

12.20 hrs.

**CALLING ATTENTION TO MATTER  
OF URGENT PUBLIC IMPORTANCE**

**SUPPLY OF SABRE JETS TO PAKISTAN**

श्री श्रीकार लाल बेरवा (कोटा) :  
मैं श्रविलम्बनीय लोक महत्व के निम्नलिखित  
विषय को श्रीर वैदेशिक कार्य मंत्री का ध्यान  
दिलाता हूँ और प्रार्थना करता हूँ कि वह इन  
बारे में एक बक्तव्य दें :—

श्रीद्वाना-बौन-तेहरान गठजोड़ के  
जरिरे पाकिस्तान को अमरीकी सेवर जेट  
दिये जाने के समाचार।

**The Minister of External Affairs**  
(Shri Swaran Singh): Hon. Members  
have drawn attention to reports  
about the recent receipt of F-86 sabre  
jet aircraft by Pakistan. The position  
is that Pakistan recently received a  
large number of F86 aircraft from  
Iran, estimated at 60—90 in number.  
These aircraft had been manufactured  
in Canada and sold by Canada to West  
Germany some years ago. West Ger-  
many recently resold these aircraft  
to Iran. Though the aircraft were of  
US design, we have been informed by  
the US Government that their manu-  
facture, sale and disposal were not  
subject to US control.

Late last year, when reports were  
received that Pakistan was making  
efforts to acquire arms and equip-  
ment from West Germany through  
third countries, we took up the mat-  
ter with the Government of the  
Federal Republic of Germany and we  
were assured that no arms and  
equipment were being sold to Pakis-  
tan. Subsequently reports indicated  
that Iran was buying F86 aircraft  
from West Germany. As far back  
as January last, our Ambassador in  
Tehran conveyed the apprehension  
of the Government of India arising  
from the likelihood of the F86 aircraft  
finding their way to Pakistan to the  
Iranian authorities at very high level.  
Soon after, a formal note was presen-

ted to the West German Government  
expressing in clear terms the Gov-  
ernment of India's misgivings and ap-  
prehension about diversion of the  
aircraft to Pakistan. The Govern-  
ment also kept in touch with the  
Canadian Government through diplo-  
matic channels. Both Governments  
assured us that under the agreement  
of sale, the aircraft sold by West  
Germany could not be passed on to  
third countries.

A few months ago, when the arri-  
val of F86 aircraft in Pakistan be-  
came known to us, we made strong  
representations to both the West  
German and the Iranian authorities,  
and we were assured by the Govern-  
ment of Iran that any aircraft sent  
by Iran to Pakistan would only be for  
repairs, servicing and modification, as  
facilities for these were not available  
in Iran. The House will no doubt  
learn with satisfaction that the Cana-  
dian Government has expressed its  
disinclination to allow further sales  
of Canadian-made aircraft to Iran.  
The Federal Republic of Germany has  
informed us that it has worked out  
with the Government of Iran proce-  
dures to ensure and verify the return  
of these aircraft from Pakistan to  
Iran.

**Shrimati Renu Chakravartty** (Bar-  
ackpore): What are they?

**Shri Swaran Singh:** The Iranian  
Government has reiterated that the  
aircraft sent to Pakistan are only for  
repairs, servicing and modifications  
and will return from there. We have  
been informed by the Government of  
Iran that some of these aircraft have  
already returned from Pakistan to  
Iran.

Hon. Members will note that ever  
since the possibility of the F-86 Sabre  
aircraft reaching Pakistan from West  
Germany came to the notice of Gov-  
ernment, the matter has been vigor-  
ously pursued with the foreign Gov-  
ernments concerned. We have apprised  
these Governments of our position  
that transfer of the 90 F-86 aircraft  
to Pakistan direct or through third

countries, which will inevitably mean a serious augmentation of Pakistan's military build-up against India, will have adverse repercussions on our relations with the countries involved in such transactions. I would like to assure the House that the Government would persist in efforts in this direction.

**श्री श्रीकार लाल बेरवा :** मैं जानना चाहता हूँ कि ईरान ने इस में बहुत कुछ हेरफेर किया है और हमारी सरकार को आश्वासन भी दिया है, हमारी सरकार इतनी भोली भाली और सुस्त है कि जिस को यह भी पता नहीं है कि ईरान के गए, जहाज मरम्मत के लिए गए हैं या लड़ाई में लड़ने के लिए गए हैं, वह उन को नान कर के बैठ गए, लेकिन मैं यह जानना चाहता हूँ कि अमरीका से सीधे जो पाकिस्तान को नकद धन के बदले में या विका में सामान जा रहे हैं, अमरीका जो उनको शस्त्र दे रहा है, उस के बारे में सरकार को क्या जानकारी है? अब तक कितना मात्र सामान वहाँ भेज दिया है?

**अध्यक्ष महोदय :** यह तो दूसरा सवाल है।

**श्री श्रीकार लाल बेरवा :** नहीं, यह तो सवाल इस में है। कार्लिंग अटेंशन यही है कि अमरीका ने उन को दिया, वहाँ से जर्मनी को दिया, जर्मनी ने ईरान को दिया और ईरान ने पाकिस्तान को दे दिया . . .

(व्यवधान)

**श्री हुकम चन्द कछवाय (बेव.स) :** अध्यक्ष महोदय, कार्लिंग अटेंशन में इस का उल्लेख है . . .

**Mr. Speaker:** Why should Mr. Kachhavaiya stand up when Mr. Berwa has been asking the question?

**Shri Swaran Singh:** The sale of equipment by USA does not arise out of this.

**Shri S. M. Banerjee (Kanpur):** We tabled a calling attention notice on this.

**Mr. Speaker:** That is a different thing. I am taking this one now.

**श्री श्रीकार लाल बेरवा :** अध्यक्ष महोदय, कैनाडा ने जर्मनी को दिया, जर्मनी ने ईरान को दिया और ईरान ने पाकिस्तान को दिया, यानी एक लड़ी बनती आ रही है. . . . .  
(व्यवधान)

**श्री हुकम चन्द कछवाय :** \*\*\*\*

**Mr. Speaker:** This will not go on record.

**श्री श्रीकार लाल बेरवा :** इस के बारे में अगर सरकार को जानकारी थी कि जर्मनी ने यह वायदा किया था कि यह पाकिस्तान को नहीं भेजे जायेंगे और जो अगली लड़ाई के अन्दर पाकिस्तान के जहाज टूट कर आये थे, उन के द्वारा उन की मरम्मत कर दी गई थी तो क्या भारत सरकार जो यह जेट विमान आये हैं, यह जब वापस आयेंगे उस मुल्क में तो किसी अपने वैज्ञानिक द्वारा जांच करायेगी कि यह वही आये हैं या खोबा भेज दिये हैं?

**Shri Swaran Singh:** We must appreciate our limitations when the sovereign rights of other countries are concerned. At the present moment I have explained the assurances that have been given by the various Governments, and we are watching the situation carefully. I do not want to overstate the matter, and I think so far as these assurances are concerned, they are very definite assurances and on'y time will show as to whether these assurances are honoured or not.

**श्री श्रीकार लाल बेरवा :** इन का जवाब नहीं आया अध्यक्ष महोदय, कि वापस जब यह सेब जेट विमान आयेंगे तो भारत सरकार अपने विशेषज्ञों द्वारा उस की जांच करायेगी कि वही विमान वापस आये हैं या उनकी जगह खाली खोबा भेज दिये हैं?

**अध्यक्ष महोदय :** उन्होंने कहा उत्तर में कि वह सावरेन कन्ट्री है, हम उस में नहीं कुछ कर सकते ।

**श्री यशपाल सिंह (कैनाता) :** श्रीमन्, सरकार यह बात या तो अस्कार करे या यह कहे कि हम इस लाइन के ऊपर चलने को तैयार नहीं हैं। सरकार को गलत विदेश नीति का नतीजा यह हुआ कि आज हिन्दुस्तान अलग खड़ा हुआ रह गया है, इस का कोई साथी नहीं है। जब यह किसी के बनने को तैयार नहीं तो इन का कौन बनेगा ? यह हर जगह जाकर कहते हैं कि हमारी तुम्हारी ट्रेडिशन मिलती है . . . .

**अध्यक्ष महोदय :** आर्डर, आर्डर ।

**श्री यशपाल सिंह :** रूस से भी कहते हैं कि हमारी तुम्हारी ट्रेडिशन मिलती है और अमरीका से भी कहते हैं... (व्यवधान) अपने मूलक को मजबूत नहीं करते और दूसरे मुल्कों से जाकर भोख मांगने की कोशिश करते हैं \*\*\*

**Mr. Speaker:** Order, order. This will not be recorded.

When Thakur Sahib stands up, he proceeds like an automatic machine and does not listen to anybody.

मुझे मालूम नहीं कि वे जान बूझ कर मेरी तरफ नहीं देखते, मैं आवाजें देता रहता हूँ, लेकिन वह सुनते नहीं, इतने मगन हो जाते हैं उस में, कि इधर देखते ही नहीं। मैं उन को बार बार बुलाता रहा, और देखता रहा कि जरा आंख इधर तो कर लें ।

**श्री यशपाल सिंह :** अगर इजाजत दें तो अपना सवाल एक सेकेण्ड में साफ़ कर दूँ । इतने देशों की सरहदों को पार करते हुए वे जहाज वहाँ पहुँचे, क्या उन में से भारत का

कोई ऐसा मित्र देश था जिसने उनको रास्ते में चेक किया हो ?

**Shri Swaran Singh:** It is a matter of geography that for aircraft to come from Iran to Pakistan no other country is crossed.

**श्री मधु लिमये (मुरै) :** अध्यक्ष महोदय, यह जो ध्यान दिलाने का नोटिस है उस में ओटावा, बीन और तेहरान आक्सिस की खास तीर पर चर्चा है। जहाँ तक मुझे मालूम है, कैनाडा और पश्चिमी जर्मनी नाटो के सदस्य हैं और ईरान सेन्टो का सदस्य है। तो इन दोनों का नाता-रिश्ता क्या है, उसकी भी सफ़ाई होनी चाहिये। मेरा सवाल यह है कि किन शर्तों पर कैनाडा ने पश्चिमी जर्मनी को और पश्चिमी जर्मनी ने किन शर्तों पर ईरान को ये सेबर-जेट हवाई जहाज दिये थे।

**Shri Swaran Singh:** I have already explained that when the earlier permission was sought by West Germany from Canada, it had been allowed by them because it was a sale to Iran but it was made clear that the recipient country, the purchaser from West Germany will not transfer it to any other country. It is mainly for this reason, because of the subsequent facts that have come to light, or the subsequent sale, Canada has not allowed West Germany to sell a further lot of sabre jets to Iran.

**श्री मधु लिमये :** किन शर्तों पर कैनाडा ने बेचा, यह तो उन्होंने कहा ही नहीं है ? किन शर्तों पर नहीं बेचा यह कहा है। क्या आपने जानकारी हासिल करने की कोशिश की ?

**अध्यक्ष महोदय :** क्या वह सेल था ?

**Shri Swaran Singh:** That was a sale by West Germany to Iran.

\*\*\*Not recorded.

**Shrimati Renu Chakravartty:** All the sabre jets in this deal had gone from Bonn to Teheran to Karachi. We knew from January that this was in the offing. Yet on the question of Bonn, about which we are so much deeply concerned whenever it is a question of upsetting them on any one point, I would like to know what is it that our Government has done in order to see that Bonn is not permitted to act in this manner and whether it is a fact again, that the West German Government has asked for a further allotment of sabre jets which are to be given to Teheran and had written to Ottawa. It is this second instalment which has come in the papers. Bonn has again asked Ottawa for the second lot to be sent to Teheran. It is at this stage Canada objected. I would also like to know whether it is not a fact that the U.S. designs of sabre jets manufactured by Canada are governed by certain guidelines whereby they are not permitted to hand over these designs of aircraft to any other country and if so what have we done? Have we protested to the United States also?

**Shri Swaran Singh:** I can well understand the desire of the hon. Member to drag other countries into it.

**Shrimati Renu Chakravartty:** Other countries are involved in it.

**Shri Swaran Singh:** I have clearly stated about the second lot about which Shrimati Renu Chakravartty had made an enquiry, about seeking Canadian permission for selling a second lot to Iran—that has not been agreed to.

**Shrimati Renu Chakravartty:** Has Bonn made such a request?

**Shri Swaran Singh:** If the permission has been disallowed obviously they did seek permission to sell further. About the US involvement, I have mentioned in the statement itself that according to their agreements, the United States Government has no control over the sale by Canada to other countries. So, we may have our own

attitude and our assessment, but let us not try to connect these things. *(Interruption)*

**Shrimati Renu Chakravartty:** Have they seen this agreement? He says that there is no check on the American designed Sabre jet that they can hand it over to any country in the world. Is that the position? Has he seen this?

**Shri Swaran Singh:** In this case, obviously I cannot have access to all those documents nor has she access to any documents. It is easy to make an allegation and then to ask me either to contradict or to confirm it. In this case, we should deal with it on its own merits. Here was a jet plane which was manufactured by Canada; it was sold to West Germany on the condition that West Germany cannot sell it to another country unless the original supplier, namely, Canada, agreed. They had agreed with regard to the first lot and now, it is on account of our taking this up with the various Governments—Canada and West Germany—they are calling upon Iran to honour their commitments not to transfer them to any other country. Even Iran has assured that they have been sent to Pakistan for repairs, etc. I can understand our feeling of concern about it. But I am fully satisfied that the maximum that we could do we have done, and it has yielded some results.

**Shrimati Renuka Ray (Malda):** The Minister has said that Canada has given a definite assurance about this. I would like to know whether he is satisfied that the Bonn Government has given a similar assurance that this kind of thing will not be repeated in some other way again?

**Shri Swaran Singh:** I have already said that the West German Government have assured us that they have taken this matter up with Iran and the Iran Government has assured both West Germany and the Government of India that they are taking steps to take these aircraft back to Iran.

**Shri Bhagwat Jha Azad** (Bhagalpur): On the one hand the Minister says that Bonn has asked Teheran and on the other hand Bonn has asked for permission for the second lot. How does he reconcile both these statements? We have been told time and again that Bonn has assured us, but in the second lot they have asked permission from Ottawa. (*Interruption*).

**Shri Joachim Alva** (Kanara): I want to know whether the United States has secretly given any instruction to Canada for Sabres to be given to Pakistan.... (*Interruption*).

**Mr. Speaker:** Order, order. **Shri Hem Barua.**

**Shri Hem Barua** (Gauhati): There is much noise, Sir.

**Mr. Speaker:** Yes; I am also waiting for it to subside.

**Shri Hem Barua:** During the last Pakistani aggression on our soil, the West German Government banned the entry of certain war equipment coming from a certain Scandinavian country which wanted to hand this war equipment direct to Pakistan through Frankfurt, and the West German Government banned this entry. In that context, may I know whether (a) the present ominous silence and the ambiguous attitude and the reluctance to rebuke Teheran on the part of the Bonn Government is due to the coolness engineered by or generated by the joint Indo-Soviet communique that was issued after our Prime Minister visited Moscow—and unwise that was—acknowledging the existence of two Germanys, and (b) the hon. Minister has said that Iran has told us that these were sent to Pakistan for repairs but our information is that Pakistan does not have the capacity to repair those aircraft brought down by our pilots and damaged in the last aggression. If they have not got the capacity to repair her own damaged aircraft, how can she repair the aircraft for other people? Are our Government convinced by this lame excuse offered by Iran?

**Shri Swaran Singh:** There are three parts of the question. The question about the supply or the stoppage of the war equipment does not arise out of this. That is a matter which the Defence Minister can deal with better. About the joint Indo-Soviet communique, this has got no relevance, because we must remember that that communique was issued only very recently.

**Shri Hem Barua:** It was issued in July.

**Shri Swaran Singh:** But this agreement about the sale of aircraft took place in the months of January and February. Since that time, we are taking up that matter with them.

**Shri Hem Barua:** It is a wrong answer. I asked whether the subsequent attitude of the Bonn Government during this controversy is due to the coolness generated by so many other things.

**Shri Swaran Singh:** The subsequent conduct, if anything, is to appreciate the strength of our viewpoint and they have taken steps accordingly. I do not see how he connects this with the Indo-Soviet communique. Some hon. members function under a certain obsession and they want to import it, irrespective of the chronology of events or their connection. If he wants to say that the Indo-Soviet communique is responsible for the supply of the Sabre jets, it is incorrect.

**Shri Hem Barua:** I am sorry, because what I said has been misinterpreted. I know that it was in January that our Ambassador in Teheran informed our Government about this smuggling of aircraft and our Government have taken up this matter for a long time. It was during July that the joint Soviet-Indo communique was issued and it acknowledged the existence of two Germanies. My question was whether the present attitude of

ominous silence during this controversy on the part of the Bonn Government is due to the coolness generated by that communique.

**Shri Sawaran Singh:** My reply is a simple 'No'. I do not accept that there was any coolness on that score. So far as our attitude on this question of East Germany is concerned, there was nothing new in this communique which was not already there. We stand by that; it is no business of any other country to take any attitude merely because we express a certain view. Let there be no misapprehension on that score.

**Shri Hem Barua:** What about the second part of my question? He has conveniently forgotten it.

**Mr. Speaker:** That is because it was too long.

**Shri Surendranath Dwivedy (Kendrapara):** He said that Iran has promised to take back these things. Have they given any time-limit within which they would take them back? Then I want to repeat that question whether Pakistan has the capacity or facilities for repairing or reconditioning sophisticated weapons as Sabre jets? The explanation given by Iran seems to be quite incredible. Have they any information about this?

**Shri Swaran Singh:** I myself have doubts if Pakistan has the capacity. That is one reason why we have succeeded in convincing the Governments concerned that this appears to be an excuse and that they should retrace those steps. To a certain extent, we are succeeding. But I cannot hold out any firm hope. Only time will show whether the assurances that have been given are being honoured or not. About the time-limit, this matter has not been broached in that manner. I would request hon. members not to press that.

**श्री बड़े (खारगोन):** अभी मंत्री महोदय ने जवाब दिया कि उन के पास स्पेअर पार्ट्स भी नहीं हैं और कर्पसिटी भी नहीं है सेवर

जेट्स को रिपेअर करने की। मैं जानना चाहता हूँ कि क्या कोई इस प्रकार की गारन्टी ली गई है कि इन सेवर जेट्स के वापस जाने के बाद यह बात रिपीट नहीं होगी। क्या आपने इस तरह की कोई गारन्टी ईरान और कनाडा से मांगी है कि इस प्रकार से सीक्रेटली या स्माल व्हेज में यह विमान पाकिस्तान को फिर नहीं भेजे जायेंगे।

**Shri Swaran Singh:** Let us not assume that we can just ask any guarantee that suits us from any country. Other countries also are sovereign countries. In this particular case, let us confine ourselves to this transaction. So far as sale of arms is concerned, we also purchase from other countries and other countries also purchase. We cannot insist on this type of guarantee from each and every country about each transaction and the manner in which it is enforced.

**श्री हुकम चन्द कछवाय:** मैं जानना चाहता हूँ कि क्या मंत्री महोदय केके पास एसी कोई कमेटी या एसा कोई विभाग है जिसने यह जांच की हो कि पिछले युद्ध में पाकिस्तान के कितने अमरीकी विमान नष्ट किये गये थे जिन के रिपेअर वह ठीक ढंग से कर सकते हैं। क्या सरकार का ध्यान इस बात पर गया है कि उस समय अमरीका से जो आदमी बुलाये गये थे सैनिक शिक्षा देने के लिए उन को वह फिर से बुलाना चाहते हैं।

**अध्यक्ष महोदय:** इस का सवाल नहीं पैदा होता।

**श्री हुकम चन्द कछवाय:** यह सवाल क्यों नहीं उठता ?

**अध्यक्ष महोदय:** नहीं, यह सवाल नहीं उठता।

**Shri S. M. Banerjee:** It appears from the statement of the Minister that Ottawa has taken up the matter with West Germany and West Germany with Iran. It means, passing on the baby without a kiss.

**Shri Hem Barua:** What does it mean, Sir? Is it Indian English?

**Shri Swaran Singh:** It is better if some simple English is used, because my knowledge of English is not so much as that of some hon. members opposite.

**Shri S. M. Banerjee:** This is universally known. In view of the repeated unfriendly acts by West Germany—at the time of Pakistani aggression also, they behaved very shabbily, while East Germany, with whom we have neither the courage nor conviction to have diplomatic relations, supported us—in case of future recurrence of such incidents, may I know whether the Government will seriously consider severing diplomatic relations with West Germany and Iran?

**Mr. Speaker:** It does not arise out of this.

**Shri Swaran Singh:** This is a hypothetical question; I cannot answer it.

**Shri S. M. Banerjee:** It does arise, Sir.

**Mr. Speaker:** He asked whether in the event of something happening, they will sever connections. That does not arise out of this.

**Shri S. M. Banerjee:** In his statement itself, he has said "unfriendly act". Will they sever diplomatic relations now, Sir?

**Mr. Speaker:** Shri Daji. (*Interruptions*).

**Shri S. M. Banerjee:** We are afraid of Anglo-American power. (*Interruptions*).

**Shri Daji (Indore):** It is true that we cannot control the acts of other Governments—either West Germany or Iran—but the way the explanation was given by the Minister seems to indicate that this Government at least is satisfied with the explanation given by Bonn and Iran that Iran has called back the planes. But there is a legitimate fear that even if the planes go back, some vital spare parts would be taken out of them. We cannot inspect all these things. Has the Government satisfied itself that the explanations trotted out by Iran and West Germany are justified and fair? If not, does the Government propose to take up the matter in a more serious manner with those two powers, so that in future at least such things can be stopped?

**Shri Swaran Singh:** We have always taken up this matter with the greatest seriousness. I have also said at the conclusion of my statement which I read out that we will continue to pursue this matter with the greatest seriousness. I have said, it is our hope that the assurances will be honoured and implemented. About satisfaction or non-satisfaction, these are subjective matters. I do not want to enter into that.

**Shri Daji:** We can reject their explanation if we are not satisfied.

12.49 hrs.

#### PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE

#### NOTIFICATIONS AND ORDERS UNDER ESSENTIAL COMMODITIES ACT

**The Deputy Minister in the Ministry of Commerce (Shri Shafi Qureshi):** On behalf of Shri Manubhai Shah, I beg to lay on the Table—

- (1) A copy of Notification No. S. O. 2314 published in Gazette of India dated the 30th July, 1966 issued under section 5 of the Essential Commodities