

[श्री बाल्मीकी]

योजनायें तो चल रही हैं लेकिन ना यह चाहिए कि उनके लिए कुछ हुआ भी है या नहीं हुआ है। योजनाओं के अन्दर उन के लिए कुछ होना चाहिये। मैं कहने के लिए तैयार हूँ कि योजनाओं में पैसा तो निर्धारित कर दिया जाता है, धनराशि तो निर्धारित कर दी जाती है लेकिन वह खर्च नहीं होती है। राज्य सरकारें उदासीनता दिखाती हैं। जिले के स्तर पर कोई प्रेरणा नहीं होती है। यही कारण है कि काम आगे नहीं बढ़ता है। आज भी उन धनराशियों को लेकर आप देखें तो आपको पता चलेगा कि जो लक्ष्य निर्धारित किए गए थे वे पूरे नहीं हुए हैं। वे पूरे होने चाहिये थे। मैं अर्ज करना चाहता हूँ....

Mr. Chairman : Order, order, The hon. Member may continue his speech on the next day.

17 hrs.

MEDIA FOR UPSC EXAMINATION*

Shri Sezhiyan (Perambalur) : Mr. Chairman, the question of the media of UPSC examinations which came up in the starred question referred to in the Order Paper has been agitating the minds of all people, especially the people from the non-Hindi-speaking areas. There is long-drawn inaction and silence on the part of the Government which often is mystifying and sometimes menacing, to all the people of our parts. Therefore on this question, at least in this discussion, I want a categorical, clear and just answer from the Minister concerned.

Coming to the discussion, in the answers given to Starred Question No. 64 of the 27th July, 1966, Shri Shukla, the Deputy Minister of Home Affairs, seems to have stated. because it is reported in this—

“There was a secret communication from the UPSC to the Govern-

ment.....and it would not be in public interest to disclose it.”

Then the question was raised by Shri Azad and others that the Speaker should go into the Communication and satisfy himself whether it is genuine or not and the speaker promised that he would go into this. On that point I want a clarification.

Secondly, during the questions and answers I quoted a categorical statement made by the Chief Minister of Madras that the UPSC has finalised a scheme for introducing all the fourteen languages in the UPSC examinations. Pointing to that categorical public statement made by the Minister, I questioned the veracity of the statement made by the Deputy Minister that it is a secret document. This point was acceded to by the Speaker also and he drew the attention of the Minister. The Minister of Home Affairs Shri Nanda, said this on that day :—

“If it is so, then I will have to check it up. If it is so, it certainly goes beyond the limits which are imposed on revealing certain information.”

There was a decision taken ; there was certain information. The Chief Minister of Madras has inadvertently disclosed it in a public speech. Shri Shukla said the other day that the Chief Minister had not made that statement. Therefore, I want a categorical answer from him as to whether such a statement was made or not.

Further, though the Minister was fighting shy here and was refusing to acknowledge that open statement, three days later—this question came upon 27th July—on 30th July the Home Minister, Shri Gulzarilal Nanda, was addressing the Hindi Advisory Samity and he is reported to have informed the Hindi

*Half-an-hour discussion.

Advisory Samiti that the Union Public Service Commission was making preparations to introduce all the fourteen languages listed in the Constitution as the media for competitive examinations. What he was denying three days earlier in Parliament he had informed the Hindi Advisory Samiti in a separate meeting. Therefore it is no longer a secret or confidential matter but has come out in the papers as said by the Home Minister himself.

श्री श्रीकार लाल बैरवा (कोटा) :
 सभापति महोदय, कोरम नहीं है ।

Mr. Chairman : The bell is being rung.....now there is quorum.

Shri Sezhiyan : While replying to the No-Confidence Motion in the Madras Assembly, the Chief Minister, Mr. Bhaktavatsalam, stated :

"The details of the scheme for making all the 14 regional languages as the media for U.P.S.C. examinations were being worked out".

So, on principle, it has been accepted and it is also being worked out. But this House has not been taken into confidence in view of what has been said by the Chief Minister and what has been said by the Home Minister in the Hindi Advisory Committee. It is nothing new for the Minister to come forward and give an assurance, at this stage, that all the 14 languages, all the regional languages, will be allowed as media for U.P.S.C. examinations. This is not a new assurance nor a new decision taken by the Government. This decision has been there in our books for the past twelve years.

On May 2, 1955, while answering a question, the then Home Minister, Mr. Govind Ballabh Pant, gave an assurance to this House as :

"The Government have decided to be guided by the principles

contained in the Resolution entitled "Examinations for all India Services" which was passed by the Congress Working Committee on 5th April, 1954".

What is the Congress Working Committee Resolution dated 5th April, 1954? it said :

"The Working Committee recommend that progressively examinations for the all-India Services should be held in Hindi, English and the principal regional languages and candidates may be given the option to use any of these languages for the purpose of examinations."

This Resolution was passed by the Congress Working Committee in the year 1954 and accepted as the Government directive in the year 1955. Therefore, a clear decision has been taken ; a categorical assurance has been given by the Government. But still they have been wavering.

In May, 1957, I think, the Working Committee reiterated the original decision. But in the middle of 1964, when the time for the introduction of Hindi as the official language was nearing there were reports in the papers that the Government was going to introduce Hindi only as the alternative medium for the U.P.S.C. examinations. That resulted in many apprehensions in the minds of the people of the non-Hindi area and there was a huge agitation, a momentous agitation, in January, 1965. When the Chief Ministers met in February last year, the original stand was taken to allow all the 14 languages as the media for the U.P.S.C. examinations.

So, I want a categorical assurance on this. For the past twelve years, they have been repeating it day in and day out and whenever there is a agitation, whenever there is a "misapprehension" in the minds of the people, as they call it, they have been coming out with the Congress Working Committee's Resolution. you take the whole language question, you

[Shri Sezhiyan]

will find a big bibliography of assurances only. There is a saying: If you write sugar on a piece of paper, it will not sweeten your tongue. Just like this, all the assurances have been on paper but in practice they have never been implemented.

I want to know whether on principle they have accepted the position that all the regional languages should be allowed as the media for U.P.S.C. examinations, whether they are serious enough to implement it and how they are going to implement it. Are they going to have a phased programme under which examinations are to be restricted to certain languages only. Just like saying, "We will give an opportunity to all the regional languages", they may say, let us experiment with Hindi only. That was a view taken by Government in the middle of 1964. I want categorically to be told whether they are going to implement the Resolution of the Congress Working Committee, accepted by the Government as its own directive, whether they are going to introduce all the regional language or they are going to introduce one or two languages.

Also I want a further clarification whether they are going to introduce all the regional languages into all the subjects given in the UPSC or they will restrict it to only one or two. If they introduce only Hindi as an experimental one excluding other languages, it will be a very grave and disastrous start, because even in the Constituent Assembly whenever the question of official language came, this medium of U.P.S.C. was agitating the minds of all non-Hindi speaking people; I am not talking about Tamils or Malayalis or South Indians; even those coming from Orissa, from West Bengal, from Kashmir, were all agitated about this. Here I shall give a quotation from a person coming from Orissa because he was far removed from the agitational attitude taken by the South Indians.

Mr. B. Das, a Congress member coming from Orissa, said, while speaking in the Constituent Assembly on the question of official language:

"I am not willing to reconcile myself to the position that after the next fifteen, twenty or thirty years, sons of the Hindi-speaking people, whether they belong to U.P. or to the C.P., will preponderate in the All-India Services."

Therefore, whenever the question of Hindi comes, whenever the question of official language comes, the minds of the non-Hindi speaking people, whether they belong to Orissa or Kashmir or West Bengal or Tamilnad or Kerala, are agitating with this fear. Therefore, Government should make a categorical statement in this regard.

Also, even now, Hindi is given as an optional subject along with the other subjects for I.A.S. and I.P.S., examinations, but the other languages are not given the same status and opportunity. There are 27 optional subjects from which a choice can be made for IAS and IPS examinations; so many subjects are given like Pure Mathematics, Applied Mathematics Indian History, World History, International Law, General Economics, etc., and along with these, Hindi is also offered as an optional subject. For a person coming from Tamilnad, there is no optional subject like Tamil; for a person coming from Kerala, here is no optional subject like Malayalam, but Hindi alone is given the favoured position. What will happen if Hindi alone is given this status? We can judge from the average marks scored in each of the subjects: for the year 1963, I have got the statistics with me; the average percentage of marks scored by the candidates in Pure Mathematics was only 29; in Applied Mathematics it was 25; in Indian History it was 33; in Political Science it was 37; in statistics it was 29,

and so on and for Hindi it was 44. That means, if an average student coming to the UPSC examination happens to come from an area where Hindi is spoken and is well-versed in Hindi, then he has got a decided advantage over the non-Hindi speaking students. I may be a better mathematics student still on an average. I will be scoring only 29% whereas an average person from a Hindi-speaking subject, will be able to score 44%. Therefore, the discrimination will enter. If they are going to introduce only Hindi as the alternative one, it will be a very grave disaster to unity and to the little united feeling that we have been able to create throughout the country.

Therefore, on these four issues, I want categorical, clear and just answers and decisions from the Government:

on the point of decision on principle, whether they are going to introduce all the regional languages or only a very few languages, whether they are going to restrict the subjects only to certain subjects and to certain languages; also even after introducing all these things, whether there will be a compulsory paper in Hindi for anybody who wants to enter into government service. In this connection, Government should give us a categorical clear and just assurance because, we want to know where we stand in relation to Hindi, whether the non-Hindi-speaking people also will have an equal status and equal opportunities as the Hindi-speaking people or whether they will be relegated to the position of second class citizens in this country. That question should not be allowed to linger any longer and whatever decision is taken should be clear. Government should not give a dubious decision or resort to double-talking because so far they have said one thing here but when the Chief Minister of Madras goes to his state he says Tamil will have a place though we do not find any place for it here. So, this kind of dubiousness should end; this kind of suspension should not

be allowed to persist any longer and the air should be cleared by a clear and just decision taken by the Home Minister

Shri S. Kandappan (Tiruchengode) : This question of language has been agitating the minds of the non-Hindi speaking people for a very long time and this has come up in this House on many occasions. I would like to have one clarification from the hon. Minister particularly on one point. I do not know where to pinpoint it, because there were so many assurances given and repeated on so many occasions, but I would only say this that often they have said that no action will be taken which would hamper the development of other languages and they have repeated in this House time and again that all the administrative work, as far as the Central Government departments are concerned, will be carried on in English and even while permission is given to communicate with the Centre in Hindi, such communication will inevitably be followed or accompanied by a translation in English. But I find that Government have given permission to Madhya Pradesh and some other Hindi-speaking States to communicate with the Centre only in Hindi without their being required to send any accompanying translation in English.

An hon. Member : What is the harm in that ?

Shri S. Kandappan : I think there is a lot of harm. This would mean that a secretary who does not know Hindi or a top official who does not know Hindi and who may have to handle this communication has to seek the help of some lower division clerk or upper division clerk or some other chap who knows Hindi and get it translated into English; it may create lot of administrative difficulties, because the officer may not be able to deal directly with the communication in original.

Pending the decision to use all the languages as media for the UPSC examination and for all Central administrative pur-

[Shri S. Kandappan]

poses, I would like to have from the Government a categorical assurance that they would not indulge in any kind of perpetuation of this type of propagation of Hindi by fair or foul means.

Shri Nambiar (Tiruchirappalli) :

In view of the confusion that has already been deliberately created by the Government spokesman who wanted to prefer Hindi to other languages and treat the non-Hindi speaking people as second class citizens, may I have the assurance that till such time as the UPSC decides on the moderation formula in valuing the answer-papers in all the regional languages, the present system of examination in English would continue and no single Indian language would get superiority over the other thirteen national languages in India.

Shri N. Sreekantan Nair (Quilon) :

In view of my information that the secret communication sent by the UPSC was to the effect that Hindi alone could now be experimented upon and the regional languages could not be experimented upon, may I know whether Government are contemplating to introduce Hindi imperialism in India.....

Shri S. Kandappan : It has already been introduced.

Shri N. Sreekantan Nair : ... which will ultimately fritter away the little national integration and the little unity that has been achieved during these years of Independence and will force the people in the non-Hindi-speaking areas to demand secession from the Centre or the Union ?

Shrimati Renu Chakravartty (Barrackpore) : Is it a fact that the UPSC have stated that it is not possible to introduce the 14-languages formula for their examinations, and may I know whether they have made a recommendations that only English and Hindi are the two languages that will continue as the media ? If so, why is it so impossible for the entire

talents of India to produce a few examiners in all the 14 languages of the Indian Union and why can a system of moderation not be brought about on that basis ? If it is so difficult for them to find professors and teachers for the purpose, we will tell them how to do it.

Shri N. Sreekantan Nair : It is because the Bengali and other languages are not developed like Hindi !

Shri Vasudevan Nair (Ambalapuzha) : In spite of the fact that a decision in principle was taken on the introduction of all the regional language for examinations in UPSC, in actual practice nothing is being done. Also as regards the introduction of a modern non-Hindi Indian language in the Hindi-speaking States, we have the same experience— I am not referring to a South Indian language only but also other languages like Bengali, or some other non-Hindi languages.

Shrimati Renu Chakravartty : Bengali is easy for them.

Shri Vasudevan Nair : In view of this experience, can the Minister give assurance that this principle will be implemented in practice and a target date will be fixed by which time it will be implemented ?

Mr. Chairman : Shri Shukla.

Shri N. Sreekantan Nair : On a point of order. The Home Minister, who is responsible for the Ministry, was here at the beginning of the discussion. Now he is remaining somewhere outside, making this poor Dy. Minister a cat's-paw.

Mr. Chairman : He is neither poor nor a cat's paw; he is one of the Minister's in the Ministry and is competent to answer.

The Deputy Minister in the Ministry of Home Affairs. (**Shri Vidya Charan Shukla**) : I must disabuse the mind of the hon.

Member and say that all Ministers belonging to a particular Ministry are equally responsible. He need not have any inferiority complex on account of the

Shri N. Sreekantan Nair : I do not have ; only he has.

Shri Vidya Charan Shukla : Before I go over to the main discussion, I would like to inform the House that after we took the plea of public interest regarding the secret communication received from the UPSC, the Speaker did call for me and saw the papers and was satisfied that it was a proper plea made by Government not to disclose the information to the house at the present juncture.

Before I proceed to give answers to the points raised by the hon. members, I would like to say that it is not right, as Shrimati Renu Chakravartty and Shri Sreekantan Nair said, that the UPSC's advice is that except for English and Hindi, no other regional language can be the medium of UPSC examinations. It is not their advice at all ; that can be firmly denied.

As you know, this question of media of examination of UPSC has been considered. One hon. Member did quote the late Home Minister and the Working Committee resolution. I would say that the late Home Minister, Pandit Pant, said that 'a detailed scheme will be prepared by the Government, if necessary, after consulting the Hindi Commission which is to be appointed shortly'. A Committee of Parliament for official language was appointed and it made more or less unanimous recommendation in 1959 that while English may continue to be the medium of competitive examination, Hindi should also be admitted an alternative medium after sometime, both Hindi and English being available thereafter as media of examinations at the option of the candidate. This was again put to the Chief Ministers for their consultation. They also approved of this arrangement.

Shri S. Kandappan : Does that report preclude other languages.

Shri Vidya Charan Shukla : The report of the Parliamentary Committee on official language mentioned only Hindi and English ; it did not recommend about other languages. After that, the Chief Ministers also confirmed this recommendation which was accepted by the Government. After that, as you know, this introduction of the medium of examination in the UPSC was deferred for one reason or other. Later on, the Congress Working Committee took other decision that all the principal 14 languages of the country which are mentioned in the Eighth Schedule of the Constitution should be used for the examination purpose by the UPSC, and the Government accepted this recommendation, and I must assure this house that Government stands by this assurance, and all the 14 languages will be used as the examination media in the UPSC.

Shri N. Sreekantan Nair : In a century ?

Shri Vidya Charan Shukla : It will move in the same manner as introduction of Hindi has moved, with the same speed, not slower than that.

I would again say that any assurance that has been given by the Government and every assurance that has been given by the Government has been honoured by it. Nobody can point out here in this House any assurance which has been given by the Government and which has not been honoured by this Government.

Shri Vasudevan Nair : [Sabotage in practice.

Shri Vidya Charan Shukla : Mention has been made about the statement which the Chief Minister of Madras made. There is some confusion about this matter. When I said in this House that a certain communication from the UPSC could not be divulged because it would hurt the public interest, I was not touching upon the arrangements that

[Shri Vidya Charan Shukla]

were being made by the UPSC for conducting this examination in all the 14 national languages of the country. It was only about a particular advice on a particular matter about which they had sought some clarification and had addressed a communication to the Home Ministry, and that particular communication was treated as secret by us.

The two statements of the Chief Minister of Madras have been printed in the *Hindu*, and I am quoting from it. He said on 7th March :

"The Government of India had accepted the suggestion of the Congress Working committee that all the 14 national languages be made the media of UPSC examinations."

Again, he said on 7th May :

"The Central Government had agreed in principle to allow candidates appearing for UPSC to write answers in 16 (it was actually 14) recognised languages, but legislation to this effect had yet to be enacted".

This is public information which we did not want to deny to this House. Of course, this information has been given, and I am again saying that this is clear, and this is the Government's position.

It is also a fact that in order that the 14 languages of the country are used as media of examination, an Act of Parliament is not necessary. It can be done by an executive order, and I can assure the House that as soon as the UPSC has finalised its arrangements about moderation and about all other connected matters which are necessary, all the 14 languages will be introduced as media of examination by the Public Service Commission.

Shri Nambiar : Till such time, what will be the position?

Shri Vidya Charan Shukla : Till such time, the present arrangements will continue.

I must again say this, that it is not a fact that we are or the UPSC is contemplating to introduce Hindi before other regional languages. This is also not correct. We want to introduce all the 14 languages.

Shri Nambiar : Simultaneously

Shri Vidya Charan Shukla : That is our intention, but there are certain representations, certain difficulties that have been pointed out by various university authorities. They have been pleading that certain languages, four or five languages, which have been used as media of instruction for a long time in various universities, may be introduced first, and the other languages may follow. We have not made up our mind. Our inclination is that we should be able to introduce all the fourteen languages simultaneously and not four or five languages to begin with and later on the other languages. But a decision to this effect will be taken a little later. This categorical assurance can be given to this House that it would not be that Hindi alone would be introduced as medium in the UPSC and other languages would follow ; that is not the intention of the Government.....
(Interruptions.) Let him.

Shri Nambiar : Let us extract as much as possible.

Shri Vidya Charan Shukla : Mention has been made about letters which have to be written by Hindi-speaking States to Centre. The original provision was that translations in English should accompany these letters when they are sent to the Central Government. This was done for some time but as soon as we were able to make satisfactory and good arrangements for translation this became a superfluous thing. The non-Hindi-speaking government servants have had no trouble in dealing with Hindi communications to the Centre because of the arrangements we have made in every Ministry for translation facilities.

Shri S. Kandappan : Will he allow communication in Tamil—without a translation?

Shri Vidya Charan Shukla : From Madras? Yes. We have never told that we shall not answer or honour any letter received by us in Tamil.

If they write to us in Tamil....

Shri S. Kandappan : It is not a national language ?

Shri Vidya Charan Shukla : It is a national language ; if you know your Constitution, you will know that it is a national language. Sir, I do not think that I should go into the political slogans that had been mentioned in the form of questions.

Shri Vasudevan Nair : Does the Minister know any other Indian language than Hindi or propose to learn any other Indian language ?

Shri Vidya Charan Shukla : Yes, Though Mr. Vasudevan Nair's point does not fall within the ambit of this discussion, I will still say that the various Hindi-speaking States in the beginning introduced Hindi or Sanskrit or something like that under the three-language formula ; but now

he would be happy to know that this position has changed. Now the Hindi-speaking States have started teaching other modern Indian languages, spoken and written languages, under the three-language formula. There could be no objection of Tamil or Telugu is taught in the schools of Madhya Pradesh or Uttar Pradesh under the three-language formula.....
(Interruptions.)

Shri D. C. Sharma (Gurdaspur) : The Punjab University at Chandigarh is today selecting a lecturer in Tamil and I was a member of that committee but I could not go as I am here.

Shri Vidya Charan Shukla : I think, Sir, I have covered most of the points that have been raised by the hon. Members and if further questions are there I shall answer them.

Shri Sezhiyan : I have to ask for two clarifications.

Mr. Chairman : Questions have already been asked ; there cannot be questions any more now.

17.34 hrs.

The Lok Sabha then adjourned till Eleven of the Clock on Friday, August 19, 1966/ Sravana 28, 1888 (Saka).