

[Shri L. N. Mishra]

(2) lay on the Table a copy of Notification No. G.O.(P) No. 315 published in Kerala Gazette dated the 15th March, 1965, making certain amendment to the Kerala Public Service Commission (Consultation) Regulations, 1957, under clause (5) of article 320 of the Constitution read with clause (c) (iv) of the Proclamation dated the 24th March, 1965, issued by the Vice-President discharging the functions of the President in relation to the State of Kerala, together with an explanatory Memorandum thereto. [Placed in Library, see No. LT-4536/65].

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: May I remind the senior Minister of the assurance he gave in the last session that the report of the Central Vigilance Commission would be laid on the Table in this session, and ask whether he is going to implement that assurance?

The Minister of Home Affairs (Shri Nanda): Yes, Sir.

12.28 hrs.

DEMANDS FOR SUPPLEMENTARY GRANTS (GENERAL), 1965-66

The Minister of Finance (Shri T. T. Krishnamachari): I beg to present a statement showing Supplementary Demands for Grant in respect of Budget (General) for 1965-66.

12.28½ hrs.

EMPLOYEES' STATE INSURANCE (AMENDMENT) BILL*

The Minister of Law and Social Security (Shri A. K. Sen): I beg to

move for leave to introduce a Bill further to amend the Employees' State Insurance Act, 1948.

Mr. Speaker: The question is:

"That leave be granted to introduce a Bill further to amend the Employees' State Insurance Act, 1948."

The motion was adopted.

Shri A. K. Sen: I introduce the Bill.

12.28-1½ hrs.

MOTION RE: INDO-PAKISTAN AGREEMENT ON GUJARAT-WEST PAKISTAN BORDER—Contd.

Mr. Speaker: The House will now take up further consideration of the motion moved by Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri on the 16th August, 1965, namely:—

"That the statement laid on the Table of the House by the Prime Minister on the 16th August, 1965, on the Indo-Pakistan Agreement of June, 1965 relating to Gujarat-West Pakistan border be taken into consideration."

The Prime Minister and Minister of Atomic Energy (Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri): Mr. Speaker, Sir, I have heard the speeches delivered by hon. Members from both sides with rapt attention and I could well understand the feelings of the hon. Members so strongly expressed and with such frankness. I fully understand it and appreciate it, especially in the context of what has recently happened in Kashmir. But I would like to deal

*Published in the Gazette of India Extraordinary, Part II, section 2, dated 18th August, 1965.

with the Kutch situation first and this agreement.

May I in the very beginning refer to the arrangements which have been made with a view to the eventual demarcation of the boundary in question? I shall not go into generalities and therefore, I propose to take up the specific points. We had already agreed to following the procedure which had been settled between the two Governments in 1959 and 1960. At first discussions at official level were envisaged and thereafter at ministers' level. In the event of the failure of these negotiations, the matter was to be referred to an impartial tribunal for a binding decision.

About the various steps relating to the future course of action, a number of points have been made. Here-again, it would be useful to take them up one by one. The first point made is that in my statements in this House, I had referred only to demarcation and not to determination. Our basic stand has all the time been that the boundary is already well established and that the only question which remains is that of demarcation. At the same time, this is a matter on which there is a difference of opinion with Pakistan, whose contention has been for several years that the boundary has yet to be determined.

To begin with, I would like to draw the attention of the hon. members to the very first statement I made on the subject on 28th April, 1965 in this House. While referring to the situation which had arisen, I had then made the following point:

"I see no reason why the simple fact of determining what was the actual boundary between the erstwhile Province of Sind and the State of Kutch and what is now the boundary between India and Pakistan cannot be settled across the table."

The question of determination arose, because although we are quite firm

that the boundary is already officially settled, Pakistan contests that position. The resulting situation, therefore, has to be resolved by negotiations and failing that, by the verdict of an impartial tribunal. In either case, there has to be a determination of the boundary, which may be achieved by negotiation, or by a decision of the tribunal. Once this has happened, the next step would be demarcation of the boundary on the ground. I need not say more on this question, because as the matter is likely to be referred to a tribunal eventually, it would not be advisable to go into further details.

Shri Hem Barua (Gauhati): In the cease-fire agreement, you have used the word 'determination' once in the preamble and three times in the text.

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: Yes, it has been used and therefore I have given the explanation. What is important is what has to be determined. It has to be determined as to where the border between Pakistan and India lay at the time of either 15th August 1947 or when Kutch ceded to India. That is the first point which has to be decided. We have to determine where the border was between Pakistan and India.

Shri Hem Barua: Determine the claim of Pakistan to 3500 square miles?

Mr. Speaker: Order, order. Let us hear him.

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: I was coming to that. I am merely saying that "determination" in that sense is right and it has to be used here.

Shri Hem Barua: There is no mention of the word "demarcation" anywhere in the statement.

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: Another point was made that although I had stated clearly that we do not accept that there was any territorial dis-

[Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri]

pute, eventually we had gone back upon that position. This, of course, is not at all correct. The fact is that we took good care to state in the agreement that so far as India was concerned there was no territorial dispute since the boundary was well established. You may see the relevant portion of the agreement in which it is said: "India claims that there is no territorial dispute as there is a well established boundary running roughly along the northern edge of the Rann of Kutch as shown in the preparation maps which needs to be demarcated on the ground".

An hon. Member: What about the (b) part?

Shri Hem Barua: What about the 1959 agreement on which the cease-fire agreement is based? There it is said: "and by exchange of territorial jurisdiction if any".

Mr. Speaker: Order, order. He is trying to read that. Let us listen to him first.

श्री मधु लिमये (मुंबई) : अध्यक्ष महोदय . . .

अध्यक्ष महोदय : इन तरह बार बार इंटरप्ट करना ठीक नहीं है, जो उन को कहना है कह लेने दायिमे । अगर घाप का कोई प्वाइंट रह जाएगा तो मैं उसके लिए बाद में इजाजत दे दूंगा ।

Shri Hem Barua: We want to clarify . . .

Mr. Speaker: Not after every point, every minute.

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: Sir, several hon. Members have referred to the statement of Pakistan's claim in article 3 of the agreement and particularly to the question of 3500 square miles of territory. Let us read the relevant portions of the

agreement. The actual words used are:

"Pakistan claims that the border between India and Pakistan in the Rann of Kutch lies roughly along the 24th Parallel as is clear from several pre-partition and post-partition documents etc."

Shri Hem Barua: And therefore . . .

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: And, therefore, the dispute involves some 3500 square miles of territory.

Shri Hem Barua: Now it is complete.

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: Hon. Members will see that the basic claim of Pakistan is in regard to the alignment of border between India and Pakistan, and this claim Pakistan seeks to base on pre-partition and post-partition documents. In other words, Pakistan also clearly agrees that the question for determination is the subsisting border between India and Pakistan. That is the main point which I would like to emphasise (*Interruption*). They also accept that the question for determination is the subsisting border between India and Pakistan—in its view, however, as I said, the border runs along the 24th Parallel. I would like, however, to reiterate and re-emphasise that the text of the agreement makes it perfectly clear that both India and Pakistan are referring to the subsisting border between the two countries and both claim to have evidence in support of what they say. This position is further clarified by the contents of article 3(1) (c) of the provisions of the agreement. For instance, it is stated on behalf of both Governments that their Ministers would meet in order to agree—mark the words—on the determination of the borders. Even when referring to the Tribunal, both Governments jointly stated that the issue before

the Tribunal is the determination of the border.

Shri Hem Barua: In the light of their respective claims.

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: That is true; the claims are there. These are the words actually used in the text of the agreement. It is, of course, true that where there is a dispute about the alignment of a border between one country and another, such a dispute *ipso facto* involves some territory or other. But the basic issue is the determination of the border and not one of a decision as to whether the whole or part of the territory belongs to one claimant or the other. In the history of international disputes there have been occasions when territorial claims have been made by one country upon another despite the existence of a determined and accepted boundary.

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath (Hoshangabad): Give one or two examples or instances.

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: It is in such cases that a claim can appropriately be called a territorial claim.

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: Certainly.

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: Where, however, the border is undemarcated, the position is somewhat different. The issue in that case is one of laying down the alignment of the border.

My further comment on this point is that if a territorial dispute, properly so called, were raised on a border which has already been demarcated, we would resist that claim stubbornly, even if it related to a few square yards of our territory, let alone a few thousand square miles.

Lastly, I would like to state what is to be determined by negotiations or by the verdict of the Tribunal is not of any new boundary between India and Pakistan. That is not the

claim of either of the two countries. What is to be determined is the boundary which came into being as a result of the partition of the country and the accession of the State of Kutch to India. Clearly that boundary has to be identified, which has always existed between India and Pakistan and which will now be demarcated on the grounds. This identification and this determination will proceed on the basis of evidence and not on the basis of any other extraneous considerations. I hope that these clarifications which I have put forward will, to some extent meet the points raised by hon. Members.

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: "To some extent"; you are right.

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: I knew that if I said "fully" it would not be hundred per cent correct.

There has been reference to the Tribunal, because, ultimately, the whole matter has to be decided by the Tribunal. There has been criticism of the personnel of the Tribunal. It is said that it provides for two members to be nominated by India and Pakistan but they will not be either Indians or Pakistanis. We did consider it and we felt that in case there is an Indian and a Pakistani then they will always be, if I might say so, pressing their point of view or, to some extent, they will be fighting amongst themselves. Perhaps, they might come to an agreement but it may not be possible for these two gentlemen to be of any special help to the third man, and the result would be that the third man will become the sole arbiter, one man completely deciding our fate with regard to this vital matter. We, therefore, felt that in case there are two people from different countries representing India and Pakistan, then it is possible that they might be able to take a somewhat reasonable view of things. Naturally, it is true that both the representatives will stand for the country they represent and it would be their duty to press their claims.

[Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri]

But it is just possible that they might be somewhat more helpful, their approach might be somewhat more reasonable and they would be helpful to the third man. So, I do not think that we are going to suffer in any way because we have decided to have members of the Tribunal from outside India.

Of course, it has been stated that the Tribunal might commit fraud, or fraudulent transactions or things of that type. I would not like to take that view. After all, the Tribunal will consist of very distinguished people and it would not be advisable to charge them from now on and express our view.

Shri Hem Barua: That was not my contention when I raised the point of order. I said that according to the International Law Commission the decisions of an international tribunal can be questioned on four grounds and I mentioned those four grounds. This agreement binds us with this particular sentence, and that is why I raised the objection. I did not doubt the *bona fide* of the members and I did not doubt the *bona fide* of the Indians.

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: There is no question of doubting our *bona fide*. But, after all, there are conditions and conditions and a human being is a human being. Therefore, if we take a decision on the lines I have suggested, it does not mean that we suspect the *bona fide* of our own people.

In regard to the question of patrolling I can very well understand the feelings of the hon. Members. But, as I had stated in the beginning, Pakistan's claim was undoubtedly very big and they said that they were patrolling up to Karimsahi and they asked, of course, to patrol in all that area. I would not like to say much.

Shri Indrajit Gupta made a plausible case, I think, because of a shift

in their attitude or in their policy that is taking place. Anyhow, it was plausible and I would not like to go into that. But, somehow, it did not convince me, because first that party lent its full support to this agreement and, later on, changed its attitude. I do not know what the real reasons are. I shall leave it to Shri Indrajit Gupta to decide for himself.

Shri Indrajit Gupta (Calcutta South West): I cannot understand what you are saying. The party never lent its full support.

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: Anyhow, we read it in the newspapers. I could not get their official resolution, of course, but I did read it in the newspapers, and it was a clear support. However, that party is absolutely free to change its opinion any time it likes.

Shri Warior (Trichur): After seeing all the bungling.

An hon. Member: You have yourself changed the opinion.

श्री रामसेवक यादव (वाराणसी): प्रधान मंत्री भी अपनी राय बदल देते हैं।

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: However, about this matter, there was a good deal of discussion and, in fact, the whole thing was considerably delayed because of this particular point. It is true the British Government went into this matter in great details...

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: Not you.

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: And we also. They came to certain conclusions. We had also some information and on the basis of our information as well as on the basis of what they had said, we felt that—this is a small track of about 9 miles which passes through the Indian territory—it would be in consonance with the

status quo ante if we accepted this track and allowed the Pakistan police to patrol over it.

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: Did the Gujarat Government agree?

Shri Yajnik (Ahmedabad): Was the Gujarat Government consulted about it?

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: Not exactly when we signed this Agreement. But there were talks and discussions about this with the Gujarat Government officials sometime back.....

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: You trusted the British Government and not the Gujarat Government.

एक माननीय सदस्य : वह मानिक है ।

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: I personally think that this track....

Shri Indrajit Gupta: Why did the Prime Minister use the words in his statement that Pakistan was said to have used the track and we had to accept it? What is the significance of these words?

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: You will perhaps not like it. But I cannot go into those details.

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: Why not? It is very serious. Parliament is being kept in the dark.

Mr. Speaker: I cannot force him to say any particular thing. Whatever he wants to say, we have to listen and then to take a decision. Let him reply to the debate.

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: This is not the way to treat Parliament. We are being kept in the dark. So many times has this blunder been committed. Parliament should be taken into confidence.

Shri H. N. Mukerjee (Calcutta Central): In the statement of the Prime Minister there was a sentence

full of great significance. Surely, we have the right to have an explanation.

Mr. Speaker: It has been asked but I cannot force him to say any particular thing.

Shri H. N. Mukerjee: If it is the case that to explain this complex sentence is to divulge the material which he does not wish to put before the House, it is most ill-advised on the part of the Prime Minister to use that sentence for the consumption of the House and the people of this country. Once he has made the statement, he must explain it.

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: As I said just now, on the one hand, the British Government looked into these matters and naturally they expressed their own views and we had also our own information and we felt convinced that this proposal of the patrolling on this track by the Pakistan police—it was formerly there—was legitimate... (Interruption). It was not—I am sorry...

श्री रामसेवक यादव : अध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं प्रधान मंत्री से निवेदन करूंगा कि वह मानुषाया में बोले। तब ऐसे शब्दों का इस्तेमाल नहीं होगा और सही सही बातें सामने आयेंगी।

श्री झोंकार लाल बेरवा (कोटा) : हमारे एरिया में पाकिस्तान का क्या अधिकार था ?

श्री वसु लिमये : 3 मार्च को सरदार स्वर्ण सिंह ने यह क्यों कहा कि 25 जनवरी के पहले पाकिस्तानी पुलिस या सैनिक वहां कभी नहीं घाये ? सरकार की ओर से 3 मार्च को इस सदन के सामने यह बात कही गई, लेकिन अब प्रधान मंत्री कह रहे हैं कि हम को मानना पड़ा। क्या संदेशों के कहने पर मानना पड़ा ? सरदार स्वर्ण सिंह ने साफ कहा था कि 25 जनवरी से पहले पाकिस्तानी वहां पर कभी नहीं आए।

श्री श्रीकार लाल बेरवा : मंत्री महोदय ने कहा था कि पाकिस्तानी पुलिस वहाँ गश्त नहीं करेगी ।

श्री हुकूम खन्व कछवाय (देवास) : अध्यक्ष महोदय, मंत्री लोग भिन्न भिन्न बात कहते हैं । एक मंत्री एक बात कहता है और दूसरा कोई और बात कहता है ।

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: As I said, it would not be, of course, necessary to go into the details of it but we felt convinced that . . .

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: Those are vital details.

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: . . . in consonance with the spirit of the Agreement, that is, the status quo ante, it was proper and correct for us to have agreed to the fact that Pakistani patrol will take place or they will patrol on that track between Ding-Surai . . .

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: On a point of order, Sir.

श्री मधु लिमये : 3 मार्च के बयान के साथ इस को पढ़ेंगे न ? प्रधान मंत्री इस का जवाब क्यों नहीं दे रहे हैं ? उन्होंने कहा था कि पूर्व-स्थिति लाने की बात थी और 3 मार्च को कहा गया था कि 25 जनवरी से पहले पाकिस्तानी कभी उस क्षेत्र में नहीं आए थे ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : मैं ने कहा है कि अगर माननीय सदस्य कोई बात जानना चाहेंगे, तो बाद में मैं सवाल करने की इजाजत दे दूंगा । उस वक्त प्राय ने मान लिया, लेकिन अब प्राय बार बार सवाल पूछ रहे हैं ।

श्री मधु लिमये : जब सब लोग पूछ रहे हैं, तो मैं क्यों बँटू ?

श्री हुकूम खन्व कछवाय वयन देने से पहले मंत्री लोग प्रायस में फैसला कर लें ।

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: On a point of order, Sir. The Prime Minister has rightly referred to the expression status quo ante. Now, according to him, the status quo ante, as revealed or disclosed to him after the last session of Parliament, showed that Pakistan was patrolling that area even sometime before January, 1965. But during the last session, he said quite a different thing. How can he reconcile what he says today with what he said during the last session of Parliament when he said that there was no Pakistani patrolling? Now he says that there has been some patrolling. In fairness to the House, I would request you, Sir, to ask the Prime Minister to place before the House all the information that he has got since the last session so that the House can judge what that information was and not blindly trust the British Government.

Mr. Speaker: There is no point of order. He might resume his seat.

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: Will you not come to our rescue?

Mr. Speaker: There is no point of order.

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: The Agreement is being debated. Is the Government not bound to place all the relevant documents and other material before the House that it has got since the last session of Parliament?

Mr. Speaker: That is for the Prime Minister to see. There is no point of order that I can decide.

श्री रामसेवक यादव : डय का जवाब दिनाया जाये ।

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: This is merely a track and, as I said, the police does not stay here. Of course, the army has been withdrawn completely but the police is there—they come and go: they do not stay there . . .

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: That we know. They do not build their houses there. (Interruptions).

श्री रामसेवक याद : 3 मार्च को क्या कहा था ?

श्री मधु लिमये : मंत्री जी का 3 मार्च का लिखित बयान पढ़ा जाये ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय माननीय सदस्य बैठ जायें । मैं इस बात का प्रवर्णन देता हूँ कि माननीय सदस्य अपने अपने खराब जवाबों पर नहीं धीर फिर प्राइम मिनिस्टर अपना खराब दे सकें । मैं उनको यह कैसे कह सकता हूँ कि कता बात कहो धीर कता बात न कहो । वह जो कुछ मुताबिक समझे, वही बात उन्होंने कहा है । जब माननीय सदस्य भाषण देने हैं, तो क्या मैं उन को मजबूर कर सकता हूँ कि वह कता बात कहें ?

श्री रामसेवक यादव अध्यक्ष महोदय, यह बहुत महत्वपूर्ण प्रश्न है । प्रधान मंत्री जी बयान दे रहे हैं, लेकिन जब बयान का जवाब नहीं मिलता है, तो बहस का क्या अर्थ होगा ?

श्री श्रीकार लाल बेरवा : हम में धीर उन में बयान प्राप्तान का अन्तर है । उन की बयान में क्या है ।

Shri Ranga (Chittoor): He makes a statement which, on the face of it, appears to be so absurd that everybody laughs. Can you not take any objection to that?

Mr. Speaker: What can I do?

13.00 hrs.

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: I shall state the fact; it is for the hon. Members to take it or interpret it in the light they think proper. There is no police post or anything of the kind there. It was asked whether we could go to that area. I would only say that we are entitled to inspect

867 (A) LSD—7.

that line and even go over to Kanjarkot. This point is also quite clear. There is nothing like no-man's land.

An hon. Member: Can we go to Ding-Surai?

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: Ding and Surai are in Pakistan.

Shri S. M. Banerjee rose—

अध्यक्ष महोदय : भारत को मैंने कहा है कि इस तरह में नहीं धार कर सकते हैं । इनको खत्म कर लेने दीजिये, भारत को मोका दे दूंगा ।

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: I would only say that the Kutch Agreement has to be considered as a separate and independent question altogether. I do realise that the Kashmir situation has created special difficulties for us. Yet I would not like that we should mix it up with Kashmir because I have always said that this Kutch Agreement is a separate Agreement by itself. To suggest that we will agree to arbitration or to reference to a tribunal in regard to other disputes also is not correct or will not be correct. Mr. Trivedi said and I have made it absolutely clear that this stands by itself and has nothing to do with other border disputes.

श्री बृजराज सिंह (बरेली) इन्होंने कहा था कि बात नहीं करेगे जब तक कञ्जरकोट खाली न हो जाय । इस पर टिप्पणी इसकी क्या गारंटी है ।

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: I think that the basic point has been met and I personally think that what we have done is good for our country and also good from the international point of view. Of course, Kanjarkot, Blar Bet and other points have been vacated. We have now complete civilian control over the Rann of Kutch. There is absolutely no doubt.

श्री हुकम चन्द कच्छवाय : कञ्जरकोट जा सकते हैं क्या ?

श्री लाल बहादुर शास्त्री : जी हा जा सकते हैं, कंजरकोट, बियारबेट आदि सब जगह जा सकते हैं ।

श्री रामसेवक यादव : कंजरकोट, बियारबेट, सरदार चौकी पर प्राणकी मुक्ति होगी क्या ?

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: It is true that I had in mind that, if possible, we should avoid a major conflict or war. I do not deny that fact. It is a basic principle which India has accepted and adopted. May I, in this connection, quote what the Constitution says? Article 51 says that the State shall endeavour to promote international peace and security and also foster respect for international law, etc., and encourage settlement of international disputes by arbitration . . . (Interruptions).

Shri Hem Barua: We are concerned not merely with Art. 51 but also with Art. 253 of the Constitution.

Mr. Speaker: Order, order.

Shri S. M. Banerjee (Kanpur): The sovereignty of the country is not arbitrable.

श्री रामसेवक यादव : प्राणकी भूमि दे कर नहीं करेगे ।

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: It is also in the Directive Principles. I really cannot understand why there should be opposition to this basic principle which has always been upheld by this House and by the whole country . . . (Interruptions.)

Shri Hem Barua: He calls this tribunal as arbitration. We do not subscribe to the view that the tribunal has an arbitrator's powers. By citing the Constitutional provision, the Prime Minister is saying the same thing which Pakistan has been saying.

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: Why should we deny that? It is entirely

a different matter. On particular matters we may consider the whole question on its merits. This Directive Principle does not advise or direct us to go in for arbitration every time. I merely said that on this basic question. After all, we have adopted a policy, we have adopted an attitude, and I think it is something good. (Interruptions.)

Shri Harish Chandra Mathur (Ja-lore): This thing cannot be tolerated any more. How can we go on ilke this?

Shri Hem Barua: This is democracy and we have a right to put questions. My hon. friend is an ex-bureaucrat and that is why he says this.

Mr. Speaker: Why is Mr. Hem Barua interrupting so much? I have requested him to wait and allow the Prime Minister to continue. Let him finish and then I shall allow one or two Members to speak.

श्री रामसेवक यादव : माथर नाइब को प्रधान मंत्री बना दिया जाय ।

कुछ माननीय सदस्य : प्राण बैठ जाइये ।

श्री रामसेवक यादव : प्राण बैठ जाइये ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : प्राइंर, प्राइंर ।

श्री बजरंग सिंह : एक स्पष्टीकरण में चाहता हूँ । प्राबिंटेशन होने जा रहा है या ट्रिब्यूनल के हवाने कर रहे है ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : एक के बाद दूसरा खड़ा हो कर बोलता जा रहा है । उस तरह से कैसे काम चल सकता है ।

श्री बड़े (खारगोन) : अब तक मैं चुप बैठा रहा हूँ और मैं बोलना नहीं हूँ । लेकिन . . .

अध्यक्ष महोदय : मैं बार बार कह रहा हूँ कि बैसे . . .

श्री बड़े : मैं शान्ति में बैठा रहा हूँ ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय घाप घब भी बँट जाये ।

श्री बड़े : यह हस्ताक्षर हो रहा है, इसको घाप देखें । यह इमनिज हो रहा है कि डिप्यूनन प्रोर प्राबिड्रेगन

अध्यक्ष महोदय : किनो रिनिफिनन को मानेंगे या नहीं ?

श्री बड़े यह वाकिफना के हक में जाता है ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : इनने मोनिगर मैम्बर को जब इनको बार कहा जाता है लेकिन वह भी मानने को तैयार नहीं होता है तो अफसोस होता है । एक के बाद दूसरा बोचना होना नया जा रहा है । कोई कुछ परवाह ही नहीं करता है कि उनको क्या कहा जा रहा है ।

श्री बड़े : इनारे दिन बन रहा है . . .

अध्यक्ष महोदय : सब कार्रवाई मैं बन्द कर देता हूँ प्रोर घाप बोलने चले जाइये ।

श्री रामसेवक घाबर इन समयोते के विरोध स्वरुप इस मदन को स्थगित कर दिया जाए ना अच्छा है ।

श्री राधेलाल व्यास (उज्जैन) : कम में कम उनको स्थगित कर दिया जाए तो अच्छा होगा, मदन को तो नहीं ।

श्री हुकम खन्व कछवाय : घापको निकालना जाना चाहिये यहाँ में । अध्यक्ष महोदय, इनको ये जन्म बापिन लेने चाहिये ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : घाप बँटें नहीं मैं उनको कुछ कह सकता हूँ । कई बार मैं कह चुका हूँ लेकिन घाप मानने को ही तैयार नहीं है ।

मैं ने घाप में कहा (Interruptions.) फिर घाप खड़े हैं । कोई हद भी होंगे घाप को । मैं ने घाप में मौ दफे कहा कि घाप प्राइम मिनिस्टर साहब को सुन लें । उन के

वाद प्रगर घाप को कुछ कहना होगा तो मैं इजाजत दूंगा । यहाँ पर कोई आर्टिकल बिटोचियर तो होना चाहिये तभी तो रिबेट हो सकता है, फिजिकल वाउडम कैसे कर सकते हैं ।

एक माननीय सदस्य : इन लोगों का मदन में निकाला जाये ।

श्री हुकम खन्व कछवाय : अध्यक्ष महोदय माननीय सदस्य ने जो कहा कि हम लोगों को मदन से निकाल दिया जाये तो क्या हम प्रकार कहना ठीक है ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : घाप बँट जाइये । घाप लोगों ने इनको बाँटे कही, प्रगर दूसरे माननीय सदस्य कुछ कह दें तो मैं तथा अर ।

श्री हुकम खन्व कछवाय : हम इन बदीन करने के लिये तैयार नहीं हैं । यह जन्म यहाँ नहीं कां जाने चाहिये ।

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: I shall not take much time of the House. But I would clearly and categorically like to tell the House that we stick to this agreement and we do not want to deviate from it.

Some hon. Member: Shame!

श्री रामसेवक घाबर यह देश को बदकिस्मती की तारीख है ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : जब इतना एम्पाइमेंट हो तो मैं नहीं चाहता कि इस वक्त किन्ही में कुछ कहूँ । मगर क्या हम तरह में फैलना .

श्री बड़े : नोन नाब घापनां घाव

अध्यक्ष महोदय : श्री बड़े, मैं ने घाप में कहा कि घाप बँट जाइये, घाप बकौल भी है, पुराने सदस्य भी हैं, लेकिन कोई हद तो होनी चाहिये । मैं ने बार बार कहा

श्री बड़े : देश में ऐसी परिस्थिति है ।

श्री रामसेवक यादव : जब भूमि का मशाल हा तो कानून का सवाल नहीं रह जाता वकील का मशाल नहीं रह जाता । सोमा हा तो हे कानून की घोर मतचाही करने की ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : सिवा इन के क्या कोई घोर भी तरीका है कि आप हर एक को मुने बां कोई कुछ कहना चाहता है घोर तब फैसला दे ।

श्री हुकम चन्द कछवाय : सरकार त्यागत्र दे ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : त्यागत्र सरकार देना जब हाडा रहेगा । अगर हाडन नहीं वहेता तब हीन देगा । श्री कछवाय बँट जायें, डा के गठन से सरकार त्यागत्र नहीं देगी ।

श्री हुकम चन्द कछवाय : हाडा कमी नहीं वहेगा ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : अब प्राग बँट जाइये ।

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: But I might inform the House that in view of the recent developments which have led to sharp deterioration of the relations between India and Pakistan.....

Some hon. Members: The Prime Minister is not audible. He may speak a little louder.

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: I said that because of the recent developments and the serious deterioration in the relations between India and Pakistan, our Foreign Minister has suggested to the Foreign Minister of Pakistan not to visit India on the 20th of this month.....

श्री मधु लिमये : जैसे यह फैसला किया है वैसे ही पं बां के फैसले को भी रह किया जाये ।

श्री हुकम चन्द कछवाय : मैं सरकार को बधाई देता हूँ इस बात के ऊपर ।

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: But as I have said just now we do not want to

get out of this agreement that will neither be honourable for us or for our country nor in any way desirable from the general, moral and.....

श्री मधु लिमये : देश पर आक्रमण हो रहा है ।

श्री बजरज सिंह : वायस प्राफ अमेरिका को जवाहर लाल जी ने रेप्यूडिएट किया था घोर शास्त्री जी प्राग कह रहे हैं कि हमारे लिए इस को रेप्यूडिएट करना प्रानरेबल नहीं है । जब जवाहरलाल जी ने रेप्यूडिएट किया था तब यह कैसे प्रानरेबल था । आप गलत बात क्यों कहते हैं । उन वक्त 17 जनवरी पर दस्तखत हुए थे प्राग तो एक जनवरी पर हा दस्तखत हुए है ।

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: No, as I have said, we cannot go back on it. If I had the slightest feeling.....

श्री रामसेवक यादव : गन्ती को मुधार लेना अच्छी बात है ।

श्री बड़े अध्यक्ष महोदय.
(Interruptions.)

अध्यक्ष महोदय श्री बड़े, अब प्राग बँट जाइये । मैं बीस दफे कह चुका हूँ कि प्राग बँट जाइये । यह सब क्या है । आखिर कोई हद होनी चाहिये । किन्ती वक्त तो इमे खन्म होना चाहिये ।

श्री हुकम चन्द कछवाय सरकार की भी हद होनी है त्रां समझौता करना है ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय अब प्राग प्राग प्राग बँट जाइये ।

श्री राबेलास ध्यास : अध्यक्ष महोदय, कुछ मुझे भी कहने की इजाजत दीजिये ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय अब प्राग प्राग बँट जाइये ।

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: As I said, we do not reject the reference to the tribunal. I have no alternative, in spite of some of the Members of the

Jan Sangh strongly protesting against it..... (Interruptions.)

श्री बृज राज सिंह अध्यक्ष महोदय गन्तव्यवादी नहीं होंगे चाहिये। कोई घपोजीशन के मेम्बर हो इग का विरोध नहीं कर रहे हैं। स्वयम् सरकार की तरफ के मेम्बर भी ऐसा कह रहे हैं। (Interruptions.)

श्री रामसेवक यादव निर्णय विरोधी माने जा सकते हैं, सरकारी पक्ष के लोग भी इस के विरोध में हैं। (Interruptions.)

श्री जगदेव सिंह सिद्धान्ती (मन्थर) : राष्ट्र का नेता के हवाले कर दी।

श्री रामसेवक यादव हमारे ही नहीं, सरकार पक्ष के लोग विरोध करने हैं।

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: This is a very good exhibition of how we behave in Parliament, but anyhow, let it be there, and my hon. friends there are free to behave as they like.

श्री बड़े मेरा प्राप्तिवकन इस पर है।

अध्यक्ष महोदय श्री बड़े, आप बैठ जाइये। मैं कई बड़े आप से कह चुका कि इनतरह से नहीं चलना। आप बैठ जाइये।

श्री बड़े प्रधानमंत्री कहते हैं कि हम मान्यता में ही विवेक करने हैं।

अध्यक्ष महोदय इन बात में भी क्या कोई शक रह गया है।

श्री शीर्ष (अनांगई) : इस में कोई शक नहीं कि जिन प्रकार की गन्ती देश के प्रधानमंत्री श्री लाल बहादुर शास्त्री जी ने की है अगर किसी और देश का प्रधानमंत्री वही गन्ती करता तो उसे प्रधानमंत्री पद में इस्तीफा देना पड़ता।

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: Before I conclude, I would like to say that I have no doubt that on the Kashmir front we have to be very alert and most vigilant.....

श्री रामसेवक यादव : अध्यक्ष महोदय प्रधानमंत्री का कहना कि वह गन्तीने से निकल नहीं सकते हैं। अगर वह इस्तीफा दे दे प्रौर किसी दूसरे का प्रधानमंत्री बनता दे तो मामलों में उन में निकला जा सकता है।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : अब आप बैठ जाइये।

श्री श्रीकार लाल बेरवा क्या यह गुंती बात है जिस पर मेम्बर लोग लानी बहाये।

श्री हनुमन्तैया (बंगलौर नगर) यह बहुत ऊँची बात है।

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: Our Army and our police are quite clear about their serious responsibilities. As the House knows, only the other day, we had to go over to Kargil in order to prevent infiltrators from crossing our borders. We may take any further step which is necessary; I do not know; our Army will take any further step that it considers necessary in order to defend our borders.

I do hope that we will all be able to stand united to face this challenge, and ultimately truth will prevail.

Some hon. Members rose--

अध्यक्ष महोदय : अब आप लोग बैठ जायें ना मैं कुछ कहूँ। देखिये, श्री मधु निमये, मैं ने आप से कहा था कि मैं आप को वरत दगा अगर आप बैठ जायेंगे। निजिन दमतीन में इंटरेप्शन करने रहे प्रौर जो आप के मन में था उसे आप पूछने रहे। मेरे कहने का कोई प्रसर नहीं हुआ। अब आप फिर खड़े हो रहे हैं। क्या अब भी चाहते हैं कि आप को इन्तरेप्शन दी जाये। मैं ने बहर कहा था।

श्री मधु निमये सभी लोग खड़े हो रहे हैं तो मैं ही क्यों आप बैठना।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : अगर आप मेरा कहना मान कर बाकायदा इंटरेप्शन करते रहे हैं तो भी क्या आप का हक रह जाता है कि आप कुछ पूछ सकने हैं।

श्री रामसेवक यादव : इटरपण्म न।
हाने शी र्ने है ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : इटरपण्म ऐमे नदी
हाने । अगर आप दोनों तरफ बातना चाहते
हो यह नही हो सकना । मैंने दक्षिण को था
कि प्रधान मंत्री को स्वतम करने देखा जाये,
नकिन आप ने परनाह नही की ।

Some hon. Members rose—

Mr. Speaker: Shri Banerjee might
ask a question.

Shri J. B. Kripalani (Amroha): I
have listened to the Prime Minister's
speech without any interruption.

अध्यक्ष महोदय : मैं आप को मीका
दे दूंगा, मुझे बारी बारी में धाने दोजिये ।

श्री स० मो० बनर्जी : अध्यक्ष महोदय,
मैंने दो सवाल पूछने हैं ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : नहीं, एक के अलावा
धौर कुछ नहीं ।

श्री स० मो० बनर्जी : अच्छा मैं दोनों
को एक में भिना दूंगा । पहले तो श्री शास्त्री
ने गमस्राने को काश्मिर की कि स्पेड्य को
पेटी धौर उन के बाद कहा पेट्रोलिंग । वह
प्राया जाया करेगे जैसे कि काश्मीर में था जा
रहे हैं । यह उन का बयान था । मरदार स्वर्ण
निह जी ने डा के बारे में कोई सफाई नहीं
की थी । उन के एक मंत्री कुछ कह रहे हैं
धौर प्रधान मंत्री जी कुछ धौर कह रहे हैं ।
मे पूछना चाहता हूं कि यह मंत्रिमंडल है या
कि शिवजी की बारात है कि जिस की जो
मंत्रो नहीं कते ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आप जो बात कह रहे
हैं वही बात कहना हाउस में बिल्कुल नाबाजिव
होगा ।

श्री स० मो० बनर्जी : "शिवजी की
बारात" कहना कोई हिन्दी में गाली नहीं है ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : यह बात नहीं कहनी
चाहिए । अगर हिन्दी का भी कोई शब्द
होगा तो उनके बारे में मुझे फैसला करना है
उसे कहा जाना चाहिये था नहीं ।

श्री स० मो० बनर्जी : मैं क्या कहा है ।
मैंने यही कहा कि यह मंत्रिमंडल है या शिव
जी की बारात है । क्या यह बुरी बात है . . .

अध्यक्ष महोदय : यह बुरी बात है ।
आपको यह नहीं कहना चाहिये था । शिव
जी की बारात, आपको नहीं कहना चाहिए,
था ।

श्री स० मो० बनर्जी : मैंने ऐसा कौन
सी बात कही है ।

मेरा दूसरा सवाल यह है कि काश्मीर
के मामले में प्रधान मंत्री जी ने कहा कि पूरा
इन्तिजाम हो रहा है । मेरे पास एक सूचना
प्रायी है । क्या यह यही है कि हमारा एक
त्रिगेडियर गोली ने मार दिया गया धौर
उसके नैक्वट आफ किन को इनफार्म किया जा
रहा है, पर मदन में यह नहीं बताया गया ?
अगर ऐसा सम्भौर पारलियमि है तो
मदन को बताया चाहिये था ।

Shri J. B. Kripalani: I have listened
with the utmost respect to the speech
of the Prime Minister. What I want
to say is this, that all international
agreements are subject to certain
conditions, and if those conditions are
not fulfilled, then those agreements
can be repudiated with honour. And
we have a precedent of this. We had
said that there would be a plebiscite
in Kashmir, and after five years we
said that the conditions had changed
and, therefore, that promise does not
hold good now.

**Shri Sham Lal Saraf (Jammu and
Kashmir):** It was under certain given
conditions.

Shri G. N. Dixit (Etawah): There
was no agreement on Kashmir about
plebiscite. This a misstatement of
Shri Kripalani (Interruptions.)

Shri A. C. Guha (Barasat): This is not a correct statement of fact. There the condition was that before a plebiscite was held Pakistan would vacate her intention, which she did not do.....(Interruptions).

श्रावण महोदय : प्रती तो मैंबर बोल रहे हैं । उनको तो मून पीजिया ।

Shri J. B. Kripalani: I submit, unfortunately, the Congress Party, though it has an overwhelming majority, is behaving like the Opposition. I am really sorry for it. They are not content with their overwhelming majority, their brute majority, but they must also interfere as the Members of the Opposition do!

I say there was a promise at least of ascertaining the opinion, impartial opinion, of the people of Kashmir. It was a promise made . . .

Mr. Speaker: Why should we go into that now? I would request Acharya Kripalani to go on to the second point.

Shri J. B. Kripalani: I want to say that there is a precedent, that when conditions change, when circumstances change.....

Shri Muthyal Rao (Mahbubnagar): He is referring to some other matter. (Interruptions).

Shri J. B. Kripalani: If Congressmen do not want me to speak, I will sit down. If you want to hear me, then you must hear me as I heard the Prime Minister. Did I intervene even once when he spoke? I did not intervene even once. But I have made a point which I want to explain, that there are precedents not only in our history but in the world's history that as circumstances change, agreements also change. I say that the circumstances under which this agreement was made were quite different, radically different, from the circumstances that exist today on account of the betrayal by Pakistan in Kashmir.

That is all I have got to say. And we are not honour bound to carry out Kutch agreement. Kutch is not different from Kashmir. Kashmir is not different from Kutch, as my hon. friend, Shri Mathur, made out. This is not a separate thing. This is one country. These are not two countries. I want these two questions to be settled definitely and together. They are insulting us in every way. They are insulting us now, and we are not bound to carry out this agreement.

Shri H. N. Mukerjee: The Prime Minister has told us that we are very alert with regard to Kashmir. May I know from him what steps we are taking in regard to the connivance of the United Nations authorities, who are functioning under Anglo-American domination, with Pakistan because that connivance is linked up with whatever happens to our detriment in our agreement over Kutch.

Some Hon. Members rose—

Mr. Speaker: I can allow only one Member from one group. I find Shri Hem Barua also standing in addition to Shri Kamath.

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: I spoke on the motion.

Mr. Speaker: I can allow only one of them.

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: While it was partly gratifying to hear from the Prime Minister that the Government has asked Mr. Bhutto not to take the trouble of visiting India, may I ask whether this step is not a step in the direction, welcome direction, necessary direction, desirable direction, of accepting our demand for scrapping the agreement, revoking the agreement because it is a breach of one of the conditions of the agreement itself? May I also know whether there has been any instance in our history or in the history of any other country where the parties concerned bound themselves hand foot to accept the findings or

[Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath]

the award of a tribunal, contrary to the convention of the International Law Commission to the effect that the parties can question the award on three grounds to which my colleague Shri Hem Barua referred the other day?

Mr. Speaker: Shri Brajraj Singh. I cannot allow Shri Hem Barua because I have allowed Shri Kamath. I have made that clear.

Shri Hem Barua: I am not going to put a question but only to seek a clarification.

Mr. Speaker: No, not at this moment. He should resume his seat.

Shri Hem Barua: This is what I do not understand. This is not a party matter. Every member has a right to seek a clarification from the Prime Minister.

Mr. Speaker: I cannot allow him.

Shri Hem Barua: If you put your foot down like that, I would say it is very difficult for us to function in this House. I have a very relevant question to put and seek a clarification from him. I do not understand this.

श्री बृजराज सिंह : प्रश्न पूछने के पहले मैं यह साफ कर देना चाहता हूँ कि प्रधान मंत्री जी ने एक बहुत बड़ी गलत चयानी उस हाउस के सामने की है कि केवल जन संघ के लोग इस समस्या को रू कराना चाहते हैं। मैं स्पष्ट कर देना चाहता हूँ कि माग्य प्रपोजीशन.....

अनेक माननीय सदस्य : नहीं नहीं

श्री बृजराज सिंह : धीरे धीरे से उपादा कारण के.....

अनेक माननीय सदस्य : नहीं नहीं ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आपका अपनी बात कहने का हक है उनको अपनी बात कहने का हक है.....

श्री बृजराज सिंह : प्राप बीच में बोलने को मना करते हैं, हम को प्राप बीच में नहीं बोलने देते ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : प्राप उनकी तरफ से क्यों बोलते हैं ।

श्री बृजराज सिंह : मुझे यह प्रश्न पूछना है कि प्रधान मंत्री जी ने आरबिदेशन की बात कही और मंडिघान का हवाला दिया कि उसके अनुसार आरबिदेशन की गुंजाइश है । लेकिन यह जो इस वक्त इन्होंने ट्राइबुनल बनाया है, यह हमारे ऊपर आरबिदेशन करने के लिए बैठेगा या हमारे ऊपर फैसला देने के लिए बैठेगा इसका स्पष्टीकरण इन्होंने अभी तक नहीं किया है ।

श्री मधु लिमये : 8 मई को राज्य सभा के सामने प्रधान मंत्री श्री लाल बहादुर शास्त्री ने पंचों के सम्बन्ध में जो बातचीत चल रही है उसको लेकर यह कहा था...

एक माननीय सदस्य : जी उन्होंने कहा था वह पढ़ दीजिये ।

श्री मधु लिमये : वह प्रपोजी में है इसलिए मैं नहीं पढ़ता । माननीय सदस्य खुद पढ़ लें । उस में उन्होंने यह कहा है कि पंचों के सामने जो मसला जायगा वह प्रादेशिक विवाद का नहीं होगा बल्कि प्रत्यक्ष जमीन पर केवल सीमांकन करने का जायगा । यह उनका वाक्य है पढ़ लिया जाय । अभी सत्कार्ड इस की बंगलौर में बैठक हुई थी लेकिन उनकी हिम्मत नहीं हुई कि अपनी बैठक के सामने इस करार को रख कर उस पर स्वीकृति की महत्त्व देवायें

अध्यक्ष महोदय : माननीय सदस्य सिर्फ सवाल करें ।

श्री मधु लिमये : मैं सवाल ही कर रहा हूँ। मेरी विनती है कि अगर इस पर घाप बोट लेने जा रहे हैं तो कांग्रेस पार्टी के सभी सदस्यों को खुली आजादी होनी चाहिए कि वह अपनी इच्छा के अनुसार इस कंगरू के पक्ष या विपक्ष में बोट दें। अगर ऐसा होता है तो पता चल जायेगा कि इस सदन की मही राय क्या है। अगर इस सदन की सच्ची राय जानना चाहते हैं तो सभी लोगों को बोट करने की पूरी आजादी दी जाय।

श्री राबेनाल भास : अध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं इस पर एक प्वाएंट ऑफ़ ऑर्डर उठाना चाहता हूँ। आपने केवल सवाल पूछने की माननीय सदस्यों को इजाजत दी है लेकिन सवाल पूछने की आड़ में भाषण हो रहे हैं तो क्या यह दुवांग भाषण का इस तरह सिलसिला शुरू करने दिया जायगा (इंटररॉस)

श्री हुरुम चन्द कछुबाय : प्वाएंट ऑफ़ ऑर्डर उठा कर घाप स्वयं भाषण कर रहे हैं।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : जब कोई मੈम्बर बोले तो मुझे उससे निबटने दिया जाय यह तो नहीं कि घाप यह काम अपने जिम्मे ले लीजिये।

श्री हुरुम चन्द कछुबाय : ध्यास जी को अपने शब्द वापिस लेने चाहिए उन्हें इनके कहने का कोई अधिकार नहीं है।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : तो मैं उधर चला जाता हूँ फिर घाप घापस में कैमला कर लीजिये। श्री प्रकाशबीर शास्त्री।

श्री राबेनाल भास : अध्यक्ष महोदय, मेरे प्वाएंट ऑफ़ ऑर्डर का क्या बना? मैं ने इस पर व्यवस्था मांगी थी कि जब आपने केवल सवाल पूछने की इजाजत दी है तो क्या उसकी आड़ में भाषण भी दिये जा सकते हैं?

अध्यक्ष महोदय : इसके गवाम पूछे जा सकते हैं, भाषण नहीं किये जा सकते। प्रश्न

मिनिस्टर का जवाबी भाषण हो क्या है इसलिए अब भाषण उम पर नहीं किये जा सकते हैं।

श्री प्रकाशबीर शास्त्री (बिजनौर) मैं बड़ी नम्रता के साथ प्रधान मंत्री जी से दो प्रश्न पूछना चाहता हूँ। यह जो एपीमैट विदेश मंत्रालय की धोर में हिन्दी में प्रकाशित होकर सदस्यों में वितरित हुआ है मैं उसका प्रधान मंत्री जी को पढ़ कर सुनाना चाहता हूँ :-

“किस भारत और पाकिस्तान दोनों की सरकारें गुजरात/पश्चिम पाकिस्तान सीमाक्षेत्र में इस विश्वास में यह-विग्राम करने, और 1 जनवरी 1965 की स्थिति पुनः लाने पर सहमत हो गई है कि इस में भारत-पाकिस्तान की सम्बन्धी सीमा पर वर्तमान तनाव कम करने में भी सहायता मिलेगी।” यह है वह पृष्ठभूमि जिसके कि आधार पर यह साग एपीमैट हुआ है लेकिन इस पृष्ठभूमि को तोड़ दिया गया पाकिस्तान की धोर में कश्मीर में आक्रमण करने के बाद, तो इस के बाद भी क्या भारत सरकार इस एपीमैट पर कायम रहना चाहती है?

दूसरा प्रश्न मेरा यह है कि 1956 में छाड़बेट पर हमला होने के बाद आपने अपनी वहाँ सेना नहीं भेजी बल्कि सेंट्रल रिजर्व पुलिस को वहाँ पर भेजा। सेंट्रल रिजर्व पुलिस ने 61 से 65 तक अपना रिजिस्टर मैटन किया। आपको हर वर्ष की तारीखें लिखी कि कंजरकोट के दक्षिण के उस भाग में जहाँ आपने पाकिस्तान पुलिस को गन्त देने का अधिकार दिया है वहाँ बराबर हर साल बार, बार, पांच बार, नौ बार दस दस बार यह सेंट्रल रिजर्व पुलिस गन्त करती रही तो मैं जानना चाहता हूँ कि प्रधान मंत्री जी ने संदन में विमलन साहब के सामने इस पाकिस्तान के गन्त करने के अधि-

[श्री प्रकाशचं र शास्त्र]

कार सम्बन्धी प्रस्ताव को स्वीकार करने समय क्या अपने रजिस्टर में दर्ज उन तारीखों को नहीं देखा था और यदि देखा था तो क्या पाकिस्तान की दलील उन से भी ज्यादा मजबूत थी जैसा कि पाकिस्तान के उस तथ्य को स्वीकार कर लिया गया ? यह मेरे दो प्रश्न हैं ।

Dr. L. M. Singhvi (Jodhpur): May I know whether the Prime Minister was aware of the factual and legal implications of the status quo ante bellum as of 1st January, 1965, and if so, whether the present agreement agrees with his impressions of the status quo ante bellum as of 1st January, 1965? As a complementary question to this, may I know whether he is willing to say that under all circumstances, and irrespective of whatever Pakistan may do or perpetrate on us, they would still invoke the principle of the sanctity of treaties and not the complementary and necessarily adjunct principle of changed circumstances or *rebus sic stantibus* to which Acharya Kripalani has referred? May I know whether Government proposes to carry out this agreement under all circumstances irrespective of whatever Pakistan does?

श्री शीर्ष : पाकिस्तान के सिपाही जब मुराई से डींग जायेंगे तो बेकंजरकोट होकर जायेंगे, यदि यह बात सत्य है तो चूंकि कंजरकोट हिन्दुस्तान की सीमा में है तब क्या हिन्दुस्तान की पुलिस के सिपाही भी मुराई और डींग तक जा सकेंगे ?

श्री गोरी शंकर कच्छड़ (फतेहपुर)
 मैं एक प्रश्न प्रधान मंत्री जी से पूछना चाहता हूँ । जब उन्होंने अपना वक्तव्य इस सदन में दिया था उस समय उन को क्या इस विषय की जानकारी किसी सोर्स में थी अथवा नहीं थी कि पाकिस्तान की पुलिस को वहाँ उस मुराई डींग के क्षेत्र में गश्त होती रही है और अगर इस प्रकार की जानकारी उनको उस

समय नहीं थी तो वह कौन से महत्वपूर्ण कागजात हैं जिनके कि बारे में बार-बार कहा जाता है लेकिन वह प्रस्तुत नहीं किये जाते हैं ?

एक बात मुझे और कहनी है । अभी प्रधान मंत्री जी ने पाकिस्तान की डिमांडम के लिए दो शब्दों का प्रयोग किया है कि वह जस्टीफाइएबुल और ऐडवाइजेबुल है तो मैं उन से पूछूँ कि फिर क्या उसके बारे में कोई विवाद रह जाता है जब प्रधान मंत्री जी स्वयं यह स्वीकार करते हैं कि इस इलाके में पाकिस्तानी पुलिस की पैट्रोलिंग होना जस्टीफाइएबुल और ऐडवाइजेबुल है ? उन्होंने अपने भाषण में जो इन शब्दों का प्रयोग किया है तो उस के बाद मैं कौन सा विवाद रह जाता है ?

Mr. Speaker: Dr. Swell. Which party does he belong to? I am sorry I do not remember.

Shri Swell (Assam—Autonomous Districts): I did not join in the shouting. I did not interrupt the Prime Minister. I may be given a chance to put a question.

Mr. Speaker: He might put.

Shri Swell: It seems that between April last and now we discovered that Pakistan had been patrolling the nine-mile track between Ding and Surai which goes to show that we do not have any proper knowledge of what is going on within our own country. How do we propose to sustain our contention that the 3,500 square miles of territory which Pakistan now claims really belongs to us? Secondly, we have left everything to the tribunal. Now, if an unexpected thing happens, namely that the tribunal decides that this 3,500 square miles of territory belongs to Pakistan, will the Government willingly and happily hand over this territory to Pakistan?

Shri Hem Barua: You have deviated from your own ruling. Just now two Members belonging to the same party put two questions.

Mr. Speaker: Which party?

Shri Hem Barua: Dr. Singhvi and Shri Kakkar.

Mr. Speaker: If that has been done, it might be in ignorance. I did not know that. It has not been done, I suppose. श्री गृहमन्त्री ।

श्री रामेश्वरानन्द (करनाल) : अध्यक्ष महोदय, मुझे एक प्रश्न पूछ लेने दिया जाये ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : नहीं स्वामी जी, जब मैं प्रोरो को इजाजत नहीं दे रहा तब मैं प्राप को कैसे इजाजत दे सकता हूँ ? मैं न एक पार्टी में एक ही घादमी को सवाल पूछने की इजाजत दी है ।

श्री सुनशन (भटिंडा) : प्रधान मंत्री जी मैं हाल ही में बतलाया है कि रन श्रीफ कच्छ में पाकिस्तान की पुलिस आती रहती है और हम भी कभी-कभी आते जाते रहे तो यह बात मुझे कुछ समझ में नहीं आती कि दो देशों की पुलिस वहाँ इकट्ठी हो जाये ? वहाँ क्या कोई क्लब था या क्या था यह मेरी समझ में नहीं आता ।

दूसरी बात प्रधान मंत्री जी ने यह कही है कि कश्मीर और रन श्रीफ कच्छ का जो अगडा है वह अलहदा है तो उन दिनों जब कारगिल की चौकी को हमारी सरकार ने छोड़ा और अब प्रधान मंत्री श्री कह रहे हैं कि पाकिस्तान के साथ जो मुघाहिदा हुआ है वह खोया नहीं जा सकता तो मैं पूछना चाहता हूँ कि क्या कारगिल की चौकी जो हमने छोड़ी थी वह भी हमने वापिस ले ली ? पाकिस्तान ने कश्मीर पर हमला किया । प्रधान मंत्री के कहने के मनाबिक दोनों देशों के विदेश मंत्रियों की जो बातचीत होनी थी वह भी अब छोड़ दी है तो मैं समझना हूँ कि यह समझौते

को एक कड़ी टूटी है और दूसरी भी टूटने वाली है तो फिर यह समझौता कैसे रह गया ?

श्री रामेश्वरानन्द : अध्यक्ष महोदय, मुझे एक प्रश्न पूछने दिया जाय ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : नहीं स्वामी जी, प्राप बैठ जाइये । जब मैं ने बाकी पार्टियों को इसकी इजाजत नहीं दी और हर एक पार्टी में केवल एक को बुलाया तो फिर प्राप को कैसे बुला सकता हूँ ?

श्री रामेश्वरानन्द : इसमें पार्टी का प्रश्न नहीं है मुझे एक मिनट सवाल कर लेने दिया जाय ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : स्वामी जी, एक मिनट या दो मिनट की बात नहीं है । एक पार्टी से केवल एक मॅम्बर को सवाल पूछने की इजाजत दी गई है । प्रापकी पार्टी के जॉ मीडर हैं वे बोल चुके हैं इमनिंग मैं प्रापको सवाल पूछने की इजाजत नहीं दे सकता ।

श्री रामेश्वरानन्द : मुझे केवल एक मिनट में एक सवाल कर लेने दिया जाये ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : जी नहीं, प्राप बैठ जाइये ।

कुछ सवालों के जवाब तो प्रधान मंत्री दे चुके हैं । जिन सवालों के बारे में वह समझते हैं कि उनका जवाब नहीं दिया गया है, या वह पानिमी की ओर बजाहन करना चाहते हैं, उन के जवाब वह दे ।

श्री प्रकाशचोर शास्त्री : ऐसा कहने की आवश्यकता नहीं है ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : अगर उन्होंने यह कह दिया है कि हमारी पानिमी यह है और हमारा फैसला यह है, तो क्या वह बार-बार उन्हीं बातों को दोहराने बने जायें ?

श्री प्रकाशबीर शास्त्री : अध्यक्ष महोदय, प्राप जैसे गवर्नमेंट के हिर्नपी हैं, वैसे ही प्राप हमारे अधिकाओं के भी रखक है। प्राप अपनी ओर से प्रधान मंत्री जी को यह राय देते है कि जिन बातों के जवाब प्रा चुके हैं, उन को न कहें। माननीय सदस्यों ने जो प्रश्न किये है, वे प्रायः वे हैं, जिन के उत्तर नहीं प्राये है।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : अगर उन के उत्तर नहीं प्राए है, तो मैं ने कहा है कि उन के उत्तर दिये जायें, लेकिन क्या मैं उन को कहूँ कि जिन प्रश्नों के जवाब प्रा चुके है, वह उन को भी दोहराते चले जाये और फिर सारा रपीच हो ? यह बड़ी प्रजीव बात है, जो माननीय सदस्य मझे बता रहे है।

श्री शरद्वरानन्द : प्राप को पढ़ाने की प्रावश्यकता क्या पड़नी है ? उन्होंने जो उत्तर देना है, वह तो देना ही है। (Interruptions.)

श्री लाल बहादुर शास्त्री : माननीय र्प्यकर महोदय, जो दो तीन मयाल साम हूए है, उन के जवाब मैं दूगा।

एक तो इस बारे में पूछा गया कि इन एपीमेंट में तनाव को मिटाने का जिक्र है। यह ठीक है कि उस वकत तनाव की जो बात थी, वह इस लिए थी कि तमाम बाइंडिंग पर पाकिस्तान की फीजे थी और इम के मकाबल में हमारी फीजे भी खड़ी थी। जब यह समझौता हुआ, तब उस से यह प्राशा की गई थी कि अगर हम दोनों तरफ से फीजे हटावेंगे, तो उम में तनाव या टेन्शन कम होगा।

श्री रामेश्वरानन्द : क्या वह कम हो गया ? (Interruptions.)

श्री लाल बहादुर शास्त्री : दोनों तरफ से जो हमारी फीजे खड़ी थीं, खास तौर पर उन के बारे में वह बात थी। और कुछ हद तक ऐसा हुआ भी। जब यह समझौता हुआ, तो उस के बाद दोनों तरफ से फीजे हटीं।

कम से कम रन प्राफ कच्छ में वे नहीं रही और कुछ सरहदों में भी,—पता नहीं कहा,— लेकिन वे अपनी अपनी सरहदों पर चली गईं। छाड़बेट की जो बात है, वह पहले भी . . . (Interruptions.)

श्री प्रकाशबीर शास्त्री : अध्यक्ष महोदय, व्यवस्था का प्रश्न है।

श्री राम संवक दावव : उम में पूरी सीमा का जिक्र है।

श्री प्रकाशबीर शास्त्री : अगर प्रधान मंत्री जान-बूझ कर सदन को गलत सूचना दें, तो हम प्राप से अनुरोध कर सकते है कि प्राप प्रधान मंत्री जी को कहे। इस में शब्द है "भारत-पाकिस्तान की समूची सीमा।"

श्री रामसंवक दावव : "एन्टायर बांडर"।

श्री प्रकाशबीर शास्त्री : प्रधान मंत्री जी केवल कच्छ की चर्चा कर रहे है। एपीमेंट "भारत-पाकिस्तान की समूची सीमा" पर ननाव कम करने के लिए हुआ है।

श्री लाल बहादुर शास्त्री : मैं कह रहा हूँ कि पूरे बाइंडर पर उन की जो फीजे थी और हमारी जो फीजे उन के मुकाबले में थी उन की बात थी। सब जगह की बात थी। (Interruptions.) मैं वही बात कर रहा हूँ जो उममें लिखा हुआ है, वही है। पूरे बाइंडर पर, तमाम बाइंडर पर। (Interruptions.)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : माननीय सदस्यों ने मवाल किये है, लेकिन वे उन के जवाब नहीं सुनना चाहते है। (Interruptions.)

श्री हुकूम खन्द जल्लुबाय : काश्मीर में क्या हुआ ? वहां पर उन की फीजे बिल्कुल नहीं हटी।

श्री लालबहादुर शास्त्री : इस का काश्मीर में बिल्कुल कोई मतलब नहीं है। इस से तमाम

बाइंजे की बात थी। काश्मीर की बात नहीं थी। इस में जिद करने की क्या बात है ? इस में और बाइंजे की बात थी।

श्री रामेश्वरानन्द : क्या समझीते में लिखा हुआ है कि "काश्मीर को छोड़ कर" ?
 (Interruptions).

श्री मधु लिमये : इस करार में लिखा हुआ है कि तनाव कम होना चाहिए। क्या काश्मीर में तनाव कम हुआ ?

(Interruptions).

अध्यक्ष महोदय : क्या माननीय सदस्य चाहते हैं कि मैं बहस को यहीं पर खत्म कर दूँ और प्राइम मिनिस्टर जवाब न दें ?

एक माननीय सदस्य : वह जवाब प्रवण्य दें।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : लेकिन उन को जवाब देने का मौका तो दिया जाये। वह जो भी जवाब देना चाहते हैं, उस का उन को अधिकार है। मैं कैसे उन को बन्द कर दूँ ?
 (Interruptions).

प्रारंभ माननीय सदस्य नहीं सुनेंगे। तो मुझे प्राइम मिनिस्टर को कहना पड़ेगा कि वह यही खत्म कर दें और वॉटिंग को निया जायें।

श्री बाइंजे : हम प्राय को गाइडेस चाहते हैं।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : प्राय तो किन्हीं बातों को मानने के लिए तैयार नहीं है। गाइडेस कड़ा में प्राय ?

श्री लाल बहादुर शास्त्री : जहाँ तक एग्जिमेंट वर्ग्स की बात है, ये सब बातें हर बन्द नहीं कही जाती और यह जरूरी नहीं होता कि गवर्नमेंट अपनी पार्लिमेंट और अपनी नॉति का एलान करती रहे। प्राइमि एक माका देखा जाता है, स्पिन देखा जाती है, मिट्टाएन देखा जाती है और फिर उस के

धनुसार फैसला करते हैं। मैं प्राय उस का कोई एलान इस हाउस के सामने कर दूँ, यह न ठीक है, न मुनासिब है। जो कुछ मैं ने कहा है, सिधवी साहब की बात उसी में प्रा जाती है।

श्री हरि बिष्णु कामत : टिब्यूनल के बारे में ?

श्री लाल बहादुर शास्त्री : और देशों का मैं इस वक्त प्राय के सामने कुछ नहीं कह सकता, लेकिन एक यह प्रिंसिपल है, एक उमूल है—यूनाइटेड नेशन्स का भी है—कि जहाँ तक हो सके, प्रगर सम्भव है, तो प्रगर कुछ बातें पीसफुल, शान्तिमय, तरीके से, नैगोशिएशन से, मीडिएशन से, प्रायबिटेगन से तय हो सके, तो अच्छी बात है। लेकिन हमारे यहाँ की सिटुएशन कुछ दूसरी है, क्योंकि यह बंटा मुल्क है और उस में बाउंडरीज की डिमार-केशन होने वाली है। और जहाँ बाउंडरी की डिमारकेशन नहीं हुई, उस के बारे में हम पाकिस्तान से मिले भी हैं। 1959 और 1960 में बात हुई और उस में यह तय हुआ कि हम प्रायने डिस्ट्रिक्ट्स या डिफ्रीकरटीज का प्रायस में बातचीत कर के तय करें और प्रगर उस से काम नहीं बना, तब हम टिब्यूनल की बात भी मोच सकते हैं।

श्री हरि बिष्णु कामत : मेरा प्रश्न था उस प्रंत के बारे में जिसको प्राय ने मन्जूर किया है—

"will not be questioned on any ground whatsoever"

ऐसी मिसाल कहीं भी नहीं मिलती

श्री लाल बहादुर शास्त्री : वह ठीक है। "बाइंजे" पहले भी प्राया हुआ है। जो एग्जिमेंट है, उस में प्राया हुआ है कि जो उस का फैसला है, वह बाइंजे है। यह उस में है।

श्री हरि बिष्णु कामत : किम में ?

श्री लाल बहादुर शास्त्री एपीमेंट में ।

श्री हरि विष्णु कामत : यह काबिले-एतराज है ।

श्री लाल बहादुर शास्त्री : ठीक है, लेकिन कोई ऐसा नहीं है कि अगर एक बात हम अभी मान लेते हैं, तो हम सब बातों में उस को मान लेंगे, हर एक को स्वीकार कर लेंगे । ऐसी बात बिल्कुल नहीं है । यह एक झलक एपीमेंट है, जिस को हम न माना है और जैसी स्थिति घायिगी, जैसा मोका घायिगा, हम उस का मुकाबला करेंगे ।

श्री रामसेवक यादव : अध्यक्ष महोदय एक निवेदन है ।

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: He says he may not accept it later on. How can he leave it at a loose end?

Shri J. B. Kripalani: May I submit that my question has not been replied to?

Mr. Speaker: What can I do?

Shri J. B. Kripalani: What is the good of asking questions, then?

Shri H. N. Mukerjee: I asked a specific question about the UN forces in Kashmir conniving with the Pakistani invaders. He did not answer that.

श्री रामसेवक यादव : अध्यक्ष महोदय, जिन संशोधनों को प्रेम किया जायेगा, घाय उन पर अभी मत-विभाजन करायेंगे । मेरा निवेदन यह है कि यह बहुत ही महत्वपूर्ण प्रश्न है और यह हिन्दुस्तान की, जो हमारी मातृभूमि है, जमीन का प्रश्न है । मेरा निवेदन है कि इस संबंध में गुप्त मतदान प्रणाली इस्ते-माल की जाये, बैलट से बांट किया जाये, क्योंकि सत्तारूढ़ दल के सदस्य इस के पक्ष में भी मत दे सकते हैं और विपक्ष में भी ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : ऐसा नहीं हो सकता है ।

There are eleven substitute motions.

Substitute motion Nos. 1, 2, 4, 5, 6, 11, 12 and 13 are for disapproval. I can only put No. 1 if the Opposition can agree to that, which they want me to put, because others would be barred. Therefore, any one that they like, I might put.

Shri Yashpal Singh (Kairana): No. 1 may be taken.

श्री स० मो० बनर्जी : सब को एक साथ ले लिया जाए ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : डिविजन चाहेंगे तो सब पर नहीं होगी ।

श्री स० मो० बनर्जी : इस में फर्क यह हो जाता है कि कुछ मॉर्निंग पार्टी के सदस्य जो वाक आउट कर गए थे अपनी एपीमेंट्स मूव नहीं करे . .

अध्यक्ष महोदय : इजाजत दें श्री. उन्होंने मूव कर ली है ।

श्री स० मो० बनर्जी : मेरा निवेदन यह है कि काश्मीर में जो कुछ हुआ है उसको देखते हुए मांग की गई है कि उस समस्या को रद्द कर दिया जाए और कुछ दूसरे कारणों में इसको रद्द करने की मांग की गई है । मैं चाहता हूँ कि सब को एक साथ ले लिया जाए ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : मैं धन्य कर रहा हूँ कि सब को एक साथ तो ले लेंगे लेकिन अगर डिविजन होंगी तो मैं एक पर ही कर सकूंगा । सब पर डिविजन नहीं कर सकता हूँ । अगर घाय एपी नहीं करते हैं तो मैं नम्बर को लेता हूँ । (Interruptions).

Order, order. I will ask the officers to keep the doors shut; if the Whips of the different parties have to get in their Members they might get them now. The question is:

That for the original motion, the following be substituted, namely:—

"This House, having considered the statement laid on the Table of the House by the Prime Minister on the 16th August, 1965, on the Indo-Pakistan Agreement of June, 1965 relating to Gujarat-West Pakistan

border, disapproves the Agreement as it barter away the honour and sovereignty of India." (1)

This is the substitute motion of Shri Yashpal Singh. This is for disapproval. If this one is decided, the others would be barred.

Lok Sabha divided:

Division No. 2]

AYES

[13.53 hrs.

Alvares, Shri
Bade, Shri
Banerjee, Shri S. M.
Barua, Shri Hem
Berwa, Shri Onkar Lal
Brij Raj Singh, Shri
Chaudhuri, Shri Tridib Kumar
Gokaren Prasad, Shri
Gupta, Shri Kashi Ram
Kachhavalva, Shri Hukam Chand

Kakkar, Shri, Gauri Shanker
Kamath, Shri Hari Vishnu
Lakshmu Bhawani, Shri
Maurya, Shri
Mohan Swarup, Shri
Omkar Singh, Shri
Pillai, Shri Nataraja
Rameshwaranand, Shri
Seth, Shri Bishanchander
Shastri, Shri Prakash Vir

Siddhanti, Shri Jagdev Singh
Sigh, Shri A.P.
Swamy, Shri Sivamurthi
Swell, Shri
Valvi, Shri
Vishram Prasad, Shri
Yadav, Shri Ram Sewak
Yainik, Shri
Yashpal Singh, Shri
Yudhvir Singh, Shri

NOES

Abdul Rashid, Bakshi
Abdul Wahid, Shri T.
Achal Singh, Shri
Achuthan, Shri
Akkamma Devi, Shrimati
Alagesan, Shri
Alva, Shri A.S.
Alva, Shri Joachim
Anjanappa, Shri
Ankineedu, Shri
Anthony, Shri Prank
Arunachalam, Shri
Babunath Singh, Shri
Badrudduin, Shri
Bakliwal, Shri
Bal Krishna Singh, Shri
Barman, Shri P.C.
Barrow, Shri
Barua, Shri R.
Barupal, Shri P.I.
Basappa, Shri
Basumatari, Shri
Bhagat, Shri B.R.
Bhagavati, Shri
Bhakt Darshan, Shri
Bhanja Deo, Shri L.N.
Bhargava, Shri M.B.
Bhatkar, Shri
Bhattacharyya, Shri C.K.
Birendra Behadur Singh, Shri
Bisat, Shri J.B.S.
Boroosah, Shri P. C.
Brahm Prakash, Shri
Brajeshwar Prasad, Shri

Brij Basu Lal, Shri
Brij Raj Singh-Kotah, Shri
Chakraverti, Shri P.R.
Chanda, Shrimati Jyotena
Chandak, Shri
Chandrabhan Singh, Shri
Chandriki, Shri
Chaturvedi, Shri S.N.
Chaudhry, Shri Chandramani Lal
Chudhuri, Shri D.S.
Chaudhuri, Shrimati Kamala
Chaudhuri, Shri Sachindra
Chavan, Shri D.R.
Chavada, Shrimati, Johrabai
Choudhry, Shri Lahtan
Daljit Singh, Shri
Das, Shri B.K.
Das, Shri Sudhansu
Dasa, Shri C.
Dessai, Shri Morarji
Deshmukh, Shrimati, Vimlabai P.
Dey, Shri S.K.
Dhuleshwar Meena, Shri
Dixit, Shri G.N.
Doyal, Shri Katoatha
Dubey, Shri R.G.
Dwivedi, Shri M.T.
Fring, Shri D.
Firodia, Shri
Gajraj Singh Rao, Shri
Gandhi, Shri V.B.
Gowdh, Shri Veerasana
Guba, Shri A.C.
Gupte, Shri Bedeshah

Hajarnavis, Shri
Hansda, Shri Subodh
Hanumanthiya, Shri
Haq, Shri M.M.
Harvani, Shri Ansar
Hazarika, Shri J.N.
Heda, Shri
Hem Raj, Shri
Himatsingka, Shri
Iqbal Singh, Shri
Jadhav, Shri Tulshidas
Jagjivan Ram, Shri
Jamir, Shri S.G.
Jamunadevi, Shrimati
Jayaraman, Shri
Jena, Shri
Joishi, Shri A.C.
Jyotishi, Shri J.P.
Kabir, Shri Humayun
Kadedi, Shri
Kannamwar, Shrimati, Tau
Kappen, Shri
Karni Singhji, Shri
Karuthiraman, Shri
Kedaria, Shri C.M.
Khadilkar, Shri
Khan, Dr. P.N.
Khan, Shri Shah Nawaz
Khanna, Shri Mehr Chand
Khanna, Shri P.K.
Kandari Lal, Shri
Kotaki, Shri Liladhar
Koya, Shri
Kripa Shankar, Shri

Krishna, Shri M.R.	Paliwal, Shri	Satyanarayana, Shri
Krishnamachari, Shri T.T.	Pande, Shri K.N.	Sen, Shri A.K.
Kureel, Shri B.N.	Pandey, Shri R.S.	Sen, Shri P. G.
Lakhan Das, Shri	Pandey, Shri Vishwa Nath	Shah, Shri Manubendra
Lakshmikenthamma, Shrimati	Pandit, Shrimati Vijay Lakshmi	Shakuntala Devi, Shrimati
Lalit Sen, Shri	Panna Lal, Shri	Sham Nath, Shri
Laskar, Shri N.R.	Pant, Shri K. C.	Shankaraiya, Shri
Laxmi Bai, Shrimati	Paramasivan, Shri	Sharma, Shri A. P.
Mahadeo Prasad, Shri	Parashar, Shri	Sherma Shri K.C.
Mahadeva Prasad, Dr.	Patel, Shri Chhotubhai	Shashi Ranjan, Shri
Muhtab, Shri	Patel, Shri N.N.	Shastri, Shri Lal Bahadur
Mahishi, Dr. Sarojini	Patel, Shri P.R.	Shastri, Shri Ramanand
Maimoona Sultan, Shrimati	Patil, Shri D.S.	Sheo Narain, Shri
Mulaichami, Shri	Patil, Shri J.S.	Shinde, Shri
Malaviya, Shri K.D.	Patil, Shri S.B.	Shree Narayan Das, Shri
Malhotra, Shri Inder J.	Patil, Shri S.K.	Shukla, Shri Vidya Charan
Mallick, Shri Rama Chandra	Patil, Shri T.A.	Shyam Kumari Devi Shrimati
Manaen, Shri	Pattabhi Raman, Shri C.K.	Siddananiappa, Shri
Mandal, Dr. P.	Prabhakar, Shri Naval	Sidheshwar Prasad, Shri
Mandal, Shri Yamuna Prasad	Pratap Singh, Shri	Singh, Shri D.N.
Manyangadan, Shri	Puri, Shri D.D.	Singh, Shri K.K.
Mantri, Shri D.D.	Raghunath Singh, Shri	Singha, Shri G.K.
Marandi, Shri	Rai, Shrimati Sahodra Bai	Sinha, Shrimati Ramdulati
Masuriya Din, Shri	Raj Bahadur, Shri	Sinha, Shri Satya Narayan
Mathur, Shri Harish Chandra	Raja, Shri C.R.	Sinha, Shrimati Tarkeshwari
Mathur, Shri Shiv Charan	Rajdeo Singh, Shri	Sinhaan Singh, Shri
Mehrotra, Shri Braj Bihari	Raju, Shri D.B.	Sanata, Shri Nardeo
Mehta, Shri J. R.	Ram, Shri T.	Soy, Shri H.C.
Melkote, Dr.	Ram Sewak, Shri	Srinivasan, Dr. P.
Mengi, Shri Gopal Datt	Ram Swarup, Shri	Subramaniam, Shri C.
Menon, Shri Krishna	Ramdhani Das, Shri	Subramanyam, Shri T.
Minimata, Shrimati	Ramshekhar Prasad Singh, Shri	Sumat Prasad, Shri
Mirza, Shri Bakar Ali	Rananjai Singh, Shri	Sunder Lal, Shri
Mishra, Shri Bibhuti	Rane, Shri	Surendra Pal Singh, Shri
Mishra, Shri M.P.	Rao, Shri Jagannatha	Swaran Singh, Shri
Misra, Shri Bibudhendra	Rao, Dr. K.L.	Tantia, Shri Rameshwar
Misra, Shri Shyam Dhar	Rao, Shri Krishnamoorthy	Thiramaiah, Shri
Mohanty, Shri Gokulananda	Rao, Shri Muthyal	Thomas, Shri A.M.
Mohsin, Shri	Rao, Shri Thirumala	Tiwary, Shri D.N.
Moraka, Shri	Rattan Lal, Shri	Tiwary, Shri K.N.
More, Shri S.S.	Ray, Shrimati Renuka	Tiwary, Shri R. S.
Muhammad Ismail, Shri	Reddi, Dr. B. Gopala	Tula Ram, Shri
Mukane, Shri	Reddier, Shri	Tyagi, Shri
Murli Manhor, Shri	Reddy, Shri R. Surendra	Ulkey, Shri
Mukerjee, Shrimati Sharja	Reddy, Shri Ramakrishna	Upadhyaya, Shri Nbiya Dutt
Murli Manhor, Shri	Reddy, Shrimati Yashoda	Valahya, Shri M.B.
Murthy, Shri B.S.	Roy, Shri Bishwanath	Varma, Shri M.L.
Murti, Shri M.S.	Sadhu Ram, Shri	Varma, Shri Ravindra
Muthiah, Shri	Saha, Dr. S. K.	Veerappa, Shri
Muzaffar Hussain, Shri	Sahu, Shri Rameshwar	Venkatasubbaiah, Shri P.
Nair, Shri D.J.	Saigal, Shri A. S.	Verma, Shri algovind
Nanda, Shri	Samanta, Shri S. C.	Vidyalankar, Shri A.N.
Nayak, Shri Mohan	Samnani, Shri	Vijaya Ananda, Maharajkumar
Neyer, Dr. Sushila	Sani, Rupji, Shri	Vyas, Shri Radbelal
Nesamony, Shri	Saraf, Shri Shamlat	Yadav, Shri Ram Herkh
Niranjan Lal, Shri	Sarma, Shri A. T.	Yadava, Shri B.P.
Oza, Shri	Satyabhama Devi, Shrimati	

Mr. Speaker: The result of the
Division is: Ayes* 31; Noes 272.

The motion was negatived.

श्री रामसेवक यादव : न प्राप जमीन
बचा सकते है और न जान बचा सकते है ।

*Ayes: the name of one Member could not be recorded.

Mr. Speaker: Now, substitute motion Nos. 7 and 10 are suggestions, for they are partly covered by No. 1. I will take them separately but put them both together. Substitute motion No. 7 is by Shri Brij Raj Singh, and substitute motion No. 10 is by Shrimati Renu Chakravartty.

Shri Brij Raj Singh: They cannot be put together. Sir. How can that be done?

Mr. Speaker: They can be put together if the House agrees. (*Interruption*). There is no cause for resentment. I am only saying that if the House agrees they can be put together. If it is desired that they should be put separately, certainly I shall put them separately.

Shri H. N. Mukerjee: The tenor of the two amendments is completely different and I cannot envisage their being put together.

Mr. Spaker: My intention was, if they were not being pressed, then I might put them together. But if they are pressed, I shall put them separately. I have no objection. I shall first put No. 7.

The question is:

"That for the original motion, the following be substituted, namely:—

"This House, having considered the statement laid on the

Table of the House by the Prime Minister on the 16th August, 1965, on the Indo-Pakistan Agreement of June, 1965 relating to Gujarat-West Pakistan border, is of the opinion that—

- (a) by launching an undeclared invasion on Kashmir, Pakistan has sabotaged the very basis of the pact, namely, the imperative need to maintain Indo-Pak peace and goodwill;
- (b) the Agreement was entered into on the ground that "it would result in lessening of tensions on the Indo-Pak. border";
- (c) Pakistan has, by its own action, violated this basic postulate of the Agreement;

(d) the pact in effect now stands annulled; and, therefore, urges upon the Government to let it be known to Pakistan that India does not hold itself committed any longer to the Agreement, and further directs the Government to call off the proposed meeting of Indo-Pak Foreign Ministers and take no further steps in pursuance of the Agreement until Pakistan demonstrates in a convincing manner its *bonafides*." (7).

The Lok Sabha divided.

AYES

Division No. 3]

[12:57 hrs.

Bade, Shri
Banerjee, Shri S.M.
Barua, Shri Hem
Berwa, Shri Onkar Lal
Brij Raj, Singh Shri
Gokaran Prasad, Shri

Kamath, Shri Hari Vishnu
Kakkar, Shri Gauri Shanker
Maurya, Shri
Singh, Shri A.P.
Swamy, Shri Sivamurthy

Swell, Shri
Vishram Prasad, Shri
Yadav, Shri Ram Sewak
Yashpal Singh, Shri
Yudhvir Singh, Shri

NOES

Abdul Rashid, Bakhshi	Ering, Shri D.	Mallick, Shri Rama Chandra
Abdul Wahid, Shri T.	Firodia, Shri	Manaan, Shri
Achal Singh, Shri	Gandhi, Shri V.B.	Mandal, Shri Yamuna Prasad
Achuthan, Shri	Gowdh, Shri H.K.V.	Maniyangadan, Shri
Akkamma Devi, Shrimati	Guha, Shri A.C.	Mantri, Shri D.D.
Alagesan, Shri	Gupta, Shri Badshah	Marandi, Shri
Alva, Shri A.S.	Hajarnavis, Shri	Mesuriya Din, Shri
Alva, Shri Joachim	Hanada, Shri Subodh	Mathur, Shri Harish Chandra
Aney, Dr. M.S.	Hanumanthaiya, Shri	Mathur, Shri Shiv Charan
Anjanappa, Shri	Haq, Shri M.M.	Mehrotra, Shri Braj Bihari
Ankineedu, Shri	Harvani, Shri Anwar	Mehta, Shri Jashvant
Anthony, Shri Frank	Hazarika, Shri J.N.	Melkote, Dr.
Arunachalam, Shri	Heda, Shri	Mengi, Shri Gopal Datt
Babunath Singh, Shri	Hem Raj, Shri	Menon, Shri Krishna
Bakliwal, Shri	Himatsingka, Shri	Minimata, Shrimati
Hal Krishna Singh, Shri	Iqbal Singh, Shri	Mirza, Shri Bakar Ali
Barmen, Shri P.C.	Jadhav, Shri Tulshidas	Mishra, Shri Bibhuti
Barua, Shri R.	Jaggiwan Ram, Shri	Mishra, Shri M.P.
Barupal, Shri P.L.	Jamir, Shri S.E.	Misra, Shri Bibudhendra
Basappa, Shri	Jamunadevi, Shrimati	Misra, Shri Shyam Dhar
Basumatari, Shri	Jayaraman, Shri	Mohanty, Shri Gokulananda
Bhagat, Shri B.R.	Jena, Shri	Mohain, Shri
Bhagavati, Shri	Joshi, Shri A.C.	Morarka, Shri
Bhakt Darshan, Shri	Jyotishi, Shri J.P.	More, Shri K.L.
Bhanja Deo, Shri L.N.	Kabir, Shri Humavun	Muhammad Ismail, Shri
Bhargava, Shri M.B.	Kadadi, Shri	Mukane, Shri
Bhattacharyya, Shri C.K.	Kannamwar, Shrimati Tai	Mukerjee, Shrimati Sharda
Bist, Shri J.B.S.	Kappen, Shri	Murli Manohar, Shri
Borooh, Shri P.C.	Karni Singhji, Shri	Murthy, Shri B.S.
Brahm Prakash, Shri	Karuthiruman, Shri	Murti, Shri M.S.
Brajeshwar Prasad, Shri	Kedaria, Shri C.M.	Muthiah, Shri
Brij Basi Lal, Shri	Khadilkar, Shri	Naik, Shri D.J.
Brij Raj Singh-Kotah, Shri	Khan, Dr. P.N.	Nanda, Shri
Chakraverti, Shri P.R.	Khan, Shri Shah Nawaz	Nayak, Shri Mohan
Chanda, Shrimati Jyotsna	Khanna, Shri Mehr Chand	Nayar, Dr. Sushila
Chandak, Shri	Khanna, Shri P.K.	Nesamony, Shri
Chandrabhan Singh, Shri	Kindar Lal, Shri	Niranjan Lal, Shri
Chandriki, Shri	Kotoki, Shri Liledhar	Oza, Shri
Chaturvedi, Shri S.N.	Koya, Shri	Paliwal Shri
Chaudhry, Shri Chandramani Lal	Kripa Shankar, Shri	Pande, Shri K.N.
Chaudhuri, Shri D.S.	Krishna, Shri M.R.	Pandey, Shri R.S.
Chaudhuri, Shrimati Kamala	Krishnamachari, Shri T.T.	Pandey, Shri Viahwa Nath
Chaudhuri, Shri Sachindra	Kurcel, Shri B.N.	Pandit, Shrimati Vijay Lakshmi
Chavan, Shri D.R.	Lahtan Chaudhry, Shri	Panna Lal, Shri
Daljit Singh, Shri	Lakhan Das, Shri	Pant, Shri K.C.
Das, Shri B.K.	Lakshmikanthamma, Shrimati	Paramasivan, Shri
Das, Shri Sudhansu	Lalit Sen, Shri	Parashar, Shri
Dass, Shri C.	Laskar, Shri N.R.	Patel, Shri Chhotubhai
Desai, Shri Morarji	Laxmi Bai, Shrimati	Patel, Shri N.N.
Deshmukh, Shri Shivali Rao S.	Mahadeo Prasad, Shri	Patel, Shri P.R.
Deshmukh, Shrimati Vimlabai P.	Mahadeva Prasad, Dr.	Patil, Shri D.S.
Dey, Shri S.K.	Mahtab, Shri	Patil, Shri J.S.
Dhuleshwar Meena, Shri	Mahishi, Dr. Sarojini	Patil, Shri S.B.
Dixit, Shri G.N.	Maimoona Sultan, Shrimati	Patil, Shri S.K.
Dorai, Shri Kasinatha	Malaichami, Shri	Patil, Shri T.A.
Dubey, Shri R.G.	Malaviya, Shri K.D.	Pattabhi Raman, Shri C.R.
Dwivedi, Shri M.L.	Malhotra, Shri Inder J.	Pillai, Shri Nataraja

Prabhakar, Shri Naval
Pratap Singh, Shri
Puri, Shri D.D.
Raghunath Singh, Shri
Rai, Shrimati Sahodra Bai
Raj Bahadur, Shri
Raja Shri C.R.
Rajdeo Singh, Shri
Raju, Shri D.B.
Ram, Shri T.
Ram Sewak, Shri
Ram Swarup, Shri
Ramdhani Das, Shri
Ramshekar Prasad Singh, Shri
Rananjai Singh, Shri
Rane, Shri
Rao, Shri Jagunatha
Rao, Dr. K.L.
Rao, Shri Krishnamoorthy
Rao, Shri Muthyal
Rao, Shri Thirumala
Rattan Lal, Shri
Ray, Shrimati Renuka
Reddi, Dr. B. Gopala
Reddy, Shri Ramakrishna
Reddy, Shrimati Yashoda
Roy, Shri Bishwanath
Sadhu Ram, Shri
Saha, Dr. S.K.
Sahu, Shri Rameshwar
Sugai, Shri A.S.

Samanta, Shri S.C.
Samnani, Shri
Sanji Rupii, Shri
Saraf, Shri Sham Lal
Sarma, Shri A.T.
Satyabhama Devi, Shrimati
Satyanarayana, Shri
Sen, Shri A.K.
Sen, Shri P.G.
Shah, Shri Manabendra
Shakuntala Devi, Shrimati
Sham Nath, Shri
Shankaraiya, Shri
Sharma, Shri A.P.
Sharma, Shri K.C.
Shashi Ranjan, Shri
Shastri, Shri Lal Bahadur
Shastri, Shri Ramanand
Sheo Narain, Shri
Shinde, Shri
Shree Narayan Das, Shri
Shukla, Shri Vidya Charan
Shyam Kunari Devi, Shrimati
Siddananajappa, Shri
Sidheshwar Prasad, Shri
Singh, Shri K.K.
Singha, Shri G.K.
Sinha, Shrimati Ramdulari
Sinha, Shri Satya Narayan
Sinha, Shrimati Tarkeshwari

Sinha Singh, Shri
Snatak, Shri Nardeo
Soy, Shri H.C.
Srinivasa, Dr. P.
Subramaniam, Shri C.
Subramanyam, Shri T.
Sumet Prasad, Shri
Sunder Lal, Shri
Surendra Pal Singh, Shri
Swaran Singh, Shri
Tantia, Shri Rameshwar
Thimmiah, Shri
Thomas, Shri A.M.
Tiwary, Shri D.N.
Tiwary, Shri K.N.
Tiwary, Shri R.N.
Tula Ram, Shri
Tyagi, Shri
Ukey, Shri
Upadhyaya, Shri Shiva Dutt
Vaishya, Shri M.B.
Valvi, Shri
Verma, Shri M.L.
Verma, Shri Ravindra
Veerappa, Shri
Venkatasubbaiah, Shri
Verma, Shri Balgovind
Vidyalankar, Shri A.N.
Vyas, Shri Radhelal
Yadav, Shri Ram Harsh
Yadava, Shri B.P.

Mr. Speaker: The result of the division is as follows:

*Ayes 17; Noes 262.

The motion was negatived.

Mr. Speaker: I shall now put substitute motion No. 10 by Shrimati Renu Chakravartty. The question is:

That for the original motion, the following be substituted, namely:—

"This House, having considered the statement laid on the Table of the House by the Prime Minister on the 16th August, 1965, on the Indo-Pakistan Agreement of June, 1965 relating to Gujarat-West Pakistan border, is of the opinion that the clause for reference to arbitration be revoked, as it impinges upon our sovereign rights on the territory of Kutch and is fraught with grave dangers"(10).

The Lok Sabha divided.

Division No. 4]

AYES

[13-58 hrs.

Ancy, Dr. M.S.
Badruddeen, Shri
Banerjee, Shri S.M.
Barua, Shri Hem
Basumatari, Shri
Chakravartty, Shrimati Renu
Elias, Shri Moham mad
Gupta, Shri Indrajit
Gupta, Shri Kashi Ram

Kakkar, Shri Gauri Shanker
Kamath, Shri Hari Vishnu
Maurya, Shri
Mukerjee, Shri H.N.
Murmu, Shri Sarkar
Nair, Shri Venudevan
Omkar Singh, Shri
Pandey, Shri Sarjoo
Rameshwaranand, Shri

Reddy, Shri Eswara
Reddy, Shri Yallamanda
Neth, Shri Bishanchander
Singh, Shri J.B.
Swamy, Shri Sivamurthi
Warrior, Shri
Yadav, Shri Ram Sewak
Yudhvir Singh, Shri

*Ayes: the name of one member could not be recorded.

NOES

- Abdul Wahid, Shri T.
Achal Singh, Shri
Achuthan, Shri
Akkamma Devi, Shrimati
Alagesan, Shri
Alva, Shri A.S.
Alva, Shri Joschim
nanappa, Shri
Ankineedu, Shri
Anthony, Shri Frank
Arunachalam, Shri
Babunath Singh, Shri
Bakliwal, Shri
Bal Krishna Singh, Shri
Balaraman, Shri P.C.
Barrow, Shri
Barua, Shri R.
Barupal, Shri P.L.
Basappa, Shri
Bhajat, Shri B.R.
Bhagavati, Shri
Bhakti Darshan, Shri
Bhanja Deo, Shri L.N.
Bhargava, Shri M.B.
Bhatkar, Shri
Bhattacharyya, Shri C.K.
Birendra Bahadur Singh, Shri
Bist, Shri J.B.S.
Boroach, Shri P.C.
Brahm Prakash, Shri
Brajeswar Prasad, Shri
Brij Basi Lal, Shri
Brij Raj Singh, Shri
Chakraverti, Shri P.R.
Chanda, Shrimati Jyotsna
Chandak, Shri
Chandrabhan Singh, Shri
Chandriki, Shri
Chaturvedi Shri S.N.
Chaudhry, Shri Chandramani Lal
Chaudhuri, Shri D.S.
Chaudhuri, Shrimati Kamala
Chaudhuri, Shri Sachindra
Chavan, Shri D.R.
Chavda, Shrimati Joraben
Daliit Singh, Shri
Das, Shri B. K.
Das, Shri Sudhansu
Dass, Shri C.
Desai, Shri Moraji
Deshmukh, Shrimati Vimlabai P.
Dey, Shri S.K.
Dhuleshwar Meena, Shri
Dixit, Shri G.N.
Dorai, Shri Kasinatha
Dubey, Shri R.G.
Dwivedi, Shri M.L.
Erang, Shri D.
Firodia, Shri
Gajraj Singh Rao, Shri
Gandhi, Shri V.B.
Gowdh, Shri
Guha, Shri A.C.
Gupta, Shri Badshah
Hajarnavis, Shri
Hanada, Shri Subodh
Hanumanthaiya, Shri
Haq, Shri M. M.
Harvani, Shri Anwar
Hazari, Shri J.N.
Heda, Shri
Hem Raj, Shri
Himatsingka, Shri
Iqbal Singh, Shri
Jadhav, Shri Tulshidas
Jagjivan Ram, Shri
Jamir, Shri S.G.
Jannadevi, Shrimati
Jayaraman, Shri
Joahi, Shri A.C.
Jyotishi, Shri J.P.
Kabir, Shri Humayun
Kadadi, Shri
Kannamwar, Shrimati Tai
Kappen, Shri
Karni Singhji, Shri
Karuthiruman, Shri
Kedaria, Shri C.M.
Khan, Dr. P.N.
Khan, Shri Shah Nawaz
Khanna, Shri P.K.
Kindar Lal, Shri
Kotaki, Shri Liladhar
Koya, Shri
Kripa, Shanker, Shri
Krishna, Shri M.R.
Krishnamachari, Shri T.T.
Kureel, Shri B.N.
Lahtan Chaudhry, Shri
Lakhan Das, Shri
Lakshminthamma, Shrimati
Lalit Sen, Shri
Laskar, Shri N.R.
Lazmi Bai, Shrimati
Mahadeo Prasad, Shri
Mahadeva Prasad, Dr.
Mahtab, Shri
Mahishi, Dr. Sarojini
Malmoons Sultan, Shrimati
Malaichami, Shri
Malaviya, Shri K.D.
Malhotra, Shri Inder J.
Mallick, Shri Rama Chandra
Manaan, Shri
Mandal, Dr. P.
Mandal, Shri Yamuna Prasad
Maniyangaden, Shri
Mantri, Shri D.D.
Marandi, Shri
Masuriya Din, Shri
Mathur, Shri Harish Chandra
Mathur, Shri Shiv Charan
Mechrottra, Shri Braj Bihari
Melkote, Dr.
Mengi, Shri Gopal Datt
Menon, Shri Krishna
Minimata, Shrimati
Mirza, Shri Bakar Ali
Mishra, Shri Bibhuti
Mishra, Shri M.P.
Mishra, Shri Bibudbendra
Mishra, Shri Shyam Dhar
Mohanty, Shri Gokulananda
Mohsin, Shri
Morarka, Shri
More, Shri K.L.
More, Shri S.S.
Muhammad Ismail, Shri
Mukane, Shri
Mukerjee, Shrimati Sbarda
Murti Manohar, Shri
Murtly, Shri B.S.
Murti, Shri M.S.
Muthiah, Shri
Muzaffar Hussain, Shri
Naik, Shri D.J.
Nanda, Shri
Nayak, Shri Mohan
Nayar, Dr. Sushila
Nesamony, Shri
Niranjan Lal, Shri
Oza, Shri
Paliwal, Shri
Pande, Shri K.N.
Pandey, Shri R.S.
Pandey, Shri Vabwa Nath
Panna Lal, Shri
Pant, Shri K.C.
Paramasivan, Shri
Parashar, Shri
Patel, Shri Chhotubhai
Patel, Shri N.N.
Patel, Shri P.R.
Patil, Shri D.S.
Patil, Shri J.S.
Patil, Shri S.B.
Patil, Shri S.K.
Patil, Shri T.A.
Pattabhi Ramana, Shri C.R.
Prabbakar, Shri Naval
Pratap Singh, Shri
Puri, Shri D.D.
Raghunath Singh, Shri
Rai, Shrimati Sahodra Bai
Raj Bahadur, Shri
Rais, Shri C.R.
Rajdeo Singh, Shri
Raju, Shri D.B.

Kam, Shri T.
Kam Sewak, Shri
Kam Swarup, Shri
Kamdhani Das, Shri
Kamsbekhar Prasad Singh, Shri
Rananjai Singh, Shri
Rane, Shri
Rao, Shri Jagannatha
Rao, Dr. K.L.
Rao, Shri Krishnamoorthy
Rao, Shri Muthyal
Rao, Shri Thirumala
Rattan Lal, Shri
Ray, Shrimati Renuka
Reddi, Dr. B. Gopala
Reddiar, Shri
Reddy, Shri Narayan
Reddy, Shri R. Surendra
Reddy, Shri Ramakrishna
Reddy, Shrimati Yasoda
Roy, Shri Bishwanath
Sadhu Ram, Shri
Saha, Dr. S.K.
Sahu, Shri Rameshwar
Saigal, Shri A.S.
Sarmanta, Shri S.C.
Sannani, Shri
Sanji Rupji, Shri
Saraf, Shri Sham Lal

Sarma, Shri A.T.†
Satyabhama Devi, Shrimati
Satyrajn, Shri
Sen, Shri A.K.
Sen, Shri P.G.
Shah, Shri Manabendra
Shakuntala Devi, Shrimati
Sham Nath, Shri
Shankaraiya, Shri
Sharma, Shri A.P.
Sharma, Shri K.C.
Shashi Ranjan, Shri
Shastri, Shri Lal Bahadur
Sheo Narain, Shri
Shinde, Shri
Shree Narayan Das, Shri
Shukla, Shri Vidya Charan
Shyam Kumari Devi, Shrimati
Siddanappa, Shri
Siddheshwar Prasad, Shri
Singh, Shri D.N.
Singh, Shri K.K.
Singha, Shri G.K.
Sinha, Shrimati Ramdulari
Sinha, Shrimati Tarkeshwari
Sinhasan Singh, Shri
Snatak, Shri Nardeo
Soy, Shri H.C.
Srinivasan, Dr. P.

Subramaniam, Shri C.
Subramanyam, Shri T.
Sumat Prasad, Shri
Sunder Lal, Shri
Surendra Pal Singh, Shri
Swaran Singh, Shri
Tantia, Shri Rameshwar
Thimmaiah, Shri
Thomas, Shri A.M.
Tiwary, Shri D.N.
Tiwary, Shri K.N.
Tiwary, Shri R.S.
Tula Ram, Shri
Tyagi, Shri
Uikey, Shri
Upadhaya, Shri Shiva Dutt
Valahya, Shri M.B.
Valvi, Shri
Varma, Shri M.I.
Varma, Shri Ravindra
Veerappa, Shri
Venkatasubbaiah, Shri P.
Verma, Shri Balgovind
Vidyalankar, Shri A.N.
Vijaya Ananda, Maharajkumar
Vyasa, Shri Rudhelal
Yadav, Shri Ram Hukh
Yadava, Shri B.P.

Mr. Speaker: The result of the Division is: Ayes 26; Noes 264.

The motion was negatived.

श्री मधु लिमये : मेरा बोट गलत प्रया
है। मैं इसके हक में बोट नहीं दे रहा हूँ।

Mr. Speaker: That would be recorded that Shri Madhu Limaye did not vote for this substitute motion.

Shri Brij Raj Singh: Then the count will be different.

Mr. Speaker: That would be taken into account. I have only to read what appears on the board.

I will now put to vote substitute motion No. 8 by Shri Oza, for approval. The question is:

That for the original motion, the following be substituted, namely:—

"This House, having considered the statement laid on the Table of the House by the Prime Minister on the 16th August, 1965, on the Indo-Pakistan Agreement of June, 1965 relating to Gujarat-West Pakistan border, approves of it." (8).

The Lok Sabha divided.

Division No. 5]

AYES

[13:59 hrs.

Abdul Rashid, Bakshi
Abdul Wahid, Shri T.
Achal Singh, Shri
Achuthan, Shri
Akkamma Devi, Shrimati
Alagunan, Shri
Alva, Shri A.S.
Alva, Shri Joachim

Ananappa, Shri
Ankineedu, Shri
Anthony, Shri Frank
Arumachalam, Shri
Babunath Singh, Shri
Bedruddu, Shri
Bekriwal, Shri
Bal Krishna Singh, Shri

Berma, Shri P.C.
Barrow, Shri
Barua, Shri R.
Bharal, Shri P.L.
Bhasappa, Shri
Bharamati, Shri
Bhagat, Shri B.R.
Bhagwati, Shri

- Bhakt Dattashan, Shri
 Bhanja Dev, Shri L.N.
 Bhargava, Shri M.B.
 Bhatkar, Shri
 Bhattacharyya, Shri C.K.
 Birendra Bahadur Singh, Shri
 Bist, Shri J.B.S.
 Borooah, Shri P.C.
 Brahm Prakash, Shri
 Brajeshwar Prasad, Shri
 Brij Hasi Lal, Shri
 Brij Rai, Singh, Kotah Shri
 Chakraverti, Shri P.R.
 Chanda, Shrimati Jyotsna
 Chanak, Shri
 Chandrabhan Singh, Shri
 Chandriki, Shri
 Chaturvedi, Shri S.N.
 Chaudhry, Shri Chandramani Lal
 Chaudhuri, Shri D.S.
 Chaudhuri, Shrimati Kamala
 Chaudhuri, Shri Sachindra
 Chavan, Shri D.R.
 Daljit Singh, Shri
 Das, Shri B.K.
 Das, Shri Sudhansu
 Dass, Shri C.
 Desai, Shri Morarji
 Deshmukh, Shrimati, Vimlabai P.
 Dey, Shri S.K.
 Dhaon, Shri
 Dhuleshwar Meena, Shri
 Dixit, Shri G.N.
 Dorai, Shri Kasinatha
 Dubey, Shri R.G.
 Dwivedi, Shri M.L.
 Ering, Shri D.
 Firodia, Shri
 Gajraj Singh Rao, Shri
 Gandhi, Shri V.B.
 Gowdh, Shri Veerama
 Guha, Shri A.C.
 Gupta, Shri Badshah
 Hajarnavis, Shri
 Hansda, Shri Subodh
 Hanumanthiaya, Shri
 Haq, Shri M.M.
 Harvani, Shri Anwar
 Hazarika, Shri J.N.
 Heda, Shri
 Hem Raj, Shri
 Himatsingka, Shri
 Iqbal Singh, Shri
 Jagivan Ram, Shri
 Jamir, Shri S.C.
 Jamunadevi, Shrimati
 Jayaraman, Shri
 Jena, Shri
 Jyotsahi, Shri J.P.
 Kabir, Shri Humayun
 Kaddi, Shri
 Kamnawar, Shrimati Tai
 Kappen, Shri
 Karni Singhji, Shri
 Karuthiruman, Shri
 Kedaria, Shri C.M.
 Khadikar, Shri
 Khan, Dr. P.N.
 Khan, Shri Shah Nawaz
 Khanna, Shri Mehr Chand
 Khanna, Shri P.K.
 Kindar Lal, Shri
 Kotoki, Shri Liladhar
 Koya, Shri
 Kripa Shankar, Shri
 Krishna, Shri M.R.
 Krishnamachari, Shri T.T.
 Kureel, Shri B.N.
 Lahtan Chaudhry, Shri
 Lakhan Das, Shri
 Lakshminanthamma, Shrimati
 Lalit Sen, Shri
 Laskar, Shri N.R.
 Laxmi Bai, Shrimati
 Mahadeo Prasad, Shri
 Mahadeva Prasad, Dr.
 Mahtab, Shri
 Mahishi, Dr. Surojini
 Maimoona Sultan, Shrimati
 Malaichami, Shri
 Malaviya, Shri K.D.
 Malhotra, Shri Inder J.
 Mallick, Shri Rama Chandra
 Manan, Shri
 Mandal, Dr. P.
 Mandal, Shri Yamuna Prasad
 Maniyangadan, Shri
 Mantri, Shri D.D.
 Marandi, Shri
 Masuriya Din, Shri
 Mathur, Shri Hatish Chandra
 Mathur, Shri Shiv Churan
 Mehrotra, Shri Braj Bihari
 Mehta, Shri J.R.
 Melkote, Dr.
 Mengi, Shri Gopal Datt
 Menon, Shri Krishna
 Minimata, Shrimati
 Mirza, Shri Bakar Ali
 Mishra, Shri Bibhuti
 Mishra, Shri M.P.
 Misra, Shri Bibudhendra
 Misra, Shri Shyam Dhar
 Mohanty, Shri Gokulananda
 Mohain, Shri
 Morarka, Shri
 More, Shri K.L.
 More, Shri S.S.
 Muhammad Ismail, Shri
 Mukane, Shri
 Mukerjee, Shrimati Sharada
 Murlu Manohar, Shri
 Murthy, Shri B.S.
 Murti, Shri M.S.
 Muthiah, Shri
 Muzaffar Husain, Shri
 Naik, Shri D.J.
 Nanda, Shri
 Nayak, Shri Mohan
 Nayyar, Dr. Sushila
 Nesamony, Shri
 Niranjan Lal, Shri
 Oza, Shri
 Pallwal, Shri
 Pandey, Shri K.N.
 Pandey, Shri R. S.
 Pandey, Shri Vishwa Nath
 Pandit, Shrimati Vijay Lakshmi
 Panna Lal, Shri
 Pant, Shri K.C.
 Paramasivan, Shri
 Parashar, Shri
 Patel, Shri Chhotubhai
 Patel, Shri N.N.
 Patel, Shri P.R.
 Patil, Shri D.S.
 Patil, Shri J.S.
 Patil, Shri S.B.
 Patil, Shri S.K.
 Patil, Shri T.F.A.
 Pattabhi Raman, Shri C.R.
 Pillai, Shri Nataraja
 Prabhakar, Shri Naval
 Pratap Singh, Shri
 Puri, Shri D.D.
 Raghunath Singh, Shri
 Rai, Shrimati Sahodra Bai
 Raj, Bahadur, Shri
 Raia, Shri C.R.
 Rajdeo, Singh, Shri
 Raju, Shri D.B.
 Ram, Shri T.
 Ram Sewak, Shri
 Ram Swarup, Shri
 Ramdhani Das, Shri
 Ramshekar Prasad Singh, Shri
 Rananjai Singh, Shri
 Rane, Shri
 Rao, Shri Jaganatha
 Rao, Dr. K.L.
 Rao, Shri Krishnamoorthy
 Rao, Shri Muthyal
 Rao, Shri Thirumala
 Rattan Lal, Shri
 Ray, Shrimati Renuka
 Reddi, Dr. B. Gopala
 Reddiar, Shri
 Reddy, Shri R. Surendra
 Reddy, Shri Ramakrishna
 Reddy, Shrimati Yashoda
 Roy, Shri Bishwanath
 Sadhu Ram, Shri
 Saha, Dr. S.K.
 Sahu, Shri Rameshwar
 Saigal, Shri A.S.
 Semanta, Shri S.C.
 Samnani, Shri
 Sanji Rupji, Shri

Saraf, Shri Sham Lal
Sarma, Shri A.T.
Satyabhama Devi, Shrimati
Natyannarayana, Shri
Sen, Shri A.K.
Sen, Shri P.G.
Shah, Shri Manabendra
Shakuntala Devi, Shrimati
Sham Nath, Shri
Shankaraiya, Shri
Sharma, Shri A.P.
Sharma, Shri K.C.
Shashi Ranjan, Shri
Shastri, Shri Lal Bahadur
Shastri, Shri Ramanand
Sheo Narain, Shri
Shinde, Shri
Shree Naryan Das, Shri
Shukla, Shri Vidya Charan

Shyam Kumari Devi, Shrimati
Sidheshwar Prasad, Shri
Singh, Shri K.K.
Singha Shri G.K.
Sinha, Shrimati Ramdulari
Sinha, Shri Satya Narayan
Sinha, Shrimati Tarkeshwari
Sinhaan Singh, Shri
Snatak, Shri Nardeo
Soy, Shri, H.C.
Srinivasan, Dr. P.
Subramaniam, Shri C.
Subramanyam, Shri T.
Sumat Prasad, Shri
Sunder Lal, Shri
Surendra Pal Singh, Shri
Swaran Singh, Shri
Tantia, Shri Rameshwar
Thimmaiah, Shri

Thomas, Shri A.M.
Tiwary, Shri D.N.
Tiwary, Shri K.N.
Tiwary, Shri R.S.
Tula Ram, Shri
Tyagi, Shri
Uikey, Shri
Vaishaya, Shri M.B.
Valvi, Shri
Varma, Shri M.L.
Varma, Shri Ravindra
Veerappa, Shri
Venkatasubbaiah, Shri P.
Verma, Shri Balgovind
Vidyalankar, Shri A.N.
Vijaya Ananda, Maharaikumar
Vyas, Shri Radhey Lal
Yadav, Shri Ram Harkh
Yadava, Shri B.P.

NOES

Alvaraes, Shri
Aney, Dr. M.S.
Bade, Shri
Banerjee, Shri S.M.
Barua, Shri Hem
Berwa, Shri Onkar Lal
Brij Raj Singh, Shri
Gokaran Prasad, Shri
Gupta, Shri Kashi Ram
Joshi, Shri A.C.

Kachhavaia, Shri Hukam Chand
Kakkar, Shri Gauri Shankar
Kamath, Shri Hari Vishnu
Krishnapal Singh, Shri
Nair, Shri N. Sreekantam
Omkar Singh, Shri
Rameshwaranand, Shri
Seth, Shri Bishanchander
Siddananajappa, Shri
Siddhanti, Shri Jagdev Singh

Singh, Shri A.P.
Singhvi, Dr. L.M.
Swamy, Shri Sivamurthi
Upadhyaya, Shri Shiva Dutt
Visharm Prasad, Shri
Yadav, Shri Ram Sewak
Yainik, Shri
Yudhvir Singh, Shri

Mr. Speaker: The result of the Division is:

Ages 269; Noes 28.

The motion was adopted.

श्री शिवदत्त उपाध्याय (रीवा) : मुझ से गलती हो गई।

श्री मौयं (अलीगढ़) : मेरा बोट नहीं आया है।

Mr. Speaker: That would be noted down.

श्री बुखराज सिंह : जनता की भावना को अन्यायपूर्ण तरीके से दबाने की कोशिश की जा रही है। ऐसा गर्मनाक निश्चय करने के लिए विस्तार है। (Interruptions)

Shri Vidya Charan Shukla (Mahasamund): Sir, before you proceed to the next item, I want a clarification

from you. Does shouting of slogans inside the House, when it is in session, constitute a breach of privilege of the House or is it normal conduct of a member?

Mr. Speaker: It is not normal conduct. It is very exceptionable. It is not only exceptionable, but I should say it is reprehensible.

Shri Vidya Charan Shukla: It should be condemned with all force.

Mr. Speaker: It should not be done; they can stage a walk-out, but shouting at that moment is really very objectionable.