

Rao: On behalf of Shri Manubhai Shah I beg to move for leave to introduce a Bill to provide for the repeal of the Cotton Fabrics (Additional Excise Duty) Act, 1957.

Mr. Speaker: The question is:

"That leave be granted to introduce a Bill to provide for the repeal of the Cotton Fabrics (Additional Excise Duty) Act, 1957."

The motion was adopted.

Shri Jaganatha Rao: I introduce† the Bill.

12.07 hrs.

MOTION RE: PRESENT ECONOMIC SITUATION IN THE COUNTRY—contd.

Mr. Speaker: The House will now take up further consideration of the following motion moved by Shri Sachindra Chaudhuri on on the 26th July, 1966, namely:—

"That the present economic situation in the country be taken into consideration."

Shrimati Renu Chakravartty (Barrackpore): May I point out one thing? Yesterday when we were not here, you had suspended the rules and allowed an amendment to be introduced saying that there were precedents to that in the House. I have been a Member of all the three Parliaments and as far as I remember, on every occasion whenever we had allowed suspension of rules, it was accompanied by some reason: either the papers had not been given in time or for some other reason. The House may be told as to why you are suspending the rules.

Mr. Speaker: I might correct the hon. Member here that no rule was suspended nor was any suspension required.

Shrimati Renu Chakravartty: Do I take it that you have taken it in your discretion to allow the Government to move....

Mr. Speaker: That is in the rule itself.

Shrimati Renu Chakravartty: Normally you have never done it in the past.

Mr. Speaker: It has been done so many times.

Shrimati Renu Chakravartty: It has been done, but with an explanation. You have always explained to us as to why it was necessary. So we would like to know what was the reason that prompted you to do this.

Mr. Speaker: I have seen one case where Mr. Kamath requested me after the debate had begun. Mr. Kamath made a request that because it had to go on for two more days, even amendments that are brought after one day, should be allowed to be moved. And I had allowed that.

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath (Hoshangabad): May I submit to you in all humility that this is not on all fours with that because this amendment which was allowed yesterday is identical with an amendment given by a member who was not present in the House and which you therefore, rejected.

Mr. Speaker: This is not the same.

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: This is identical with that.

Shri Tyagi (Dehra Dun): When the motion is of the nature that a particular policy be considered, it is not possible for anybody to give an amendment in advance that it approves of it. The House should first know what the policy is. It is only when the

†Introduced with the recommendation of the President.

[Shri Tyagi]

House knows what the policy is that an amendment seeking approval can be tabled. Therefore, on any such motion, such amendments are permissible even at the late hour.

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: After the Tashkent Agreement, he is not himself.

Mr. Speaker: Does the hon. Prime Minister want to say anything?

The Prime Minister and Minister of Atomic Energy (Shrimati Indra Gandhi): Not on this. But I find that hon. Members opposite are raising some points....

Shri Surendranath Dwivedy (Kendrapara): Yesterday, I had made a request to the House for creating conditions for the normal functioning and the normal carrying on of the business of the House. The Minister of Parliamentary Affairs and the Leader of the House has agreed that in future if there is a no-confidence motion, a substantial motion on policy matters will not be taken up and he has said that he will examine this question. At the end he had also said: "We shall see that such things do not recur in future." Even after that, we have continued the discussion on the economic situation. But some of our Members are not prepared to participate in it....

An hon. Member: Not some, but most of the Members.

Shri Surendranath Dwivedy: ..and they have boycotted this debate. The main demand is that this debate may be postponed and taken up after the no-confidence motion is disposed of; then, probably, those Members will not have any objection to participate in the discussion, and this important matter can be discussed with all sections of the House participating in the discussion.

Therefore, I would reiterate my appeal again, and request the Government, through you, Sir, to agree to this request. We have already debated this matter for a day. Now let us postpone it till the no-confidence motion is disposed of. Let us postpone it to a suitable day which Government and you, Sir, may decide later.

Shri Mohammed Koya (Kozhikode): It is a question of wits and counter-wits.

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: Wit and outwit.

Shrimati Indira Gandhi: It has been a well recognised and honoured principle of parliamentary democracy that important policy decisions taken during the period when Parliament is not in session should be put before Parliament on the very first day that Parliament assembles. It was in pursuance of this principle and its practice, and not to forestall the debate on the no-confidence motion that Government made their motion before the Lok Sabha.

श्री बागड़ी (हिसार): प्रधान मंत्री जी ने यह भी पढ़ना शुरू कर दिया।

डा० राम मनोहर लोहिया (फर्रुखाबाद): अध्यक्ष महोदय, इसे यह लिख कर लाई है।

अध्यक्ष महोदय: मुझे उस से कोई मतलब नहीं।

डा० राम मनोहर लोहिया: अभी एक सुझाव दिया गया। मैं खाली एक सवाल पूछ रहा हूँ.....

अध्यक्ष महोदय: अभी आप जरा बैठ जाय।

डा० राम मनोहर लोहिया: मेरा एक सवाल है कि द्विवेदी जी ने अपना सुझाव दिया तो वह इसे कैसे दे रहे हैं? मैं व्यक्त्या का प्रश्न उठा रहा हूँ। द्विवेदी जी ने सवाल उठाया तो क्या पहले से बातचीत हो चुकी थी?

श्री सोलंकी (कैरा) : जी हां, पहले से बातचीत हो चुकी थी ।

Shri Surendranath Dwivedy: So far as I am concerned, I did not know whether she had written it or not; I did not know what Government were going to decide.

अध्यक्ष महोदय : एक इधर से अपील आई है मैंने गवर्नमेंट का रिएक्शन पूछा है, बाकी कोई बात हुई है या नहीं हुई है उससे मुझे कोई मतलब नहीं है ।

Shri Kapur Singh (Ludhiana): We cannot allow this kind of command performance. It is reducing Parliament proceeding to a farce.

डा० राम मनोहर लोहिया : यह लिख कर कहां से ले आई ? क्या इन को इलाहाम हुआ करता है अल्लाह मियां से ?

Shrimati Indira Gandhi: I am glad that Shri Surendranath Dwivedy has made an appeal, but actually we had come to this decision on our own. I did not know that he was going to speak about it this morning. As I was saying, we did not make our motion to forestall in any way the no-confidence motion.

Shrimati Renu Chakravarty: They have done it.

Shrimati Indira Gandhi: Government have always respected the Opposition and have tried to seek their co-operation. At the same time, Government cannot make a positive response to protests which take the shape of holding up the business of the House. But after the debate was resumed, we thought about the matter again. Government would now be prepared, should the Speaker and the House wish, to postpone the discussion on the Finance Minister's motion is after the no-confidence motion is debated and disposed of.

But I should like to take this opportunity to appeal to all sections of

the House to co-operate with the Chair in maintaining the highest traditions of democracy for which our Parliament has earned a reputation throughout its career.

श्री मधु लिमये (मुंगेर) : अध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं एक भ्रज करना चाहता हूँ.....

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आर्डर, आर्डर ।

Shri Solanki: Now they have realised their mistake. They have been behaving like mad people so far and remained silent while the Chair stood insulted.

Shri Ranga (Chittoor): I am glad that wisdom has dawned on this Government even at such a late hour, and the Prime Minister now expresses the hope that all sections would cooperate with the Speaker. I should have thought that the Government should have thought many times before they chose to exercise their fullest possible rights and thus create all that embarrassment to the Speaker and to various sections in the House during those two days when we were going through that searing experience.

Ordinarily, it should have been understood by anyone who has any instinct for parliamentary democracy that a no-confidence motion should be given precedence. That should have been understood by them. Immediately they knew that that point would be pressed. Therefore, the Leader brought the whole House to such a level of tricks that he chose to lead you and us into a wrong path by Government themselves giving notice of a substantive motion. The gravamen of my charge is against the manner in which this House is being led, or rather misled, by this Government, and what is more, to being led into such a pass, where the Speaker himself is not only embarrassed but put into agony so much so that he was obliged to appeal to the House, on grounds of his own health, to obey him.

[Shri Ranga]

Who was responsible? True, all those friends who created that trouble, from which all of us dissociated ourselves, were also responsible. But more was the responsibility of this Government. They should have apologised to the House and to the Speaker. If they have not got that decency, I do not know when a sense of decency would descend upon them. I have nothing more to say.

श्री हुकम चन्द कछवाय (देवास) :
अध्यक्ष महोदय, इस पर विचार किया जाय ।

डा० राम मनोहर लोहिया : जरा
धन्यवाद के साथ एक जुमला कहना चाहता
हूँ.....

Mr. Speaker: I do not allow a debate on this.

Shrimati Renu Chakravartty: We are not asking for a debate.

Shri Surendranath Dwivedy: I formally move:

"That further debate on the Government motion regarding Economic Situation be adjourned."

श्री हुकम चन्द कछवाय : अध्यक्ष महोदय,
हमारी बात भी सुन लीजिये । आपने रंगा
साहब व अन्य लोगों की बात सुनी तो फिर
आप हमें आखिर क्यों नहीं सुनते हैं ?

अध्यक्ष महोदय : मैं क्या सुनूँ ? अब
जाहिर है कि 500 माननीय सदस्यों को तो
मैं नहीं सुन सकता हूँ ।

What does Shrimati Renu Chakravartty want to say?

Shrimati Renu Chakravartty: All that I would like to say is this that I am glad that the Government have at last seen sense, and better late than never, I would also say that whatever has happened in this House and we have really held up the debate—there is no doubt about it—I want to tell my hon. friends opposite that we normally

never take things to this pitch. But the reason for doing it was an extremely serious one. We tried to plead with Government again and again to realise that what they were doing was against the tents of parliamentary democracy, about which the Prime Minister spoke just now. (Interruptions). They talk about parliamentary democracy, but they do not want to hear about it.

Here were we trying to uphold a very healthy convention, and I am very glad that my hon. friend Shri Ranga has also agreed that in the circumstances in which devaluation has taken place behind the back of Parliament when a no-confidence motion was also outstanding, the Government should not have asked for a vote of confidence prior to the no-confidence motion being disposed of.

Anyway, I would plead with you further that you should re-examine rule 198. I know you have given your ruling that you are helpless in the matter, but I would request you once again to see that we by our rules have given you overriding powers in this particular clause on the question of no-confidence motion, to advise Government, as you have always advised us, on keeping parliamentary decorum to consider the importance of the no-confidence motion. Therefore, on both these points I would say that if we had been able to use the powers and the intelligence which we should have brought to bear on this matter, much of the unfortunate scenes that took place could have been avoided and I hope that in future we shall be able to avoid it with the co-operation, willing co-operation, of the ruling party who have got such a huge majority.

श्री बड़े (खारगोन) : अध्यक्ष महोदय,
मेरा सही कहना है कि जो भी हल्ला पिछले
दो दिनों से यहां हो रहा है उसके लिए मेरी
पार्टी भी तैयार नहीं थी । लेकिन जब

हम ने देखा कि डिमाक्रेसी के खिलाफ बात यहाँ हो रही है और पार्लियामेंट से अधिकार मांगे जा रहे हैं तब हम बोलें। आप ने कहा कि आप का अपमान हुआ। लेकिन इस सम्बन्ध में जो आप का अपमान हुआ और जो हल्ला यहाँ पर हुआ इस की जवाबदेही शासन पर है। पले अगर इस बात को लीडर आफ दि हाउस मान लेतीं तो इतना हल्ला यहाँ पर न होता। लेकिन देर आयद दुस्त आयद। आज ही सही। लेकिन मैं यह कहना चाहता हूँ कि यहाँ पर जो हल्ला हुआ और जो आप का अपमान हुआ है उस की जिम्मेदारी शासन पर हूँते हुए भी माफी उसने नहीं मांगी है। फिर भी मैं प्रधान मंत्री को धन्यवाद देते हुए कहना चाहता हूँ कि हमें जो कुछ हुआ उस में फारगेट और फारगिव की भावना से काम करना चाहिए।

Dr. L. M. Singhvi (Jodhpur): The acceptance of the suggestion which I made day before yesterday is very welcome, but it is all the same surprising that this suggestion should have been accepted after all this indecision and vacillation lasting for nearly two days and contributing to all that happened in this House, all the unpleasantness that was generated in the House. This seems to be a case really of psychopathological schizophrenia. I besought the Minister of Parliamentary Affairs and the Prime Minister to accept it.

Mr. Speaker: Why go into this?

Dr. L. M. Singhvi: How is it that such a decision was delayed so long? Yesterday Mr. Chatterjee requested the Government to reconsider the whole matter. Does it take all this time to come to a positive decision like this?

Shri Hem Barua (Gauhati): It seems the Prime Minister has very generously accepted the suggestion made by the Opposition. She has done it very gracefully. My submission is that all these Members on whom the suspension order....

Mr. Speaker: That is a separate thing. This must be finished.

डा० राम मनोहर लोहिया : अध्यक्ष महोदय, कोई काम चाहे वह कम अच्छा हो, चाहे पूरा अच्छा हो, चाहे देर से हो चाहे समय पर हो और चाहे खाली सतह पर हो, अगर अच्छा हो तो मैं उसे स्वीकारता हूँ और आज प्रधान मंत्री जी को थोड़ा सा धन्यवाद देता हूँ। लेकिन इस के साथ साथ जब वह सदन की शोभा की बात करती हैं तब उन को एक सलाह देना चाहता हूँ। आज देश में दो औरतें हैं, एक दिल्ली वाली और एक लखनऊ वाली। इन दोनों... (व्यवधान)।
... अभी मेरा वाक्य तो पूरा होने दो...

अध्यक्ष महोदय : डाक्टर साहब, अगर आप को कोई सलाह देनी हो तो वैसे ही दीजिये तब ज्यादा अच्छा होगा बजाय इसके कि आप हाउस में दें।

डा० राम मनोहर लोहिया : वैसे वह मुझे कहां मौका देगी। इसी लिये मैं आप के जरिये सलाह देना चाहता हूँ। जब वह शोभा की बात कह रही हैं, तब हिन्दुस्तान में दो औरतें हैं.... (व्यवधान)।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आर्डर, आर्डर।

श्री हुकम चन्द कछवाय : मैं प्रस्ताव करता हूँ कि उन्हें बाहर निकाला जाये।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आप इस तरह से नहीं बोल सकते। डाक्टर साहब, जो एटमास्फियर पैदा हो रहा है उसमें ऐसी बात न उठाइये।... (व्यवधान)। आप बैठ जायें।

डा० राम मनोहर लोहिया : : आप मुझ को अपना वाक्य तो पूरा करने दें। अगर किसी चीज से उन को एतराज है....

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आप बैठ जायें और मुझे सुन लें

Shri Raghunath Singh (Varanasi)
He should not be allowed.

अध्यक्ष महोदय : यह मौका ऐसा नहीं है कि हम यू० पी० के चीफ मिनिस्टर को यहां लायें। अब आप ऐसा ऐटमास्फियर पैदा होने दें जो हो रहा है।

डा० राम मनोहर लोहिया : एक जरूरी चीज है। (व्यवधान)।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : अगर आप लोग शोर मचाना चाहते हैं

श्री मधु लिमये : मैं आप से पूछना चाहता हूँ। आखिर आप विरोधी दल को ही क्यों बार बार कहते हैं? यह कांग्रेसी हुल्लड़बाजी कर रहे हैं, दूसरे लोग भी ऐसा कर रहे हैं, आप उन को नहीं रोक रहे हैं। . . . (व्यवधान)

श्री रघुनाथ सिंह : उन्होंने "दो औरतें" शब्दों का जो प्रयोग किया है वह बहुत खराब है। . . (व्यवधान) . . . वह हिन्दी जानते हैं, हिन्दी के पंडित बनते हैं, फिर भी "दो औरतें" कह रहे हैं, एक लखनऊ वाली और एक दिल्ली वाली। इस का अर्थ हम समझते हैं। उन में कुछ फर्कसी होनी चाहिए। चाहे श्रीमती कहें या महिला कहें।

डा० राम मनोहर लोहिया : दिल्ली के अन्दर रहने वाली औरत में क्या बात है। मुझे हिन्दी सिखाने चले हैं।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : मुझे इस बात का अफसोस है

श्री म० प्र० मिश्र (बेगूसराय) : वह बाजारू भाषा बोल रहे हैं।

श्री रामसेवक झादव (वाराणसी) : क्या बाजारू भाषा है। आप सीखिये पढ़ें। बैठ जाइये।

डा० राम मनोहर लोहिया : अपनी मां, बहन, बेटियां क्या औरतें नहीं होती हैं? यह बात मेरी समझ में नहीं आता। महल में रहने वाली महिला को पसन्द करते हो। कैसा पागलपन!

Shri Raghunath Singh: There is the Prime Minister here.

Shri Kandappan (Tiruchengode): Let all these Members better speak in English to avoid all this confusion.

अध्यक्ष महोदय : मैं डा० लोहिया से कहना चाहता हूँ, और बड़े दुःख से, कि इन सब चीजों के बाद बाकी सब चीजें तो शायद रिकवर हो जायेंगी लेकिन स्पीकर की प्रेस्टिज का जो डेमेज हुआ है वह रिकवर नहीं हो सकता।

श्री हुकम चन्द कछवाय : क्या हो गया, बतलाइये साहब।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : वही हो गया जो आप कर रहे हैं। जो कुछ बात पिछले तीन दिनों में होती रही है उसे आप भी सुनते रहे हैं और मैं भी सुनता रहा हूँ। उस को आप मरुस नहीं करते, यही तो हो गया है। . . (व्यवधान) . . .

डा० राम मनोहर लोहिया : क्या आप मेरा वाक्य भी पूरा नहीं होने देंगे। उस को पूरा होने दीजिये। अगर यहाँ पर औरतें शब्द पर ऐतराज है तो मैं महिलायें कह देता हूँ। जो दिल्ली वाली महिला है उस ने फैसला कर रक्खा है . . (व्यवधान) . . क्या वाहि-यात बात कर रहे हो। क्या इसी लिये आये हो लोक सभा में। मुझे अपनी वाक्य तो पूरा करने दो। मुझे इतनी अपेक्षा थी कि वह देश की राजनीति में कसणा और दया के पुट को इस्तेमाल करेंगी, लेकिन मालूम होता है कि उन्होंने फैसला कर रक्खा है कि

वह साबित करेगी देश में कि वह मर्द से भी ज्यादा मर्द है। इसलिये अगर वह इस लोक सभा की शोभा को बढ़ाना चाहती है तो आज यहां पर संकल्प करें कि इस देश की राजनीति में इतनी गोली, इतनी लाठी, इतनी सारी मनमानी उच्छृंखलता खत्म हो कर एक दूसरी चीज कहना आयेगी। इतना ही मुझे कहना है।

Mr. Speaker: The proposal before the House is that further discussion on this be adjourned. Yesterday we had already taken a decision on the motion of Shrimati Renu Chakravartty. So, Rule 338 should be suspended.

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: Rule 340 has to be suspended for that.

Mr. Speaker: No, it is Rule 338.

Shri Surendranath Dwivedy: Sir, I beg to move:

"That Rule 338 of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in Lok Sabha in its application to the motion for adjournment of further debate on the Government motion regarding economic situation be suspended."

Mr. Speaker: The question is:

"That Rule 338 of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in Lok Sabha in its application to the motion for adjournment of further debate on the Government motion regarding economic situation be suspended."

The motion was adopted.

Mr. Speaker: Now I will put the substantive motion of Mr. Dwivedy to the House. The question is:

"That further debate on the Government motion regarding economic situation be adjourned."

The motion was adopted.

12.32 hrs.

RE: REVOCATION OF SUSPENSION OF MEMBERS

श्री मधु लिमये (मुंजर) : अब जब कि इन नियमों को स्थगित कर दिया गया है, मैं आपकी मार्फत प्रस्ताव रखना चाहता हूँ कि जिन लोगों को निकाला गया है उनको वापिस बुला लिया जाए।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : यह अलहदा सवाल है।

Shri Hem Barua (Gauhati): May I repeat that since the situation has improved....

Mr. Speaker: He may give it in writing and I will put it to the House.

श्री बागड़ी (हिसार) : श्री मधु लिमये के प्रस्ताव का क्या हुआ है, अध्यक्ष महोदय ?

12.33 hrs.

PERSONAL EXPLANATION BY MEMBER (Shri Khadilkar)

Mr. Speaker: Mr. Khadilkar wants to give a personal explanation. He has given me advance notice and I have permitted him.

Shri Khadilkar (Khed): Yesterday, while speaking after Mr. Masani, I made some reference to the statements made by Mr. Masani and they were challenged. I had said that if they are found to be incorrect or certain modifications are called for, I will make those modifications on the floor of the House. Yesterday I said:

"He had advised publicly our creditors in America—American creditors—not to advance a cent to India unless Indian Government toes a particular economic line."

I had quoted from memory what I had said during the debate on the no-confidence motion last August.