu Chakravartty:** From the morning, the Government benches have been preaching to us about parliamentary practice. The Prime Minister has issued a statement in America saying that there are some people here who want to subvert parliamentary democracy. Again we ask you. Please do not allow this Finance Minister, who has behind the back of this Parliament brought about devaluation

[Shrimati Renu Chakravartty]

after having misled this House, to get away with this motion which is nothing more than seeking a vote of confidence when there is a no-confidence motion on the very manner of devaluation being brought in the country as well as the evil effects of devaluation which has brought us not only to ruin but to the slavery of the United States. I would beg of you, as the custodian of parliamentary democracy, not to allow this discussion. If you do so, it will not be possible for us, for some of us, to allow this discussion to continue.

**Shri Tyagi (Dehra Dun):** It is important that the House knows the views of the Government with regard to the economic situation.

**Shrimati Renu Chakravartty:** No, no. We do not want to hear. They should have done it before.

**Shri Raghunath Singh (Varanasi):** You must know first.

**Shrimati Renu Chakravartty:** You are misleading us again and again. You have told us that devaluation is not going to take place, and now you have done it behind the back of Parliament.

**Dr. L. M. Singhvi (Jodhpur):** I would like to make a submission to the hon. Members on both sides of the House for consideration of a *via media*.

After all, the debate in this House can go on only with the co-operation and goodwill of all sections. I would entreat you and the Government to consider the possibility of adjourning the debate on the Finance Minister's motion after he has made his speech, without carrying it to a conclusion, without pressing it to a vote; or, alternatively, to have it clubbed with the discussion on the no-confidence motion. This will secure the precedence on which there is an insistence among the Members of the Opposition for the no-confidence motion.

It appears legitimate that the purpose of the no-confidence motion should not be completely defeated by allowing this motion as a whole to be discussed and voted upon. My submission is that the Government should make a large-hearted and graceful gesture in this matter, particularly for the preservation of the values on which parliamentary democracy is founded, namely the accommodation by the majority party of the minority group.

It is not a question of principle, it is not a question of any procedure involved. What I am suggesting is this. Let the Finance Minister make his speech, but let the discussion on that motion be adjourned, so that the no-confidence motion can be discussed; or, both the motions can be clubbed together. That is my suggestion. I think it represents a *via media* and it would involve acceptance of the principles of both sides of the House. I suggest that the Government should accept this *via media* in the interest of the values on which parliamentary democracy is founded and in the interest of accommodating in a large-hearted manner the Opposition.

**Mr. Speaker:** We have spent more than two hours on that.

**श्री बड़े (खारगौन) :** मिनिस्टर साहब का जो स्टेटमेंट है वह हो जाना चाहिये और फिर उस पर डिसकशन आगे पोस्टपॉन हो जानी चाहिये और नो-कांफिडेंस मोशन बीच में आ जानी चाहिये। यह जो सजेशन है सिधवी साहब की यह बहुत अच्छी है।

**Shri Nambiar:** After all this is a question about which the Government should not stand on prestige. What we want is a discussion on the no-confidence motion. Discussion on economic situation can be had at any time.

**Shri C. K. Bhattacharyya (Raiganj):** We have been sitting here expecting to hear the Finance Minister. We are anxious to hear the Finance Minister.

Let us hear him. It appears that democracy consists in cutting the head of the Finance Minister. Has democracy come to that?

**Mr. Speaker:** An appeal has been made to the Leader of the House.

**The Leader of the House (Shri Satya Narayan Sinha):** I have to say, Sir, that Government's position remains what I have said before... (*Interruptions*).

**Shri Vasudevan Nair (Ambalapuzha):** We do not accept him as the Finance Minister of this country. He is in the dock. How can we accept him? He is only a Chaudhuri; he is not the Finance Minister (*Interruptions*).

**Mr. Speaker:** Would they kindly sit down?

**Shri C. K. Bhattacharyya:** Throughout the day they are dictating to the Chair (*Interruptions*).

**Mr. Speaker:** I have been asked again and again to intervene and just ask the Government to take up this motion. As I have explained, I have no powers in that respect. I have seen the rules. I cannot deprive the Government of their time . . .

**Shri Manoharan (Madras South):** You can advise them.

**Mr. Speaker:** Sometimes I am the custodian of the rights of the House; sometimes I am told that I am toeing the line of the Government.

**Shri Umanath (Pudukkottai):** The prerogative should not be misused.

**Mr. Speaker:** I regret to say that I have no powers to change that order. I cannot ask them or tell them that I shall take up first the motion of no-confidence. I shall ask the Finance Minister to move his motion.

**Shri Sachindra Chaudhuri** rose—

**Some hon. Members:** No, sit down. (*Interruption*).

**Shri Nambiar:** When he sits down, we will sit down, and when he stands up, we will also stand up. We want the discussion on the no-confidence motion to be taken up.

**Mr. Speaker:** There is one thing that they should understand. They might have very strong views on this point also. Now, they say that they would not listen to the Finance Minister, and they say that if he stands, they would stand up.

**Shri Vasudevan Nair:** He can intervene in the no-confidence motion.

**Shri Nambiar:** We will give him a patient hearing, but he must also be ready to hear us and our criticism also.

**Mr. Speaker:** Order, order. That means, the decision of the Chair might be right or might be wrong, . . .

**Shri Nambiar:** What have you decided?

**Shri Prabhat Kar (Hooghly):** It is not your decision. You have expressed your helplessness.

**Shri Vasudevan Nair:** They imposed a decision on you.

**Mr. Speaker:** It is the decision of the Government. I say that. It is not my decision. But I am trying to explain that I have no power in changing that order. Therefore, if really the Members are interested in taking . . . (*Interruption*).

**Shri Manoharan:** Within the House, you are powerful; not the Government.

**Mr. Speaker:** There are certain rules. I am also bound by certain rules. If the Members are interested in the maintenance of democratic institution (*Interruption*) if they are not interested in it and if they want to close it (*Interruption*) so far as the running of democracy is concerned, of course, the minority can

[Mr. Speaker]

have their say to the fullest extent.  
(Interruption).

श्री हुकम चन्द कञ्जराय : हम वित्त मंत्री को सुनने के लिए तैयार नहीं हैं ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : यह तो नहीं हो सकता है कि आप जिस को चाहे उस को सुनेंगे और जिस को चाहे, उस को नहीं सुनेंगे । इस तरह से तो हाउस नहीं चल सकता है ।

श्री रामसेवक यादव (बाराबंकी) : मेरा सुझाव है कि . . . . .

अध्यक्ष महोदय : मुझे मालूम होना चाहिए कि कौन कौन से मेम्बर कहते हैं कि हम बिल्कुल नहीं सुनेंगे ।

श्री रामसेवक यादव : पहले आप मेरा विनम्र निवेदन सुन लीजिए और बाद में यह मालूम कर लीजिए । चूँकि रुपये के अवमूल्यन का विषय बहुत महत्वपूर्ण है, इसलिये पहले अविश्वास प्रस्ताव पर बहस होनी चाहिए । लेकिन अगर गवर्नमेंट अपनी जिद पर कायम है, तो फिर फिनांस मिनिस्टर के प्रस्ताव को हटा कर और कोई विजिनेस ले लिया जाये और उस के बाद अविश्वास प्रस्ताव आ जाये । यह बहुत सीधा सा सुझाव है, इसलिए इस को मानने में कोई आपत्ति नहीं होनी चाहिए ।

Shri Kapur Singh (Ludhiana): I am not saying against or for the developments that have taken place in the House, but if this goes on and at the same time simultaneously the hon. Finance Minister reads a statement which we cannot hear, the proceedings are farcical and something should be done about it. The speech may either be placed on the Table or treated as read.

Shri Nambiar: Let it be treated as having been laid on the Table.

Mr. Speaker: I have been here all the day in the Chair and the Mem-

bers must be sharing my feeling that it has been too great a strain on me as well. There ought to be some end to my patience also. (Interruptions).

अगर कुछ मेम्बर साहबान इस बात के लिए डेटरमिन्ड हैं कि वे कार्यवाही को नहीं चलने देंगे, तो यह मेरे बस की बात नहीं है ।

Shri Mohammad Elias (Howrah): It is a question of saving your prestige and honour. The ruling party want you to become their slave. Whatever they want, they are getting through by their majority. We would not allow it. We are fighting for saving your prestige as Speaker of this House. This is our right.

Mr. Speaker: Twice earlier also Mr. Elias has taken the same stand that he would not allow it to proceed. That is not a fair attitude.

Shri H. N. Mukerjee (Calcutta Central): It was only to uphold your prestige and the prestige of Parliament that he has been doing whatever he has been doing.

Mr. Speaker: Is this the way of doing it?

Shri H. N. Mukerjee: What hurts us all this time is in spite of the suggestion by Dr. Singhvi, who is a constitutional expert and who has produced a book also on constitutional and parliamentary procedure, not one syllable of reprimand has fallen from your lips in regard to the conduct of the Government. It hurts me. You know I would not say one word to hurt you if I can possibly help. I have the highest regard for you personally and as Speaker. But what really hurts us is that in spite of the unanimous opinion of the Opposition, not one word of reprimand has fallen from your lips in regard to the conduct of the Government. Are we to function because Government desires things to be ordered in a particular way? Is that democracy? If that is democracy, we better say good-bye to

certain things. Some of us are accustomed to decency in political behaviour. When I see the temper affecting my people outside and here, I am astounded at my own moderation and restraint. Not a word of reprimand has fallen from your lips in regard to the action of Government and that is why this farce is taking place.

**Mr. Speaker:** I am rather surprised to hear this. What was the cause for which I should reprimand the Government? (*Interruptions*). It is being thrown at me that I have not reprimanded the Government. There was no occasion for that. Whether they have done it rightly or wrongly, the House shall have to take a decision on that.

**Shri Nambiar:** What harm will come to the country if the no-confidence motion is discussed first?

**Mr. Speaker:** Mr. Chaudhuri.

**Shri Sachindra Chaudhuri:** Sir, . . . (*Interruptions*).

**Mr. Speaker:** Order, order. I am constrained to take further action now. I cannot help it. Whatever might be the result—you might blame me—I have exercised the utmost patience. That is the limit now. From the morning I have been doing it. I will now name the hon. Members, who obstruct the proceedings, one after the other. I have no other option.

**Shri Manoharan:** Sir, if you are going to allow the Finance Minister to move his motion and make a statement, my party has decided to stage a walkout.

(*Shri Manoharan and some other hon. Members then left the House.*)

**Mr. Speaker:** That is a legitimate right, of course.

Now, the Finance Minister may continue his speech. If any hon.

Member obstructs, I will have to name him.

**Shri Sachindra Chaudhuri:** Sir, . . .

**Some hon. Members:** Sit down.

**Mr. Speaker:** Order, order. The hon. Minister may resume his seat. Shri Jai Bahadur Singh has been obstructing the proceedings of the House. He does not allow the House to proceed further, deliberately and continuously. Therefore, I have to name him. Shri Jai Bahadur Singh, Member named, has obstructed the proceedings of the House continuously and deliberately, and does not allow the proceedings to take place.

**Shri J. B. Singh:** I have never obstructed, Sir. This is wrong.

**Shri Satya Narayan Sinha:** Sir, I beg to move:

"That Shri J. B. Singh, a Member of the House, named by the Speaker, be suspended from the service of the House for one month."

**Mr. Speaker:** The question is:

"That Shri J. B. Singh, a Member of the House, named by the Speaker, be suspended from the service of the House for one month."

The 'Ayes' have it.

**Some hon. Members:** The 'Noes' have it.

**Mr. Speaker:** Let the Lobbies be cleared.

The Lobbies have been cleared.

The question is:

"That Shri J. B. Singh, a Member of the House, named by the Speaker, be suspended from the service of the House for one month."

*The Lok Sabha divided:*

## Division No. 2]

[16.58 hrs.

## AYES

- Achal Singh, Shri  
 Achuthan, Shri  
 Akkamma Devi, Shrimati  
 Alva, Shri S. A.  
 Alva, Shri Joachim  
 Ankineedu, Shri  
 Azad, Shri Bhagwat Jha  
 Babunath Singh, Shri  
 Bajaj, Shri Kamalnayan  
 Bakliwal, Shri  
 Bal Krishna Singh, Shri  
 Banerjee, Dr. R.  
 Barman, Shri P. C.  
 Basant Kunwari, Shrimati  
 Basappa, Shri  
 Baswant, Shri  
 Besra, Shri  
 Bhagat, Shri B. R.  
 Bhargava, Shri M. B.  
 Bhatkar, Shri  
 Bhattacharyya, Shri C. K.  
 Bheel, Shri P. H.  
 Borooah, Shri P. C.  
 Brajeshwar Prasad, Shri  
 Brij Basi Lal, Shri  
 Chanda, Shrimati Jyotsna  
 Chandrabhan Singh, Shri  
 Chandriki, Shri  
 Chaturvedi, Shri S. N.  
 Chaudhry, Shri Chandramani Lal  
 Chaudhuri, Shri D. S.  
 Chaudhuri, Shrimati Kamala  
 Chaudhuri, Shri Sachindra  
 Chavan, Shri D. R.  
 Chavda, Shrimati Joraben  
 Chuni Lal, Shri  
 Daffe, Shri,  
 Daljit Singh, Shri  
 Dandeker, Shri N.  
 Das, Shri B. K.  
 Das, Shri N. T.  
 Dass, Shri C.  
 Deshmukh, Shri B. D.  
 Deshmukh, Shrimati Vimalabai P.  
 Dhuleshwar Meena, Shri  
 Dighe, Shri  
 Dixit, Shri G. N.  
 Dorai, Shri Kasinatha  
 Firodia, Shri  
 Gahmari, Shri  
 Gajraj Singh Rao, Shri  
 Ganapati Ram, Shri  
 Gandhi, Shri V. B.  
 Ganga Devi, Shrimati  
 Ghosh, Shri Atulya  
 Ghosh, Shri P. K.  
 Gowdh, Shri Veeranna  
 Guha, Shri A. C.  
 Gupta, Shri Shiv Charan  
 Hanumanthya Shri  
 Haq, Shri M. M.  
 Haz rika, Shri J. N.  
 Himmatsinhji, Shri  
 Jadhav, Shri M. L.  
 Jadhav, Shri Tulshidas  
 Jagjivan Ram, Shri  
 Jamunadevi, Shrimati  
 Jedhe, Shri  
 Jena, Shri  
 Jha, Shri Yogendra  
 Joshi, Shri A. C.  
 Joshi, Shrimati Subhadra  
 Jyotishi, Shri J. P.  
 Kajrolkar, Shri  
 Kamble, Shri  
 Karuthiruman, Shri  
 Khadilkar, Shri  
 Khan, Dr. P. N.  
 Khanna, Shri Mehr Chand  
 Kindar Lal, Shri  
 Kisan Veer, Shri  
 Kotaki, Shri Liladhar  
 Koujalgi, Shri H. V.  
 Kriota Shankar, Shri  
 Kureel, Shri B. N.  
 Lahtan Chaudhry, Shri  
 Lakshminanthamma, Shrimati  
 Laskar, Shri N. R.  
 Laxmi Bai, Shrimati  
 Lonikar, Shri  
 Mahadeo Prasad, Shri  
 Mahadeva Prasad, Dr.  
 Maimoona Sultan, Shrimati  
 Majithia, Shri  
 Mallick, Shri Rama Chandra  
 Manaen, Shri  
 Mandal, Dr. P.  
 Mandal, Shri J.  
 Maniyangadan, Shri  
 Mantri, Shri D. D.  
 Marandi, Shri  
 Masani, Shri M. R.  
 Masuriya Din, Shri  
 Matcharaju, S. M.  
 Mathur, Shri Shiv Charan  
 Mehdi, Shri S. A.  
 Mehrotra, Shri Braj Bihari  
 Mehta, Shri J. R.  
 Mehta, Shri Jashvant  
 Menon, Shri Govinda  
 Minimata, Shrimati  
 Mirza, Shri Bakar Ali  
 Mishra, Shri Bibhuti  
 Mishra, Shri M. P.  
 Misra, Shri Mahesh Dutta  
 Misra, Shri Shyam Dhar  
 Mohammad Yusuf, Shri  
 Mohanty, Shri Gokulananda  
 Morarka, Shri  
 More, Shri K. L.  
 Mukerjee, Shrimati Sharda  
 Murti, Shri M. S.  
 Muthiah, Shri  
 Naidu, Shri V. G.  
 Nanda, Shri  
 Naskar, Shri P. S.  
 Nayak, Shri Mohan  
 Niranjan Lal, Shri  
 Paliwal, Shri  
 Pande, Shri K. N.  
 Pandey, Shri R. S.  
 Pandey, Shri Vishwa Nath  
 Pandit, Shrimati Vijay Lakshmi  
 Panna Lal, Shri  
 Pant, Shri K. C.  
 Paramasivan, Shri  
 Parashar, Shri  
 Patel, Shri Chhotubhai  
 Patel, Shri N. N.  
 Patel, Shri Rajeshwar  
 Patil, Shri D. S.  
 Patil, Shri J. S.  
 Patil, Shri S. B.  
 Patil, Shri T. A.  
 Patnaik, Shri B. C.  
 Pattabhi Raman, Shri C. R.  
 Pratap Singh, Shri  
 Rai, Shrimati Sahodra Bai  
 Raj Bahadur, Shri  
 Raja, Shri C. R.  
 Rajdeo Singh, Shri  
 Ram, Shri T.  
 Ram Sewak, Shri  
 Ram Swarup, Shri  
 Ramanathan Chettiar, Shri R.  
 Ramaswamy, Shri V. K.  
 Ramdhani Das, Shri  
 Ramshekhar Prasad Singh, Shri  
 Rane, Shri  
 Rao, Shri Jaganatha  
 Rao, Dr. K. L.  
 Rao, Shri Krishnamoorthy  
 Rao, Shri Muthyal  
 Rao, Shri Ramapathi  
 Rao, Shri Rameshwar  
 Rao, Shri Thirumala  
 Rattan Lal, Shri  
 Raut, Shri Bhola  
 Rawandale, Shri  
 Ray, Shrimati Renuka  
 Reddi, Dr. B. Gopala  
 Reddy, Shri Linga  
 Reddy, Shri Ramakrishna  
 Reddy, Shri Surendra  
 Reddy, Shrimati Yashoda  
 Roy, Shri Bishwanath  
 Sadhu Ram, Shri  
 Saha, Dr. S. K.  
 Sahu, Shri Rameshwar  
 Saigal, Shri A. S.

Samanta, Shri S. C.	Singh, Shri K. K.	Thomas, Shri A. M.
Samnani, Shri	Singha, Shri G. K.	Tiwary, Shri D. N.
Saraf, Shri Sham Lal	Sinha, Shri Satya Narayan	Tiwary, Shri K. N.
Satyabhama Devi, Shrimati	Sinhasan Singh, Shri	Tiwary, Shri R. S.
Scindia Shrimati Vijaya Rajee	Sivasankaran, Shri	Tula Ram, Shri
Sen, Shri A. K.	Snatak, Shri Nardeo	Tyagi, Shri
Sen, Shri P. G.	Solanki, Shri	Uikey, Shri
Shah, Shrimati Jayaben	Sonavane, Shri	Upadhyaya, Shri Shiva Dutt
Shakuntala Devi, Shrimati	Soy, Shri H. C.	Vaishya, Shri M. B.
Shankaraiya, Shri	Subbaraman, Shri	Valvi, Shri
Sharma, Shri K. C.	Subramaniam, Shri C.	Varma, Shri M. L.
Sheo Narain, Shri	Subramanyam, Shri T.	Veerappa, Shri
Shinde, Shri	Sumat Prasad, Shri	Verma, Shri K. K.
Shree Narayan Das, Shri	Surendra Pal Singh, Shri	Vidyalankar, Shri A. N.
Shukla, Shri Vidya Charan	Surya Prasad, Shri	Virbhadra Singh, Shri
Siddiah, Shri	Swaran Singh, Shri	Vyas, Shri Radhelal
Sidheshwar Prasad, Shri	Tahir, Shri Mohammad	Wadiwa, Shri
Singh, Dr. B. N.	Tantia, Shri Rameshwar	Yadab, Shri N. P.
Singh, Shri D. N.	Thengal, Shri Nallakoya	Yadav, Shri Ram Harkh
		Yadava, Shri B. P.

## NOES

Mukerjee, Shri H. N.

Nair, Shri N. Sreekantan

**Mr. Speaker:** The result of the division is: Ayes 237; Noes 2.

*The motion was adopted.*

**अध्यक्ष महोदय :** अब आप बाहर चले जाइए। मार्शल, आप स्वयं जाइए और उनको कहिए कि बाहर जायें।

(*Shri J. B. Singh then left the House*)

17 hrs.

**Shri Sachindra Chaudhuri rose—**

**Some hon. Members:** Sit down.

**Mr. Speaker:** Shri Elias has been continuously interrupting the proceedings; therefore, I have to name him. I name Shri Elias that he has done it deliberately, continuously and consistently.

**Shri Satya Narayan Sinha:** Sir, I beg to move:

“That Shri Mohammad Elias, a Member of the House, named

by the Speaker, be suspended from the service of the House for the rest of the session.”

**Mr. Speaker:** The question is:

“That Shri Mohammad Elias, a Member of the House, named by the Speaker, be suspended from the service of the House for the rest of the session.”

Those in favour may kindly say “Aye”.

**Some hon. Members:** Aye.

**Mr. Speaker:** Those against may say “No”.

**Some hon. Members:** No.

**Mr. Speaker:** The “Ayes” have it; the “Ayes” have it. The motion is carried.

*The motion was adopted.*

**Shrimati Renu Chakravartty:** You will have to name all of us.

to meet again tomorrow at 11 o'clock.

17.02 hrs.

**Mr. Speaker:** Shri Elias may now leave the House. Now, it is five o'clock. The House stands adjourned

*The Lok Sabha then adjourned till Eleven of the Clock on Tuesday, July 26, 1966/Sravana 4, 1888 (Saka).*

---