

[Shri K. C. Sharma]

When I look back I find that our agriculture, our production in the field of the primary necessities of life, dates back to something like 1320 in Europe. We had to break the hard ground. It is good that the hon. Minister has taken up the measure seriously and emphasised the necessity of research, the necessity of co-operation, the necessity of providing measures for better prices for the produce to the producer and so on. These are exactly the things that would induce and enable the producer to produce more and to produce better. (Interruption).

Things have changed. Everybody, even a school boy, if he is asked to do it, refuses because it is a difficult task, it is a difficult proposition. This plough, this wooden plough is 3000 years old. We are still sticking to it. Nowhere else in the world it is used. You sit in the Parliament, in the most modern institution and ask the farmer to go 3000 years back. It is an impossible proposition. Our farms, our fields, those that are in existence, are like those farms and fields that were in existence in 1320 in Europe. Agriculture, the main occupation of our people, the main support of our people, is as primitive as it was in 1320 in Europe. You sit in this most modern institution of Parliament talking fine English whereas the farmers holding two bighas of land are still as the farmers in Europe were in 1320, having no knowledge, having no facilities whatsoever and having no incentives. It is impossible to work like that. It is cruelty inflicted on them. It is the most inhuman attitude towards them. No life is worth living if there is no change. So I welcome this measure because it provides for scientific research, to give the farmers the know-how in the matter of production, to give incentives to the farmers to produce more and produce better. It will create in them the will to work and the will to work harder. It will provide for science and modern technology in the field of cultivation with

the institutions to be established and things will change. I wish things change speedily. I do not mind something irksome here and there provided the desired aim, the desired objective is achieved.

With these words, Sir, I heartily support the Bill.

Mr. Deputy-Speaker: We will continue this debate tomorrow. We shall now take up the other business.

14.30 hrs.

#### DISCUSSION RE: FAMINE CONDITIONS AND STARVATION DEATHS IN ORISSA

Mr. Deputy-Speaker: Now the House will take up discussion on the famine conditions and starvation deaths in Orissa. Shri Kishen Pattnayak:

Shri S. M. Banerjee (Kanpur): Sir, before Shri Kishen Pattnayak speaks, it will be better if the hon. Minister, who had been to Orissa, makes a statement. We are told that he went simply to Bhubaneswar and that he could not go to Kalahandi because of rain. So, why should he not make a statement now so that it will be easier for us?

Mr. Deputy-Speaker: You will make a statement now or will you reply to the debate?

The Minister of Food, Agriculture, Community Development and Co-operation (Shri C. Subramaniam): I will reply.

Mr. Deputy-Speaker: The Mover can take 15 minutes and others 10 minutes each.

श्री किशन पटनायक (सम्बलपुर) :  
उपाध्यक्ष महोदय, मैंने बैम्बर में स्पीकर साहब से बात की थी और उन्होंने कहा था कि 20 मिनट देंगे तो यह बैम्बर में बात करने की छाप कोई इज्जत नहीं करते हैं ?

**Mr. Deputy-Speaker:** Other Members will have no chance then.

श्री क्लिवान पटनायक : स्पीकर साहब से हम ने बातचीत की थी और 20 मिनट उन्होंने मुझे देने को कहा था ।

**Mr. Deputy-Speaker:** 2½ hours have been allotted for this.

**Shri P. K. Deo (Kalahandi):** We were told that we will be given 20 minutes and the Mover 30 minutes.

**Mr. Deputy-Speaker:** Where is the time then?

**Shri P. K. Deo:** My constituency is the worst hit.

**Shri Surendranath Dwivedy (Kendrapara)** Let others speak then. We would not speak. If you want that everybody should participate and nobody should say anything specific, give five minutes to each, let everybody speak and we will not participate in the debate.

**Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath (Hoshangabad):** In view of its importance, let the time be extended by half an hour.

**Mr. Deputy-Speaker:** At five o'clock we have the half-an-hour discussion.

**Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath:** The half-an-hour discussion can go up to six o'clock.

**Mr. Deputy-Speaker:** The Mover can take 15 minutes and others 10 minutes each.

**Shri P. K. Deo:** It is no use speaking then. The British Parliament censured the Government of India in 1867.

**Shri Surendranath Dwivedy:** There is no use participating in the debate in that case.

**Shri Ranga (Chittoor):** I do not propose to speak; therefore, give my chance to Shri P. K. Deo.

**Mr. Deputy-Speaker:** Shri Pattnayak may go on.

**Shri Kishen Pattnayak:** Two minutes are already over. Please note that.

श्री क्लिवान पटनायक : उपाध्यक्ष महोदय, प्राज 11 तारीख के लिए यह बहस रक्खी गई थी । उस का एक कारण यह था कि श्री चि० सुब्रह्मण्यम ने सदन को धारवासन दिया था कि बहस के पहले भकाल क्षेत्र का दौरा करेंगे और अपने अनुभव के आधार पर जवाब देंगे तो प्राप उनसे पूछ लीजिये कि क्या उन्होंने भकाल क्षेत्र का दौरा किया है ? मंत्री महोदय भकाल क्षेत्र के दौरे के नाम पर क्या उड़ीसा भुवनेश्वर तक पहुंचे ? थोड़ी सी बारिश हुई कि उन्होंने दौरा ही बंद कर दिया । मई के महीने में बारिश और भकाल क्षेत्र का दौरा बन्द कर देना । इस में कुछ नतीजा निकलता है कि मंत्री महोदय का दिल कितना भकाल क्षेत्र के लिए तड़पता है ? प्राप के बाद प्रधान मंत्री जी भी जा रही हैं भकाल क्षेत्र का दौरा करने के लिए । उड़ीसा में इस सम्बन्ध में बहुत चर्चा है कि प्रधान मंत्री का दौरा होगा 13 तारीख से 15 तारीख तक । उन के उड़ीसा के दौरे के बारे में भखबारों के छन्दर निकला है कि डेढ़ घंटे से ज्यादा समय उड़ीसा के भकाल क्षेत्र के लिए प्रधान मंत्री देंगी । डेढ़ घंटे से ज्यादा और हैलीकोप्टर में । जब किसी पुल का उद्घाटन होता है या चाप की पाटियां होती हैं तब मुझे लगता है डेढ़ घंटे से ज्यादा समय देती हैं इंदिरा जी । अब यह कोई मामूली बात नहीं है कि भकाल के लिए प्रधान मंत्री दौरा करने जायें हैलीकोप्टर में और मेरी तो इच्छा होती है कि वहां के लोगों को सदेला भेज दूं कि डेढ़ घंटे के बाद जब इंदिरा जी हैलीकोप्टर में बैठ कर चलने लगे तो उस हैलीकोप्टर को पत्थर से मार कर गिरायें . . . . (श्वसचान) ।

श्री बाबकी (हिसार) : जर्म नहीं घाती कि भकाल पीड़ित लोगों के माथ इस तरह का मचाक किया जाता है . . .

उपाध्यक्ष महोदय : ध्रांडर, ध्रांडर ।

श्री बाणवी : प्राप इन लोगों को तो रोकते नहीं उल्टे हम को ध्रांडर, ध्रांडर कहते हैं ।

श्री शिव नारायण (बांसी) यह एटीकेट है ।

उपाध्यक्ष महोदय : श्री किसान पटनायक अपनी बात जारी रखें ।

श्री किसान पटनायक : 18 साल की योजना की तरबकी होते होते अभी भ्रकाल तक पहुंची है । इस साल जो बारिश हुई वह भीसत सालों में वर्षा की अपेक्षा 15 इंच कम हुई और यह 15 इंच कम बारिश होने के कारण इतना बड़ा भ्रकाल सारे रेश में हो गया । योजना 15 साल की हो गई । प्रतिवर्ष एक इंच के हिसाब से भी योजना की प्रगति नहीं हुई प्रकृति के मुकाबले में । अभी इस साल जो भ्रकाल चल रहा है उड़ीसा में खास कर यह बिलकुल मनुष्यकृत भ्रकाल है । मंत्री महोदय को कम से कम मैं फरवरी से चेतावनी दे रहा हूं । मंत्री महोदय हमेशा कह रहे हैं कि उड़ीसा में चावल अधिक है, सरप्लस स्टेट है और बाहर निर्यात किया जा सकता है । उन के अपने भ्रकालों के मुताबिक 2 करोड़ की ध्राबादी का उड़ीसा उस में 25 लाख टन चावल की पैदावार हुई है और 4 करोड़ ध्राबादी के बंगाल में 50 लाख टन चावल पैदा हुआ है । 2 करोड़ ध्राबादी के लिए 25 लाख टन और 4 करोड़ ध्राबादी के लिए 50 लाख टन लेकिन मंत्री महोदय ने कहा कि बंगाल में चावल की कमी है और उड़ीसा में चावल का अधिक्य है इसीलिए उड़ीसा से चावल भेजो । फरवरी में जब केरल में मांग हुई चावल की तो मंत्री महोदय ने कहा कि उड़ीसा में ज्यादा चावल है, भेजो । मैंने उस समय भी चेतावनी दी थी । अप्रैल, में जब बंगाल में मांग हुई

चावल की मंत्री महोदय ने कहा कि बंगाल में कम है लेकिन उड़ीसा में चावल ज्यादा है तो रोजाना 1000 मैट्रिक टन के हिसाब से उन्होंने बंगाल को चावल भेजा । इस का क्या कारण है कि उड़ीसा में जितना चावल पैदा होता है बंगाल में भी उतना होता है लेकिन उड़ीसा से बंगाल को भेजा जाता है ? यह सारे भ्रकाल के पीछे जो प्रादि प्राप है थोरिजनल सिन है वह है सरप्लस स्टेट वाली बात । उड़ीसा के ऊपर प्राप ने सरप्लस स्टेट की मुहर मार रखी है । लेकिन वह सरप्लस स्टेट कैसे होती है ? सारे उड़ीसा में चावल की पैदावार साधारण वर्षों में 35 लाख टन यानी दैनिक प्रति व्यक्ति को 350 ग्राम चावल मिल सकता है अगर ठीक बराबरी के ढंग से बंटवारा हो लेकिन जमाखोरी, निर्यात और गैर बराबरी के कारण ठीक ढंग से बंटवारा नहीं हो पाता है और 150 से 200 ग्राम तक ही साधारण गरीब प्रादमियों को साधारण वर्षों में मिलता है । इस साल की बात तो छोड़ ही दीजिये क्योंकि इस साल उन्हें सिर्फ 100 ग्राम ही मिल सकता है खरीदने के लिए अगर लोगों के पास पैसा हो और इस पर भी मंत्री महोदय कहते हैं कि वह सरप्लस स्टेट है । मेरी मांग है मंत्री महोदय से बल्कि दरख्वास्त है कि उड़ीसा को सरप्लस स्टेट अधोषित करो । उड़ीसा सरप्लस स्टेट है नहीं । वहां चावल की कमी है लेकिन प्राप लोगों ने उस पर सरप्लस स्टेट की मुहर मार रखी है ? क्या इसीलिये मार रखी है कि वहां के प्रति व्यक्ति की प्राय भारत के प्रति व्यक्ति की प्राय का दो तिहाई है या इसलिये कि उड़ीसा में प्रतिशतः के हिसाब से प्रादि-बासियों की ध्राबादी सब से ज्यादा है प्रायत् 21 प्रतिशतः है या इसलिये कि उड़ीसा में पिछड़े लोगों की ध्राबादी 70 प्रतिशतः है ? क्या इसलिये प्रापने उड़ीसा पर एक सरप्लस स्टेट होने की मुहर मार रखी है कि प्राप जब चीनी का कोटा बांधते हैं

मद्रास में तो दो धादमी के पीछे एक किलो चीनी देते हैं और उड़ीसा में चार धादमियों के पीछे एक किलो चीनी देते हैं ? क्या इसीलिये उड़ीसा एक सरप्लस स्टेट है कि उड़ीसा के लोगों के पास खरीदने के लिए पैसा नहीं होता इसीलिये उस पर सरप्लस स्टेट की मुहर मार कर चावल का निर्यात करते हैं ? भविष्य के लिए धाप को यह याद रखना चाहिए कि उड़ीसा सरप्लस स्टेट नहीं है । भ्रगले दस साल के लिए रहेगी नहीं इसलिये धाप की योजना यह होनी चाहिए कि उड़ीसा में जो चावल पैदा होता है वह चावल उड़ीसा में ही रहे और उड़ीसा में लोगों की आर्थिक स्थिति सुधरे ताकि उड़ीसा में जितना चावल पैदा होता है उस को खरीदने की ताकत उन में हो ।

खाद्य मंत्री के इस्तीफे की मांग अभी तक मैंने नहीं की है और इस वक्त भी मैं उन के इस्तीफे की मांग नहीं करूंगा लेकिन मैं इतना कहना चाहता हूँ कि योजना मंत्रालय को आत्महत्या कर लेनी चाहिए । 18 साल में किसी प्रकार की तरक्की नहीं हो पायी है । जब भ्रगले से श्री सुब्रह्मण्यम एम० पी० से मिल रहे थे तो उन्होंने कहा कि क्या बात है कि पिछले 17-18 साल के अन्दर इन इलाकों में कोई प्रगति नहीं हुई है ? मैं उन को निमंत्रण दूंगा उनको धावाहन करूंगा कि सदन में भी इस बात को दुहरा दें कि पिछले 17-18 साल के अन्दर कोई तरक्की उड़ीसा के अन्दर धादिवासी इलाकों में नहीं हुई ।

अब मैं अकाल के कुछ आंकड़े देना चाहता हूँ । सरकार ने खुद आंकड़े दिये हैं, श्री सुब्रह्मण्यम ने खुद वे आंकड़े सकुलेट किये हैं कि 60 लाख धादमी अकाल से पीड़ित हैं । मैं धाप से कहूंगा कि इन 60 लाख में से 5 लाख धाबादी वह है, जो अपने गांव, घर-बार छोड़ कर पलायन कर चुकी है । आज 10 लाख धादमी अरब के मुँह पर टिके हुए हैं । अगर सरकार की बरा सी भी बिनाई हुई, तो जैसे मक्खियां मरती हैं,

उसी तरह से लोग मरने लगेंगे । उड़ीसा में 500 भुखमरी की मौतें हो चुकी हैं ।

**श्री बागड़ी :** शर्म ।

**श्री किशन पटनायक :** अगर मंत्री महोदय इस बारे में जांच करने के लिए एक पालियामेंटरी कमेटी की नियुक्ति की स्वीकृति दें, तो सौ भुखमरी की मौतों का सत्यापन मैं अकेला करवा सकता हूँ । अगर मंत्री महोदय इस को कान्ट्राडिक्ट करना चाहते हैं, तो वह एक पालियामेंटरी कमेटी की नियुक्ति के लिए तैयार हो जायें, जो इस बात की जांच करे कि 500 भुखमरी की मौतें हुई हैं या नहीं । सौ भुखमरी की मौतों का सत्यापन मैं कर सकता हूँ । इस की चुनौती मैं उन को दे सकता हूँ ।

जिन व्यक्तियों की भुखमरी से मौत हुई, उन में से कुछ नाम तारीख और पते तो मैं सदन को दे ही देता हूँ ।

24 अप्रैल, को खड़याल रोड प्राइमरी हेल्थ सेंटर के निकट एक मौत हुई, जिस का पुलिस केस रिकार्ड नम्बर 9 है । नबापाड़ा के मेडीकल आफिसर ने जब शबछेदन, पोस्ट-मार्टम, किया, तो उस व्यक्ति की पाक-स्थली में, जहां खाना रहता है, एक भी दाना खाने का नहीं मिला ।

18 अप्रैल, को खड़याल से दस मील दूर रानीमुंडा में बंसीगोड़ की बेटा, कुनी, की मौत हुई । उस से चार दिन पहले बंसीगोड़ अपने परिवार के लोगों को छोड़ कर कहीं चला गया था, क्योंकि वह उनको भोजन नहीं दे सका । उस की बीबी जंगल में पत्ते लेने के लिए गई थी, जब कि वह बच्ची घर में मर गई ।

बरगां गांव में तीन मौतें हुई । श्रीधर गोड़ किसी किसान के पास कमियाका काम करता था । चूंकि इस बार फसल नहीं हुई, इसलिये उस की नौकरी छूट गई और वह 8 अप्रैल को भूख से मर गया ।



## [श्री किशन पटनायक]

उसी बरगों में बूटी पंढा की बेंटी मर गई और 9 अप्रैल को हगरू गोड़ का बच्चा मर गया। वह भी अपने घर के लोगों को छोड़ कर चला गया था, क्योंकि वह उन को खाने को नहीं दे सका।

प्रदेश कांग्रेस के प्रेजिडेंट, बिजयपाणि, ने 7 अप्रैल, को एक पत्रकार सम्मेलन में कहा कि किसी दिल वाले धादमी के लिए नन्हें बच्चों के सामने धीरज से खड़े होने के लिए बहुत मुश्किल पड़ती है। उन्होंने यह भी कहा कि कई दिनों से न नहाने के कारण उन बच्चों के शरीर से एक प्रकार की बहबू निकल रही है। उन्होंने धागे चल कर यह भी कहा कि उभा पंचायत के बहराडुगरी गांव में एक वृद्धा की भुखमरी से मौत हुई, जिस का प्रमाण मिल चुका है।

मैं खुद 25 अप्रैल को जिला सम्बलपुर के कांदू मुंडा गांव में गया था। उस गांव की धादादी 1800 बी और उस में 440 धादमी गांव छोड़ कर चले जा चुके थे।

वहां पर मुक्ति पटेल नामक धादमी मुझे मिला, जो कि 50 एकड़ जमीन का मालिक है और जिस के परिवार में बीस सदस्य हैं। वह अपने बैल 170 रुपये में बेच चुका था। वह 140 रुपये का तकाबी का कर्जा ले कर खा चुका था। वह बेन गोला से 200 रुपये का कर्जा ले कर उस को भी खा चुका था। उस के पास बाकी तीन रुपये बचे थे। वह उन तीन रुपयों को ले कर चावल ढूँढ रहा था, लेकिन उस को चावल नहीं मिला। मैं खुद उस को एक ग्लाक धाकिसर के पास ले गया और उस को कहा कि उस को तीन रुपये का चावल दो। तब उस को चावल मिला।

इतना सब कुछ होने पर भी सरकार वहां पर भ्रकास की घोषणा करने से क्यों हिचकचा रही है? वह वहां पर भ्रकास

की घोषणा क्यों नहीं कर रही है? मंत्री महोदय ने जो मैप सकुलिट किया है, उस में लाल रंग के इलाके, खून के रंग के इलाके, के बारे में खुद लिखा है: "कम्पलीटली डैमेज्ड एरिया"। कम से कम इन इलाकों को तो अकाल पीड़ित इलाका घोषित किया जाये। वहां पर अकाल क्यों नहीं घोषित किया जाता है?

भुखमरी की मौतों को छोड़ कर अकाल की और भी तीन पहचान हैं। एक पहचान है भारी संख्या में लोगों का पलायन। मैंने आप के सामने ये आंकड़े रखे हैं कि पांच लाख के करीब लोग गांव छोड़ कर चले गये हैं।

अकाल की दूसरी पहचान है भोजन के पीछे सब कुछ छोड़ देना, सोना बेच देना, बर्तन बेच देना, बैल बेच देना और घर बालों को भी छोड़ कर चले जाना। इन इलाकों में सोने की बिक्री हुई है 60 रुपये तोला के हिसाब से—22 कैरट वाला सोना, 14 कैरट वाला सोना नहीं। वहां पर कांसा बर्तन की बिक्री हुई पांच रुपये किलोग्राम के हिसाब से, बैल बिके हैं 80 रुपये जोड़ी और बकरी पांच रुपये के हिसाब से। इस तरह से सिर्फ खड़याल पंचायत में—इस खबर के लिए मैं भी मेहताब का धाधारी हूँ—दो महीने में बैल-बिक्री पर धामदनी हुई है चौदह हजार रुपये धाधातू डार्ई पैसे प्रति बैल काटिकस। इसके बावजूद मंत्री महोदय वहां पर अकाल घोषित करने में हिचकिया रहे हैं।

अकाल की तीसरी पहचान है धनाथ बच्चे। उन इलाकों में बच्चे इधर उधर घूम रहे हैं। उन के मां-बाप उन के साथ नहीं हैं। जहां कहीं भी मुफ्त बितरण केन्द्र खोला गया है, वहीं सैकड़ों और हजारों की संख्या में बच्चे धा जाते हैं। जहां तक धनाथालकों का सम्बन्ध है, उन के बारे में न मैं झूट बोल सकता हूँ और न मंत्री

महोदय झूठ प्रमाणित कर सकते हैं। वहां पर जितने घनाघालय हैं, उन में जो बच्चे हैं, उन का क्या पता है, उन बच्चों के मां-बाप कहां हैं? क्या उन की खबर रखने की कोई एजेंसी सरकार ने कायम की है।

वहां पर मीत के धांकड़े रखने वाले जो चौकीदार थे, वे चले गये। गांव की पंचायतें इस काम को नहीं करती हैं। यदि कोई भ्राममी गांव में मर जाता है, तो सरकार के रजिस्टर में नहीं चढ़ाया जाता है कि कौन मर गया।

श्री बागड़ी : जब यह सरकार मरे, तब लोगों का भला होगा।

श्रीभती जयबोन शाह (भमरेली) :  
ये उस को नहीं मार सकते हैं।

श्री किशन पटनायक : मंत्री महोदय से मेरी विनीत प्रार्थना है कि वह इस इलाके को—कम से कम लाल इलाके को—प्रकाल-पीड़ित इलाका घोषित करें। वहां पर प्रकाल घोषित करने का फायदा होगा कि मंत्री महोदय के दिन में भी कुछ ज्यादा दर्द होने लगा, हमारे दिल में भी कुछ ज्यादा दर्द होने लगेगा और जो नौकरशाह लोग हैं—भालसी, उदासीन नौकरशाह—, उन के मन में भी कुछ दर्द होने लगेगा। कुछ काम में तेजी आयेगी।

श्री बालड़ी : वहां पर बच्चे मर रहे हैं और ये लोग हंस रहे हैं।

श्री स० मो० बनर्जी : ये मां हैं।

श्री बागड़ी : मां कहां हैं, डायन हैं।

श्री किशन पटनायक : मैं श्री सुब्रह्मण्यम् को कुछ सुझाव देना चाहता हूँ। प्रकाल-पीड़ित जिलों को केन्द्रीय सरकार से जे और केन्द्र की तरफ से कम से कम छः महीने

के लिए उड़ीसा में एक प्रकाल विभाग खोला जाये। उड़ीसा में केन्द्र के प्राफिसर रहें, प्रकसरों की एक टोली वहां पर प्रकाल विभाग के नाम से रखी जाये, मंत्री बार-बार वहां पर दौरा करें और प्रकाल के जितने पहलू हैं, उन सब पर नजर रखें।

दूसरा सुझाव यह है कि मंत्री महोदय मीतों के धांकड़े रखें और हर हफ्ते या हर पखवाड़े सामयिक प्रगति का विवरण प्रचारित करें। पलायन के धांकड़े, घनाथ बच्चों के धांकड़े, बीमार लोगों के धांकड़े और कहां बीज दिये, कहां खेती की शरघात हुई, इन सब बातों के धांकड़े एक प्राप्रेस रिपोर्ट के रूप में हर फोर्टनाइट प्रचारित किये जायें, ताकि हम लोगों को कुछ विश्वास हो कि प्रगति हो रही है या हम खुश जा कर इन बातों के बारे में जांच कर सकें।

मेरा तीसरा सुझाव यह है कि कोई भी जमीन—मैं भगले माल के लिए कह रहा हूँ—बीज या बीन या पूंजी के प्रभाव से खाली न पड़ी रहे और इस की गारंटी मंत्री महोदय को देनी पड़ेगी। अगर किसी किसान के पास बीस बेघ देने के कारण या पैसा न रहने के कारण अगर उसकी जमीन खाली पड़ गई तो जो हालत इस साल नहीं हुई, वह हालत भगले साल हो जायेगी। जून की 15 तारीख के पहले, 15 ता० भी बहुत सेट है, उसके भी पहले हर एक किसान के पास बीज पहुंचवाइये, नहीं तो भगले माल की खेती भी मृत्यु हो जायेगी।

उसी तरह से मेरा चौथा सुझाव यह है कि जिन लोगों ने सब कुछ खो दिया है, जिन बच्चों ने मां-बाप खो दिये हैं, उनको बसाने के लिए, जिस तरह से विस्थापितों को बसाया जाता है, उसी तरह से पुनर्वास की व्यवस्था उनके भविष्य के लिए कीजिये। जिन लोगों ने सब कुछ खो दिया है, उन्हीं के लिए मैं यहां पर बोल रहा हूँ।

[श्री किशन पटनायक]

मेरा पांचवां सुझाव यह है कि आप वहां पर भविष्य में होने वाली बीमारियों के लिए सतर्क रहिये। जून के बाद, बारिश के बाद वहां पर बीमारियां बहुत जोरों से शुरू होने वाली हैं।

वहां पर शराब की दुकानों को बन्द कीजिये। कम से कम आपके ये जो लाल-निशानवाले इलाके हैं, इन इलाकों में एक भी शराब की दुकान नहीं रहनी चाहिए।

श्री शिवनारायण : बहुत पीते हैं उड़ीसावाले।

श्री किशन पटनायक : आप भी पीते हो, शायद आप दूसरे किस्म की शराब पीते हो। शराब की दुकानों को बन्द करवाइये।

आखिर मैं फिर से दोहरा देना चाहता हूँ कि भ्रकाल के लिए इस साल मैं जितना श्री सुब्रह्मण्यम साहब को जिम्मेदार नहीं समझता हूँ, उन से ज्यादा जिम्मेदार समझता हूँ—श्री भगोक मेहता साहब को। योजना ने पिछले 18 सालों में कोई तरक्की नहीं करवाई। लघु सिंचाई पर इन तीन योजनाओं में आपका एक करोड़ रुपया खर्च हुआ और उसका लक्ष्य था कि 5 लाख एकड़ जमीन की सिंचाई होगी, लेकिन मैं चुनोती देकर कह सकता हूँ कि 50 हजार एकड़ जमीन की भी सिंचाई इन योजनाओं से नहीं हुई है। उड़ीसा के लिए और उसी तरह के और जितने पिछड़े हुए इलाके हिन्दुस्तान भर में हैं, हर एक पिछड़े हुए इलाके के लिए आप एक स्थायी योजना बनाइये, एक स्वतन्त्र योजना बनाइये ताकि उनकी पैसे की ताकत, आर्थिक ताकत बढ़ सके और यदि ऐसी हालत पैदा हो जाय तो पहला शिकार वे लोग न बनें।

मैं धाक्का करता हूँ, उपाध्यक्ष महोदय, कि श्री सुब्रह्मण्यम साहब जबाब से भागेंगे

नहीं और सीधे-सीधे जवाब देंगे और भविष्य का कार्यक्रम सही ढंग से बतायेंगे।

Shri P. K. Deo: Mr. Deputy Speak, Sir, it is the compulsion of conscience and compulsion of duty that forces me to speak unpleasant truth which may not be palatable to most in this House.

Sir, it was on the 25th of July, 1867, Sir Stafford Northcote, then Secretary of State of India censured the Government of Bengal for want of foresight and energy and grave error of judgment in connection with the Orissa famine of 1866. On the 2nd August, 1867, there was a lively debate in the House of Commons and at that time, the Secretary of State for India censured the Government with these words:

"This catastrophe must always remain a monument of our failure, a humiliation to the people of this country, to the Government of this country, and to those of our Indian officials of whom we had been perhaps a little too proud. At the same time, we must hope that we might derive from it reasons which might be real value to ourselves, and that out of this deplorable evil good of no insignificant kind might ultimately arise."

Sir. this was hundred years before. Just hundred years after, in 1966, Orissa is faced with another famine. They appointed a Famine Commission to go into the matter. The Famine Commission, in their Report, stated:

"The famine relief work in Orissa was anything but satisfactory—the whole thing was grossly mismanaged by the Government officials. A large sum of money was squandered away."

This was the finding of a Government whom we called the Colonial—Government. At that time India was

under alien rule. To-day, India is a free country. There are irresponsible men who style themselves as Ministers of Food and who adorn the Treasury Benches here presiding over the destiny of millions of people in this country. They feel shy to face the truth; they want to hide the truth. The entire world knows and all the papers corroborate. Who does not know that there are starvation deaths? When these hundreds of people have been dying due to starvation, my hon. friend, Shri Subramaniam is not prepared to accept it. He always blames the Providence. There was a failure of crops; he says that there was no rain. He could not go to the scarcity areas; because he says there was plenty of rain. Left him chant the mantra "Kale varshathu parjanya" and let him be satisfied for all the time. But, Sir, this House is not going to spare him. He has to be censured and with him the entire Government have to be censured. Sir, it is a disgrace to democracy in this country when a calamity of this magnitude has come, no adjournment motion could be allowed in this House. But, at long last, a no-day-yet-motion has been admitted and there too, the time has been restricted. You know, Sir, how difficult it is to present the proper picture of that great calamity. It has become very easy for Mr. Subramaniam to deny all kinds of deaths because no vital statistics have been kept of these figures; no register has been maintained at the village level. It has been discontinued since introduction of Panchayat Raj. That is why when the television team of the B.B.C. wanted to go to that area and wanted to have a spot visit, they were not allowed to go there. This is a man-made famine which is due to the neglect of the administration for not providing food and medical facilities. That is why so many people have been dying. My hon. friend Shri Kishen Pattnayak has pointed out the starvation death near Khariar Road. Post mortem record has clearly showed the starvation deaths. The entire Government machinery are after the bold doctor

to change the report of the starvation death. Why should you change the report? The Prime Minister will be visiting Khariar Road shortly. If she will call for the records, she will herself be convinced that the death was due to starvation.

So far as different parts of Kalahandi are concerned, I would like to clear this misunderstanding that Navapara subdivision was a part of British India. It was all along a part of Raipur district and then in 1936 formed part of Sambalpur district of Orissa. Again, after reorganisation of the district in 1949 it formed a part of Kalahandi district. It is the most badly affected area. It has been neglected for all these years. It has been shifted from one district to another. In these days, Mr. Subramaniam could not go over there because there is no road and the entire area is cut off. It is neither connected with the Sub-Division nor with the District Headquarters. No relief measure was forthcoming in Sinapali. I was there day before yesterday. There, the entire rice stock has been consumed. Unless before the advent of the monsoon the rice reaches there, the people who are there will die of starvation. Kalahandi District was all along a surplus district. 50,000 tons of rice used to be procured from that district and used to be exported to all the deficit areas. In spite of the warning given by us that in 1965-66 there has been a failure of monsoon and as a result the famine is anticipated, no action was taken. 30,000 tons of rice were procured last year and were exported. Sir, on the 5th of September, 1965, the Zilla Parishad passed a resolution anticipating these things. On the 16th September, the Swatantra party passed a Resolution and I met the District Collector and requested him to take immediate steps. On the 4th January, I led a march of nearly 10,000 people and met the district collector. But all these have fallen on deaf ears. At long last, the Kumbhakarna came out of his sleep and the only relief that reached the

[Shri P. K. Deo]

people was in March, 1966. There too, the entire delivery system has been so defective, and there have been so many leakages in the delivery pipe that only a few drops of what was meant for the people trickled down at the other end.

15 hrs.

All the labour intensive programmes and all the relief works have been entrusted to the favourite contractors of the Congress Government. In this regard, I would like to point out what has appeared in *The Hindustan Standard*. The representative of *The Hindustan Standard* was there and he has written about the Jammasagar project. Even though there have been three Plans, there has been absolutely no impact of the Plans in that area. No irrigation project worth the name has been taken up. The representative of *The Hindustan Standard* had been to the project at Jamunasagar which is quite close to Bhawanipatna which is the district headquarters. He says:

"Without the slightest of exaggeration, it can be said that the Jamunasagar project is a sad reflection on the efficiency of the irrigation authorities. A scheme that would presumably cost Rs. 5 or Rs. 6 lakhs should certainly not be in the stage of construction for years on end . . .".

It has been there since the last ten years but it could not be completed.

He further says:

"The Labourers engaged on the project are by and large in a deplorable condition, and when together with the Panchayat Samiti Chairman I went to the site, I was shocked to find their women and children, many of whom were diseased, in as wretched a condition as destitutes. I heard complaints that fair wages were not paid to the labourers and they were made to work beyond their ability."

That is how the people are being treated.

You will be surprised to know that the contractor there is Sardar Ujagar Singh who is the chairman of the Mandal Congress Committee there. These are the people who have been exploiting and who have been sucking the blood of the people of that area. In that project, 60 people have died only last month. When Mr. Vaidyanathan, the Adviser to the Planning Commission went to the site, the people complained to him that they were not being paid properly and as soon as Mr. Vaidyanathan came away, those people who had complained were mercilessly beaten by these contractors. This is the state of affairs.

Mr. Vaidyanathan has rightly pointed out in his report that:

"There may be cases of contractors taking undue advantage. But, unfortunately, there are no effective means of preventing this."

Right from the very beginning we have been hammering this thing before Government that the Labour Department should be streamlined and there should be people to see that the labourers get proper wages, but nothing has been done in this regard.

The Prime Minister will be going there shortly, and I request her to intervene and see that all the work now executed by the Rural Engineering Organisation is transferred to the village committees and to the panchayat. The people should be taken into confidence. The money meant for them should be given to them for proper work . . .

**Shri Sheo Narain:** From his privy purse of Rs. 5 lakhs, how much has the hon. Member given to the people?

**Shri P. K. Deo:** This situation has been taken advantage of even by the biri leave contractors . . .

**Shri Bibhuti Mishra (Motihari):** What has the hon. Member who comes from that area done for that area?

**Shri P. K. Deo:** I am not yielding. My hon. friend can have his say later.

You know, Sir, that there is monopolistic biri leave trade in this State. In the name of State enterprise, the monopolist right of collection is given to some favourite. Shri Mahatab will bear me out when I say this, and he has already circulated a pamphlet where he has stated that taking into consideration the pitiable state of affairs, the people are being exploited and they are being paid a very meagre wage which works out to 50 paise a day. You can very well imagine the plight of the people.

With all the emphasis at my command, I say that the situation has been aggravated by the monopolistic biri leave trade system, the monopolistic procurement and the levy system and the monopolistic forest contract system. Why should the people not be allowed to collect the minor forest produce and sell it in the open market? Why should the monopolistic right be given to a few favourite Congressmen?

Coming to the food supply, even though some fair price shops have been opened, still there are certain areas, big and central villages in the interior and in the remote areas where even in panchayat headquarters, no fair price shops are there. So far as wheat is concerned, we are prepared to consume it. You may give us wheat, you may give us barley or you may give us anything edible; we do not insist that only rice should be supplied.

Wheat or barley or anything may be given adequately and in proper time it should reach the people. At the moment, people are living on *pipal* leaves; even cows are being killed and are being consumed by the caste-Hindus throwing to winds all the old religious beliefs.

The gratuitous relief cards are reported to be available only for a consideration. Only the favourites are being supplied with these cards.

Free kitchens have been opened by the Bharat Sewak Samaj. As I had pointed out the other day, it is the other side of the coin of the Congress Party. Free kitchens are being opened by some charitable people, but no State aid is given to them. All the American wheat and all the American milk powder goes to the Bharat Sewak Samaj. I would like to speak to the American Government from this platform, from this House that all their charity is being misused for party purposes. It is a disgrace to democracy. It is a disgrace to the Government. Why not give the facility to other non-official organisations also like the Ramakrishna Mission or other parties?

**Shri Ranga:** Like the Ramakrishna Mission or the Gauranga Mission.

**Shri P. K. Deo:** Why not give the facility to the Ramakrishna Mission or other parties? For God's sake, do not play politics with the life and death of the people.

Some orphanages have been started in Komna and Khariar. But why are they not being patronised by Government? These things are being corroborated by the Bulletin of the Congress Party. The District Congress Party in their Bulletin have stated that it is the Bharat Sewak Samaj through which they are going to distribute . . .

**Shri Parashar (Shivpuri):** On a point of order . . .

**Shri P. K. Deo:** I am not yielding . . .

**Mr. Deputy-Speaker:** He may deny those allegations later.

**Shri Parashar:** My point of order is a very important one. The hon. Member has just now stated that through this House he is appealing to the American Government. No Member can appeal to any foreign Government through this House. It affects the sovereignty of this House.

(Dis.)

[Shri Parashar]

I would, therefore, request that those remarks should be expunged from the proceedings of the House.

**Shri Raghunath Singh** (Varanasi): He should try to appeal on behalf of us.

**Shrimati Renu Chakravartty** (Barrackpore): Shri Asoka Mehta will convey it to the American Government.

**Mr. Deputy-Speaker:** Shri P. K. Deo should try to conclude now. He has already taken about 15 minutes.

**Shri P. K. Deo:** The hon. Speaker had told me that I would be given 20 minutes.

**Mr. Deputy-Speaker:** But there are other speakers also.

**Shri P. K. Deo:** I come from that area, and the entire discussion is on my area.

**Shri Raghunath Singh:** How can he appeal on our behalf? He can speak on behalf of his own party, not on behalf of Parliament.

**Mr. Deputy-Speaker:** Everybody speaks on behalf of his own party. There is no point of order.

**Shri P. K. Deo:** These are to be tackled on a war footing. The administrative machinery has to be streamlined. We know how the relief committee has been treated. The proceedings of the District Relief Committee of the 15th March 1966 and 15th April 1966 are monumental documents. If you go through them, you will be convinced that the Relief Committee was called. The District Collector was the only person who was present, and he wrote the proceedings himself and he implemented the whole thing. There was the same force in the second meeting. The Deputy Minister was the president. He sat there for five minutes. He did not have the patience to listen to the

other members. He abruptly adjourned the meeting and ran away. Are we to run away from realities like this? Are we keen to tackle the problem? If we are, we must have a human approach to the subject, a practical approach to the subject. But nothing was done.

As a short-term measure, I suggest that emaciated people who need medical care should be properly nursed and fed. Abandoned children should be looked after in orphanages which should be started throughout the area. A team of dedicated officers with missionary zeal should be sent to that area. The present District Collector and the Deputy Minister should be dismissed for their most callous approach (*Interruptions*). Subsidised fair price shops should be opened. Seeds have to be supplied in time. Here, you will be surprised to know that seeds which are procured in the district at Rs. 35 per quintal are going to be sold to people at Rs. 58 per quintal. From this, you can imagine how the Government is making a profit out of this thing. Liquor shops should be closed and schools should be taken over.

As a long-term measure, I suggest this. The 1886 famine there was a boon in disguise. After that famine, a Famine Commission submitted a report as a result of which the entire delta irrigation system in Orissa was taken up. Similarly, I submit that after this famine, this neglect area should receive some special treatment. The Indravati project which has been pending consideration in the Ministry of Irrigation and Power should get the green signal, and it should synchronise with the visit of Indiraji. There is so much affinity between Indira and Indravati.

Lastly, a Famine Commission should be appointed to go into the whole thing. It should evolve a realistic famine code. Finally, there should be provision for crop insurance all time to come.

**Shri Mahatab** (Angul): Mr. Deputy-Speaker, there is no doubt—it is admitted on all sides—that the situation in some parts of Orissa is really bad, as bad as is generally the case in a famine. There is difference in the language, in the words used by this side or that side. But the fact is admitted that the situation is bad. It is very unfortunate that politics is being introduced into this matter. This should not be the case (*Interruptions*).

**Shri Raghunath Singh:** They want to take advantage of the situation.

**Shri Mahatab:** I would beg of the House to kindly listen to me. This is a question involving misery to millions of people. If we go on in this manner, I do not see the necessity of speaking. After all, it is a serious matter.

15.15 hrs.

[**SIRI SHAM LAL SARAF** in the Chair]

**Mr. Chairman:** I have been listening to the previous speakers. Certainly, this is a matter which will receive the sympathy of the whole House. So I would request all hon. Members to listen to the speech and not go on interrupting.

**Shri Mahatab:** In fact, I expected that this matter should be discussed irrespective of party considerations, as it has been done at the State level. There the relief committees have been formed with representatives of all parties. In the districts, the relief committees have been constituted with representatives of all parties. Whether they are functioning correctly or not, it is for us to point out, it is for us to criticise them. But the approach should be a non-political approach to these matters. That is my humble submission.

With regard to the situation as it is, there is no doubt there has been failure. I may tell the House in confi-

dence that I had a talk with the Chief Minister there with all the officers present when he was good enough to agree that there should be an inquiry as to where and how the administration failed. Then I suggested—this was on my initiative—that the inquiry should not be undertaken now because in that case the attention of all the officers working there would be diverted to that and away from the actual work there now. So let the crisis be over and after that there should be an inquiry. That has been agreed to. Therefore, there is no point of dispute now. It is admitted that there has been failure at some points. There is no doubt about it.

I was thinking as to which Ministry has to be tackled in connection with this matter. Since yesterday, I have been trying to find out whether it is the Food Ministry or the Finance Ministry or any other Ministry here at the Centre which should be taken to task for whatever has happened there. So far as the Food Ministry is concerned, as far as I can make out, their work is to see that proper supply takes place. But so far as the situation in Orissa is concerned, it is not want of stock which was responsible for this situation. Of course, there was some slackness in exercising control over the trade. But that is a different matter. So far as stock is concerned, it was there. Therefore, I do not know how the Food Ministry here can be brought into the picture.

But there is one point, namely, the purchasing capacity of the people, because the crops failed completely. It was known to all concerned that the crops had failed, but no step was taken to take initial steps to prevent a catastrophe. That could have been taken in September last. Not only the zila parishad but also the pan-chayat samitis had reported to the authorities that there had been complete failure of crops. It is said that almost the entire crop was destroyed. I say 'almost' because in some little



[Shri Mahatab]

areas, there was some crop; otherwise there was total destruction. In spite of that report, no step was taken. As far as I have understood, no steps were taken because correspondence went on between the Orissa Government and the Central Government.

**Mr. Chairman:** Does he mean at the State level or Central level?

**Shri Mahatab:** My information is that correspondence went on as to who would finance the relief measures. The State Government had no resources of their own; they approached the Central Government for finance. A team of the Planning Commission visited Orissa in February last. They made a report. The difficulty arose there. This is what appears to me the reasons for delay in action. Therefore, I said to the Chief Minister and I have also suggested to the Prime Minister here this morning—that there should be some inquiry after the present crisis was over as to where the machinery failed. That has to be found out.

I visited these areas. I visited some of the feeding centres. I visited many villages and I saw some sights myself. I cannot describe all these things in detail because one cannot stand those sights. It is a real famine. There is no doubt about it. We read accounts of the 1943 famine in Bengal and parts of Orissa. This famine can also be compared with that famine. Therefore, I suggest that no useful purpose will be served in describing how people are dying, how they are suffering. I think the fact should be accepted as such.

**Shri Nambiar:** (Tiruchirapalli): It is disputed here.

**Shri Mahatab:** It is not disputed. Excuse me for saying so; as far as I have understood it, it is not disputed here.....Dispute perhaps is taking place on a wrong.....

**Shri Surendranath Dwivedy:** Do they agree that there is famine there?

**Shri Mahatab:** The Food Minister said in Bhubaneswar—it has appeared in the papers—that the situation is very difficult.

**Shri Surendranath Dwivedy:** Acute scarcity and not famine—that is what they say.

**Shri Mahatab:** What is the difference?

Everybody has got his own word to describe it. Somebody says it is acute distress, somebody says it is famine. I am not called upon to distinguish between these two expressions. I do not know why this fruitless discussion is going on over words. Probably it is on account of the fact that there is a provision in the Famine Code that if starvation deaths are admitted, then certain other steps must be taken. My point is that in spite of the fact that any area is not declared a famine area, much more than those steps are undertaken now.

**Shri P. K. Deo:** No, no. It is wrong.

**Shri Mahatab:** Please excuse me. You read the Famine Code, and you will see how things have changed.

I along with a professor wrote an article on the 1866 famine which was published in some research journals, and all the records that were read out just now will be found there. Let us not go as far back as 1866. There was a drought followed by unprecedented floods in Orissa in 1955-56, when Shri Nabha Krishna Choudhary was the Chief Minister. The total amount of relief expenses was to the tune of Rs. 11 crores. At that time also, a Relief Commissioner, Mr. Ramanathan, was appointed. The whole relief was based on the Famine Code with considerable modifications. The Famine Code was

amended last in 1930. Even then, that Code is insufficient today. Therefore, the Government is amending the rules now and then and they are meeting the situation as it arises, not only in Orissa but in all States. For instance, gratuitous relief is being given in some parts of U.P. even now. It is not provided in the Famine Code. No starvation death has been declared there. Therefore, let us not fight over words.

The question to be considered to-day is whether the conditions are of famine or not and whether steps are being taken or not. There is no doubt that steps have been taken since the second week of April as far as I know. It is agreed that this should have been taken much earlier, three months ago. If that had been done, the present situation would not have arisen.

There is no doubt that during famines all kinds of corruption take place. That is the usual experience, because people all around lose their moral moorings. Therefore, all kinds of corruption take place. Let us suggest how this can be checked, how the administration can be streamlined and how other checking measures should be taken. These are the matters which should be discussed, I think at a different level not here on this occasion. Here, the point is that the Government of India should come forward and say that the conditions are equivalent to the conditions of famine and what steps are and will be taken. As far as I have understood from the Orissa Government, what they want to know is this, and they should be assured, that the Government of India would finance the entire relief. That is the problem now. It is not a small sum which will be required. My own calculation was that it would be about Rs. 10 crores. The Governor's own calculation, I was told was also of that amount. Now I am told, after discussion with the Planning Commission team, the amount has come to

about Rs. 11 crores or so. It has come to that. The Orissa Government have no resources to meet this famine relief expenditure. Therefore, it is the Government of India which should come to their rescue.

**Shri Ranga:** What were they doing with all the money?

**Shri Mahatab:** That is a different matter. That question cannot be replied here as to what was not done or what should have been done.

**Mr. Chairman:** The question is not who is to foot the bill, the question is—let the people get the relief.

**Shri Mahatab:** I entirely agree with you that people must be given relief.

**Mr. Chairman:** And immediately.

**Shri Mahatab:** I entirely agree with you.

**Shri Ranga:** That Government should be dismissed and the administration should be taken over.

**Shri Raghunath Singh:** That is political propaganda.

**Shri Ranga:** Why do you say it is political. According to him the local Government has failed, and it wants all the money from the Government of India.

**Mr. Chairman:** I would request him, he is a very senior Member of this House. Let us have some decorum. Let the hon. Member speak. Everybody will have a chance to speak. By intervening continuously we lose the trend of the speech.

**Shri Mahatab:** I am speaking on behalf of myself. I am appealing to all the Members here and all but consider that the main concern today should be relief of the people. Other considerations should come in later. We may accuse the Government, we may demand their dismissal or what-

(Dis.)

[Shri Mahatab]

ever we like, but that should be done after the misery of the people is solved. The immediate problem is relief. The immediate problem is that people should be relieved of their distress. We should take into consideration the humanitarian aspect now. That is my approach to the whole problem. Let us forget for the time being as to where the fault lies, abuse of power here and there etc. There are matters which can be taken up at leisure, later on, but today the problem is that the distressed people must be relieved of their distress. That is the main problem.

That being so, first of all I have suggested that seed loans, should be given immediately. It is already too late. It is really not 30th June but I was told by the farmers that the latest by which the seed loans must be given is by the end of May, otherwise it would be too late for sowing, they say. Therefore, the seed loans should be given immediately. I am told a discussion is going on between the Planning Commission and the Orissa Government as to whether this should be short-term or long-term. I was asked to give my opinion. I said "payable when able." should be the condition. If the crops are good, then the farmers may be called upon next year to pay. If they are not good, nobody can ask them to pay next year. Therefore, these discussions are immaterial at the present juncture.

The farmers should be given assistance either in the form of loans or even grants, not only for seeds, but also for bullocks. The figure of Rs. 14,000 which I have got is from the panchayat office itself, and the total number of cattle, as far as can be judged, sold in that area would be about 58,000. That being so, it is not an easy matter to purchase 56,000 heads immediately from somewhere. It will take a long time. There is a suggestion that large tracks could be ploughed by tractors. That is again

another scheme which I am not going into on this occasion, but that is a matter for those who are in charge to examine whether it is feasible or not. Otherwise, to purchase this 56,000 heads of cattle is really a proposition that is perhaps next to impossibility. Then, the economic position of the farmers is such that it will take a long time, three or four years, to recover from this damage. It cannot be expected that next year they will be on their feet. Even the effects of the 1943 cyclone in North Balasore in Orissa have not yet gone, people have not yet recovered from that shock which they received then. I have got my experience of that. Let us give all possible help so that these people may recover as soon as possible, but it will take them three or four years to recover gradually in stages.

Then with regard to the administration I am told a Relief Commissioner has been appointed, the administration is being streamlined. I had a discussion with the Chief Minister there, and he has been good enough to accept some of the suggestions how it should be streamlined. In this again I appeal to all sections, not only Congressmen but those in the opposition also to try to help the administration in all possible ways. Supposing at a certain stage they do not listen to us, they are adamant in their own position, then I think we should approach the Government of India to correct them because this is a serious matter. We cannot go and carry on an agitation.

**An hon. Member:** That stage has come now.

**Shri Mahatab:** If that is the point of any Member here, then let us approach the Food Minister in his office and try to get things done. This long range discussion probably will not bear any fruit. That is my suggestion, because the situation is so serious and I do not know how to describe it.

I give one instance. While I was there in one of the blocks, the ration cards were not issued because under the rules the ration cards had to be signed by a revenue officer. The BDO was present, the revenue officer was not present. I persuaded the BDO to sign. I said I would take the responsibility and protect him whatever might happen. I got it signed by him and got the ration cards issued. This is a small matter but that would have meant a delay of two days in distribution. I think there are many ways in which we can be of use. I have been told that opposition Members who are very critical here are trying to help the administration there. If we have other points to take up, political or otherwise let us take them up later on, not in the midst of the crisis. Let us try and see that people are relieved of their distress.

**Shri L. N. Bhanja Deo (Keonjhar):**

Sir, I am one with my hon. friend Dr. Mahatab who spoke just before me that this matter has to be tackled from a humanitarian point of view and there should be no squabbling as to what we should do according to the famine code which is probably outdated. Our main concern here in a welfare state is that we should try to bring relief and succour to the people when they are hard-hit by natural calamities of the type that we are facing in Orissa. Of course I have not been to the areas which are acutely hit just like my friend the Maharaja of Kalahandi and Mr. Pattanayak. But from what we gathered from papers and from what I have heard from friends, the situation here is really distressing and is very acute. To tackle a problem of this magnitude both the resources at the command of the centre as well as the state had to be augmented and co-ordinated to tackle a matter of this magnitude. It cannot be left to the state alone to find ways and means to meet a calamity of this kind. But having faced a similar situation in 1954 when I had the fortune of being a member of the Orissa legislative assembly, that should have opened the eyes of the Govern-

ment to meet the situation like that. I recollect what I have said on that occasion from the long-term point of view. Unless we tackle this situation from a long-term point of view the short-term palliative just to meet the situation as it occurs does not give permanent relief because we know from our experience about the vagaries of nature, especially in India and in the parts I come from. We have both the ravages of floods as well as drought, if not in alternate years, in periods of cycles because as I have gathered these cycles probably come in periods of ten years. That is why what I had suggested at that time is useful in meeting this situation in the backward areas of those parts of Orissa from which I happen to come and from which the Maharaja of Kalahandi has come. There are lots of tribal people. I am very sorry to say that during the period of the last 16 or 20 years much has not been done there. Their main resource was the forest produce and they were destroying them, though in our time also they were destroying them indiscriminately but there were certain checks. Unfortunately, they were merged in a bigger unit and the forest reserves of those areas are being depleted; they are not done on a long-term planning to meet the requirements of the people. That is the main cause of the drought because it is my experience of that area and I come from that area, that rainfall has gradually, over a period of the last thirty years, been deteriorating in these areas because of the lack of forests which catch rain. No doubt something is being done to meet the situation by way of soil conservation and to augment the forest resources but not in comparison to the depletion that has taken place or is now taking place because every year there are indiscriminate encroachments into the forests to convert them into land. Unless this process is stopped we will not have adequate forests to catch the rain because that is the problem everywhere. Deserts are not created in a day. The Rajasthan desert or the deserts in other countries, they take a long period of time to come to the pre-

[Shri L. N. Bhanja Deo]

sent state. Unless we are able to protect these areas which are being depleted, especially the catchment areas of important rivers in Orissa and take action to conserve them, I do not think we shall be meeting the long-term requirements of that part of the area. The next thing what we should do is to augment the minor and medium irrigation projects in those areas. Small wells or tanks in the way of relief for this problem will not be meeting the requirements of the people of these areas. It is not that we do not have natural water resources. Our Governor who is an expert on irrigation has suggested and has probably drawn up a long-term programme for this area. If that is executed and the planning commission gives the directive to the state government not only in the way of paper plan but with the resources to meet these requirements, I think this problem could be solved once for all. While we were discussing with the Prime Minister the other day about the problem of these areas, I was one of the Members to discuss the matter, I was surprised that some of us still did not grapple with the situation, and with what is the requirements? Certain areas were under the rulers or were under the vested interests at one point of time. In spite of a long lapse of 18 years, we still say that these areas were neglected in those days and because of lack of communication the succour to the people did not reach. But we forget at the same time that the times have changed. In spite of the lapse of 18 years, if we have not been able to develop communications in that area, we cannot fairly blame those who were administering those areas and now say that due to their neglect of these areas, they are such. I give one example about the communication problem of my area. Those who come from urban areas or thickly populated areas, probably may not appreciate the difficulty of catering for an area like my area of 3,000 square miles where communication is lacking. I am very sorry to say that in 1962 when elec-

tions were in the offing, I went to that area and again two years ago I wanted to go there. I could not even go there in a jeep, leave alone other means of communications. There is block development. It comes under the block development area. Yet communications in that area is so poor that it was not possible for me even to go to these areas. Only in summer months one could go there. If during those periods it is difficult for us as Members of Parliament or legislature to go there to find the requirements of the people, you can well appreciate in times of emergency like this what succour could be taken to the people in those areas? I know our Chief Minister, who was the revenue minister when he tackled the 1954-55 drought conditions and the hon. Maharaja of Kalandhandi happened to be a member of the legislature those days will bear me out, tackled that situation ably. Given the resources for which our Government had approached the Government of India, I am sure he will be able to tackle the problem ahead of us because I know him to be very human and he will not like the distress to continue in that area. Not that he is not very practical; he may be lacking the dynamism of some but that does not mean he is not in the know of the problem and does not want to bring relief and succour to the distressed people there.

I would suggest one or two measures for the consideration of the Food Minister who had been to Orissa lately, though unfortunately due to reasons beyond his control, he could not go to the actually drought-affected areas. But from what I gathered from him during my talk yesterday, I feel he is in full grip of the requirements of the situation prevailing in Orissa. He has given particular emphasis on seeing that there is no bottle-neck at the administrative level. A special officer has been appointed who will discharge the duties of the Government and go away with

redtapism. I would urge him to ask the State Government to send the officers to help the people in those affected areas with a missionary zeal, as the Maharaja of Kalahandi was saying. I happened to go round certain pockets in my area which has been affected by drought for the last 12 years. There is one panchayat called Parjanpur panchayat area, which has been affected by drought for the last 12 years. Yet conditions there are not so severe as in those areas which are very badly hit. I went with the Collector and I found wherever the Collector is sympathetic and wants to do something, he can easily get it done. I was surprised to hear from some hon. members who had visited the severely affected area that the Collector and some officers in charge of the district had not yet visited those areas.

Another matter which I would like the Food Minister to consider is this. It is not so much the supply of rice that we want. If paddy is supplied to these areas, apart from foodgrains and fodder for cattle we can also give supplementary work for the people there if the paddy is husked there. Besides that, some subsidiary food also can be got out of the paddy, which is not used as rice, but small broken paddy that can be used for gruel which can form a supplementary diet.

Hon. Dr. Mahtab referred to the tractor organisation in the State. But the conditions are such that we have got very small land-holdings where even if we have the entire tractors at the disposal of the Government, we will not be able to cultivate these areas, because various complications about tenancy rights, etc. would arise. So, if we supply cattle which can do the cultivation in these areas it will be better.

Since the Prime Minister is visiting the area shortly, I would urge on her to go to the famine-affected areas specially and spend more time there

than having discussions with the officials, because that will not only create confidence in the people, but it will give her an opportunity to see things directly for herself.

**Shri Surendranath Dwivedy:** Sir, this is a national calamity. It is really a slur on our democracy that after 18 years of freedom, a section of our population has been reduced to a position where they cannot get enough to eat and they have to die of starvation. I have been watching the proceedings of the House not only today, but in the past whenever this question has arisen. I am surprised not only at the complacent attitude of the Government, but of my fellow Members of Parliament, who ought to take this matter very seriously. If even one person dies in this land, Mr. Subramaniam may feel that his caravan is running all right, but the disgrace is on very Indian in this country. The House should seriously consider this matter.

Mr. Mahtab might try to white-wash the whole thing; he may be sincerely concerned about the suffering of the people there and therefore he may urge "let us forget everything and devote our attention entirely to removing the distress of the people there at the moment" . . .

**Mr. Chairman:** He said, let us devote our attention to that first and then we can see what can be done about other things.

**Shri Surendranath Dwivedy:** That is what I was saying; there is no question of interrupting me. I want to know what is the controversy going on now. This matter was first brought before the Orissa Assembly not by me or by any newspaper, but by a Deputy Minister of the Congress Party who is representing that area. He said, the people are migrating and the situation is very serious. Children have been sold and unless immediate action was taken, thousands will die. What was the result? The reply was, it is a tissue

[Shri Surendranath Dwivedy]

of lies and third-hand information has been given; and, that man was asked not to open his mouth. That is how the situation has been tackled there. Here the Food Minister is still not concerned with the relief of the people, but he is only concerned with the controversy whether there is famine, acute scarcity or starvation death. They have not the slightest concern. Any person with a little bit of concern for the people would have apologised before the nation.

See this report. Everybody who has visited that place, except the Minister and the officials, have said there have been starvation deaths. But Mr. Subramaniam could not go there because of the rains. Without waiting at Bhubaneswar to talk to the officers, he should have gone there by car. But he did not go there on the plea that rains have come. He believes the same officers who have given this report, which is not worth the paper on which it is written. On the basis of this report decisions are taken. Unless the situation is analysed and properly assessed, no amount of relief measures can be said to be proper for the occasion. Mr. Mahtab says famine conditions exist. Why are they fighting shy of declaring this fact which has been admitted by all? Everybody who has gone there including the Press correspondents, except the officials and Ministers, has said and corroborated that there is starvation death. They have no quarrels with this Government. The Sarvodaya People and the Press Correspondents have no quarrel with this Government. The *Statesman's* correspondent, who is writing harrowing tales has no quarrels with the Government. They are giving names after names. The Minister could have taken a day or two to verify whether at least one name is correct. Even about starvation deaths, what does this team, on which he relies, say? The Orissa Government had at long last in November agreed. Then a Deputy Minister

after visiting that place—Deodhar village said there have been 9 deaths of children due to superimposed illness and continued malnutrition and also the death of one adult. Mr. Subramaniam should sack these people who have given this report. It says that any evidence of widespread malnutrition was not visible in the area. Can you believe a report like this? They do not know the actual conditions of the area. About starvation deaths what do they say? Names have been quoted by Shri Kishen Pattnayak. These names have been published in the newspapers giving the names of their villages, their age, family names etc. But they have not verified this. How have these deaths occurred? These shameless creatures, they say:

"Our impression is that specific cases looked into are cases of death caused by prolonged illness like T.B., diabetes, etc., commencing long before the scarcity conditions set in, though death was probably accelerated by malnutrition."

Did these nine children die because of diabetes? Can you imagine such a report on the basis of which you are going to decide what relief measures you are going to take for these people? This is the state of affairs in this country.

We should not fight shy of reality. There is a false sense of dignity in this country. The Prime Minister sometimes goes and makes speeches in Delhi saying that in this country there have been no starvation deaths, these cannot be starvation deaths. When she goes on repeating, no starvation deaths, no starvation deaths, naturally, the officers who give these reports, who want to be good to their masters, prepare these reports accordingly to suit the statements of my hon. friend. Shri Subramaniam and the Government. That is how things are manipulated and the real conditions have been concealed.

Sir, people are dying in their hundreds. That is the actual position. It is not a pleasure for us to come here and say these things. They say it is a surplus State. They say there is no food shortage. If there was no food shortage, why have these deaths occurred, why has this situation arisen? What is the reason for it? Has he entered into it? He says everything is quite all right, the State is proceeding according to Plan and everything is all right. Then why have these things happened? What is his explanation for it? What explanation has he to offer? It is admitted by Shri Mahatab and also by the report here that till the beginning of March no relief measures have been started in that area. You will be surprised to know that in the district of Kalahandi—my friends are trying to lay the blame on the ex Maharaja of Kalahandi although the ex rulers are not there and although they hold the title of Maharaja there are no Maharajas existing in this country—in the present area which is a famine area, which never formed part of any native State but which formed part of a regular British district, famine conditions exists, and if they declare it has a famine area four to five lakhs of people will have to be fed till the next harvest. That is the position. Shri Mahatab may not agree. If they once declare that it is a famine area, they will have to take up the responsibility of feeding these four to five lakhs people—I do not say, six million people.

Sir, scarcity conditions prevail there. Everybody is agreed on that point. It varies from place to place. But acute conditions exist in this area where people of all classes and stature are unable to maintain themselves. Even your relief works will not do anything there. In those places it is necessary for the Government to declare, at least in respect of that area, that it is a famine-affected area because a large number of deaths have taken place.

What they say is, and it was repeated by my friend, Shri Menon, the other day, that there is no question of shortage of rice, this situation has arisen because of lack of purchasing power. You will be surprised to know that after this report was submitted in February, between February and April all these deaths have occurred. What has been done during this period? How are you going to give purchasing power to the people? What measures are you actually taking in that direction? These are the questions that have to be considered.

Simply because the Central Government does not want to say that it is a famine-affected area, simply because they do not want to say that these are starvation deaths in Orissa, the Orissa Government asks their people to say that these are not starvation deaths. But it has been mentioned here that a person who went to the hospital died and after post mortem it was recorded in the hospital that there was nothing in his stomach and he died. That officer is being taken to task. He is asked why he reported like this. This is worse than British period. I can tell you, even the British people, when in 1866 a Commission was appointed, said that ten lakhs of people died because of the failure of local officers. Here they want to protect everybody. People may die, but they want to pose as if they are running this country quite well. This really is nonsense. One cannot stand this disgrace.

Let us frankly admit that there has been a lapse. Who is responsible for that? I agree with Shri Mahatab. I would even say, appoint a Parliamentary Commission. Let our friends who do not believe these facts come with us and see things for themselves. Let not the Prime Minister go over the place in a helicopter, spend only one or two hours in the affected areas and then address public meetings at Bhubaneswar. We do not want the Prime Minister to address meetings there. That is



[Shri Surendranath Dwivedy]

not our immediate problem. The immediate problem is to go there and see what can be done to relieve the sufferings of the people. Let Shri Subramaniam accompany us. Let there be a Parliamentary Commission to find out what is the actual condition. Let us see what we can do. It is not a party question. There is no question of any government being toppled. If there was any sensible government here, it would have taken over the administration there. It is a question of saving the lives of lakhs of people. Let us all cooperate and find out the facts and suggest measures to save the people there. For that, I am prepared to say, let us suspend all other activities and try to save these lakhs of people in that part of the country.

What are they eating? I have before me a sample of this powder called *salap* out of which liquor is prepared. This is being sold in the market. Can you imagine such a thing? I have pictures with me here. I do not want to take the time of the House by showing these very grim pictures showing conditions there. I do not want to tire the House with them, with such horrible pictures at this stage.

But let my suggestion be accepted. Let us go there and see things for ourselves. Let five or six Members of Parliament go there. I welcome those persons who do not believe these things to go there and find out the facts. Let us sit together and think how to alleviate the sufferings of these people and stop further miseries. Greater miseries are still ahead. Whatever you are hearing is nothing in comparison to what is coming. I can tell you, no amount of grants or loans or anything of that sort is going to help. One panchayat earned Rs. 14,000 by sale of cattle in the market by charging two annas for every sale—and these officers who went there have reported, that cattle has not gone out of the State. I

think those persons who have not even the slightest idea of the living conditions of the people were sent there. Let them sit here at the Planning Commission table and write stories for the gratification of ministers like Shri Subramaniam who in turn will tell the Parliament and outside that everything is all right.

**Mr. Chairman:** Cattle were sold individually or in the cattle market?

**Shri Surendranath Dwivedy:** Truck-loads of cattle and goats were sold in the market and they went out of the State. I can tell you another thing. In this part of Orissa cattle is not available. They come 50 or 60 miles to our side of the State to purchase cattle. Not only people have gone out but cattle also have gone out. And, who had the heyday? It was the heyday for money-lenders. It was the heyday—I do not want to name any community—of the mercantile community.

**An hon. Member:** *Marwaris.*

**Shri Surendranath Dwivedy:** They have done this. Nobody is trying to prevent this and this is happening. Now there is no cattle, no seed, no capacity even to till the land. When that is the situation, what should we do? We must see that agricultural operations start as soon as possible so that they are saved for the future.

**Mr. Chairman:** The hon. Member should try to conclude now.

**Shri Surendranath Dwivedy:** Sir, you can ring the bell. You can even ask me to sit down. There is nothing more for me to say. I do not expect anything from this Government. I know that is an unfortunate part of this country. Because our people are docile, because they are adivasis, because they are not politically developed, they are made to suffer. If they had developed a situation like that in Bengal or Kerala these people

would not have sat here silently and discussed with us what is happening there. Because they are peaceful citizens they have to die and nobody listens to them. It started in August, 1965 and now we are discussing what relief measures are to be undertaken. More than nine months have passed and many more months will pass like this. That is the situation here. You may ask me not to say anything and I do not want to say anything.

16 hrs.

Regarding the fair price shops, a reference is made here in this report that 1,100 or so many fair price shops have been opened.

**Shrimati Renu Chakravartty:** Please read out that contradictory portion.

**Shri Surendranath Dwivedy:** There are many. What can I say?

Then, I may tell you about these fair price shops. Everybody knows that Orissa is supplying rice outside. There are three types of rice—super-fine, fine and common rice. It has been admitted by this report that in these fair price shops rice is being sold for 91 paise per kilo.

**Mr. Chairman:** Could I ask you what remedies should we adopt now? (Interruption).

**Shrimati Renu Chakravartty:** Overhaul.

**Shri Surendranath Dwivedy:** I am very glad that you put that question. I am prepared to say this that the present Government is thoroughly incapable of tackling the situation.

श्री बागड़ी : सुबहपायम साहब को इस्तीफा देना चाहिये । यह लोगों के कानिब हैं ।

**Shri Surendranath Dwivedy:** The Centre should take over the entire

administration and relief measures in the area. Let the State Government agree but if the State Government does not agree, let us invoke President's rule, if necessary, or the Constitution may be amended, if necessary. Again, I say that if they think that it is a national cause, that everybody should support this, let them set up a committee consisting of all parties to see how to tackle this very serious situation there. We are prepared to lend our hand of co-operation. I am prepared to suspend all other activities and devote ourselves completely and fully for that type of work together. That is how it should be dealt with.

Now what do we find? They go to the officials, bring the papers and give us the information that everything is all right.

**Mr. Chairman:** He should conclude now.

**Shri Surendranath Dwivedy:** If you will bear with me, I was saying that there are three types of rice. They are completely in the hands of the millowners. They are in league with the millowners. This is rice that has been brought from the fair price shop. This is worse than common rice and this is being sold for 91 paise. In the market, they admit, rice is being sold for Re. 1. This 91 paise per kilo rice, according to Government's own verification and categorisation, actually should have been sold at 74 paise. Because the millowners are supplying it, some ministers must have told the supply officer to certify this so that he gets the money and he gets a chunk out of it. Nobody sees it. So many officers are working there but nobody sees it. My hon. friend, a Member of the other House, who visited this area, pointed out to the officers that this is being done. He told the Chief Minister there that at least for God's sake, whatever you may be doing, pass the order that whatever type of rice may be sold there, it will have

[Shri Surendranath Dwivedy]

a uniform price, that is, the lowest price—76 or 75 paise, not more than that. I do not know whether they have done that or not.

That is what is happening. These matters cannot be tackled only by sitting here and saying that everything is all right and that everything has been done all right. Shri Mahatab repeatedly stated as to what the poor Food Minister is to do, how can we make him responsible for this. Of course, he is speaking in Parliament. How can he accuse his own friend? I can understand his difficulty and his awkwardness. I fully sympathise with him. But I accuse Shri Subramaniam.

श्री बागड़ी : मुस्लिम है ।

Shri Surendranath Dwivedy: I charge him for the death of these people because fully well it was known to the Central Government, however halting and whatever may be the fault of the State Government, that these things are happening and it is going to take a serious turn. In spite of that, they say shamefacedly here again that after the reports of scarcity conditions were available they were not exporting rice. Shri Menon was repeating this that day. But the fact remains that in January they exported rice. You will be surprised to know that—I was in Sundargarh District yesterday which is affected 75 per cent by acute famine and shortage I was told, even during acute shortage in Kalahandi District there was some hundreds of maunds of rice at Bhawanipatna, and it was supplied to other areas, it was not supplied to this place. In January when there was shortage of rice and when it was not sent to that area, Shri Subramaniam ordered that rice should be sent to Kerala.....

Mr. Chairman: You have to conclude now.

Shri Surendranath Dwivedy:..... and to West Bengal. Rice is being exported. We have been doing that for long. We are prepared to do that whenever there is an occasion. Whenever it is the national demand, Orissa never grudges doing that. Though Orissa is given the lowest price, for the national cause Orissa does not bother. But is it time, I ask you, when there are scarcity conditions and they need rice, that you want them to export it to other places?

That is why I say that the seriousness of the situation has not been realised either here or there as a result of which people are dying. We are wasting our time here because we cannot paint more grim pictures than has already been painted in newspapers by independent correspondents and others who have seen the place. It is all there. Only the high priests of Government do not realise that it is there. So, if the discussion has any value or any worth, let us here and now declare that a very serious situation has developed there, famine conditions exist, people have died, we shall prevent further deaths, we shall see that the situation does not deteriorate and we will take measures for that. Let them tell us what are the measures necessary for the purpose. It is not a question of accusing again, but I tell you what harm you are doing.

I made a press statement and I have got a letter from the Bombay Central Relief Committee....

Mr. Chairman: Please conclude the first part, whatever you were suggesting.

Shri Surendranath Dwivedy: I have made the suggestion. Let them tell us what concrete measures they are taking and what sort of help they need. Let us sit together, but before doing that we must overhaul the administration because whatever

scheme you may have it will not work.

Then, they are doing another harm. Not only because of the false sense of dignity they are not admitting that there is famine and starvation conditions, he has said from Bhubaneswar that the situation is well under control. It is really very surprising that a responsible person like him should say that. He could be agitated when there was Hindi agitation in the south which affected his constituency, but he will not have a little concern when there are deaths there. He says, the situation is under control!

I made a press statement and I have received letters from Bombay, from the Bombay Central Relief Committee, saying, "We want to go there to help the people and give them as much relief as is necessary, how we can be helped by Government, where do we go, how do we go, whether the railways and others would give us the facilities." The world outside knows that that is the situation. There are sufficient patriotic, citizens in this country who will come forward, whether the Government helps them or not, to help these people and to alleviate their misery. But let him say that there is a very serious situation. Let us all appeal to philanthropic persons, wherever they may be, to come forward and help these people. Our friends, the peasants, in Madras, Andhra and other places would come forward to part with their seeds in order that agricultural operations start there. It cannot be done by the Government machinery because it moves slowly. He does not realise what harm he is doing.

Therefore, I suggest to him most humbly that for the sake of these people let us admit that there is utter misery and there is famine. It is a disgrace and, I think, mere resignation will not do. By his resigning it will be a political victory for us. I think, any respectable person would resign, but he would not resign. I

do not press for his resignation because if I had the capacity I would throw him out. I do not believe in the mercy of persons resigning voluntarily. The administration has failed completely and miserably and he should admit that.

Shri H. N. Mukerjee (Calcutta Central): Mr. Chairman, it is something that the Prime Minister chose to be here for a little while because she had the opportunity of listening to Shri Dwivedy and for a change Shri Nanda also graced us with his presence for some time, but I was wondering about the whereabouts of our Planning Minister who, I thought, owed it to the Minister of Food Imports to share and, to some extent, soothe his headache. But, may be, the Planning Minister is trying to recover from the impact of what he has himself called all "meetings of minds" which he experienced and enjoyed in America. In Orissa, there has been for quite sometime now in the political atmosphere a stink which rose to high heavens when certain individuals carrying the names of Patnaik and Mitra and so on and so forth had created an atmosphere about which the whole country was ashamed and remains thoroughly ashamed till today. That was a political stink and that has been succeeded on account of the utter inefficiency of the administration, to which reference was made by Mr. Dwivedy in such eloquent terms, by the ugly smell of death, an excruciating smell of death when children die, when old people are left to their own resources and whoever has a wherewithal to do so walk upto a town nearby leaving those areas where scarcity conditions are intolerable.

I had a look at those photographs which Mr. Dwivedy has brought with him and they are such as would wring tears out of stones. I remember, the other day, to my shame that our friend, Mr. Kishen Pattanayak, had brought up the question of starvation deaths, of children dying, infants dying and on that occasion

[Shri H. N. Mukerjee]

there was resistance from the Treasury Benches and we had to counter that resistance in order to have some opportunity for a discussion. Our friend, a very good friend, Mr. Hare Krishna Mehtab, has suggested that we keep politics out of it. Who wants to bring politics into a matter where humanitarian impulses require to be invoked? How can we keep away from politics when this kind of thing happens? But how can we forget the Minister over there,—I don't see him; my visibility has probably weakened—and how is it that the quibbling over words continues even to the present day as my friend, Mr. Dwivedy has pointed out? How is it that in this House on the 27th of April, the Speaker had to exercise his authority after he was goaded by some of us, to command the presence of Mr. Subramaniam and to ask him to report in regard to conditions in Orissa? He wanted to go with the Prime Minister, clinging to her skirt tails, 15 days later and give a kind of report and this House told him that he could not get away with that kind of absurdity. We had to do that.

In the Orissa Assembly, I discovered, on the 21st of April, the Deputy Chief Minister—the Chief Minister has a deputy, a man called Mr. Routrey—was breezily telling the Assembly that there was an adequate supply of rice to meet all internal requirements in the State. The *Statesman* reports, and my friend the Maharaja of Kalahandi has referred to it, that the Orissa State Deputy Chief Minister for Community Development who represents the only Kalahandi electorate where a Congress nominee got returned last time, had warned the Government as early as August that people in hills and other areas were in great distress and that they urgently needed help. The Opposition also was saying the same thing. But the Opposition is always sought to be black-guarded by Government and their administrative

minions who have nothing better to do than to dot the i's and cut the t's. as far as governmental pronouncements are concerned. How can we keep politics entirely out of the picture? They are still quibbling over words. The *Statesman* reporter who is writing a special feature on this matter writes very ominous words. I am quoting his words from today's edition of the *Statesman*:

"The people who are being fed at free kitchens at Khariar, Sinalj and other places look the same as those who roamed the streets of Calcutta in the black days of the Bengal famine of 1943."

This is the condition of things to which the country is reduced by the inefficiency, the callousness and the criminality of this Government which seeks to disown responsibility at a point of time when they could come forward before the House and the country and ask for cooperation of all concerned in order to resolve these difficulties which arise. We are always ready to offer cooperation if a suggestion is made in time and on honourable terms. But it is never done. It is always done too late and in a grudging spirit and they want to put us in the wrong by saying that we do not give our cooperation. We have been trying to do something. I have noted the Members like Mr. Dwivedy and others have been persistently trying to raise this matter and everytime there is resistance from the Treasury Benches. They tell us we are scare-mongering, that we ourselves are trying to picture a situation in the darkest possible colours only in order to give the Government a bad name and to hang it. The Government does not require a bad name in order to have it hanged. As far as the people are concerned, they know what this Government is worth. Only because they have not yet got the organisation and the kind of political consciousness that should go along with that orga-

nisational ability that this Government still continues to cling to power. They can only cling to power by the power of the purse, by that kind of ugly machinations, but they have no moral right to remain in authority in any part of the country. And Orissa is the pointer: the handwriting is on the wall.

They are postponing the elections in Orissa, one reason being that the people of Orissa in spite of their being submerged, in spite of their being considered to be not particularly advanced as far as political consciousness goes. They are still very well aware that this Government is no longer able to serve the people and should be given the order of the boot as soon as that is possible. How can we keep out politics when the food policy of this Government has continued to be such a very tragic farce ever since 1947? In 1948, in two years' time, they said, we would no longer need food imports; in 1956, there is another target year; then, Mr. S. K. Patil begins his buffer stock idea with P.L. 480 bounty; in 1966, they said, we shall cease to depend on foreign imports and Mr. Subramaniam—I don't blame him; he has inherited the legacy—says, in 1971 or 1972, we shall perhaps be able to do something. How can we forgive this kind of Government?

We are told that the whole country is covered with community development schemes and national extension blocks. The former Minister who is an enthusiast, almost an evangelist, in regard to this matter said once that we have 15 million village volunteers able to do all kinds of work. Where the devil are they? Where have they gone? Where have they vanished? Why cannot we mobilise the man-power of our people? Why do we have such a million strong volunteer force?

**Mr. Chairman:** Who is he?

**Shri H. N. Mukerjee:** Mr. S. K. Dey. When I said he was an evan-

gelist, I thought you recognised him. I may have used expression of a tenuous character.

**Mr. Chairman:** I have to learn it from the Professor like him.

**Shri H. N. Mukerjee:** Perhaps, you came to this House only in 1962. If you were here since October, 1952, when that portfolio was created and Mr. Dey began to function, you would have collected so much material about his evangelist activities that you would not have needed any kind of explanation.

Here, in this country, I refer to the Minister of Planning, not particularly because I like the look of his face, the problem is that there are pockets of distress in the State of Orissa, particularly in the ex-princely States of Orissa—I am not going to blame anybody—or in north Bihar or in Rayalaseema district of Andhra and so many other places which could be named or in Rajasthan from where plaintive telegrams are coming that there is no water, that people are crying for the sake of drinking water. We are celebrating the Gandhi Centenary and Mr. Ranga and I and Mr. Dwivedy are all called upon to participate in meetings to discuss such things as national integration, in order to commemorate Gandhiji and all that and the people do not get a drop of water to drink in Gandhiji's country! There are in Rajasthan and in so many other areas of our country pockets of distress. What has the Planning Commission got to say about it? Why don't they look after these areas? Why don't they have the priorities? They have a sense of priority, I hope. The priorities should be set up and some kind of effort should be made to work according to those priorities. Many of the people concerned who are suffering are aboriginals, the tribal world of our country which is sometimes in uproar. But they are innocent people, God's own children, so to speak, innocent of the trappings of the miserable kind of civilisation which so

[Shri H. N. Mukerjee]

many of us seem to be proud of. These aboriginals of this country, from one end to the other, from Nagaland and Mizo land to Orissa, to Bastar, to wherever you look, are in trouble, in distress, in agony and all that. What we see from time to time is that we appoint a committee or we send a study team or we arrange a seminar of something of that sort. This kind of thing just will not pass muster. The people's grievances are mounting in this country. Woes and indignities abound in this country. It is disgrace abounding, in a manner which no civilised community can tolerate for any further length of time. But the rulers of our country, whether in the Centre or in the States never care for the people. The administration is preoccupied with other things, and the sufferings accumulate.

But, as I have said before in this House, the line between hunger and anger is very thin, and when the anger of our people, the disinherited of our land who have suffered throughout the ages, is roused, it may be that situations might arise in comparison with which the Russian revolution would look like a tea party. In this country you never know what things might happen. Provided you have the understanding, the wisdom, the insight to approach the people in time and bring something like a healing touch, you can perhaps manage the problem. But who is going to manage the problem? Has this team of Ministers led by whoever is there for the time being got the slightest suggestion or trace of a capacity to tackle with imagination and power the problems which face this country? Have they got the power today to approach the people, to tell them plainly about our difficulties, not to put a cloak on our difficulties, not to hide the fact that in parts of our country people are starving, not merely mumble about the image of India being distorted? The image of India is blackened enough in the eyes

of the world. But has this Government led by whoever it is, got the imagination, the power, the gumption the strength, the character, to appear before our own people, not only in Parliament, but also in the country and do things and say things which would enthuse, which would bring about the result? No; they cannot do it. That was why Shri Surendranath Dwivedy had to say that it would be like Kerala or West Bengal in Orissa; unless you look out, Kerala everywhere would come into the picture, and there is no doubt about it.

I do not want merely to say things in sharp criticism of Government, though they need to be said and they deserve it. I say at the same time also that we have to make a more constructive approach because for a temporary solution of problems we have to try to help as much as possible.

In regard to what is being done, this report has been amply dealt with by Shri Surendranath Dwivedy. But even this report suggests that in the free feeding centres, the quantity supplied appears to be—they cannot say more than that—rather inadequate. I do not know what to say or think about this sort of thing. Only one meal is supplied, and even the official team which goes, at the time when things are rigged up, I am sure, in those particular free feeding centres, has discovered that the one meal supplied to these poor starving famishing people is inadequate. Do something. Please do increase the quantum of food,—whatever you have got—from these free feeding centres, and get the assistance of non-official agencies. Do not stand on ceremony. Do not stand on ceremony in regard to nomenclature about famine or scarcity conditions. Do not stand on ceremony regarding Government being able to control the situation. It is no use controlling the situation; do something to relieve the situation. For that purpose, get the assistance of the Ramakrishna Mission or other philan-

thropic missions some of which have already approached Shri Surendra-nath Dwivedy.

In regard to work being offered to the people, let us find out what kind of work could be given, which would be continued even when the rains begin, because the rains will soon start and the work has to be of such a nature that work continues. Even at the present stage, this committee reports:

"The result of our enquiries is that on an average an adult gets about 62 paise a day for the sort of work he is putting in."

While he ought to be able to earn at least Rs. 1.25, he is getting only 62 paise. Therefore, this aspect has got to be looked into.

In regard to supply of seeds, as Shri Mahatab has pointed out, the supply of seeds should be made in good time so that the results can be commensurate. The loans also have been referred to by Shri Mahatab. The fear is expressed that if we give the loans a little too early, people need food so badly that the loan given for seeds or implements or whatever else which may be necessary for agricultural purposes would be eaten up, because the people would want to buy the food as soon as they get the money.

**Shri Ranga:** Cattle-feed is also needed.

**Shri H. N. Mukerjee:** I say that in regard to the loans, there is a fear expressed that the loans might be eaten up by people who are so much in distress that instead of keeping the money in reserve for the purchase of implements or seeds or whatever else might be necessary for agricultural operations, they may eat it up by way of purchase of food; but even so, make a proper calculation, get the panchayats into the picture; get your national extension service blocks or

whatever else you have got into the picture and see that the loans are properly utilised and are really helpful. So also, do something in regard to the farm labourers who have left the agricultural areas and gone to some other township or some other areas, many of whom are missing, because there are photographs of people, women and men waiting for their children to come back. Do something about the return of the farm labourers.

Then, this report says that medium and minor irrigation schemes could be of great help. But how is it that after so many years of talk about medium and minor irrigation schemes, we have not got much progress? We have Ministers here, the Minister of Irrigation and Power, the Minister of State for Irrigation and Power, and we have umpteen material and literature supplied over what we are doing about the irrigation projects. How is it then that medium and minor irrigation schemes go on being neglected for so long?

Then I would say, let immediate decisions be taken, because the reports are ready; you do not have to appoint another miserable Commission or committee or whatever it may be; the reports are ready on the basis of which, facts are available, on the basis of which you can have a scheme for the specially derelict areas of our country, and in regard to Orissa, let immediate top priority measures be taken so that the suffering of the people could be alleviated.

I would, therefore, conclude by saying this. We all want to bring whatever alleviation is possible to the misery of our people who are suffering in Orissa; whether they suffer in Orissa or Bengal or Kerala or Gujarat, we all suffer. Who lives if Orissa dies? Does India live if Orissa dies? we cannot conceive of that kind of contingency. Let us all behave in a manner which would really mean that as Indians we feel for the people of Orissa. Let us try to alleviate the



[Shri H. N. Mukerjee]

position. But at the same time, here in Parliament, we try to function to the best of our ability which may be very little; we try to function as the mouthpiece of the people. The people have suffered beyond words in Orissa, as they have suffered beyond words and will continue to suffer beyond words in many other parts of the country; to that suffering, it is our bounden duty and obligation to give voice in the forum of the nation. That is why we have to say, at the same time as we offer whatever possible co-operation available to Government and is acceptable to Government and will actually be taken by Government, that we have to voice our indignation at the indignity to which our own people have been subject, the indignity of the utterest kind of poverty which has meant the kind of starvation deaths as have been reported from Orissa.

Mr. Chairman: Shri K. C. Jena.

Shri S. M. Banerjee: Are you extending the time for this discussion?

Shri C. Subramaniam: I have to reply to all the speeches, and for that I require at least half an hour. The debate has to conclude by 5 P.M. If you are going to call any other Member now, I do not know how I shall be able to reply to the debate.

Mr. Chairman: He can reply tomorrow.

An hon. Member: It is only for 2½ hours.

Shri Surendranath Dwivedy: Let it be extended. In order to enable the hon. Minister to reply adequately, let us extend it.

Mr. Chairman: We may extend it up to 5.30 P.M. and the hon. Minister may be called at 5.30 P.M.

Shri S. M. Banerjee: You may extend it up to 6 P.M.

Shri Nambiar: All sections of the House may be given an opportunity.

Mr. Chairman: There would not be enough time for that. Let us see.

श्री जेना (भद्रक) : सभापति महोदय, उड़ीसा की स्थिति संकटपूर्ण है। उड़ीसा एक पिछड़ा हुआ छोटा प्रदेश है जिसकी कि जनसंख्या 175 लाख है और जिसमें कि हरिजन और आदिवासियों की संख्या 50 से 55 लाख तक है। इस से मालूम होता है कि उड़ीसा की जनसंख्या का एक तिहाई हरिजन और आदिवासी हैं। उस की जो आर्थिक स्थिति है वह हमेशा ही पिछड़ी हुई रही है। अगर उड़ीसा के पिछले 100 साल के इतिहास का अध्ययन किया जाय तो पता चलेगा कि उड़ीसा हर साल खाद्यान्न का अभाव होता है। श्री किशन पटनायक ने बतलाया है कि केन्द्रीय सरकार ने उड़ीसा को धान के बारे में एक सरप्लस स्टेट माना है। अब मेरा कहना है कि वहाँ अधिक धान तो होता है लेकिन इतना अधिक नहीं होता कि वह बाहर देकर अपना गुजारा कर सकें। उस धान को जब तक वह नहीं बेचते तब तक उन के पास पैसा नहीं आता और उसके बगैर वह दूसरी अपनी आवश्यकता की चीजें नहीं खरीद सकते इसलिये उन्हें खाद्यान्न को बेचने पर मजबूर होना पड़ता है।

इस साल भी जो वहाँ पर संकट आया और खाद्यान्न का अभाव हुआ वह अनावृष्टि से हुआ है। प्रत्येक पांच साल में उड़ीसा में बाढ़ या अनावृष्टि का प्राकृतिक प्रकोप आता रहता है। हर साल ही कुछ न कुछ देवी संकट वहाँ पर आ जाया करता है। प्रत्येक पांच साल में वहाँ पर अनावृष्टि और बाढ़ की स्थिति आ जाती है। प्रति पांच वर्ष में आप देखेंगे कि अनावृष्टि और बाढ़ की जो मात्रा है वह बढ़ी ज्यादा हो जाती है और वहाँ की स्थिति बढ़ी संकटापन्न हो जाती है। उड़ीसा के सिर्फ 13 जिले हैं। प्रत्येक जिले में कुछ न कुछ फसल नष्ट हुई है, खाद्यान्नों की हानि हुई है।

खास कर 6 जिलों में फसल का नाश बड़े पैमाने पर हुआ है और वह 6 जिले हैं कालाहांडी बलांगीर, सुन्दरगढ़, कोरापुट, डेकानाल और फूलबानी। इन जिलों में बड़े पैमाने पर फसल की हानि हुई है।

उड़ीसा में खेती करने लायक जमीन 142 लाख 88 हजार एकड़ हैं। उस में से खरीक की फसल बोई गई थी 112 लाख 75 हजार 400 एकड़ में। उस में से पूरे तौर पर जिस भूमि की फसल नष्ट हुई है उस की मात्रा है 18 लाख 23 हजार 400 एकड़ और प्रांशिक फसल की जो हानि हुई है उस की मात्रा है 42 लाख 14 हजार 300 एकड़। अगर इस पूरी फसल की हानि और प्रांशिक हानि को इकट्ठा किया जाय तो उस की पूरी मात्रा होती है 60 लाख 37 हजार और 700 एकड़। जो जमीन खेती के अन्दर थी जैसा कि मैंने पहले बताया 112 लाख 75 हजार 400 एकड़ उस में से खली गयी 60 लाख 37 हजार और 700 एकड़ और बाकी रही 52 लाख 37 हजार 700 एकड़ जिसकी फसल की हानि नहीं हुई है। इतनी जमीन में फसल की कोई हानि नहीं हुई है।

बुर्भाग्य की बात है कि उड़ीसा जैसे पिछड़े प्रदेश में जिसकी कि धाबादी का एक तिहाई आदिवासी हरिजन हैं उसमें बड़े पैमाने पर फसलों की हानि हुई है। केन्द्रीय सरकार की रिपोर्ट और उड़ीसा सरकार की रिपोर्ट से यह मालूम होता है कि 185 लाख 36 हजार 245 क्विंटल धान की हानि इस साल हुई है। लेकिन स्थिति कुछ ऐसी है कि उड़ीसा खाल बाहर भेजता है क्योंकि उसके लिए केन्द्रीय सरकार का अनुरोध होता है और उड़ीसा सरकार उस अनुरोध की वजह से खाल भेजती है। अभी तक उड़ीसा सरकार केन्द्रीय सरकार पर यह चाप नहीं डाल पाई है कि दूसरे स्थानों से आयात लेकर उड़ीसा में भेजें। केन्द्रीय सरकार अभी विदेशी मुद्रा के अभाव की स्थिति में पड़ी हुई है और उस विदेशी मुद्रा की स्थिति पर और अधिक बोझा न डालने के लिए हमें उड़ीसा

सरकार को धन्यवाद देना चाहिए केन्द्रीय सरकार का यह कर्त्तव्य हो जाता है कि उड़ीसा की आर्थिक स्थिति जो कि संकटपूर्ण है उसे सुधारने में उड़ीसा सरकार जितनी आर्थिक सहायता चाहती है उतनी नहायता केन्द्र को देनी चाहिए।

14.36 hrs.

[MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER in the Chair]

अनादृष्टि के अंश में जो सरकार की तरफ से काम हो रहा है वह वहां तीन किस्म का हो रहा है एक होता है वह जिनके पास जमीन है उन को ऋण दिया जाता है चाहे वह लम्बे घस के लिए हो या छोटे घस के लिए हो। यह ऋण दिये जाते हैं। दूसरे यह कि जो सबल आदमी है जो काम कर सकते हैं उन्हें काम भी दिया जाता है, उनके वास्ते काम का बंदोबस्त किया जाता है जिससे कि वह अपनी कमाई कर लेते हैं। इस के अलावा जो बड़े आदमी हैं, अकर्मण्य लोग हैं उन्हें मुफ्त खाना खिलाने के वास्ते भी बंदोबस्त किया गया है। स्कूल जाने वाले बच्चों को, गांवों में रहने वाले छोटे छोटे बच्चे जिनकी कि स्थिति बहुत बुरी है उन को भी खाना मिलता है लेकिन उन्हें दिन में एक दफे मिलता है। मेरी मांग है कि उन्हें दिन में दो दफे भोजन मिलना चाहिए क्योंकि एक दफे खाना देने से वह तमाम दिन अपना गुजारा नहीं कर सकेंगे। यह जो काम हो रहा है इसे सरकारी और गैर सरकारी संस्थाएं दोनों कर रही हैं। उड़ीसा की रिनीफ कमिटी भी वह काम कर रही है और भारत सेवक ममाज भी वह काम कर रहा है। अभी भारत सेवक ममाज के बारे में जिक्र करते हुए हमारे कालाहांडी के महाराजा जोकि इम हाउस के एक माननीय सदस्य भी हैं उन्होंने भारत सेवक ममाज की निन्दा की और उन्होंने कहा कि यह भारत सेवक ममाज कांग्रेस का दूसरा नक्शा है। मैं उन से कहूंगा कि कांग्रेस अगर कोई अच्छी बात भी करती है तो भी वह बूक अपोजीशन में बैठे हैं इसलिए वह उनकी बुराई ही करेंगे।

[श्री जैना]

धपोजीशन में बैठे हुए हैं इसलिए हम इस के सिवाय उनसे घ्राणा भी क्या कर सकते हैं ? लेकिन मैं इतना उन से प्रवश्य कहूंगा कि भले ही जहां उन्हें कोई वुटि या दोष दिखाई दे उधर वह सरकार का ध्यान दिलाते हुए सरकार की घ्रालोचना करे लेकिन एक जनरल तौर पर जिस प्रकार से उन्होंने निन्दा की है मैं उस को पसन्द नहीं करता ।

इसके साथ ही साथ श्री त्रिवेदी ने जो एक नकशा दिखाया था वह घ्राज का नहीं है बल्कि वह नकशा काफ़ी रोज पहले का है । मैं एक दफ़े कालाहांडी गया था । महाराजा साहब ने जिनको कि मुखवासी कह कर पुकारा उन को मैंने देखा, वह नंगे जिनके पास खाने के लिए दाना नहीं, पहनने के लिए कपड़ा नहीं और रहने के लिए घर नहीं उन को मुखवासी कहते थे और अब भी कहते हैं उधर की स्थिति ज्यादा बिगड़ने के बाद उन लोगों की अवस्था और भी खराब हो गयी है . . .

**उपाध्यक्ष महोदय :** माननीय सदस्य का समय समाप्त हो रहा है ।

**श्री जैना :** बस मैं समाप्त ही कर रहा हूँ । मैं घ्रापके जरिए श्री मुखहाप्यम से कहूंगा कि घ्राभी जो रिलीफ का काम चल रहा है उसे चलने दिया जाये लेकिन जैसा पटनायक साहब ने बताया कि वहां एक इंच जमीन बे-फसल न रहे इसका उन्हें पूरा बन्दोबस्त करना चाहिए । जो रिलीफ का काम हो रहा है वह बारिश घ्राने की वजह से बन्द न हो जाय । मैं चाहता हूँ कि सरकार का और हम सब का यह कर्तव्य हो जाता है कि इस देश में राम राज्य की स्थापना हो । अब राम राज्य क्या है इसका जरा नकशा देकर और घ्रापकी घ्राजा से एक, दो बात कह कर मैं घ्रापना ध्यान घ्राहण कर लूंगा ।

सरकार का कर्तव्य यह होता है :—

उच्छातान् प्रतिरोपयन्, कुसुमितान् चिह्न-  
वन, शिशुन् वडंयन्, उत्तुगान्  
नमयन्, नत्तान्, समुदयन्, म्लानान्  
मुहुमिचयन्, क्रूरान् कंटकनैव  
बहिरनिर्णयन्, मालाकारः इव  
प्रयत्न निपुणः राजन् चिरं-  
जीविति ।

उपाध्यक्ष महोदय, घ्रापकी घ्राजा से मैं इसका अर्थ बना देता हूँ । इसमें एक मालाकार के साथ सरकार की तुलना की गई है । रामचन्द्र जी ने रावण से पूछा कि राजा का या सरकार का कर्तव्य क्या है । रावण ने बताया, "उच्छातान् प्रतिरोपयन्" जो पेड़ उखाड़ जाता है, माली जैसे उसके मूल में, उसकी जड़ में मिट्टी देता है, उमी तरह सरकार को चाहिए कि जो लोग बेघरबार हो गए हैं, उनको घर बार और अन्य सहायता देकर बसाया जाये ।

"कुसुमितान् चिह्नवन" : पेड़ पर जो फल और फूल लगते हैं, माली जैसे उनको ले जाता है, उसी प्रकार हमारे देश में जितने बड़े और धनी घ्रादमी हैं, उन से कर और टैक्स लेना सरकार का अधिकार है ।

"शिशुन् वडंयन्" : जिस तरह माली छोटे पेड़ को यत्न और घ्रादर से बढ़ाता है उसी तरह सरकार को चाहिए कि वह बच्चों को घ्राच्छी तरह से पढ़ाये और उनके स्वास्थ्य के लिये बन्दोबस्त करे ।

"उत्तुगान् नमयन्, नत्तान् समुदयेन्" : जो बड़े पेड़ है, उनके नीचे छोटे छोटे पौदे नहीं उग सकते हैं, इसलिए बड़े पौधों और पेड़ों को माली थोड़ा काट देता है । इसी प्रकार बड़े बड़े जमींदारों और राजा-महाराजाओं पर टैक्स लगा कर छोटों को ऊपर उठाना उचित है ।

“मनानान् मुहुसिचयन ” : जिस जमीन पर सूखा हो जाता है, फ़मले नहीं उग सकती हैं, पेड़ नहीं उग सकते हैं, मानी वहां पर बारम्बार पानी देता है । उसी प्रकार सरकार को चाहिए कि जहां बारिश नहीं हुई है या जहां बाढ़ आ गई है, वहां पर रिलीफ़ देकर लोगों को उठाया जाय ।

धरर सरकार इस नीति पर चलेगी, तो यह सरका कायम रहेगी । चाहे लोग उसकी कितनी ही निन्दा करें और उसको बदनाम करें, वह बराबर बनी रहेगी, वह हट नहीं सकेगी और वह लोगों के दिनों और दिमाग में रहेगी ।

श्री स० मो० बनर्जी : उपाध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं समझता हूँ कि उड़ीसा में जो घटनायें हुई हैं और वहां पर जिस तरीके से छोटे छोटे बच्चों और नर-नारियों की हत्या इस सरकार ने की है, धरर सरकार कुछ शर्मदार होती, तो इसको लेकर अपने प्राय इस्तीफ़ा दे देती । लेकिन मैं समझता हूँ कि वह शर्म और हया सरकार में रही नहीं है । केरल के बाद बंगाल, बंगाल के बाद उड़ीसा और मैं समझता हूँ कि मायद इसके बाद . . . . .

श्री शिव नारायण : कानपुर ।

श्री स० मो० बनर्जी : . . . . . राजस्थान की भी बारी है । गुजरात में यह स्थिति है कि वहां के कुछ प्रफ़सरों ने इस वजह से इस्तीफ़ा दे दिया है कि उनके पास ऐसे कोई प्रख़यारात नहीं थे कि वे उन लोगों को कुछ बैसा या काम दे सकें, जो फ़ाकाकशी का सामना कर रहे हैं ।

मंत्री महोदय पिछले दिनों इन सदन में इस कारण मौजूद नहीं रह सके कि उनको कोई सेमिनार एटेंड करने के लिए बम्बई जाना था । लेकिन मैं उनसे यह जानना चाहता हूँ कि आखिर वह उड़ीसा के कानाहाड़ी जैसे उन जिलों और इलाकों से क्यों नहीं जा सके, जहां भुखमरी है, जहां काफ़ी लोग मर

चुके हैं और काफ़ी लोग मौत का इन्तज़ार कर रहे हैं । क्या यह सही नहीं है कि जब वह भुखनेश्वर पहुंचे, तो उनको बताया गया कि वह बारिश की वजह से, या कुछ और बिककतो की वजह से, उन इलाकों में नहीं जा सकते हैं, जहां प्रकाल की स्थिति है और रहने वाली है? मंत्री महोदय किसानों के बहुत हिमायती बनते हैं और कहते हैं कि वह किसानों से बातचीत करने के लिए बम्बई गए थे । तो क्या उन इलाकों में नहीं जा सकते थे ? क्या सिर्फ़ बारिश की वजह से ही उन्होंने वहां जाने का इरादा छोड़ दिया ? क्या वह भूल गये कि पुराने कांग्रेसी बग़ैर जूते पहने नंगे पैर, उन इलाकों में जाते थे, जहां इस प्रकार की कठिन परिस्थिति उत्पन्न हो जाती थी? क्या वह गांधी जी की परम्पराओं को भूल गए हैं, जिन के आघार पर प्राज़ वोट मांगे जाते हैं ? हमारे जो नये नये मंत्री हैं, धरर उन्होंने किसी ऐसी जगह जा कर इन्वैश्शन कम्पेयन करना होता है, जहां सड़कें नहीं होती हैं, तो बेहेलीकोप्टर से वहां जाते हैं । इसी तरह मंत्री महोदय भी हेलीकोप्टर से जा कर उन इलाकों को देखते, जहां भुखमरी फली हुई है ।

जो तस्वीरें मैंने देखी हैं ,

श्री शिव नारायण : उन्होंने सिर्फ़ तस्वीरें ही देखी हैं ।

श्री स० मो० बनर्जी : श्री शिव नारायण से मैं यह कहना चाहता हूँ कि वह उत्तर प्रदेश के पूर्वी जिलों से आते हैं, जहां प्राज़ नहीं, तो साल भर बाद यही परिस्थिति होने वाली है ।

जो तस्वीरें मैंने देखी हैं, उन से बाहिर होना है कि उड़ीसा में लोग किस तरह से मर रहे हैं । लेकिन मंत्री महोदय बार-बार कहते हैं कि वहां पर भुखमरी से कोई मौत नहीं हुई है । लेकिन उड़ीसा के प्रख़बारों और

## [श्री स० मो० बनर्जी]

उड़ीसा के दूसरे भ्रष्टाचारों के लेखों और एडीटोरियल्स को पढ़ने से साफ़ पता चल जाता है कि इस वक्त वहाँ पर जो भयंकर स्थिति पैदा हो गई है, उस के लिए उड़ीसा की सरकार और केन्द्रीय सरकार दोनों जिम्मेदार हैं।

वहाँ पर जो टीम भेजी गई, उस की रिपोर्ट मेरे पास है। मैं पूछना चाहता हूँ कि क्या यह बात सही नहीं है कि इस दौरे के दौरान उस टीम पर पन्द्रह से बीस हजार रुपया खर्च किया गया, जिस में से पांच से सात हजार रुपया केवल खाने पर खर्च किया गया। मैं यह पूछना चाहता हूँ कि जब वह टीम वहाँ पहुंची थी, तो उसने क्या खाना खाया था। अगर उन लोगों ने सुबह के ब्रेकफ़ास्ट से लेकर रात के डिनर तक खाया होगा, तो वे कैसे यह देख सके होंगे कि वहाँ के लोग किम तरह से भुखमरी से मर रहे हैं ?

मैं मानता हूँ कि उड़ीसा की जनता घन्य है। अगर उड़ीसा की जनता को जागृत होने के बाद वहाँ पर ऐसी परिस्थिति पैदा हुई होती, तो मेरा खयाल है कि उड़ीसा की वर्तमान सरकार कायम नहीं रह सकती थी। इस वक्त उड़ीसा में जो गली, सड़ी सरकार है, जो भ्रष्टाचार कराने वाली सरकार है, उसी सरकार की भ्रष्टाचार को इस सदन में एक बिल ला कर बढ़ाया जा रहा है और कहा जा रहा है कि वहाँ पर अभी चुनाव नहीं होगा, बल्कि भ्राम चुनावों के साथ ही वहाँ भी चुनाव होगा।

आज जब कि देश में संकटकाल है, इमर्जेंसी है और केन्द्रीय सरकार चाहती है कि देश में शान्ति बनी रहे, तब उसकी यह जिम्मेदारी है कि उड़ीसा में फ़ौरन खाना भेजने की व्यवस्था की जाये। मेरे मित्र, श्री किशन पटनायक, ने चावल के बारे में काफ़ी तफ़्सील के साथ कहा है और श्री द्विवेदी ने भी कहा है। लेकिन जिस तरह वहाँ पर लोग बिना खाए मर रहे हैं, उसको देखते हुए गेहूँ, चावल,

बाजरा, मक्का, ज्वार वगैरह कोई भी अनाज इतनी मात्रा में वहाँ भेजा जाये कि लोग भूखे न मरें। किसानों को तकाबी इन्ट्रस्ट-फ़ी लोन दिये जायें और उनको बसूला न जाये। वहाँ पर बीज का इन्तजाम किया जाये। मैं समझता हूँ कि यह जिम्मेदारी केन्द्र की है।

यह हमारे देश का दुर्भाग्य है कि जिस खाद्य मंत्री को लोगों को खाद्यान्न और खाद्य पदार्थ देना चाहिये, आज वह उड़ीसा और बंगाल से मरघट का सरदार बन कर खड़े हैं और उन लोगों के कफ़न का इन्तजाम कर रहे हैं, जो मर चुके हैं। मैं समझता हूँ कि उड़ीसा में जो परिस्थिति उत्पन्न हुई है, वह इस बात की इलामत है कि हमारे देश में क्या होने जा रहा है।

मानसून के बारे में हमेशा भगवान को दुआयें दी जाती हैं। अनाज की कमी के बारे में कभी कहा जाता है कि ज्यादा बारिश हो गई है, जिस की वजह से बाढ़ आ गई, है कभी कहा जाता है कि पाला पड़ गया, कभी कहा जाता है कि सूखा पड़ गया। मैं समझता हूँ कि अगर इस बात का फ़ैसला हो जाय कि जो पाला पड़ा है, वह ज़मीन पर पड़ा है या मिनिस्ट्रों की भ्रूल पर पड़ा है, तो सारी चीज़ें तय हो जायें। वहाँ पर मिनिस्ट्रों की तरफ़ से कहा जाता है कि अगर बारिश ठीक से हो जाय, मानसून ठीक से हो जाय, तो सारी चीज़ें मिल जायेंगी, लेकिन अगर सूखा पड़ गया, तो हम लोग क्या करें। अगर मिनिस्ट्रों की कामयाबी का आश्वासन इसी बात पर है कि पानी ठीक से हो जाये और सूखान हो, तो फिर इन मिनिस्ट्रों की ज़रूरत ही क्या है? इस सूखे का इन्तजाम दूसरे देशों ने भी किया है। तो क्या हमारे देश में सूखे का इन्तजाम नहीं हो सकता है? क्या सूखा अचानक पड़ गया? मैं समझता हूँ कि ऐसा नहीं हुआ।

प्राज राहस भरा हुआ है, लेकिन चोर-बाजारी करने वाले जो लोग मुनाफ़ा कमाते हैं लोगों की लाशों पर, उन के लिए क्या इन्तज़ाम किया गया है ? स्टेट ट्रेडिंग इन फूड प्रेंच के बारे में बार-बार हम लोगों ने कहा कि सारे देश में फूड प्रेंच का किया जाय, वह क्यों नहीं किया गया ? कौन हैं वे लोग जो उसको चलने नहीं देते हैं ? मुश्किलों का साहब साफ़ तरीके से कहें कि फूड प्रेंच के लिये स्टेट ट्रेडिंग की जिम्मेदारी को बसाना चाहते थे, प्राखिर वह क्या सकती है या नहीं चल सकती है ?

मैं एक चीज, उपाध्यक्ष महोदय, धीर कहूँ। उड़ीसा में जिस तरह से लोग मर रहे हैं, बंगाल में जिस तरह से गोलियों के शिकार हुए हैं, गुजरात या राजस्थान या उत्तर प्रदेश के पूर्वी जिलों में जो परिस्थिति है, अगर यही हालत रही, तो वह दिन दूर नहीं है कि लोग भूख से नहीं मरेंगे, बल्कि भूख के साथ खड़े हो जायेंगे, गोली से घने हो मर जाय, लेकिन भूख से नहीं मरेंगे धीर मैं समझता हूँ कि प्राज यह परिस्थिति घाबकी है। हम सरकार को चाहिये कि इस ईशू पर देखे कि 18 साल की आजादी के बाद भूखमरी बढ़ी है या नहीं, क्या हालत है प्राज हमारे देश की। पहले 100 रु० ज़िमकी सामदानी थी, मंहगाई ने उसकी कमर तोड़ दी है, धीर वह प्राज 40 रु० रह गई है। जो आदमी मकान में रहता था वह झोंपड़ों में रहने लगा है, झोंपड़ी में रहने वाला मडक पर रहने लगा है धीर मडक पर रहने वाला प्राज बिना कफ़न के मरघट की तरफ़ जाने लगा है। मैं समझता हूँ कि अगर सरकार को जर्म है तो वह स्वीफ़ा दे धीर मारे देश के मामने करें कि हम मज़रिम हैं। उसके बाद नया चुनाव हो धीर लोगों को अधिकार दिया जाय कि उड़ीसा में चुनाव होने चाहिये या नहीं होने चाहिये। दो-दो एकस-बीफ़ मिनिस्टर धीर प्रेजेन्ट मिनिस्टरि मारी करण्ट

हो धीर लोगों को इस तरह से भूखमरी का शिकार करे, यह गलत होगा धीर इस का बदला लोग ज़रूर लेंगे।

Shri Nambiar: Mr. Deputy-Speaker, it is very sorrowful news that we get from various parts of the State, one after the other. We heard about the famine condition or near famine condition in Kerala, in Bengal and the tragedy in Bastar and now the Orissa situation takes a toll of many hundreds of innocent lives. Government does not at all say or feel that there is famine in Orissa. From the report submitted by the team, it speaks about the "drought" conditions in Orissa, as the team was sent to make a fresh "assessment of the present situation". After all what was sought to be done was only a fresh assessment of the situation and they never agreed that there was famine condition. That is the reason why, whenever they try to hide the real situation they will never be in a position to do anything tangible to improve the condition. That is why we say the Central Government has really failed. The reason may be there: maybe the State Government did not bring it to the notice of the Central Government but the Central Government cannot shirk responsibility on the plea that only the State Government is normally to do it and only if they bring it to the notice of the Government here they should step in. But it is now clear. I think there will be no dispute about the condition there after the speech of Mr. Mahatab who explained clearly that there is famine and it is only equal to that of Bengal; that type of conditions is prevailing in Orissa today. If that is so, the government must come forward and say how they are going to tackle the problem. The study team's report, if you go through between the lines you can see the truth behind it. But one should have to read between the lines. They state that malnutrition is there. 25 per cent of the population are affected and 36 per cent of the total cultivated area is affected. All these facts are given.

[Shri Nambiar]

Still they say that there is no famine. How could we be able to tackle the problem? Here we do not want to have any political gain out of it. After all we do not want to play politics with the lives of the people. They say we are bringing this to the notice of the people because we want to take political advantage. No. What relief are you going to give to the people in question? Mr. Mahatab said that Rs. 10 crores are required to do this and the question is whether the Central or State Government should foot the bill. They have endless correspondence. Are we to know that this correspondence will go on and to take more time? Will relief go or not go? If they say that foodstocks are available, then the question is one of distribution or the question of purchasing power. If it is a question of the purchasing power, then small little works here and there brought in through contractors will not suffice. Therefore, the whole thing has to be brought on a war footing and the entire thing has to be planned out. Then, there is the question of usage of land for cultivation immediately after the rains come in. All these things are to be looked into. Government cannot do these things through its administrative machinery alone. Government must take the co-operation of the people, voluntary organisations, etc. must form committees at the lowest and the highest level. Shri Dwivedy said that he was prepared to co-operate. Members from that area, members of the legislative assembly, panchayats and all these people should be associated with the distribution arrangement of the food, whether it is free kitchen or free packets, whatever it is. There must be publicising of the actual position so that the country's conscience can be roused and then the entire people from the whole country will send assistance to the area. Therefore, the Government should not take it as a matter of prestige. They seem to be afraid that if such a condition is exposed it will be taken advantage in the coming elections. On this side we never take it that way

because we see the sufferings of the people. Let them not labour under false conception about the opposition. They may have their own political reasons. We plead; we press the Government of India at the centre to step in with all the resources at its disposal, all the power it can command and with the full support of the entire people of this country, we will see that the famine situation in Orissa is ended in favour of the people. If the Government will come forward with such a thing, we will fully co-operate with the government and we want it to be done.

Shri A. C. Guha (Barasat): Mr. Deputy-Speaker, I think the time is short. I do not like to enter into any details. In the beginning I should congratulate Mr. Hiren Mukerjee because in discussing such a grim and serious situation by his performance, gestures and words, he could provoke mirth and laughter among the Members of the Opposition, not once but repeatedly. This performance, is an indication of the seriousness they attach to this problem.

According to this report, there are about 45 lakhs of people affected by drought conditions. Whether it is famine condition or acute scarcity condition—it is rather a question of academic discussion. The real fact is that there is acute distress, affecting about 45 lakhs of people resulting in some deaths. Whatever steps have been taken by the government seem to be inadequate. So far in the record, one lakh of persons are covered by gratuitous relief. This team has recommended that at least two lakh persons should be covered by the gratuitous relief; it should be done immediately. The number should be further increased. The number of fair price shops are not adequate and in these shops the price is 91 paise per kilo which was higher than the ration shop price in Delhi and Calcutta. The open market price is only

one rupee. The difference between the fair price and the open market price should be much wider than this. It should not be more than 60 or 62 paise per kilo so that the people may have the power to purchase. It is not a question of so much scarcity of foodgrains as of lack of purchasing power. The fair price shop price should be reduced to not more than Rs. 0.60 or 0.62 per kilo—may be even lower. In spite of the fact that this team has been condemned by Mr. Dwivedy, this team has given out certain useful facts which should be considered by the Government. This team has stated that the average earnings of a man engaged in test relief work is only about 62 paise. The test relief is given to all the workers under piece work system; it is wrong and absurd. These should not be given under piece-work system because people there have not been in the normal strength and they could not be expected to do the normal work. It should be given on daily wages. And that wage should not in any case be lower than the minimum wage fixed for agricultural labour in Orissa.

**Mr. Deputy-Speaker:** There is half an hour discussion at 5 O'clock. Shall we take it up on some other day?

**Shri Sham Lal Saraf (Jammu and Kashmir):** Let it be on some other day.

**Shri Dinesh Bhattacharya (Serampore):** What is the meaning of this discussion? . . . (*Interruptions*).

**Mr. Deputy-Speaker:** I am asking the House whether the half an hour discussion can be taken up now or on some other day.

17 hrs.

**Shri Linga Reddy (Chikballapur):** With great difficulty, time has been found today for the half-hour discussion. It will not be possible to have it on any other day.

**Mr. Deputy-Speaker:** It will be posted to some other day.

**Shri A. C. Guha:** This team has suggested at least Rs. 7 crores should be provided for relief. The Government have provided only Rs. 1 crore for test relief. About 10,000 persons are covered by the free kitchen and 1 lakh persons by the gratuitous relief scheme. The total amount of expenditure on all these may not exceed Rs. 2 to Rs. 3 crores. It should be raised at least to Rs. 7 crores, though even that may not be quite adequate. Sir, in the present case there should not be any consideration of money to save human life.

Within a few weeks the agricultural season is coming. It is not only a question of preventing starvation deaths, but maintaining the strength and vitality of the agricultural labour there, so that they can put in their full labour in the coming season. For this Government should take adequate steps by way of gratuitous relief, test relief, etc.

This team has suggested many things—about 20 items. Through test relief, they should develop minor and small irrigation schemes which would be helpful for the coming agricultural season and other agricultural operations there. With the development of rapid transport system famine in general should be a thing of the past. In this country, either famine or scarcity conditions have been continuing and every year there is some distress in some part of the country or the other. I agree there has not been much deaths due to starvation. In Orissa this year there might have been a few deaths. The previous speaker compared the position in Orissa with conditions in Bengal in 1943. That would be an absurd comparison.

**Shri Nambiar:** It was Mr. Mahtab's comparison.

**Shri A. C. Guha:** He did not do that. Then in Bengal, at least 35 lakhs of people died. But in Orissa the maxi-



[Shri A. C. Guha]

imum number that is given has been about 100 or so; that also is disputed.

Mr. Mukerjee referred to the Orissa situation and said that it is the criminality of the Government which created such a situation. I hope the country will also realise the criminality of certain elements in the country which helped the British Government in the criminality of creating that man-made famine in Bengal in 1943. So, everything should be taken in proper perspective and we should not lose our sense of proportion and balanced thinking. We agree this is a grim situation. Government should not have allowed even a single death out of mal-nutrition or starvation. Mal-nutrition in a number of cases in a particular area may be due to lack of proper supply of food.

There is no clear definition of famine. The question is there is acute distress whether the people have been suffering from inadequate supply of food or from supply of food to which they are not accustomed or to which the people in the country in general are not accustomed. Such a situation has been created in Orissa this year in certain pockets. For that, there should be extensive relief organisation. That is the first thing the Government should do and there should not be any formalities hindering test relief. I find that contractors have been trying to profit from the test relief schemes at the cost of the starving poor peasants. I suggest that it should be done through zila parishads and panchayats. It is better the contractors are eliminated and the peoples' representative organisations are made responsible for providing the necessary relief organisation for the people.

श्री बाणकी : उपाध्यक्ष महोदय,  
मंत्री कोई नहीं है।

श्री छ० चं० गुह : मंत्री बैठा है।

श्री बाणकी : यह तो सतरी बैठा है।  
पूरा नहीं प्राधा बैठा है।

Shri A. C. Guha: After the Bengal Famine in 1943, the Bengal Government passed an Act which nullified all transactions, sale deeds, etc. A similar Act should be passed by the Orissa Government also. Any sale of persons, children or property, cattle or utensils, as far as traceable, should be nullified and restored back to the original owners. There should be a general Act to indemnify the persons who have been compelled to sell their property and children as a result of this distress. Government should start some orphanages or children's homes to take charge of the children of families who have been suffering from want of adequate food.

I suggest that land revenue for this year in the distressed area should be suspended and there should not be any attempt to realise it. Adequate facilities should be provided even now for the coming agricultural season by supplying seeds, fertilisers, implements, loans and whatever is necessary. Government should not be late in making these preliminary arrangements for the next agricultural season.

It is really a matter of regret for us that the administration has failed. It is not so much the Ministry, because I find from some reports that the Chief Minister of Orissa even as long ago as August last year sent a warning to the administration that they should report any case of distress. Somehow, the administration failed. On the one hand, some Members condemned Mr. Subramaniam for the failure and callousness of his Ministry. On the other hand, they have suggested that the Centre should take over the administration of Orissa. There is no logic in this. If the Centre takes over the administration, then also those officers due to whose lapses this situation might have been created will be in the field. The Centre cannot change the entire administrative set-up. This is a political propaganda against the Govern-

ment of Orissa. The House should not pay heed to that. In this grim situation, the House and Government should take a vow that there should not be any death due to starvation or mal-nutrition anywhere in the country.

The Famine Code should be amended and revised.

श्री बागड़ी : फौमिन कोड है ही नहीं ।  
मंत्री जो झूठ बोलते हैं ।

Shri A. C. Guha: It was made in 1883, about 75 years ago. I do not expect there will be famine, but there will be pockets of distress, for which there should be proper arrangements for providing relief either through test relief or gratuitous relief, so that every State Government should know what is their obligation. It should be properly circulated to the administration that whenever there is any distress anywhere, they should immediately report it to the Government. In this regard prompt administrative measures are the first necessity.

One lacuna has been created in the Orissa rural administration by the abolition of the chowkidari system. The chowkidars used to report such things of starvation or mal-nutrition deaths. Last year when I went to Orissa, this matter was reported to me. Without creating an alternative machinery, they have abolished the chowkidari system. That also should be reconsidered and some alternative arrangement should be made.

श्री काशी राम गुप्त (भ्रमवर) :  
उपाध्यक्ष महोदय, उड़ीसा की बात करने के पहले मैं आप के सामने यह दो तार पेश करता हूँ जो कि बिबानी से घायल हैं जहाँ पर लोग पानी के बिना प्यासे मर रहे हैं । यहाँ पर तो हम भूख की बात कर रहे हैं लेकिन लोग पानी के प्यासे मर रहे हैं । आप की इजाजत से मैं इन को मेज पर रखना चाहता हूँ । आप मुझ को इस की इजाजत दीजिये ।

Mr. Deputy-Speaker: Not necessary. Unless it is asked for you cannot lay it on the Table.

श्री काशी राम गुप्त : दूसरी बात यह कि मैं आप का ध्यान लोक-सभा सेक्रेटेरियट की एफिसिएसी की तरफ भी दिवाना चाहता हूँ । जो अजेंडा पेपर है उस में माता की तरह से नीचे छपा हुआ है जिस को कोई पढ़ भी नहीं सकता उड़ीसा का भ्रमर यहाँ पर भी घा गया है ।

भाज हमारे कांग्रेस के सदस्य बार बार यह कहते हैं कि विरोधी पक्ष वाले इस को राजनीति का प्रश्न बना रहे हैं । हम राजनीति का प्रश्न इस को नहीं बना रहे हैं, किन्तु उन के मन के घन्दर इतनी खलबली मची हुई है कि वहाँ के लोगों को जो तकलीफें हैं उन के स बन्ध में वह कहते हैं कि यह राजनीतिक प्रश्न है । मैं निवेदन करना चाहता हूँ कि छात्रों राजनीति क्या है । अगर हम विरोधी पक्ष वाले लोग यह प्रश्न यहाँ नहीं उठाते तो क्या इस बात के लिये श्री सुब्रह्ण्यम तर्कनीक करते - वहाँ कोई टीम जाती या स्वयम् बह जाने का कुछ प्रयत्न करते । हम अपना कर्तव्य पालन करते हैं लेकिन कांग्रेस वाले उस का नाम राजनीति देते हैं । मैं इस बात की तरफ ध्यान दिवाना चाहता हूँ कि इस तरह की गैरजिम्मेदाराना बात कहने से कोई लाभ नहीं होगा ।

दो वर्ष हुए जब मैं और मेरे कुछ साथी उड़ीसा गये थे और वहाँ पर बीजू पटनायक से मिले थे । उन्होंने एक प्रजीव तस्वीर हम लोगों को दी कि उन के जो कार्यक्रम वहाँ पर चल रहे थे उन में वह पांच वर्ग में यह कर देंगे, वह कर देंगे । लेकिन भाज हालत यह हो रही है कि वहाँ के लोगों में भ्रमाज लेने के लिये रूप बलित नहीं रही है । जो रिपोर्ट आई है उस का कुछ हिस्सा पढ़ कर श्री विवेक ने सुनाया, लेकिन मैं प्रमाणित करूँगा इस रिपोर्ट से कि इस में उन लोगों ने कितनी बालाकी से काम लिया है । वह बालाकी यह है कि

[श्री काशी राम गुप्त]

इस रिपोर्ट के क्लोज 20 में उन्होंने फ्री फीडिंग सेन्टर्स के सम्बन्ध में लिखा है :

"We visited some of these centres. The attendance seemed to vary from 200 to 800 and most of the people were really infirm and destitute and there was a high proportion of children in varying degrees of malnutrition."

पहले तो यह स्वयं मानते हैं कि वहां पर माल न्यूट्रिशन है। उस के बाद क्लोज 21 में वे कुछ सुझाव देते हैं। फिर क्लोज 22 में वह कहते हैं :

"....a quick survey was made during the tour, among the cultivators, labourers in the field as well as the infants, children and mothers attending the feeding centres and those coming to the gratuitous relief centres. It was generally observed that the adult population was healthy, cheerful and active whereas a few typical merasmic infants (thing and underfed) were spotted in the feeding centres."

माल न्यूट्रिशन के लिये वह मान चुके हैं, उस के बाद वह इन्कार करते हैं और इस तरह से उन की बातों में यह विरोधाभास प्रा जाता है। घाखीर में स्टार्वेशन डेप्स के बारे में उन्होंने जो तस्वीर दी है, जिस के बारे में श्री छिबेदी ने भी कहा है, वह यह जाहिर करता है उन को यह कह कर भेजा गया है कि वह स्केप्रसिटी के बारे में कोई बात न करें, अन्यथा न्यूट्रिशन की जो हालत है उस के बारे में बतलाया गया है कि 62 पैसे एक घ्रादमी को मिलते हैं कि जिस से उस का घपना पेट नहीं भर सकता है 91 पैसे के हिमाब से। वह कहते हैं कि वहां पर जो अफसर हैं उन्हें नहीं मालूम कि उन के अधिकार क्या हैं। उन्हें मालूम नहीं था कि ऐसी स्थिति में जो वहां के बड़े अधिकारी हैं उन को खर्च करने का अधिकार है, उन को व्यवस्था करने का अधिकार

है। इन सब बातों से भ्रसल में उन के दिल में दर्द नहीं उठता और विरोधी पक्ष के लोग अगर कोई बात कहते हैं तो वह उस को दबाने या छिपाने की कोशिश करते हैं। जब तक यह स्थिति रहेगी और यह प्रवृत्ति चलती रहेगी तब तक उड़ीसा और राजस्थान में यही हालतें रहेगी। आज सरकार यह चाहती है कि वह लोग मजबूर होकर अपने आन्दोलन को तेज करें और यह बातें बर्दाश्त न करें। अगर वे इन को बर्दाश्त न कर के हिंसा पर उतारू हो जायें तो यह कहें कि लोग हिंसा को भड़काना चाहते हैं।

मैं निवेदन करूंगा कि इस समस्या का एक ही हल हो सकता है। चाहे कमिशन बने या न बने, कुछ भी हो, दो महीनों के लिये, मैं श्री छिबेदी से कहना चाहता हूं और श्री मेहताब से कहना चाहता हूं, वे मई और जून के लिये उड़ीसा में जायें, जो उड़ीसा के एम० पी० हैं वह वहां बैठ कर काम को खुद देखें वना लोग मर जायें और हम हिंसा ही करते रह जायेंगे। अगर लोगों को बचाना है तो वे वहां जा कर खुद बैठ जायें और इस काम को सुचारु रूप से चलवायें।

श्री मेहताब ने कहा कि वे समझते हैं कि यह फूड मिनिस्टर का काम नहीं है, शायद फाइनेंस मिनिस्टर का काम है। यह नई दलील श्री मेहताब ने दी है। मैं कहना चाहता हूं कि अगर यह फूड मिनिस्टर का काम नहीं है तो फिर यह बहस यहां उठाने का प्रश्न नहीं उठता। इस लिये इस प्रकार की दलीलों से इन बातों को छिपाने की कोशिश श्री मेहताब न करें। चाहे यह फाइनेंस मिनिस्ट्री का काम हो चाहे फूड मिनिस्ट्री का काम हो, यह सरकार का काम है और सत्तास्व दल का काम है। इसी के साथ यह हम लोगों का भी काम है कि हम उन के साथ कंधे से कंधा मिला कर काम करें।

घन्त में मैं कहना चाता हूँ कि ऐसी समस्याओं के घन्दर राजनीति का कोई प्रश्न पैदा नहीं होता है। हम यह जरूर चाहेंगे कि हम सच्ची बातें यहाँ उठावें। उन को उठाने के बाद अगर उन को सरकार राजनीति कह कर टाल दे, तो हम कड़ा विरोध करेंगे और जितनी ताकत होंगी उतनी लगायेंगे। इस लिये मुझे इतना ही कहना है कि यह उड़ीसा की समस्या नहीं है, यह राजस्थान की समस्या नहीं है, यह महाराष्ट्र या पंजाब की समस्या नहीं है, यह सब जगहों की समस्या है और यह भीषण रूप धारण करती जा रही है। घक्कर कहा जाता है कि जब चुनाव नजदीक आते हैं तब विरोधी पक्ष वाले राजनीति उभार दिया करते हैं। मगर यह चुनाव का प्रश्न नहीं है। यह भूखमरी का प्रश्न है जिस को सरकार हल करवाये और इस को हल करने के लिये तेजी से काम करे।

श्री बागड़ी : यह जो तार है . . . . .

उपाध्यक्ष महोदय : अब प्राप बैठ जाइयें।

श्री बागड़ी : मेरा व्यवस्था का प्रश्न है जिसे भिवानी और हिसार के व्यापक लोगों का तार है। इस को पटल पर रखने कीजिये प्राप यहाँ पर रूल का फैसला न करें। बल्कि पटल पर इस को रखने दें। मैं पटल पर रखता हूँ।

Mr. Deputy-Speaker: No. Unless it is asked for you cannot lay it on the Table.

श्री जगदीश सिंह सिद्धाण्ठी (भुवनेश्वर) : उपाध्यक्ष महोदय, उड़ीसा के दुष्काल के सम्बन्ध में माननीय श्री मेहताब ने जो प्रमाण पत्र दिया है, उस के बाद उस के सम्बन्ध में मुझे कुछ बहुत नहीं कहना है। मैं यह कहना चाहता हूँ कि पांच छः कारण होते हैं जिन से दुष्काल हुआ करता है। दैवी प्रापति हो सकती है, सरकारी योजना कागजों पर रहती है कर्मचारी कर्तव्यहीन हों, व्यापारी

वर्ग निष्पूर हो, विरोधी पक्ष की घण्टी बात पर ध्यान न दिया जाये, समाजसेवी संस्थाओं का सहयोग न लिया जाये, धन्न का वितरण न किया जाये और जो मंत्री लोग हैं वे म. न. प्रपमान का ध्यान रख कर उचित रूप से काम न करें, यह दुष्काल के कारण है। मैं तो कहता हूँ कि दैवी प्रापति हटाई जा सकती है। हमारा इतिहास बतलाता है कि पहले दुष्काल कभी नहीं पड़ता था क्योंकि वर्षा समय पर होती थी, और धाज भी वर्षा समय पर हो सकती है अगर सरकार इधर ध्यान दे। हमारी प्रचीन पुस्तकों में इस का वर्णन है। दूसरी बात, जैसा मैंने बतलाया, यह है कि सरकारी योजनाएं कागजों पर ही हैं। अगर उस को पूरी तरह से प्रयोग में लाया जाये तो उड़ीसा में हो या दूसरे प्रदेशों में हो, ऐसी बुरी व्यवस्था नहीं हो सकती है। यह बात भी निश्चित है कि कर्मचारी लोग जो हैं वह ध्यान नहीं देते क्योंकि जब वह देखते हैं कि मंत्रिमंडल जो है वह उन से ही काम लेता है तो वह ऐसे कामों में और भी धाना कानी करने लगते हैं जिस के कारण वह कर्तव्य रहित हो कर जनता की सेवा नहीं कर सकते। यह बात भी कही जा सकती है, जैसा कि कहा भी गया है, कि व्यापारी वर्ग धन्न को छिपाता है। जो धन्न उन को दिया जाना है वह उसे लोगों तक भेजते नहीं हैं, जिन से वे ऐसे समय पर अनुचित लाभ उठाते हैं। जब दुष्काल के समय मृत्यु का नाच हो रहा हो तब जो लोग जनता को धन्न न दें उन को कठोर के कठोर दंड दिया जाना चाहिये। उन के कोड़े लगाये जायें और उन के धावों पर नमक और मिर्च छिड़का जाये ताकि उन की पीड़ियां भी याद रखें।

इसी तरह से जिनकी भी समाजसेवी संस्थायें हैं सरकार को उन का प्राहवान करना चाहिये कि ऐसे मौके पर धन्न वितरण धादि-काम काज के लिये वह भी धाने धायें। घन्त में मैं एक बात और कह दूँ। मैं घंटी नहीं बजने दूँगा, सारी बातों को इस में ही कह जाऊँगा

[श्री जगदेव सिंह सिद्धान्तः]

मंत्रिमंडल की और श्री मुखहणयम की चाहे जितनी भी आलोचना हो, उन को मान घप-मान से ऊपर उठ कर केवल जनहित की भावना से राष्ट्र के निर्माण के नाम पर, भूखों को भ्रष्ट मिले, प्यासे को पानी मिले, केवल इस भावना को लेकर काम कीजिये।

**निम्नन्त नीति निपुण : यदि वास्तवम्**

चाहे निन्दा हो, चाहे स्तुति हो, यदि आप अपने कर्तव्य से हीन होंगे तो दुनिया की बर्दाश्त आपको बचा नहीं सकती और अगर आप अपना कर्तव्य पालन करेंगे तो दुनिया की बर्दाश्त आपका कुछ कर नहीं सकती। इसलिए खड़े होकर के दुष्काल की स्थिति का सामना कीजिये। सरकार का जो कुछ सामर्थ्य हो सकता है उसके अनुसार भ्रष्ट को पूरी तरह से बर्दाष्ट पाहुँचाइए। यही सबसे बड़ा काम इस समय है।

**Mr. Deputy-Speaker:** Shri Kandapan.

**श्री बागड़ी :** उपाध्यक्ष महोदय, मेरा प्वाइंट ऑफ़ ऑर्डर है। सेंट्रल हाल के प्रन्दर प्रधान मंत्री मीटिंग कर रही है और .

**Mr. Deputy-Speaker:** There is no point of order. Please sit down.

**श्री बागड़ी :** अध्यक्ष महोदय, मेरी बात सुन लीजिये। ख़ास का इतना महत्वपूर्ण प्रश्न है और प्रधान मंत्री वहाँ पर सेंट्रल हाल में मीटिंग कर रही हैं . . . (व्यवधान) . . . यह मजाक नहीं है तो क्या है ? इससे ज्यादा शर्म की और क्या बात हो सकती है ?

**Mr. Deputy-Speaker:** Order, order: there is no point of order.

**श्री बागड़ी :** उपाध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं बँट रहा हूँ। पर मैं आपसे भ्रष्ट करुंगा कि इस ख़ास से ज्यादा कोई जरूरी चीज़ नहीं है . .

**Shri Sham Lal Saraf:** That is not a meeting of Members of Parliament. That is the meeting of Parliamentary Science Committee.

**Shri Ranga:** You can send word through some appropriate person or authority.

**Mr. Deputy-Speaker:** There is some meeting. We can go on as long as there is quorum. There is no point of order.

**श्री बागड़ी :** कैसे नहीं है ?

**उपाध्यक्ष महोदय :** आप बँट जाइए। ऑर्डर ऑर्डर, बँट जाइए। . . . (व्यवधान)

**Shri Sheo Narain:** The Food Minister is there.

**श्री बागड़ी :** शर्म घानी चाहिए, लज्जा घानी चाहिए। . . (व्यवधान) . . .

**श्री शिव नारायण :** लोहिया साहब कहां हैं ? . . . . (व्यवधान) . . . . .

**Shri S. Kandappan (Tiruchengode):** Mr. Deputy-Speaker, Sir, recently our Food Minister, Shri Subramaniam, has prided himself in the Rajya Sabha while replying to the debate on the food situation on the 8th March, 1966 saying:—

"we have the record and we can take credit for it that we have not allowed large-scale famine, outbreak of epidemics and starvation deaths in the country."

As if to spite him now this calamity in Orissa has occurred.

In all fairness to him, I think, it should be conceded that there is nothing of a large-scale catastrophe that has taken place in the country. There have been a few cases of famine here and there; perhaps, the condition is worst in Orissa, but for

this honestly we cannot blame the Government because they did not have sufficient time to work out a large-scale catastrophe. Perhaps, if enough time is given, they may bring about a situation where we will have to face a very calamitous and a very tragic situation in this country.

**Shri S. M. Banerjee:** You accuse the Government only for Hindi.

**Shri S. Kandappan:** It seems to me that it is a taboo for the Food Minister in our country to utter the word "famine" or to call a famine as "famine", just as for the rural housewife it is taboo to call the name of her husband. In spite of what all the Government claims, it is quite obvious and evident that the situation is very bad in Orissa. Even the cautious report prepared by the Study Team headed by Shri Vaidyanathan, Adviser, Planning Commission, after saying that the deaths were due to so many other diseases, like TB and other epidemics, has said:—

"though the death was probably accelerated by malnutrition."

The hon. Member, Shri Dwivedy, has already pointed to this thing. We should really be thankful to Dr. Mahatab for candidly saying that it is beyond description and we cannot express the predicament and the tragic situation in which the people of Orissa are placed.

There are so many paper reports, but I may quote here from the *Indian Express* from Delhi dated 9th May wherein it is given:

"The awesome spectre of starvation, deaths in some of the drought-hit areas of Orissa, does not strike the visitor as an act of God.

On the other hand, it is a sad commentary on the ability of the administration to manage grave human problems in a welfare

State 19 years after Independence.

It churns one's stomach to see skinny infants clinging to their mothers, slow and gaitless death-walk of emaciated children, pregnant women heavily dragging their leaden feet, old people with gnarled skins too weak to make their peace with God, desperately hungry people seeking sustenance in mohwa flowers and peepal leaves."

I do not think anything could be worse than this. Nor, I could appreciate the Government declaring something worse than this as famine and not this as famine. Really, this is very amazing, the way the Government brushes aside the real situation in this country.

While Shri Mahatab was speaking about the Orissa situation, he was pleading very pathetically that we should not take to task the present Government. I do not understand that kind of argument. It is really because of the failures of this Government that this kind of a situation has been brought about in our country.

Our Minister, Shri Subramanian, in the speech to which I have earlier referred, has candidly admitted in the Rajya Sabha on the 8th March:—

"We have failed, so far as agriculture is concerned, during the Third Plan period. That we have to admit."

It is not only during the Third Plan but we have failed during all the Plans. Any brochure or statistics pertaining to the plans will show that we have failed miserably, particularly on the agricultural front in all the Plans. Just by way of an example I will quote one thing.

In all the three Plans put together we had fixed the target for irrigating lands to the tune of 64.7 million acres and our achievement was 31.6 million

[Shri S. Kandappan]

acres, not even half of what we had fixed. Not only this. It is only one example; I can go on giving any number of examples of this kind. We know pretty well that our country is not short of water or the potential land for development. In fact, as per the assessment made by Government itself, two-thirds of the utilisable irrigable water is being wasted and is flowing into the sea without being used. So also available land is not being properly developed.

After all these failures I think it would be in the fitness of things for the Government to come and confess frankly before the Parliament that they have failed and miserably failed at that.

**Mr. Deputy-Speaker:** Shri Subramaniam.

**श्री बागड़ी :** उपाध्यक्ष महोदय, कोरम पूरा नहीं है। बहुत सारे मेम्बर सेंट्रल हाल में बैठे हैं।

**Mr. Deputy-Speaker:** The bell is being rung.....Now there is quorum.

**श्री किशन पटनायक :** उपाध्यक्ष महोदय, मुझे एक बात कहनी है। स्पीकर महोदय ने मिनिस्टर को डाइरेक्ट किया था कि फ़ैमिन कोड या उसका सन्सीच्यूट लाकर टेबल पर रखें। क्या मिनिस्टर फ़ैमिन-कोड प्रपने साथ लाये हैं ?

**Shri C. Subramaniam:** It is coming up tomorrow.

**श्री बागड़ी :** क्या हो गया फ़ैमिन-कोड को, क्या बीमार हो गया है ?

**Shri C. Subramaniam:** Mr. Deputy-Speaker, Sir, Members from all the sides had expressed concern at the situation in Orissa. It has been recognised that we are really facing a very difficult situation in that State and there is also acute distress and

it is not as if the State Government was just sleeping over it or the State Assembly was sleeping over it. I find from the records that even in August, 1965, there was a discussion about the drought situation arising in Orissa and after a full discussion, the Government indicated the steps they were taking for the purpose of alleviating distress there. Then, again I find that there was a three-day discussion in December, 1965 and in his reply, the Chief Minister dealt with the situation elaborately, and he also gave a list of the various relief works the Government was undertaking for the purpose of seeing that the situation did not go out of control. Again, there was a discussion during the Budget debate and, therefore, we cannot say that the Assembly of Orissa or the Government were not aware of the situation there. But in spite of that, we do find the actions taken there were not adequate to meet the situation. That will have to be admitted.

After our own letters from here and various other representations also, the Collectors Conference was convened in the first week of April to discuss the situation in Orissa particularly in these drought affected areas and also to evolve measures for the purpose of seeing that relief measures were taken in an adequate measure. I have got the proceedings of the Collectors Conference and the various orders issued after that. I find, after that, there has been a good deal of earnest effort to see that things improve there.

**Shri Surendranath Dwivedy:** That was in April.

**Shri C. Subramaniam:** Yes, the first week of April. Therefore, when Mr. Mahtab said that only from March onwards more adequate measures were undertaken, I am in agreement with him and, as a matter of fact, it was further intensified during April. That is why when I

stated that the situation was coming under control, it was not because of a sense of self-complacency that I stated that it was coming under control but it was after having looked into the various measures which the State Government was taking for the purpose of seeing that the situation did not go out of control.

The intensity of the drought also we have to realise it, looking into the statistics, is as has been equalled only by the drought of 1886. After 1886, this is the worst drought that has happened. In 1886, this drought was in the coastal area, particularly, in the districts of Cuttack and Puri and it is on record that a million people died there and more than a million cattle perished at that time. After that, this is the worst situation which we are facing today. Fortunately, because of that warning in 1886, various measures were taken in the coastal districts, some irrigation projects and all those things. That is why, in spite of the monsoon failure, the coastal districts have not been affected to the same extent because of the assured irrigation. But, unfortunately, in this area, western part of Orissa, which Prof. Mukerjee also described as occupied by Adivasis....

**Shri Surendranath Dwivedy:** Mostly ex-princely State areas.

**Shri C. Subramaniam:** In this area which, unfortunately has been hit now, we find that even one failure brings about an intensity of misery, an intensity of difficulties, mainly because of the historical background also of this area. It is not only the Adivasis area, as Mr. Dwivedy was pointing out, but it is the ex-princely State of Orissa.....

**Shri P. K. Deo:** Noapara sub-division was never in the princely State, it was in Madhya Pradesh.

**Shri C. Subramaniam:** The hon. Member need not have a guilty conscience. He is no longer a prince. He is one of us now. He is amongst

us. He in his previous incarnation and his grand-fathers were responsible.

**Shri P. K. Deo:** It was never in the princely State.

**Shri Kishen Pattnayak:** Sambalkot was certainly not the princely State area.

**Shri C. Subramaniam:** This is the background. Even the colonial rule was something tolerable. But this backward princely State rule was worst. It is for that....

**Shri Kishen Pattnayak:** This is a map prepared by you. He is telling a white lie.

**श्री कृष्ण लिवये :** स्वदेशी राज्य में विदेशी राज्य प्रच्छा है, यह उन्होंने कहा है ।

**श्री राम सेवक :** उन्होंने जो कुछ कहा है, उसे सुनियें ।

**Shri Raghunath Singh:** This is not the way to interrupt the Minister. This is the turn of the Minister to reply. What he has said is correct.

**Shri S. Kandappan:** He is side-tracking the issue.

**Shri Raghunath Singh:** He is not side-tracking the issue.

**Shri C. Subramaniam:** I am not sparing myself even. Kindly, hear me.

**Shri P. K. Deo:** You are proceeding on false premises; it was in British India.

**Shri C. Subramaniam:** This is the background we have to keep in mind. Unfortunately, even though princely areas have been abolished, this feudal set-up, the feudal exploitation, has not been broken still. It still continues there. There is another difficulty, that in spite of democracy, in spite of Independence, there are pockets where feudalism still persists, it has still got a grip on the people. I do agree that this is a disgrace that in Independent



[Shri C. Subramaniam]

India, the feudalism system still persists. I think, it should be the duty of this country and particularly of Parliament to see that this feudal set-up, this feudal grip, is broken as quickly as possible.

**Shri P. K. Deo:** It gives place to a new feudalism.

**Shri C. Subramaniam:** Unless this grip is broken, whatever measures we take will not yield results.

**Shri Surendranath Dwivedy:** I agree with the background that you are giving. But the particular area which is worst affected, which we call famine was never under any princely State.

**Shri C. Subramaniam:** I will come to that.

Therefore, if we want socialism, when we talk of socialism, particularly, when we want to see that there is more equitable distribution of wealth, first of all, this primitive type of feudalism and those aspects of feudalism will have to be obliterated. That should get the first priority. Mr. Mukerjee was talking about the priorities. I will attach first priority to this. That will have to go. But I do agree that in spite of that a certain share of what is happening to day will have to be borne by the Government in Independent India also. I find today, not only in this Adivasis area but take any tribal area anywhere, I am afraid, that development which is taken place is not worth mentioning. Therefore, it is necessary that we should have this priority. As a matter of fact, that is what we are discussing for the last two or three days after return from Orissa, that in planning, the priority will have to go to these down-trodden millions of people, the scheduled tribes and scheduled castes. Unless we do that, we cannot call ourselves a civilised Government.

**श्री किशन पटनायक :** प्रटारह माम क्या कर रहे थे ।

**Shri C. Subramaniam:** Therefore, I am prepared to share the responsibility to this extent....

**Shri P. K. Deo:** After eighteen years he has learnt this.

**Shri C. Subramaniam:** We have learnt it at least now, but some people did not learn at all.

**श्री बागड़ी :** लोगों का खून चूम रहे थे ।

**Shri C. Subramaniam:** That is why they cling to the same old methods of what I would call reactionary policies and they want to proceed on the basis of those reactionary policies. Therefore, I am not ashamed of it, but I am glad that people are realising that we are prepared to learn these things, and we are learning these things. That itself is a sign of progress. Therefore, while I am ashamed that such a thing has happened about, that we have realised it and we want to give priority to the development of these areas will have to be taken into account. But this is the background unfortunately. Orissa in the whole set-up of India is one of the most backward States, and in the most backward State this area seems to be the most backward. This is the real difficulty. That is why the intensity of the misery is so much. Therefore, as has been pointed out by my hon. Friend Shri Mahatab, our endeavour should now be to see how we could minimise this misery, and how we shall be able to see that there is an end of unnecessary suffering of the people. That should be our first concern, and as a matter of fact, even though I had not gone to the area as such, I can assure hon. Member....

**Shri P. K. Deo:** I was there waiting to receive you.

**श्री बच्चू लिवये :** प्राप प्रकाल प्रम्न इलाकों में नहीं जायेंगे जालबा जायेंगे ।

**Shri C. Subramaniam:** I am not going to defend myself I know where

to go. It is not as if I did not want to go there. If that were the case I need not have gone all the way to Bhubaneswar for this purpose. Somebody has said 'why not go walking?' I wish I were able to walk in two days 250 miles to reach that place. Therefore, there should be some sense of proportion when they make such suggestions.

**Shri Kishen Pattinayak:** There is a motorable road.

**Shri C. Subramaniam.** Therefore, what is important now is this. How do we see that the conditions do not further deteriorate, and how do we see that conditions improve? How do we see that the people's sufferings are removed as quickly and as effectively as possible? That was the one thing with which I was concerned. After the return of the team, I had a discussion, and then I had a long discussion with the Chief Minister and the other Ministers and the officers concerned there. As I have already stated, since March or April, various measures have been taken. First of all, they have made an attempt, every earnest attempt and to a certain extent a successful attempt also, in opening these relief works on an extensive scale.

**Shri P. K. Deo:** Question!

**Shri C. Subramaniam:** Whether they are adequate or not, generally the number of works, I am told, is quite adequate. Whether all the people who are ready to work are getting employment or not is a matter for verification, and if necessary, any further expansion of these works will have to be done, and that has been discussed. But what I want to suggest is that within a measurable distance you will find that the test works are going on everywhere; according to the report that is what we find.

**Shri P. K. Deo:** It should go into the interior.

**Shri C. Subramaniam:** But what is important now is this. It is not merely a question of providing test relief

work. Somebody condemned this report. Of course, one can condemn anything. But if one looks into it one will find that in spite of these relief works having been started, there is one important inadequacy or deficiency which has been pointed out, and that is the wage which a person is able to earn today. Whatever might be the reason, whether it is weakness of the people or malnutrition or whatever it be they are not able to work for more than four hours. I do not think that in the present conditions you can expect them to work for eight hours and put in hard labour. I do not think that that would be possible. Therefore, if they go for work at 8 a.m. and come back by 12 noon, I am not surprised about it. They say that according to the standards laid down, that is Rs. 1.75 for 100 c.ft. of earth-work they are able to earn only 62 paise on an average; the average is 62 paise, but it varies actually from 50 paise to 75 paise. Therefore, some people earn only 50 paise. This is grossly inadequate to meet their requirements. That is why the first thing that we have discussed is that while we have undertaken these works, we should also ensure that they earn a wage which will be adequate to meet their daily requirements, if not effect some saving; this is not the time when they will be able to effect some savings. So, we made two suggestions with regard to this. One was that they should increase this rate to Rs. 1.75 to an adequate extent so that doing this amount of work for four hours, they will be able to earn at least Rs. 1 to 1.25 which would be adequate. That is one way of dealing with it. Another way of dealing with it would be to provide them some grains also in kind, in addition to the wage. They have agreed to try both these methods and whichever would be successful would be spread out, so that there will be an adequacy of the wages earned by these people which alone would give them the purchasing power to get their daily requirements of food, apart from other things.

**Shri Surendranath Dwivedy:** Grain means paddy or rice? They should give them paddy.

**Shri P. K. Deo:** For how long will this experiment go on?

**Shri C. Subramaniam:** I am coming to that. That is also another point which has been taken up.

This is one aspect of it. Another thing is that when we say that they should earn this wage, we should also look into the price at which these grains are sold, so that whatever they purchase would be adequate for them.

Then, there is the point raised by Shri Surendranath Dwivedy and some other hon. Member with regard to the price at which rice is being sold. It is 91 paise per k.g. At that price, nobody will be able to purchase adequate quantities. Therefore, we have decided at what price rice should be sold. I was told that already an order had been passed that there should be no distinction between first grade, superior and all those things; it should be sold as a common variety, whatever be the quality of the rice. But at the meeting, somebody brought forward some technical difficulty with regard to that. But this is not the time when technical difficulties should be brought in. We should solve those problems. Therefore, that order has been passed. But apart from that, I have given them the assurance that we shall stock particularly some millets like milo or jowar which would be sold at a much lower rate, namely 35 to 40 paise per kg., and as far as these are concerned, they should be sold without any limitation in regard to the quantity, so that anybody who wants these things could get them and these cheaper grains would be available to them to any extent; and we have already started moving milo to Orissa so that this could be sold at a subsidised rate and anybody will be in a position to purchase sufficient quantity of it to the extent he requires it. That is one decision which

has been taken, and we are trying to implement it. This is one area in which there was a deficiency, and we have tried to make up that deficiency.

The next area in which they have tried to provide relief is by way of gratuitous relief by giving cards to the various disabled persons, old persons and persons sufferings from disease so that they would be able to get 290 gms. of foodgrains per day. I am told it is being given in the form of rice and wheat, and they have already distributed about one lakh of cards. With regard to the persons who have received these cards, in some places there are complaints and there are some irregularities that persons who are entitled to the cards have not obtained the cards while ordinary persons who would not be entitled to them have got it. This is a matter which will have to be looked into. We have made the suggestion in any event that even if a person who is entitled to it has got a card, he will not be in a very prosperous condition, and, therefore, we need not go and snatch away that card from him at this time, and let him get the benefit of that card. But in addition to that, we should see that all the disabled persons, all the old persons and the persons suffering from disease should be in a position to get the cards, and that is why we have suggested that with in the next ten days there should be an additional distribution of one lakh cards, particularly, under proper supervision to those weaker sections of the people who would be entitled to this. That has also been agreed to, and I hope it would be done much more effectively and efficiently, and these sections should be covered by that. If it is necessary to increase the number, I can give the assurance to this House that this figure of one lakh is no magic number, but we think that it would ordinarily cover those persons, but if it is necessary to increase the number, certainly we would increase it. This is the second aspect of it.

The third aspect is with regard to these free feeding centres. Free feeding centres fall under two heads. One is for the school children, in whose case the school lunch programme has been going on for some time. With regard to this, I was told that the schools were to be closed for holidays very soon. We took the decision that even though there would be holidays we should pay some honorarium for the teachers who stay behind and should continue this food programme for the children even during holidays and I have given the assurance that we would provide...

**Shri Kisben Pattanayak:** Is there a distinction between the school children and other children?

**Shri C. Subramaniam:** In the school programme, all the other children also are included. Therefore, if we close them, it is not only the school-going children who would suffer but also other children. So a decision has been that these schools will not be closed down simply because schools are closed during holidays. It will be continued.

In addition to that, we have agreed to give multi-vitamin tablets and other nourishment for these areas...

**Shri P. K. Deo:** The Congress Government needs vitamins.

**Shri C. Subramaniam:** This will compensate for other deficiencies. This is another thing which we have decided.

I forgot to mention one thing. With regard to gratuitous relief, the feeding centres, it has been pointed out that the quantity of food supplied particularly for one meal only is inadequate. So we have taken another decision that all those who attend free feeding centres would also be entitled to get a gratuitous relief card and they would be able to get 290 gms not a lesser quantity. I do not think a little bit of overfeeding will do any injury to them. Therefore, we have decided that they should also be given those cards. This is how we

have looked into and arranged the present programme and tried to remove various difficulties.

Another factor which have taken into account is concerning test relief works which will have to be closed down when the monsoon starts. We did not want to do that. Therefore we considered whether there should be relief works carried on even after the monsoon starts. We came to the conclusion that it will have to be carried on. So a small committee has been appointed consisting of the Chief Engineer, Director of Agriculture and others for the purpose of identifying some works which could be carried on even during the monsoon season. Even if it is a question of some small work, it should be carried on so that they may be able to earn this wage. Therefore, that is also being undertaken now. Hence those relief works will not stop when the monsoon starts, but will be carried on. This is how we have looked at it and tried to solve the immediate problem. We have taken decisions in this regard. For the purpose of carrying out these decisions effectively, we came to the conclusion that there is no use people looking to Bhubaneswar to solve problems, to find out what decisions should be taken what is the staff to be employed for this purpose etc. That is why the Orissa Government have agreed to station one officer of the status of Member of the Board of Revenue with all powers delegated to him who will have his headquarters in this very area and who will function with all these powers on the spot. Even if he does not have the power in respect of some matter, he will take the decision when something has got to be done and will report back to Government that he has done so in anticipation of approval. That also has been agreed upon. This is how we have tried to look upon this problem and attempted to fill up the deficiencies and inadequacies as best we can. This is one side.

The second side which was emphasised by hon. Members, particularly

[Shri C. Subramaniam]

by the hon. Member who initiated the debate, is with regard to agricultural operations. We will have to attach great importance to this because without normal agricultural operations being undertaken, these people will find themselves in greater difficulties soon after the monsoon when the agricultural season commences. In this, first of all, preparation of the land is important. Without that they will not be able to undertake agricultural operations. Therefore, we tried to find out how far the farmers have got the capacity to undertake the tillage of the land in the coming agricultural season. There was an estimate given by some Ministers and some officers that about 70 per cent of the land had already been ploughed. But some people say this is an over-estimate, that only 30 per cent would have been covered. But apart from these figures, the important thing is to find out if there is any difficulty experienced for want of bullocks or other things he needs. Where he is unable to find bullock power, we should provide either bullock power or tractor power. As far as tractor power is concerned, they have about 90 or 93 of them in Orissa. They have agreed to mobilise them and move them to this area for the purpose of starting these operations. But there are areas where these tractors will not be useful because these are big tractors. Fortunately, the State Government have in their position now about 100 power tillers, small tillers, which could be used.

**Shri P. K. Deo:** Tractors cannot reach the areas once the monsoon starts.

**Shri C. Subramaniam:** Power tillers could be used particularly when there has been rain. When the ground is hard, it might not be possible to use them for breaking the earth, but after the rainfall they come in handy and can be used. The State Government have agreed to move these 100 power

tillers also into this area and make them available to the people wherever land preparation is lagging because of lack of bullocks or other circumstances. This is how we have tried to solve this particular problem.

The next thing is seed. Even in November last, we issued circulars to the various State Governments which have to face drought conditions warning them that in these acute drought conditions, if things were left as they were whatever was stored for seed would be consumed; therefore, they should be able to get from within their own States or from various other places sufficient quantities of seeds and stock them for distribution. The Orissa Government also were alerted on this point. They have made some procurement, but not enough. But they are confident that with the second crop from Sambalpur, Cuttack and various other areas it should be possible for them to have round about 5 lakh maunds of seeds.

**Shri Surendranath Dwivedy:** Has it been ascertained whether those seeds are suitable for cultivation there?

**Shri C. Subramaniam:** They say they are. Apart from that, we have already alerted the Madras and Andhra Governments that they should select seeds which are suitable for Orissa. It has been indicated to them what varieties would suit Orissa and they should make available sufficient quantities of seeds for the benefit of Orissa. But the Orissa Government seem to think that they would be able to procure within their own State.

**Shri P. K. Deo:** They have all been thinking like that from the beginning.

**Shri C. Subramaniam:** But still I do not rely upon that estimate. I am asking the Madras and Andhra Government to reserve sufficient quantities of seeds in case of emergency. The officer who was the Chief Secretary

till recently, who is our Agriculture Secretary, is going to Orissa to day to find out about the adequacy of the measures which have been taken for the purpose of agricultural operations, particularly with regard to seed. I can give you this assurance that we shall see that if sufficient quantities of seeds are not available in Orissa, we shall try to rush them from Madras and Andhra. This should have been undertaken a little earlier. I do agree that it is a little bit late, but it is not too late.

श्री बृज बिहारी ब्रह्मरोत्रा (बिल्हौर) :  
क्या मंत्री जी बतलायेंगे कि सारी योजना के लिये कुल कितना रुपया स्वीकार किया गया है ?

Shri P. K. Deo: Are the seeds to be supplied free or on payment?

Shri C. Subramaniam: The question arises how the seeds should be distributed and at what rate. We have come to the conclusion that there should be no extra cost, also that the seeds should be distributed as a loan, not a short-term loan, but a loan to be repaid in three annual instalments. This decision has been taken. Now our concern is to see that the seeds are available in sufficient quantities, not only that, but that they reach the farmers in time. Therefore, we have tried to find out what should be the last date by which they should reach the farmers and then work backwards and find out at what date they should reach the block level, at what date they should reach the district level, at what date they should be made available to the State authorities for the purpose of moving to the districts. This schedule of dates has been worked out. For the purpose of seeing that we stick to this schedule, we have fixed responsibility on particular individuals. At the State level, it is the Agriculture Minister and Director of Agriculture who would be responsible, so that sufficient quantities are procured and moved to districts by the scheduled date. At the district level an officer has been identified who will be responsible to see that he moves the seeds

to the block level, and at the block level the block authorities have been made responsible for the purpose of distributing it to the farmers. Therefore, as far as possible, there is streamlining of administration and also location of responsibility, not to leave it saying the Agricultural Department is responsible, the State Government is responsible etc; we have tried to identify and locate responsibility.

18 hrs.

Shri P. K. Deo: Is it not a fact that the seed that was procured in the State for Rs. 35 per quintal is being supplied at Rs. 58 to the cultivators?

Shri C. Subramaniam: A decision has been taken, and it will be supplied at the rate at which it is procured, the extras which are charged for seed will not be charged. I am not quite sure if it is Rs. 35 or Rs. 38 but the decision is that these extras would not be charged.

It is not seed alone which is important. We should have sufficient finances to carry on the other operations, and there should also be some subsistence element so that till the harvest comes, the farmers will be in a position to sustain himself. Therefore, a programme of distributing loans has been worked out, and for that also responsibilities have been located on individual officers, and they have been made responsible for getting the loans and seeing that it is distributed at various levels.

This is what we were able to achieve by the discussion during my visit to Bhuvaneshwar. Even though it is regrettable that it was not possible to visit the other places, I feel we have done a good job, as far as looking into the various difficulties and difficulties is concerned, and trying to find out what actions will have to be taken.

Shri P. K. Deo: You should accompany the Prime Minister.

Shri C. Subramaniam: Secondly, are we going to allow the situation

[Shri C. Subramaniam]

to continue like this, not only in Orissa, but also in adjoining Madhya Pradesh, not only in Madhya Pradesh, but as was pointed out in Gujarat and Maharashtra, wherever tribals are there? In Maharashtra and Gujarat something has been done, but in some of the other areas, nothing has been done and they continue to be in the same old primitive stage. That is why it is now necessary to have a programme. I was told that the Orissa tribal area has the best water resources. All the rivers seem to start there and flow downwards. Therefore, that is the very source. In addition to that, I am told that all the mineral wealth is almost concentrated in that area. In spite of that, it happens to be one of the most economically backward areas. Fortunately, already some action has been taken for the purpose of investigating some of these medium and major irrigation projects, but what is important now is to have a worthwhile programme of seeing that immediately those programmes are taken up not only for providing some employment, but also to have development which would ensure that area against famine as even the coastal areas have been ensured against famine, by taking up large-scale irrigation works.

**Shri Surendranath Dwivedy:** Indravati project.

**Shri C. Subramaniam:** I am told there are many projects. I do not know the names and details, but there are sufficient number of projects and with Rs. 20 to Rs. 25 crores spent in the next three or four years we would be able almost to bring about a transformation of that area. That will have to be looked into and some priority will have to be given to that.

In addition, I have no doubt that we will have to look into the tribal and backward areas problem as a whole and try to give some priority in allocation of resources. The Plan-

ning Commission has also agreed, the Prime Minister is involved in it, and we have had discussions for the last two days, and I can give this assurance that we are aware of this problem and we will try to solve it as best as possible.

Many other points have been raised. It is not as if I want simply to rebut or answer criticism. What is more important today is to see that these things are implemented properly, and I do know the Orissa Government requires a little bit of assistance in this financial assistance. We have discussed this with the Finance Minister he has also agreed, and along with my Agriculture Secretary, a Finance man is also going to Orissa today. They will look into the whole thing, and I can give this assurance that none of these programmes will get bogged down, stopped or delayed for want of finances.

**Shri Kishen Pattnayak:** Are you going to declare famine?

**Shri C. Subramaniam:** I shall come to that, to your famous famine.

In addition, we have already come to the conclusion that we should have some officer, of a sufficiently high status from the Central Government, who will be visiting these States, particularly Orissa and a few other States which are in difficulties to see that there is no slackening of effort, that they do not get into difficulties. To the extent possible we shall give this assistance. I will not call it supervision, I shall say offering assistance to the State Government. That also has been decided upon. We are trying to appoint an officer for this purpose. I suppose with his periodical visits he would be able to report back to the Central Government and keep us fully informed with regard to the developments taking place and if any urgent action is necessary from the Central Government, we will not hesitate to take it.

A suggestion has been made by Shri Dwivedy, I am not surprised, that the Orissa Government should be immediately dismissed. With all respect to my hon. friend I suggest this would bring about chaos there, because for the Central Government to get settled and start all these operations there I am sure it will take at least one month. Instead of that, I hope it would be possible to energise the State Government to see that things move on, instead of inviting and confusion by asking the State Government to be taken over, which I feel is not constitutionally correct also. After all, when we take over in Kerala, everybody has been crying hoarse that democracy has been murdered, and here is a suggestion that democracy in Orissa should be murdered. I am not going to be a party to that.

**Shri Surendranath Dwivedy:** The life of the Assembly is over.

**Shri C. Subramaniam:** Therefore, I do not think we should fall into the trap as saying that the Centre should take over.

Shri Nambiar is fresh from jail, with fresh ideas, therefore he suggested why not have election immediately, why should it be postponed.

**Shri Nambiar:** That is for Kerala.

**Shri C. Subramaniam:** You neither belong to Kerala nor Tamilnad, that is the great difficulty. You are an imposter everywhere. The difficulty is this. Suppose we start elections now when people are undergoing this suffering, will our officials look after the election arrangements and arrange for the polling and all those things or to this relief work? Shri Dwivedy has offered his services for this relief work, but immediately the elections are there, he will be concerned with elections, he will not have the sacrificing spirit of saying that the elections do not matter, he is only concerned with the sufferings of the people. I am a politician and I know

something of the election fever. Our whole attention will be diverted to these elections. Therefore, I am afraid it is a very dangerous suggestion. If we are all very much concerned with the situation in Orissa and we want to take all measures for the purpose of containing the situation, I think it is a very light-hearted suggestion to say that we should have immediate elections there and I hope that will not be done.

Mention was made I think by Mr. Mukerjee that I was accusing the Opposition of scare-mongering. I should think he was accusing me of scare-mongering, perhaps he has forgotten about it. I did visualise we were going to have a difficult situation in the country and I did give a warning, but at that time I was accused of scare-mongering, but let me leave that alone. Now every one of us has got involved in the present situation, and we have to see that it does not go out of control, because this is not a political matter. It is a question involving the lives of the people, involving particularly the future of children. It does not matter even if there is some misery with regard to the old people. What about the flowering youth, the young children? Their whole life would be shattered. Therefore, we have to concentrate first on them. Not that I am not concerned with the misery of the others, difficulty of the others. In the order of priority I would give the first priority to give all the nutritious food, all the relief to the children and see that they get out of these miseries. Not that we should ignore the others. We must also take measures to see that human misery and suffering is lessened and minimised and normalcy is brought about in this state. I welcome the offer made by Prof. Mukerjee and by the others to co-operate in this cause. Whatever might be done by the administration on the official side, unless we as Members of Parliament and responsible elected representatives participate in



[Shri C. Subramaniam.]

all these things along with the elected assembly members, perhaps whatever action may be taken by the officials are likely to be deficient. These deficiencies will have to be made up, particularly by the participation of elected representatives, to whatever party they may belong. With regard to voluntary agencies, I do agree that voluntary agencies will have to be brought in, particularly organisations like the Ramakrishna Mission in which I am deeply involved. Therefore, it is not as if I would not like the Ramakrishna Mission to come in. I would like the Ramakrishna Mission to come in. But the feeding programme should not be left to the voluntary organisations alone. We cannot say that voluntary organisations have not come forward and therefore, these programmes have not been taken up. So, I have impressed upon the Orissa Government that if there is no voluntary organisation coming forward, that should not be an excuse for saying that the feeding programme has not been taken up. If the voluntary organisation is not there, Government will have to step in and see that the gap is filled up. In that also, I am sure the elected representatives will play a great role. I can assure the House that it is not as if we are not concerned with the situation there, that we are benumbed with regard to the situation in the country, with regard to the miseries of the people. We are greatly concerned with them. I am really happy that this discussion has brought about a better understanding of the situation. Particularly, I am grateful to the co-operative spirit in which the discussion had taken place. I thank you.

**Shri P. K. Deo:** Sir, just one question. Will the Minister assure the House that henceforth all the relief works will be entrusted to the people's organisations like the panchayats and all that and that the contractors will be eliminated?

**Shri C. Subramaniam:** I am sorry I missed this point. This is one of the points which I took up with the state Governments. They have agreed to this. Also with regard to some other suggestion about the distribution of paddy instead of rice, we have put this point also to the state Government. There were some difficulties raised with regard to this but I have said that I am not going to listen to the difficulties. These difficulties will have to be overcome. If paddy distribution will be better for the people, it will have to be undertaken. I have also requested the Prime Minister to take this up and see that these matters are settled . . . (Interruptions.)

श्री मधु लिमये : एक प्रश्न मुझे पूछने दीजिये ।

**Mr. Deputy-Speaker:** No more questions. We have had enough now. The discussion is over. The House stands adjourned till 11 A.M. tomorrow.

18.15 hrs.

The Lok Sabha then adjourned till Eleven of the Clock on Thursday, May 12, 1966/Vaisakha 22, 1888 (Saka).